

## Revolution and Its Discontents

The death of the Islamic Republic's revolutionary patriarch Ayatollah Khomeini, the bitter denouement of the Iran-Iraq War, and marginalisation of leading factions within the political elite, in tandem with the end of the Cold War, harboured immense intellectual and political repercussions for the Iranian state and society. It was these events which created the conditions for the emergence of Iran's postrevolutionary reform movement, as its intellectuals and political leaders sought to re-evaluate the foundations of the Islamic state's political legitimacy and religious authority. In this monograph, Sadeghi-Boroujerdi examines the rise and evolution of reformist political thought in Iran and analyses the complex network of publications, study circles, and think tanks that encompassed a range of prominent politicians and intellectuals in the 1990s. In his meticulous account of the relationships between the post-revolutionary political class and intelligentsia, he explores a panoply of political and ideological issues still vital to understanding Iran's revolutionary state, such as the ruling political theology of the 'Guardianship of the Jurist', the political elite's engagement with questions of Islamic statehood, democracy, and constitutionalism, and their critiques of revolutionary agency and social transformation.

Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi is a British Academy Postdoctoral Research Fellow in the Faculty of Oriental Studies at the University of Oxford and Postdoctoral Associate at St Cross College, Oxford. He has taught at the University of Oxford, SOAS (University of London), and the University of Exeter. Sadeghi-Boroujerdi was Associate Editor at the *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* from 2014 to 2017 and is Series Editor of *Radical Histories of the Middle East*. His writings on Iran have been widely published in academic journals and the international media, including the *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies, Iranian Studies, Digest of Middle East Studies, Middle East Journal, Foreign Policy, Jadaliyya, Al Jazeera, Lobelog, Muftah, Jacobin, and The Guardian.* 



#### The Global Middle East

General Editors

Arshin Adib-Moghaddam, SOAS, University of London Ali Mirsepassi, New York University

Editorial Advisory Board

Faisal Devji, University of Oxford
John Hobson, University of Sheffield
Firoozeh Kashani-Sabet, University of Pennsylvania
Zachary Lockman, New York University
Madawi Al-Rasheed, London School of Economics and Political Science
David Ryan, University College Cork, Ireland

The Global Middle East series seeks to broaden and deconstruct the geographical boundaries of the 'Middle East' as a concept to include North Africa, Central and South Asia, and diaspora communities in Western Europe and North America. The series features fresh scholarship that employs theoretically rigorous and innovative methodological frameworks resonating across relevant disciplines in the humanities and the social sciences. In particular, the general editors welcome approaches that focus on mobility, the erosion of nation-state structures, travelling ideas and theories, transcendental techno-politics, the decentralisation of grand narratives, and the dislocation of ideologies inspired by popular movements. The series will also consider translations of works by authors in these regions whose ideas are salient to global scholarly trends but have yet to be introduced to the Anglophone academy.

#### Other Books in the Series

- 1. Transnationalism in Iranian Political Thought: The Life and Times of Ahmad Fardid, Ali Mirsepassi
- 2. Psycho-nationalism: Global Thought, Iranian Imaginations, Arshin Adib-Moghaddam
- 3. Cosmopolitanism in Iran: A Cinematic History, Golbarg Rekabtalaei
- 4. Money, Markets and Monarchies: The Gulf Cooperation Council and the Political Economy of the Contemporary Middle East, Adam Hanieh
- 5. Iran's Troubled Modernity: Debating Ahmad Fardid's Legacy, Ali Mirsepassi



# Revolution and Its Discontents

Political Thought and Reform in Iran

ESKANDAR SADEGHI-BOROUJERDI University of Oxford





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108426343

DOI: 10.1017/9781108681834

© Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Names: Sadeghi-Boroujerdi, Eskandar, 1982– author.

Title: Revolution and its discontents : political thought and reform in Iran /

Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi, University of Oxford.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, [2019] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018041015 | ISBN 9781108426343

Subjects: LCSH: Iran – Politics and government – 1979–1997. | Iran – Politics and government – 1997– | Political culture – Iran. | Social change – Political aspects – Iran.

Classification: LCC DS318.825 .S233 2019 | DDC 955.05/4–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018041015

ISBN 978-1-108-42634-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To my parents か Homa Katouzian





## **Contents**

Acknowledgements		page viii	
Note on Sources and Transliteration		xii	
List of Abbreviations		xiii	
	Introduction	1	
1	Religious Intellectuals, Reform, and the Struggle for Hegemony	20	
2	Constructing <i>Behesht-e Jahan</i> : Islam, the Clergy, and the State	59	
3	Political Genealogies of Reform: The <i>Rowshanfekran-e Dini</i> and the Islamic Left	136	
4	Revolution and Its Discontents: Ideology and the Death of Utopia	187	
5	Free Faith, Democratic Governance, and the 'Official Reading' of Religion	241	
6	Khatami, the 2nd Khordad Front, and the Pedagogics of Pluralism	287	
7	Sa id Hajjariyan and Reformist Strategy: Sovereign Disenchantment and the Politics of Participation	340	
	Conclusion	375	
Appendix		385	
Glossary		389	
Select Bibliography		391	
Index		433	

vii



## Acknowledgements

I would first like to thank Homa Katouzian, my mentor and doctoral supervisor at the University of Oxford. He was never short of time, advice, or support and was always ready to help in any way possible. I simply cannot express sufficient gratitude for his abundant kindness, integrity, and generosity of spirit, as well as the example he has set as both a scholar and human being, all of which have indelibly left their mark.

I must profusely thank Ali Ansari and Faisal Devji, whose incisive comments and provocative questions in the course of my viva voce upon which this work is based were invaluable and helped me to improve this modest piece of research. Both have been a generous source of support and encouragement, indispensable to any early career scholar and their development. Nasser Mohajer is also in need of special thanks and has been a brilliant source of advice and guidance. He has spent many hours speaking with me and discussing sources, events, and historiography, very often on issues unrelated to the subject of this work. Nonetheless, I believe myself a much better researcher as a result of his positive influence and meticulous intellect, which have enabled me to understand the vicissitudes of twentieth-century Iranian history in a far deeper fashion than I might have done otherwise. He also took great care when reading the chapters I sent for his review and gave comments that were without exception insightful and thoughtprovoking. They always inspired me to polish and improve those points which were unclear or demanded further elucidation. Siavush Randjbar-Daemi is deserving of profuse thanks and gratitude. He has always and without fail been indefatigable in offering his help, suggestions, and constructive criticism. I feel fortunate to consider him not only a first-rate academic colleague and interlocutor but also a dear friend. Without our constant back-and-forth and intellectual dialogue I would be quite a different historian to the one I am today.

viii



Acknowledgements

ix

Nader Hashemi has always encouraged my research and writing and instilled confidence into me when I most doubted myself. I cannot thank him enough for all of his advice, support, and help over the years. Abdel Razzaq Takriti was a true friend, both in the good and, more importantly, in the difficult times. His friendship and intellectual camaraderie have been decisive to my personal and professional life, and I simply cannot express in words their value to me. I consider myself fortunate to know such a remarkable, passionate, and committed scholar and generous ensan. Arshin Adib-Moghaddam was always encouraging, and unsparing with this time and gave me crucial opportunities to teach and engage with the SOAS community for which I am immensely grateful. Ali Mirsepassi, too, has been most encouraging, and his recommendations and interjections have been vital to further improving this piece of research. Without the stellar guidance of Arshin and Ali, this book would have turned out quite differently. Hossein Kamaly was always ready with his time, kind words, and wisdom. His dignity, ethical fortitude, and learned erudition were of great inspiration. My friend and colleague Rasmus Elling kindly read the original dissertation and wrote an eloquent and insightful review as well as commenting on the draft manuscript with typical precision and insight.

Ervand Abrahamian has been an intellectual lodestar and source of inspiration since my undergraduate years. I will never forget when he generously sent this unknown and rather clueless undergraduate a photocopy of his article in the post after I emailed him out of the blue. Apart from his personal generosity, he is a scholar and a critically minded intellectual whom I have never ceased reading and learning from. I was truly humbled that he took the time, despite his many other commitments, to read an earlier draft of the manuscript and provide me with incisive feedback, which I have since incorporated. Laleh Khalil similarly read the manuscript and, as always, provoked me to thought in ways only she could. Her friendship and comradely engagement continue to stand as an exemplar. Behrooz Ghamari-Tabrizi, whose own pioneering work has always proven to be mandatory reading, was ever gracious and, despite his hectic schedule, took the time to read through an earlier draft and pose crucial questions which pushed me to refine certain key elements. Babak Rahimi provided excellent feedback leavened with humour and levity, importantly reminding me not to take myself too seriously. Another senior colleague for whom I have



Acknowledgements

X

only admiration, Omid Safi, has never been short of encouragement, support, or advice, for which I can only express the deepest of thanks. The two anonymous reviewers should be amply thanked for their care, attention, and empathy when reading my work. It is no exaggeration to say that their input made a decisive impact on the book before you.

Edmund Herzig, Stephanie Cronin, Hamid Dabashi, Abolghasem Fanaei, Touraj Atabaki, Mohsen Kadivar, Hossein Bashiriyeh, Mehrzad Boroujerdi, Golbarg Bashi, Anoushiravan Ehteshami, Ali Rahnema, Sajjad Rizvi, Fatemeh Shams, Nazanin Shahrokni, Mazen Masri, Ariabarzan Mohammadi, Mohammadreza Jalaeipour, Reza Zia-Ebrahimi, Alam Saleh, Naghmeh Sohrabi, Yasuyuki Matsunaga, Marc Valeri, Fanar Haddad, M. Ali Kadivar, Amin Ehteshami, Janet Coleman, Amin Borzorgian, Omar Shweiki, Robert Waller, Siavash Hariri, Bahareh Zavvar, Mostafa Zavvar, Shahram Rezaei, Shahrzad Rezaei, Pankaj Santiago, Ali Rezaei, Harry Manikdiwela, and Taymour Harding all gave their precious time in a variety of ways which, directly and indirectly, contributed to this piece of research and/or my academic development, for which I cannot express enough thanks. I must heartily thank my family – Sacha Reza Sadeghi, Seyyed Morteza Tayebi-Jazayeri, Bibi Saeideh Moravej Al Ali, Ali Tayebi-Jazayeri, Shima Tayebi-Jazayeri, Sahar Tayebi-Jazayeri, Safa Tayebi-Jazayeri, Amir Ale Mohammad, and Hossein Tayebi-Jazayeri - who have sent countless books from Tehran for my research and were always ready to help in any conceivable way. My brother Sam has been invariably supportive and caring. It was in the quiet of his West London apartment that I spent many hours editing the following text.

My deepest appreciation goes to Queen's College, Oxford, for the award of bursaries and travel grants to facilitate my research. I would like to thank the British Academy, which awarded me a highly coveted postdoctoral research fellowship and thereby the opportunity to complete the final edits of this monograph before moving on to my next major project. Maria Marsh of Cambridge University Press has proven to be a terrific editor who has tirelessly stewarded the publication process from start to finish. Her assiduousness and diligent oversight made all the difference. Abigail Walkington and Natasha Whelan, also at CUP, have been incredibly helpful throughout and answered my many queries with patience and enthusiasm.



Acknowledgements

xi

Penultimately, I would like to thank my wife, Ala, whose love, devotion, and joyfulness I could not live without. Her patience, affection, and understanding throughout the duration of working on this monograph made all the difference. Above all, I must thank my father, Mehran, without whose unconditional love and support none of this would have been possible. I alone am culpable for any of the shortcomings which follow.

Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi, April 2018, Oxford



### Note on Sources and Transliteration

Part of Chapter 2 is based on a revised version of the essay 'Ali Shariati and the Ideologization of Religion', Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi, Tehran Bureau, *PBS Frontline*, 30 October 2011.

Chapter 7 is based on a revised version of the article 'From *Etelā* 'āti to *Eslāhtalabi*: Sa'id Hajjarian, Political Theology and the Politics of Reform in Post-Revolutionary Iran', Eskandar Sadeghi-Boroujerdi, *Iranian Studies* 47, no. 6, 987–1009. This book uses a variation of the *Iranian Studies* journal's transliteration system, albeit dispensing with all diacritical marks reserved for long vowels.



## **Abbreviations**

IRI	Islamic Republic of Iran (Jomhuri-ye eslami-ye Iran)
MRM	Association of Combatant Clerics (Majma'-e rowhaniyun-e
	mobarez)
<b>IRGC</b>	Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps (Sepah-e pasdaran-e
	enqelab-e eslami)
JRM	Society of Combatant Clergy (Jame'eh-ye rowhaniyyat-e
	mobarez)
GC	Guardian Council (Shura-ye negahban)
IRP	Islamic Republic Party (Hezb-e jomhuri-ye eslami)
<b>SMEEI</b>	Mojahedin Organisation of the Islamic Revolution of Iran
	(Sazman-e mojahedin-e enqelab-e eslami-ye Iran)
<b>SMEE</b>	Mojahedin Organisation of the Islamic Revolution (Sazman-
	e mojahedin-e enqelab-e eslami)
PRG	Provisional Revolutionary Government
NAI	Freedom Movement of Iran (Nehzat-e azadi-ye Iran)
SFMMI	Council of National-Religious Activists of Iran (Shura-ye
	faʻalan-e melli mazhabi-ye Iran)
PFII	Participation Front for Islamic Iran (Hezb-e jebheh-ye
	mosharekat-e Iran-e eslami)
HEM	National Trust Party (Hezb-e e'temad-e melli)
DTV	Office for Strengthening Unity (Daftar-e tahkim-e vahdat)
JME	Islamic Coalition Society (Jam'iyyat-e mo'talafeh-ye eslami)
SQST	Society of Qom Seminary Teachers (Jame 'eh-ye modarresin-
	e howzeh-ye 'elmiyyeh-ye Qom)
<b>PMOI</b>	People's Mojahedin Organisation of Iran (Sazman-e mojahe-
	din-e khalq-e Iran)
<b>PSRC</b>	Presidential Strategic Research Centre
SEF	Council for Cultural Revolution (Setad-e enqelab-e farhangi)
OIPFG	Organisation of the Iranian People's Fada'i Guerrillas
	(Sazman-e cherik-ha-ye fadaʻi-ye khalq-e Iran)
FI	Devotees of Islam (Fada 'iyan-e Islam)

xiii

