Wittgenstein’s “middle period” is often seen as a transitional phase connecting his better-known early and later philosophies. The fifteen essays in this volume focus both on the distinctive character of his teaching and writing in the 1930s, and on its pivotal importance for an understanding of his philosophy as a whole. They offer wide-ranging perspectives on the central issue of how best to identify changes and continuities in his philosophy during those years, as well as on particular topics in the philosophy of mind, religion, ethics, aesthetics, and the philosophy of mathematics. The volume will be valuable for all who are interested in this formative period of Wittgenstein’s development.

DAVID G. STERN is Professor of Philosophy and a Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa. He is the author of Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction (CUP, 2004) and Wittgenstein on Mind and Language (1995), as well as more than 50 journal articles and book chapters. He is also a coeditor of The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein (CUP, 2nd edition, 2018), Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, from the Notes of G. E. Moore (CUP, 2016), and Wittgenstein Reads Weininger (CUP, 2004).
Wittgenstein in the 1930s
Between the *Tractatus* and the *Investigations*

*Edited by*

DAVID G. STERN

*University of Iowa*
Walking with Wittgenstein

My father was equable and mild. Not so
Was Ludwig Wittgenstein. His lean
Body twitched nervously and his musician’s
Hands never ceased from movement, nor his bony
 Ankles and feet. He never would sit still,
 As though the violence of his thoughts made slow
 Deliberate movement quite impossible.
 Yet there were times his nervous face went stony
 And quiet as he brooded on the green
 Meaning of things. His thoughts resembled flowers
 Drawn by a delicate hand. In golden showers
 They flickered silently across his face.
 Anxiety kept to his bodily conditions,
 His knitted brows, his knotted legs. His thoughts had grace.

Walking with Wittgenstein was like a race,
But a race for bobbledehoys, three-legged dwarfs,
Fantastic wizards. Nothing went by halves.
He strode ahead, all joints, his noble face
Swept by the wind, his eyes darting about,
Observant and perceptive as his mind,
And just as nervous, earnest, and devout
In seeking truth, and also just as kind.
But often he saw nothing but the river
Of his own thoughts, the nervously twitching veins
Of fine distinctions, philosophic gains
And losses, victories, defeats.
For, while he loved the people in the streets,
Philosophy alone rushed on forever.

Nicholas Moore, poet and son of G. E. Moore
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Contributors</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Abbreviations</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: Wittgenstein between the <em>Tractatus</em> and the <em>Investigations</em></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G. Stern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part I  Changes and Continuities in Wittgenstein’s Philosophy</strong></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Wittgenstein and Moore on Grammar</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G. Stern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Wittgenstein on Understanding: Language, Calculus, and Practice</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alois Pichler</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Wittgenstein on Sentence-Hypotheses and Certainty</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauro L. Engelmann</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Wittgenstein on Meaning, Use, and Linguistic Commitment</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anna Boncompagni</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Will There Soon Be Skilful Philosophers? Wittgenstein on Himself, His Work, and the State of Civilization in 1930</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wolfgang Kienzler</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Wittgenstein and His Students: 1929–1933</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James C. Klagge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Part II  Philosophy of Mind</strong></td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 From Moore’s Lecture Notes to Wittgenstein’s <em>Blue Book</em>: The Emergence of Wittgenstein’s Performative Conception of the Self</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hans Sluga</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>“Two Kinds of Use of ‘I’”: The Middle Wittgenstein on “I” and the Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Wittgenstein on Rules and the Mental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part III</td>
<td>Religion, Ethics, and Aesthetics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Wittgenstein’s Discussion of “Use of Such a Word as ‘God’”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Wittgenstein on Ethics, May 1933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Wittgenstein on Aesthetic Normativity and Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Wittgenstein’s Remarks on Aesthetics and Their Context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part IV</td>
<td>Philosophy of Mathematics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Moore’s Notes and Wittgenstein’s Philosophy of Mathematics: The Case of Mathematical Induction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Wittgenstein, Goodstein, and the Origin of the Uniqueness Rule for Primitive Recursive Arithmetic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bibliography 272

Index 290
Contributors

Hanne Appelqvist, Docent of Theoretical Philosophy, University of Helsinki, and Fellow of the Turku Institute for Advanced Studies, University of Turku. She is the author of Wittgenstein and the Conditions of Musical Communication (2008) and has published several articles on the Kantian features of Wittgenstein’s thought.


Anna Boncompagni, Chancellor’s ADVANCE Postdoctoral Fellow, University of California, Irvine. She is the author of Wittgenstein and Pragmatism: On Certainty in the Light of Peirce and James (2016) and Wittgenstein: Lo sguardo e il limite (2012).


Mauro L. Engelmann, Professor of Philosophy at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Brazil, and researcher at the National Research Council (CNPq). He is the author of Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Development: Phenomenology, Grammar, Method and the Anthropological View (2013) and a number of articles on Wittgenstein and the history of analytic philosophy.

Warren Goldfarb, W. B. Pearson Professor of Modern Mathematics and Mathematical Logic, Harvard University. He coauthored, with Burton Dreben, The Decision Problem: Solvable Classes of Quantificational Formulas (1979), and coedited, with Solomon
List of Contributors

Feferman et al., Kurt Gödel’s *Collected Works*, vol. III (1995), vols. IV–V (2003), and has published many papers on mathematical logic, the development of analytic philosophy, and on issues in metaphysics and philosophical logic.

Wolfgang Kienzler, teaches philosophy at Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany. He is the author of books (in German) on Wittgenstein’s turn to his late philosophy, 1930–1932 (1997), Wittgenstein’s *Philosophical Investigations* (2007), and a study of the development of Frege’s thought (2009).


Mathieu Marion, Professor of Philosophy, University of Quebec at Montreal. He is the author of two books on Wittgenstein: *Wittgenstein, Finitism, and the Foundations of Mathematics* (1998), and an introduction (in French) to the *Tractatus* (2004), as well as a number of papers on Wittgenstein and the history of analytic philosophy.

Volker A. Munz, Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, University of Klagenfurt, Klagenfurt, Austria. He is the author of *Satz und Sinn* (2005) and coeditor, with Bernhard Ritter, of *Wittgenstein’s Whewell’s Court Lectures, Cambridge 1938–1941* (2017).

Mitsuhiro Okada, Professor of Philosophy, Keio University, Japan. He has published widely on logic in general, and proof theory in particular, as well as on logical philosophy and philosophy of mathematics, epistemology, semantics, and historical studies in logic and philosophy.

Alois Pichler, Professor of Philosophy, and Director of the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen, Norway. He is the author of *Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Investigations: From the Book to the Album* (2004) and coeditor, with Simo Säätelä, of *Wittgenstein: The Philosopher and His Works* (2005).

Duncan Richter, Professor of Philosophy, Charles S. Luck III ’55 Institute Professor, Virginia Military Institute. He is the author of five
List of Contributors

books; the most recent are the second edition of a Historical Dictionary of Wittgenstein’s Philosophy (2014) and Anscombe’s Moral Philosophy (2011).

Joachim Schulte, recently retired from teaching at University of Zurich, Switzerland. His publications include numerous articles and four books on Wittgenstein as well as critical editions of his main works; with P. M. S. Hacker, he edited and translated the revised fourth edition of Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Investigations (2009).


David G. Stern, Professor of Philosophy and a Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa. He is the coeditor, with Brian Rogers and Gabriel Citron, of Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, From the Notes of G. E. Moore (2016) and the author of Wittgenstein on Mind and Language (1995) and Wittgenstein’s Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction (2004).
Abbreviations

AWL Wittgenstein’s Lectures, Cambridge 1932–1935, edited by A. Ambrose
BLBK The Blue Book
BRBK The Brown Book
BT The Big Typescript
CPJ Kant, Critique of the Power of Judgment
CPR Kant, Critique of Pure Reason
CV¹ Culture and Value
LC Lectures and Conversations on Aesthetics, Psychology and Religious Belief
LE “A Lecture on Ethics” (In PO)
LFM Wittgenstein’s Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, Cambridge 1939
LWL Wittgenstein’s Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1932, edited by D. Lee
M Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, From the Notes of G. E. Moore
MS Manuscript in Wittgenstein’s Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition
Ms- Manuscript in Wittgenstein Source Bergen Nachlass Edition
MWL Moore, G. E. “Wittgenstein’s Lectures in 1930–33” (In PO)
NB Notebooks 1914–1916
OC On Certainty
PG Philosophical Grammar
PI Philosophical Investigations
PO Philosophical Occasions
PPO Ludwig Wittgenstein: Public and Private Occasions

¹ References to Culture and Value are cited from both the 1980 English translation edition and the 1998 revised second edition; e.g., the 1930 “Sketch for a Foreword” is cited as CV, 1980: 6–8; 1998: 8–11.
List of Abbreviations

PR  Philosophical Remarks
RFM  Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics
RLF  “Some Remarks on Logical Form” (In PO)
RPPII  Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology, vol. II
TLP  Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus
TS  Typescript in Wittgenstein’s Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition
Ts-  Typescript in Wittgenstein Source Bergen Nachlass Edition
VW  The Voices of Wittgenstein. The Vienna Circle
WC  Wittgenstein in Cambridge: Letters and Documents 1911–1951
Wi3  Wiener Ausgabe Band 3 [MSS 109–110]
Wi4  Wiener Ausgabe Band 4 [MSS 111–112]
Wi5  Wiener Ausgabe Band 5 [MSS 113–114]
WWCL  Wittgenstein’s Whewell’s Court Lectures, Cambridge 1938–1941
WWK  Waismann, Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle
Z  Zettel