

The Politics of the Past in Early China

Why did the past matter so greatly in ancient China? How did it matter and to whom? This is an innovative study of how the past was implicated in the long transition of power in early China, as embodied by the decline of the late Bronze Age aristocracy and the rise of empires over the first millennium BCE. Engaging with a wide array of historical materials, including inscriptional records, excavated manuscripts, and transmitted texts, Vincent S. Leung moves beyond the historiographical canon and explores how the past was mobilized as powerful ideological capital in diverse political debate and ethical dialogue. Appeals to the past in early China were more than a matter of cultural attitude, Leung argues, but were rather deliberate ways of articulating political thought and challenging ethical debates during periods of crisis. Significant power lies in the retelling of the past.

VINCENT S. LEUNG is Associate Professor of Chinese History at Lingnan University, Hong Kong.





The Politics of the Past in Early China

VINCENT S. LEUNG Lingnan University, Hong Kong





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108425728

DOI: 10.1017/9781108348843

© Vincent S. Leung 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Leung, Vincent S., 1976- author.

Title: The politics of the past in early China / Vincent S. Leung.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge

University Press, 2019. | Revision of author's thesis (doctoral) - Harvard

University 2011. | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019001275 | ĪSBN 9781108425728

Subjects: LCSH: Historiography - China - History.

Classification: LCC DS734.7 .L4228 2019 | DDC 931-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019001275

ISBN 978-1-108-42572-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To W. K. Leung, S. Y. Sin, and W. H. Leung





Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
	Introduction	1
	Beyond Didacticism: Methods and Perspectives	3
	Organization and Terminology	17
1	Time out of Joint: Uses of the Past from the Western Zhou	
	to the Early Warring States	20
	Western Zhou: Moments of Origins, Exemplary Acts,	
	and the Genealogical Past	24
	The Analects: Past Cultural Practices, Moral Interiority,	
	and the Deliberative Self	40
	The Mozi: The Origin of Disorder and the Problem with the	
	Deliberative Self	53
	Conclusion	71
2	A Parenthetical Past: Deep History and Anti-history	
	in the Late Warring States	75
	Guodian Laozi: Cosmogony, Deep History, and a Feminine	
	Genealogical History	79
	The Mengzi: Bioethics, Moral Potentiality, and the Antihistorical	
	Imagination	92
	Conclusion	100
3	Specter of the Past: Bureaucratic Amnesia under the Rise	
	of the Qin Empire	102
	Preamble: Bibliocaust, or Empire and Time	104
	The Legalist Premise of a Discontinuous Past	109
	Legalists and Their Trouble with History	113
	The Qin Resolution: Bureaucratic Amnesia and the End of Histor	ry 121
	Conclusion	128

vii



viii		Contents
4	The Rehabilitation of Antiquity in the Early Han Empire	130
	Jia Yi's <i>Xinshu</i> : Historicizing the End of History	132
	Lu Jia's Xinyu: A Classical Encapsulation of the Past	139
	Conclusion	150
5	Sima Qian's Critical Past	153
	"Huozhi Liezhuan": Natural Economy and the Futility of Governance "Bingarhun Shu": Imperial Expansion Magical Currencies	155
	"Pingzhun Shu": Imperial Expansion, Magical Currencies, and Original Disorder	164
	Violence, Civilization, and Critical History	174
	Epilogue	177
Bibliography		181
	Primary Sources	181
	Secondary Scholarship	182
Index		198



Acknowledgments

It is a pleasure to finally write this ledger of many debts. It is about time. The creation of this book has been a long, exhilarating journey, and it would not have been possible without the generosity of many institutions, teachers, colleagues, and friends. First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my teachers at Harvard. It was under their exemplary intellectual guidance that this project first took shape as my dissertation. I am indebted, most of all, to the tremendous mentorship of Michael Puett. Between the many seminars and countless conversations, he illuminated for me the exciting world of early China. His critically adventurous scholarship was a great source of inspiration for me as I embarked on my own journey in the bygone world of early China. Peter Bol's questions were always incisive and probing, and the book would have been much poorer if not for his sharp critique. I am also greatly indebted to Li Wai-vee's inspiring instruction over the years; it was in her seminars that I learned how to read once again, this time not as a mere spectator of words but as an interlocutor of texts.

Harvard had been a most hospitable intellectual home for me for more than a decade, and as a graduate student, one can hardly hope for a more supportive research environment than the one at the East Asian Languages and Civilizations Department. I am grateful for the years of intellectual nourishment as well as the predoctoral financial support that allowed me to carve out a viable existence as a reader of old texts. I would also like to thank the Fairbank Center for the Graduate Student Associate Fellowships in my last two years at the university; they provided much-needed financial support that allowed me to complete the dissertation which formed the basis of this book.

In the years since I left Cambridge, I have been very fortunate to have received research support from the University of Pittsburgh, New York University, and Lingnan University. The History Department at the University of Pittsburgh provided a convivial space for continuing this

ix



Acknowledgments

X

project in those heady first years out of graduate school. I am also grateful to the university's Asian Studies Center and Humanities Center for their research support and funds that allowed me to advance the manuscript significantly. My year-long stay as a visiting scholar at New York University's Institute for the Study of the Ancient World (ISAW) was simply fantastic; I am grateful for the opportunity to work out key issues of the manuscript there in dialogues with its pre-eminent cohort of scholars of antiquity. In the home stretch of this very long process, I am grateful for the research support of the History Department of Lingnan University; the teaching relief, in particular, gave me a chance to finally whip this unruly morass of words into a somewhat legible thing.

One summer back in the late 1990s, I came across Burton Watson's Ssu-Ma Ch'ien: Grand Historian of China in a library in Boston. Intrigued by what I had read, I then picked up – and devoured – the Grand Archivist's The Letter to Ren An. In my own autobiographical musings, that is the moment when I decided that I must learn everything about the world in which such a remarkable thing – The Letter to Ren An – could have been made. What I did not anticipate at the time was that this one chance encounter would lead to many more in the years ahead; it set me on a path filled with many marvelous friends and colleagues. All of you have not only shaped my thinking in relation to this book, directly or indirectly; your cheerful smiles and good humors have also sustained me in this quixotic quest of a career in academia. From the beginning, on and around Divinity Avenue, I learned a great deal from the brilliant cohort at Harvard; there are simply too many to name here, but I must specifically thank Michael Ing, Maria Sibau, Jeffrey Moser, Rod Campbell, and Hong Yue for their terrific friendship all these years. Allison Miller, Chris Foster, Du Heng, and Billy French, too – you were a most magnificent, delightful early China cohort. During my brief but immensely rewarding time in New York City, I thank Lillian Tseng and Guo Jue for their generous feedback and support for my work. Conversations with friends and colleagues at ISAW, over a great many meals and pints, have much broadened my understanding of the ancient world; I thank Elizabeth Murphy, Perrine Pilette, Ethan Harkness, Adam Schwartz, Jan Bemmann, Nicholas Reid, Jonathan Skaff, and David Ratzan for their friendship. I also appreciate the opportunities to have collaborated on various early China projects with Paul R. Goldin, Charles Sanft, Garret



Acknowledgments

xi

P. S. Olberding, and Leslie Wallace; I am grateful for your fellowship in the field, and your scholarship has inspired me in a great many ways.

During my time at Pittsburgh, I had the incredible good fortune to be able to call Evelyn Rawski and Katheryn Linduff my colleagues. I also thank the Asian studies cohort there – Katherine Cartliz, Nicole Constable, Tom Rawski, James Cook, and the late Linda Penkower – for their tremendous collegiality and support. I am also grateful to Hsu Cho-yun for his valuable feedback on the manuscript at an early stage of the process. The junior cohort at Pittsburgh were simply marvelous; I thank these wonderful human beings for creating such a joyous, supportive environment: Molly Warsh, Pernille Røge, Mari Webel, Benno Weiner, David Luesink, Mina Rajagopalan, John Stoner, Dan Asen, Katja Wezel, Jamie Miller, Raja Adal, James Pickett, Patryk Reid, Loukas Barton, Bruce Venarde, and Gregor Thum. I am also grateful to William G. Liu for his support this past year at Lingnan as this project nears completion.

I must also express my gratitude to my teachers at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst, who set me on a path that ultimately led to the publication of this book. Shen Zhongwei was an exemplary teacher and adviser, and without his inspiring model I would never have had the courage to embark on this academic pursuit. In Doris Bargen's marvelous classes on Japanese literature, I learned how to revel in literary splendor for the first time. I am also grateful to Alvin Cohen; his classes on classical Chinese instilled in me a rigor and meticulousness in parsing the language of early Chinese texts that allowed me to confidently confront, for the first time, the richness and elegance of this dead language.

Different parts of this book were presented at various universities, workshops, and conferences over the years, including the University of Virginia's East Asia Center, Columbia University's Early China Seminar, the University of Oregon's East Asian Languages and Literatures Department, Yale University's East Asian Languages and Literatures Department, Bucknell University's China Institute, Academia Sinica's Institute of Chinese Literature and Philosophy, the University of Hong Kong's Institute for the Humanities and Social Sciences, Hong Kong Baptist University's Jao Tsung-I Academy of Sinology, the Association of Asian Studies Annual Conference (San Diego, 2013), the Inaugural Association of Asian Studies in Asia Annual Conference (National University of Singapore, 2015), and of



xii

Acknowledgments

course, the Institute for the Study of the Ancient World and the University of Pittsburgh's Asian Studies Center, Humanities Center, and History Department. I am grateful for the audiences' engagement and lively responses at these various venues; your comments and criticisms have shaped the arguments of the book in many different, important ways.

Librarians at the Harvard-Yenching Library, the Hillman Library at the University of Pittsburgh, the Institute for the Study of the Ancient World, and the Fong Sum Wood Library at Lingnan University were indispensable to the research for this book. I thank them for their extraordinarily able assistance over the years. I would like to express my gratitude in particular to Zhang Haihui, Head of the East Asian Library at the University of Pittsburgh, for her tireless efforts in getting all the materials I needed during my years at Pittsburgh.

I would also like to thank my editor Lucy Rhymer for shepherding this project so expertly, with such enthusiastic support, from the very beginning. I am also grateful to the anonymous readers at both Cambridge University Press and Harvard University Press for going through the manuscript with such care and patience. I am much obliged to them for their thoughtful and sharp criticisms, which helped me vastly improve the arguments in this book. The faults and shortcomings that remain, needless to say, are entirely my own.

Finally, I would like to express my deep gratitude to my family. Without the steadfast support and good cheer of my parents and my sister, none of this would have been possible or even mattered at all. It is to them that this book is dedicated.