

THE CHALLENGE OF INTER-LEGALITY

The sovereignty of states to enact and enforce laws within their jurisdictions has been recognized since the Treaty of Westphalia in 1648. There are now, however, accepted global legal norms that transcend national sovereignty and hold states accountable for not including these in their domestic legal regimes. This volume is the first book-length treatment to describe and explain how legal orders can be interwoven and what to do about it. Coining the term "inter-legality," this volume provides essays on the history of inter-legality, the primary areas of inter-legality, the concept of jurisdiction, and the normative developments prompted by inter-legality. Bringing together a wide range of contributors who stem from a variety of different academic backgrounds, this book aims to answer three questions: Does inter-legality occur with some regularity? How does it affect traditional legal concepts such as "jurisdiction," "legal order," or "responsibility?" And what are the normative implications?

JAN KLABBERS is Professor of International Law at the University of Helsinki, Finland.

GIANLUIGI PALOMBELLA is Professor of Law and Applied Legal Theory at the Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa.



ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory

Series Editors

Mark Agrast, ASIL Mortimer Sellers, University of Baltimore

Editorial Board

Samantha Besson, Université de Fribourg
Allen Buchanan, Duke University
David Kennedy, Harvard University
Jan Klabbers, University of Helsinki
David Luban, Georgetown University
Larry May, Vanderbilt University
Mary Ellen O'Connell, University of Notre Dame
Onuma Yasuaki, Meiji University
Helen Stacy, Stanford University
John Tasioulas, University College London
Fernando Tesón, Florida State University

The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law.

This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Books in the Series

The Challenge of Inter-legality Edited by Jan Klabbers and Gianluigi Palombella The Nature of International Law Miodrag A. Jovanović

Reexamining Customary International Law Edited by Brian D. Lepard

Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights Edited by Jens David Ohlin

Human Rights in Emergencies Edited by Evan J. Criddle

The Theory of Self-Determination Edited by Fernando R. Tesón

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: Global and Local Legal Pluralism Edited by Michael A. Helfand

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance Edited by Jan Klabbers and Touko Piipaerinen



> Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice Edited by Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg The Future of International Law: Global Government Joel P. Trachtman

> Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law Edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes

Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law Edited by Mortimer Sellers

Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects Edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

The Role of Ethics in International Law Edited by Donald Earl Childress III

The New Global Law Rafael Domingo

Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications Brian D. Lepard

International Criminal Law and Philosophy Edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins





The Challenge of Inter-Legality

Edited by

JAN KLABBERS

University of Helsinki

GIANLUIGI PALOMBELLA

Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108425476 DOI: 10.1017/9781108609654

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Klabbers, Jan, editor. | Palombella, Gianluigi, editor.

TITLE: The challenge of inter-legality / edited by Jan Klabbers, University of Helsinki; Gianluigi Palombella, Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: ASILstudies in international legal theory | "The general idea underlying this volume has been presented at workshops and dedicated seminars in various places, including the University of Edinburgh, Erasmus Law School Rotterdam, the European University Institute in Fiesole, the University of Milan Bicocca, and the 2017 annual meeting of the International Society of Public Law at the University of Copenhagen." –ECIP preface. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018060515 | ISBN 9781108425476 (hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Conflict of laws-Congresses. | BISAC: LAW / International.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K7041 .C422 2019 | DDC 340.9–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018060515

ISBN 978-1-108-42547-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Pref	face	раде ix
List of Contributors		xi
1	Introduction: Situating Inter-Legality Jan Klabbers and Gianluigi Palombella	1
PART I OPENING THE FIELD		21
2	"Formats" of Law and Their Intertwining Gianluigi Palombella	23
3	Summum Ius, Summa Iniuria: Critical Reflections on Issues of Responsibility, the Legal Form, Inter-Legality, and the Limits of Law Friedrich Kratochwil	42
4	Between or Beyond Legal Orders: Questioning the Concept of Legal Order Sanne Taekema	69
PART II REALITIES AND INTER-LEGALITY QUESTIONS		89
5	Why and What (State) Jurisdiction: Legal Plurality, Individual Equality and Territorial Legitimacy Samantha Besson	91
6	Inter-Legality – Citizenship – Inter-Citizenship Dimitry Kochenov	133



viii Contents

7	Trade and Inter-Legality Antonello Tancredi	158
8	Inter-Legality and the Protection of Marine Ecosystems Laura Pineschi	188
9	Managing Inter-Legality: Conceptualizing the European Union's Interactions with International Investment Law Panos Koutrakos	206
10	The Perils of Complacency: The European Human Rights Backlash András Sajó and Sergio Giuliano	230
11	Inter-Legality and Criminal Law Alberto di Martino	250
PART III SHAPING INTER-LEGALITY		269
12	Shaping Inter-Legality: The Role of Administrative Law Techniques and Their Implications Edoardo Chiti	271
13	Global Law As Inter-Contextuality and As Inter-Legality Poul F. Kjaer	302
14	International Courts As Inter-Legality Hubs Yuval Shany	319
15	Judging Inter-Legality Jan Klabbers	339
16	Theory, Realities, and Promises of Inter-Legality: A Manifesto Gianluigi Palombella	363
Bib	liography	391
Inde	Index	



Preface

The general idea underlying this volume has been presented at workshops and dedicated seminars in various places, including the University of Edinburgh, the Erasmus School of Law in Rotterdam, the European University Institute in Fiesole, the University of Milano-Bicocca, and the 2017 annual meeting of the International Society of Public Law at the University of Copenhagen. The editors are indebted to participants and commentators on those occasions, including Cormac Mac Amhlaigh, Maurizio Arcari, Nehal Bhuta, Mikael Rask Madsen, Dimitri van den Meerssche, Claudio Michelon, Hans Micklitz, Stefania Ninatti, the late Wibo van Rossum, Sanne Taekema, Rodrigo Vallejo, Neil Walker, and Tleuzhan Zhunussova. An authors' meeting was organized at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna in Pisa, where useful non-authorial comments were received from Lorenzo Gasbarri, Christian Joerges, Tuomas Tiittala, Orlando Scarcello, and Maria Varaki. The meeting was supported by the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna and the Academy of Finland; the editors are grateful to both, as well as to Mortimer Sellers and John Berger for publishing this volume in the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series. The editors are also grateful to the contributors to this volume for their endorsement of inter-legality as a subject of advanced research and not least for their patient cooperation in preparing and finalizing this book.





Contributors

Samantha Besson

University of Fribourg

Edoardo Chiti

University of La Tuscia, Viterbo

Sergio Giuliano

Unaffiliated

Poul F. Kjaer

Copenhagen Business School

Jan Klabbers

University of Helsinki

Dimitry Kochenov

University of Groningen

Panos Koutrakos

City, University of London

Friedrich Kratochwil

European University Institute, Fiesole

Alberto di Martino

Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa

Gianluigi Palombella

Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa

Laura Pineschi

University of Parma



xii Contributors

András Sajó

Central European University, Budapest

Yuval Shany

Hebrew University, Jerusalem

Sanne Taekema

Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam

Antonello Tancredi

University Côte d'Azur Nice/University of Palermo