Feedback in Second Language Writing

Now in its second edition, this volume provides an up-to-date, accessible, yet authoritative introduction to feedback on second-language writing for upper-undergraduate and postgraduate students, teachers, and researchers in TESOL, applied linguistics, composition studies, and EAP. Chapters written by leading experts emphasize the potential that feedback has for helping to create a supportive teaching environment, for conveying and modeling ideas about good writing, for developing the ways students talk about writing, and for mediating the relationship between students’ wider cultural and social worlds and their growing familiarity with new literacy practices. In addition to updated chapters from the first edition, this edition includes new chapters that focus on new and developing areas of feedback research including student engagement and participation with feedback, the links between second language acquisition and feedback research, automated computer feedback, and the use by students of internet resources and social media as feedback resources.

Ken Hyland is Professor of Applied Linguistics in Education at the University of East Anglia. His primary research area is written discourse analysis, particularly in academic context. He has written and edited over twenty-five books, including Second Language Writing (Cambridge University Press, 2003) and Disciplinary Identities (Cambridge University Press, 2012).

Fiona Hyland was Associate Professor in the Faculty of Education at the University of Hong Kong until her retirement in 2015. She has more than thirty-five years of experience teaching and researching applied linguistics and teacher education in a variety of international contexts.
Feedback in Second Language Writing
Contexts and Issues
Second Edition

Edited by
Ken Hyland
University of Hong Kong
Fiona Hyland
University of Hong Kong
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108425070
DOI: 10.1017/9781108635547

© Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland 2019
This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.
First published 2019
Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Title: Feedback in second language writing : contexts and issues / edited by
Ken Hyland, Fiona Hyland.
Description: Second edition. | Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University
bibliographical references and indexes.
Identifiers: LCCN 2018045177 | ISBN 9781108425070 (hardcover) | ISBN 9781108439978 (softcover)
Subjects: LCSH: Language and languages—Study and teaching (高等教育) | Rhetoric—Study and teaching (Higher) | Second language acquisition.
Classification: LCC P53.27 .F44 2019 | DDC 418.0071/1-dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018045177


Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.
Contents

Contributor Bios vii
Acknowledgments xi
Author’s Preface xiii
Series Editors’ Preface xv

INTRODUCTION
1 Contexts and Issues in Feedback on L2 Writing 1
Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland

SECTION 1 SITUATING FEEDBACK: SOCIOCULTURAL DIMENSIONS 23
2 Sociocultural Theory: A Framework for Understanding the Socio-Cognitive Dimensions of Peer Feedback 25
Olga S. Villamil and María C. M. Guerrero
3 Culture and Peer Feedback 45
Guangwei Hu
4 Appropriation, Ownership, and Agency: Negotiating Teacher Feedback in Academic Settings 64
Christine M. Tardy

SECTION 2 SHAPING FEEDBACK: DELIVERY AND FOCUS DIMENSIONS 83
5 The Intersection between SLA and Feedback Research 85
John Bitchener
6 Does Error Feedback Help L2 Writers? Latest Evidence on the Efficacy of Written Corrective Feedback 106
Dana Ferris and Kendon Kurzer
Contents

7 Automated Feedback and Second Language Writing 125
   Marie Stevenson and Aek Phakiti

8 Collaborative Writing as Peer Feedback 143
   Neomy Storch

SECTION 3 NEGOTIATING FEEDBACK: INTERPERSONAL AND
   INTERACTIONAL DIMENSIONS 163

9 Interpersonality and Teacher-Written Feedback 165
   Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland

10 Fostering Formative Online Forums: Feedback, Dialogue
   and Disciplinarity 184
   Ann Hewings and Caroline Coffin

11 Supervisory Feedback: Building Writing Scaffolds with
   Doctoral Students 206
   Sue Starfield

12 Reviewers’ Feedback on Second-Language Writers’
   Submissions to Academic Journals 226
   Brian Paltridge

SECTION 4 ENGAGING WITH FEEDBACK: STUDENT
   PARTICIPATION DIMENSIONS 245

13 Learner Engagement with Written Feedback:
   A Sociocognitive Perspective 247
   Ye Han and Fiona Hyland

14 What Messages do Students Take from Teacher Feedback? 265
   Ken Hyland

15 Students Initiating Feedback: The Potential
   of Social Media 285
   Soobin Yim and Mark Warschauer

Index 305
Contributor Bios

John Bitchener is Professor of Applied Linguistics at AUT University, New Zealand. He has supervised, researched, and published widely in international journals and in edited books on written corrective feedback for L2 development and on advice and feedback to L2 doctoral students. He is the author of six books in these areas.

Caroline Coffin retired from her position as Professor in English Language and Applied Linguistics at The Open University, UK in 2015. Since the early 1990s she has been using systemic functional linguistics to investigate the role of language in learning in a range of contexts including through computer-mediated dialog.

Dana Ferris is Professor and Director in the University Writing Program at the University of California, Davis. Her research has focused extensively on response to student writing. She was the founding editor-in-chief of the Journal of Response to Writing and is the co-editor of the Journal of Second Language Writing.

Maria C. M. Guerrero is retired Professor from Inter American University of Puerto Rico, Metropolitan Campus, where she taught ESL and TESL courses and conducted research on L2 learning. She has published numerous journal articles, chapters, and the book Inner Speech – L2: Thinking Words in a Second Language.

Ye Han is Assistant Professor in the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at Harbin Institute of Technology (Shenzhen). She has a PhD in English Language Education from the University of Hong Kong. Her research interests include written feedback, writing conferences, and individual differences in L2 writing.

Ann Hewings is Director for Applied Linguistics and English Language at The Open University, UK. She has taught English language in a variety of countries around the world. Much of her research and teaching has focused on aspects of disciplinarity in higher education.

Guangwei Hu is Professor of Language and Literacy Education in the Department of English, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University. His
research interests include academic discourse, academic literacy, bilingual education, and second-language writing. He has published extensively on these topics in major international journals and edited volumes.

**Fiona Hyland** previously worked in the Faculty of Education at the University of Hong Kong and has more than thirty-five years’ experience teaching and researching in applied linguistics and teacher education in numerous international contexts. She has published widely on the subject of feedback and second-language writing.

**Ken Hyland** is Professor of Applied Linguistics in Education at the University of East Anglia. He has published over 240 articles and 27 books on academic discourse and EAP, with over 36,000 citations on Google Scholar. A collection of his work was recently published as *The Essential Hyland* (2018).

**Kendon Kurzer** is currently Lecturer in the University Writing Program at the University of California, Davis. His primary research interests include the intersection of Writing across the Curriculum and L2 writing and written corrective feedback. He has published in the *TESOL Quarterly, Assessing Writing*, and *Foreign Language Annals*.

**Brian Paltridge** is Professor of TESOL at the University of Sydney. His most recent publications are *The Discourse of Peer Review* (2017), *Writing for Research Purposes* (2018) and, with Sue Starfield, *Thesis and Dissertation Writing in a Second Language* (new edition, 2019).

**Aek Phakiti** is Associate Professor in TESOL and Postgraduate Coursework Coordinator at the Sydney School of Education and Social Work at the University of Sydney. Aek is author and editor of numerous books in applied linguistics and his research has been published in numerous peer-reviewed journals.

**Sue Starfield** is Professor in the School of Education at the University of New South Wales. Her recent publications include *Ethnographic Perspectives on Academic Writing* (with Brian Paltridge and Christine Tardy, 2016) and *Getting Published in Academic Journals* (with Brian Paltridge, 2016).

**Marie Stevenson** is Senior Lecturer in Language Teaching and Learning and Coordinator of the Master’s in TESOL program at the Sydney
School of Education and Social Work, University of Sydney. Her research areas include second-language and writing processes, academic literacy, digital literacy, and discourse analysis. She has published in numerous peer-reviewed journals.

Neomy Storch is Associate Professor in ESL and Applied Linguistics at the School of Languages and Linguistics, the University of Melbourne. Her research focuses predominantly on topics related to L2 writing, including collaborative writing, corrective feedback, and assessing writing development. She has published and presented extensively on these topics.

Christine M. Tardy is Professor of English Applied Linguistics at the University of Arizona, where she teaches undergraduate and graduate courses in TESOL, applied linguistics, and writing studies. She has published widely in the areas of genre theory and pedagogy, English for academic purposes, and second-language writing.

Olga S. Villamil is retired Professor from Inter American University of Puerto Rico. She has specialized in teaching undergraduate and graduate courses in ESL, L2 writing, and language acquisition. Her research on peer revision and metaphor analysis has been published in major journals and edited volumes on language teaching and learning.

Mark Warschauer is Professor of Education at the University of California, Irvine, where he directs both the Digital Learning Lab and the Teaching and Learning Research Center. His research focuses on diverse students’ learning processes and outcomes with digital media, including in collaborative cloud-based writing.

Soobin Yim is Postdoctoral Fellow at the School of Education at the University of California, Irvine, where she earned her PhD degree in Language, Literacy, and Technology. Her research focuses on Computer Assisted Language Learning (CALL), digital literacy development, second-language writing, and English for Specific Purposes (ESP).
Acknowledgments

We want to thank our authors for their professionalism, their impeccable attention to deadlines, and their enthusiastic commitment to this project. We have enjoyed working with them and learned a lot from their insights into feedback and second-language writing.
Author’s Preface

The first edition of this volume, published in 2006, filled an important gap in the literature on feedback, the provision of which has come to be recognized as one of the ESL writing teacher’s most important tasks. This second edition is a response to the considerable changes that have occurred in feedback research since then. So, while retaining updated versions of some of the chapters from the first edition, it includes ten new chapters as well as a new section on student engagement with feedback. In this edition, readers will find chapters that consider the links between written corrective feedback and second language acquisition, chapters that focus on the collaborative and interactive aspects of feedback, and chapters that consider how teachers and learners can best harness the potential of technology in the provision and facilitation of feedback. As in the first edition, the chapters emphasize the potential feedback has for helping to create a supportive teaching environment, for conveying and modeling ideas about good writing, for developing the ways students talk about writing, and for mediating the relationship between students’ wider cultural and social worlds and their growing familiarity with new literacy practices.

Despite the major part feedback plays in modern writing classrooms and in the lives of all teachers and learners, we still believe that much of the research published in journals fails to find its way to teachers. We have asked contributors of the volume to try to address these gaps by providing readers with a clear synthesis of theory and practice, highlighting what is conceptually and pedagogically significant, and offering a state-of-the-art picture of the key issues in feedback today. We therefore attempt to bring together theoretical understanding and practical applications of feedback for teachers, researchers, and others working in the fields of second-language teaching and literacy studies.

We do this by focusing on what we see as the four key dimensions of feedback. The first situates feedback in the wider institutional, social, political and cultural context and considers factors that participants bring to the writing class that have been found to influence feedback. The second looks more closely at the “how” and “so what” of feedback: the ways it is shaped through its modes of delivery and its potential impact on learning and writing. The third is concerned with the negotiation of feedback in the relationships between providers and
receivers, addressing issues that arise in the social interactions around feedback itself. The fourth reflects recent moves in feedback research toward greater interest in how students understand feedback and the ways they engage with it. These different dimensions are not meant to imply divisions between context, delivery, interaction, and engagement, as it is evident that every act of feedback will involve a complex interaction among them. They do, however, allow the authors to focus on one or other feature of the process to highlight salient aspects of feedback and what it means for participants.

Another important feature of the book is that it takes a broad view of feedback on writing. In the following chapters, distinguished figures in the field of second-language writing: explore different modes, such as oral, written, computer-modeled, and electronically mediated feedback; examine commentary given on form, organization, academic conventions, and meaning; review the immediate and longer-term impact of feedback on learning and writing; study the preferences students have for different kinds of interaction and commentary; and discover the kinds of comments that are given and the issues that teachers consider when framing them. Yet, despite the enormous growth of feedback research in research years and the increasing diversity of its focus, many unanswered questions remain. Our aim here is to show that there is a vast array of potential questions that are there to be explored.

Finally, we have tried to make the volume as useful to teachers and researchers as possible. Rather than dwell on the abstract benefits of various feedback practices, the authors in this book take care to link research with practice, highlighting what the research tells us about feedback and exploring its relevance for the classroom. The volume goes a long way toward answering questions that researchers and teachers have been asking for some time. These questions include: “What shall I give feedback on?,” “How shall I express it?,” “What mode should I use?,” “How will this affect my relationship to this student?,” and “Will this make a difference to students’ writing?.” Thus, each chapter gives teachers and researchers a clear, complete, and current perspective on different issues on which to base their classroom practice or research into this fascinating and fundamental area.
Second-language students receive feedback on their written language whenever someone makes a comment expressing a judgement of the text. The source of the feedback can be a teacher, other students, or software programmed to automatically analyze or evaluate electronic texts. Constructive feedback intended to raise writers’ awareness of their language, improve their texts, and help them to learn to use the language effectively has remained a core component of the second-language writing classroom for many years. From a cognitive perspective, one might expect that the types and timing of effective feedback would have been identified long ago through laboratory studies. However, such research seems to have little to offer to the field’s understanding of the dynamics of feedback associated with language classrooms. To learn about the dynamics of feedback, Ken Hyland and Fiona Hyland have compiled a revealing collection of studies investigating a range of feedback practices in instructional contexts. The studies share the definition of feedback as a constructive judgement of text that reflects concern for students’ future writing and development of their writing processes. In this sense, all feedback shares a functional purpose. Instances of feedback differ in many other ways including the ways in which writers respond to them.

The editors help readers to discover these differences with a collection of studies examining actual feedback practices. The authors have investigated questions about the effects of a variety of feedback from teachers, peers, and computers, provided in a range of learning contexts, and targeting various different aspects of writing. Insights emerge through analysis of the feedback in view of the sociocultural contexts for learning, the delivery mode for the feedback, the interactions between the learner and the source of the feedback, and the learners’ response to the feedback. Each of these perspectives on feedback is carefully observed and richly interpreted through appropriate theoretical lenses. The resulting studies bring readers up-to-date on the complex issue of feedback in second-language learning as it occurs across the many different contexts where learning takes place today. We are very pleased to have this second edition of *Feedback in Second-Language Writing: Contexts and Issues* in the Cambridge Applied Linguistics Series.