PERSECUTION & TOLERATION

The Long Road to Religious Freedom

Religious freedom has become an emblematic value in the West. Embedded in constitutions and championed by politicians and thinkers across the political spectrum, it is to many an absolute value, something beyond question. Yet how it emerged, and why, remains widely misunderstood. Tracing the history of religious persecution from the Fall of Rome to the present-day, Noel Johnson and Mark Koyama provide a novel explanation of the birth of religious liberty. This book treats the subject in an integrative way by combining economic reasoning with historical evidence from medieval and early modern Europe. The authors elucidate the economic and political incentives that shaped the actions of political leaders during periods of state building and economic growth.

Noel D. Johnson is Associate Professor of Economics at George Mason University and a Senior Research Fellow at the Mercatus Center.

Mark Koyama is Associate Professor of Economics at George Mason University and a Senior Scholar at the Mercatus Center. He was a 2017–2018 National Fellow at Stanford University’s Hoover Institution.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN ECONOMICS, CHOICE, AND SOCIETY

Founding Editors
Timur Kuran, Duke University
Peter J. Boettke, George Mason University

This interdisciplinary series promotes original theoretical and empirical research as well as integrative syntheses involving links between individual choice, institutions, and social outcomes. Contributions are welcome from across the social sciences, particularly in the areas where economic analysis is joined with other disciplines such as comparative political economy, new institutional economics, and behavioral economics.

Books in the Series:

TERRY L. ANDERSON and GARY D. LIBECAP
Environmental Markets: A Property Rights Approach

MORRIS B. HOFFMAN
The Punisher’s Brain: The Evolution of Judge and Jury

PETER T. LEESON
Anarchy Unbound: Why Self-Governance Works Better Than You Think

BENJAMIN POWELL
Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy

CASS R. SUNSTEIN
The Ethics of Influence: Government in the Age of Behavioral Science

JARED RUBIN
Rulers, Religion, and Riches: Why the West Got Rich and the Middle East Did Not

JEAN-PHILIPPE PLATTEAU
Islam Instrumentalized: Religion and Politics in Historical Perspective

TAIZU ZHANG
The Laws and Economics of Confucianism: Kinship and Property in Preindustrial China and England

ROGER KOPPL
Expert Failure

MICHAEL C. MUNGER
Tomorrow 3.0: Transaction Costs and the Sharing Economy

CAROLYN M. WARNER, RAMAZAN KILINÇ, CHRISTOPHER W. HALE and ADAM B. COHEN
Generating Generosity in Catholicism and Islam: Beliefs, Institutions, and Public Goods Provision

RANDALL G. HOLCOMBE
Political Capitalism: How Political Influence is Made and Maintained

VERNON L. SMITH AND BART J. WILSON
Humanomics: Moral Sentiments and the Wealth of Nations for the Twenty-First Century

PAUL DRAGOS ALIGICA
Public Entrepreneurship, Citizenship, and Self-Governance
Persecution & Toleration

*The Long Road to Religious Freedom*

**NOEL D. JOHNSON**
George Mason University, Virginia

**MARK KOYAMA**
George Mason University, Virginia
Contents

List of Figures page viii
List of Tables x
Preface xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1 Tolerance, Persecution, and State Capacity 1
  1.1 Introduction 1
  1.2 The Rise of Modern States and the Birth of Religious Liberty 12
  1.3 A Conceptual Framework 15

I CONDITIONAL TOLERATION 23

2 Religion and the State in the Premodern World 25
  2.1 Religious Legitimacy and the State 25
  2.2 A Simple Model of Church and State 31
  2.3 Applying the Model: The Medieval Equilibrium 39
  2.4 The Absence of Persecution Does Not Imply Religious Freedom 45
  2.5 Chapter Summary 47

3 Why Do States Persecute? 52
  3.1 The Commercial Revolution, Religion, and Identity Rules 53
  3.2 Rise of the Medieval State and the Persecuting Society 57
  3.3 Chapter Summary: Persecutions and the Rise of States in Medieval Europe 69

4 Jewish Communities, Conditional Tolerance, and Rent-Seeking 73
  4.1 Rent-Seeking and Conditional Tolerance 74
  4.2 Jewish Moneylending 80
  4.3 The Path to Expulsion in England 82
  4.4 Chapter Summary and the Road to Expulsion in France 86
Contents

5 Climatic Shocks and Persecutions
  5.1 The Vulnerability of the Conditional Toleration Equilibrium
  5.2 Temperature Shocks and Jewish Persecutions across Europe
  5.3 Chapter Summary: Climate Shocks on the Conditional Toleration Equilibrium

6 The Shock of the Black Death
  6.1 The Black Death Pogroms
  6.2 Black Death Pogroms across Europe
  6.3 The Argument Thus Far ... A Summary of Part I

II THE ORIGINS OF RELIGIOUS FREEDOM

7 State Building and the Reformation
  7.1 The Reformation
  7.2 State Building
  7.3 The Reformation and Religious Persecution
  7.4 Temporary Religious Toleration
  7.5 Religious Peace Elsewhere in Europe
  7.6 Chapter Summary: The Impact of the Reformation

8 The Inquisition and the Establishment of Religious Homogeneity in Spain
  8.1 The Conversos “Problem”
  8.2 The Threat of the Reformation in Spain
  8.3 The Decline of Spain and the Continuation of the Inquisition
  8.4 Chapter Summary: The Legacy of the Inquisition

9 From Confessionalization to Toleration and Then to Religious Liberty
  9.1 The Breakdown of Conditional Toleration in the Holy Roman Empire
  9.2 The Fall and Rise of Religious Toleration in France
  9.3 The Emergence of a Modern State in England
  9.4 Chapter Summary: The Rise of the State and the Abandonment of Religious Regulation

10 From Persecution to Emancipation
  10.1 The Decline in Jewish Persecutions
  10.2 Jewish Emancipation
  10.3 The Argument Thus Far ... A Summary of Part II

III IMPLICATIONS OF GREATER RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

11 The Persecution of Witchcraft
  11.1 Explanations for the European Witch Panic
  11.2 Legal Fragmentation in France
Contents

11.3 Legal Centralization and the Decline in Witchcraft Trials 216
11.4 The Growth in Legal Capacity 220
11.5 Other Parts of Europe 220
11.6 Chapter Summary: Legal Centralization and Rule of Law 224
12 Religious Minorities and Economic Growth 229
12.1 Minorities and Economic Development 229
12.2 Jewish Communities and City Growth 231
12.3 The Relationship between Jewish Communities and City Growth 232
12.4 Access to the Network of Jewish Communities 234
12.5 Chapter Summary: Liberalism and Markets Enabled Religious Minorities to Contribute to Growth 239
13 The Emergence of Modern States, Religious Freedom, and Modern Economic Growth 245
13.2 Nationalism and General Rules 248
13.3 Fiscal Capacity and National Identity in Ancien Regime France 250
13.4 Modern States and Modern Economic Growth 253
13.5 Innovation and Modern Economic Growth 257
13.6 Chapter Summary: The Demise of Conditional Toleration and Modern Economic Growth 259
14 Applying Our Argument to the Rest of the World 262
14.1 The Middle East 262
14.2 China and Japan 268
14.3 The United States 275
14.4 Chapter Summary 278
15 Modern States, Liberalism, and Religious Freedom 281
15.1 Exclusionary versus Inclusive Nationalism 284
15.2 Power States 285
15.3 The Holocaust 287
15.4 Chapter Summary 290
16 Conclusions 293
16.1 A Summary of Our Argument 294
16.2 Alternative and Complementary Hypotheses 298
16.3 Implications of Our Argument for Today 304

Bibliography 312
Index 351
Figures

1.1 Tax revenues in relation to unskilled wages for Austria, the Dutch Republic, England, France, Prussia, and Spain between 1500 and 1800  

1.2 The conditional toleration equilibrium that prevailed in Europe prior to 1500  

1.3 The religious liberty equilibrium that arose in many parts of Europe after 1800  

2.1 Coronation of Charlemagne in 800 CE  

2.2 Coronation of Napoleon in 1804  

3.1 Total urban population 800–1500  

3.2 Urbanization rates 800–1500  

3.3 The Kingdom of France in 1180  

3.4 The Kingdom of France in 1223  

3.5 Political boundaries of Western Europe in 1000. Based on Nussli (2011)  

4.1 Details showing the punishment of usurers from Giotto’s Arena Chapel  

5.1 Temperature deviations (five-year averages) in Kitzingen 1100–1350. The Armleder pogroms (1336–1338) followed a period of extremely cold temperature in Alsace and Franconia  

5.2 Reconstructed growing season temperature deviations in 1300  

5.3 Jewish persecutions, 1100–1800  

5.4 Cereal suitability in Europe  

6.1 Black Death mortality rates (%) in 1347–1352  

6.2 Persecution intensity in archbishoprics, bishoprics, and imperial free cities  

7.1 Michael Servetus and Jean Calvin  

7.2 Executions of heretics by généralité  

7.3 Distance of heresy executions from high court in Provence located at Aix-en-Provence
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Distance of trials from regional Parlement, 1520–1560</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Total tax revenue divided by nominal GDP, 1290–1815</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>The effect of temperature on persecution probability over time</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>The rise of state capacity in early modern Western Europe</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Partial and full emancipation of Jews across selected European countries</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Total tax revenues and tailles revenues, 1600–1695</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Distribution of witchcraft trials across French généralités</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>Tailles receipts per capita across French généralités</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Incidence rate ratios from negative binomial regressions indicating the effects of our key variables on the number of witch trials</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>The effect of investment in fiscal capacity in the seventeenth century on legal expenditure in the subsequent century</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>Locations of witch trials and executions, 1300–1850</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>Elevation and state boundaries in Europe in 1500</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>The correlation between witch trials and proxies for the costs of investing in state capacity across Europe</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Matching the cities in the Bairoch dataset and Jewish communities</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>The effect of a Jewish community on city growth</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>Example of a 10 × 10 kilometer grid with four travel technologies</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>The least cost path between Paris and Rome</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>The effect of Jewish communities on city growth rates over time</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>National identity in the 1789 General Cahiers</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>The discontinuity in national identity at the CGF border</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>Direct tax receipts 1817–1821 and national identity</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>Tax on notary contracts and national identity</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>Religious regulation, 1990–2008 and state fiscal capacity</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>Religious fractionalization and government regulation of religion in low-capacity states</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>Religious fractionalization and government regulation of religion in high-capacity states</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

3.1 Brief chronology of medieval heresy  
4.1 Brief chronology of England’s Jewish community  
5.1 An example of difference-in-differences  
7.1 Brief chronology of the French Reformation  
7.2 Brief chronology of the English Reformation