

THE LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

The recent rise of international trade courts and tribunals deserves systemic study and in-depth analysis. This volume gathers contributions from experts specialized in different regional adjudicators of trade disputes and scrutinizes their operations in the light of the often-debated legitimacy issues. It not only looks into prominent adjudicators that have played a significant role for global and regional integration, but it also includes the newly established and/or less-known judicial actors. Critical topics covered range from procedures and legal techniques during the adjudication process to the pre- and postadjudication matters in relation to forum selection and decision implementation. The volume features cross-cutting interdisciplinary discussions among academics and practitioners, lawyers, philosophers, and political scientists. In addition to fulfilling the research vacuum, it aims to address the challenges and opportunities faced in international trade adjudication.

ROBERT HOWSE is the Lloyd C. Nelson Professor of International Law at NYU School of Law. New York, USA.

HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI is Director of the Max Planck Institute Luxembourg for Procedural Law, and Head of the Department of International Law and Dispute Resolution.

GEIR ULFSTEIN is Professor of International Law in the Department of Public and International Law and Co-director of PluriCourts, the Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, at the University of Oslo, Norway.

MICHELLE Q. ZANG is a postdoctoral research fellow at PluriCourts, the Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, at the University of Oslo, Norway.



STUDIES ON INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

General Editors

Andreas Follesdal, University of Oslo
Geir Ulfstein, University of Oslo

Studies on International Courts and Tribunals contains theoretical and interdisciplinary scholarship on legal aspects as well as the legitimacy and effectiveness of international courts and tribunals.

Other books in the series:

Mads Andenas and Eirik Bjorge (eds.) A Farewell to Fragmentation: Reassertion and Convergence in International Law

Cecilia M. Bailliet and Nobuo Hayashi (eds.) The Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals

Amrei Müller with Hege Elisabeth Kjos (eds.) Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights

Nienke Grossman, Harlan Grant Cohen, Andreas Follesdal and Geir Ulfstein (eds.) Legitimacy and International Courts

Robert Howse, Hélène Ruiz-Fabri, Geir Ulfstein and Michelle Q. Zang (eds.) *The Legitimacy of International Trade Courts and Tribunals*Marlene Wind (ed.) *International Courts and Domestic Politics*



THE LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

Edited by

ROBERT HOWSE

New York University

HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI

Max Planck Institute Luxembourg for International, European and Regulatory Procedural Law

GEIR ULFSTEIN

University of Oslo

MICHELLE Q. ZANG

University of Oslo





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108424479
DOI: 10.1017/9781108335690

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Names: Howse, Robert, 1958–, editor.

Title: The legitimacy of international trade courts and tribunals /
edited by Robert Howse and others.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2018. |
Series: Studies on international courts and tribunals

Identifiers: LCCN 2017041377 | ISBN 9781108424479 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Commercial courts. | Foreign trade regulation.

Classification: LCC K1008 .L44 2018 | DDC 343.08/70269–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017041377

ISBN 978-1-108-42447-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



More Information

CONTENTS

	List of Contributors vii
	PART I International Trade Courts and Tribunals
1	Introduction 3
	ROBERT HOWSE, HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI, GEIR ULFSTEIN, AND MICHELLE Q. ZANG
2	The WTO Adjudicating Bodies 20
	RETO MALACRIDA AND GABRIELLE MARCEAU
3	The Court of Justice of the European Union 70
	P. J. KUIJPER
4	The EFTA Court 138
	HALVARD HAUKELAND FREDRIKSEN
5	The United States Court of International Trade 182
	DONALD C. POGUE
6	The Federal Courts of Canada 202
	MAUREEN IRISH
7	The Case of MERCOSUR 227
	PAULA WOJCIKIEWICZ ALMEIDA
8	The Andean Court of Justice 255
	MIGUEL ANTONIO VILLAMIZAR

9 The Case of the Economic Court of the CIS 286 RILKA DRAGNEVA

10 The COMESA Court of Justice 314

JAMES THUO GATHII

V



More Information

i	CONTENTS
11	The WAEMU Court of Justice 349
	OUSSENI ILLY
12	The ASEAN Trade Dispute Settlement Mechanism 365
	MICHAEL EWING-CHOW AND RANYTA YUSRAN
	PART II Cross-Cutting Studies 403
13	A Comparative Analysis of Formal Independence 405
	THERESA SQUATRITO
14	Judicial Interaction of International Trade Courts and Tribunals 432
	MICHELLE Q. ZANG
15	Access to Trade Tribunals – Comparative Perspectives 454
	OLE KRISTIAN FAUCHALD
16	Toward a More Just WTO: Which Justice, Whose Interpretation? 479
	ANDREAS FOLLESDAL
17	Conclusions 503
	ROBERT HOWSE, HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI, GEIR ULFSTEIN,
	AND MICHELLE Q. ZANG
	Index 511



CONTRIBUTORS

RILKA DRAGNEVA is Professor of International Legal Studies at the University of Birmingham, UK. Her current research interests center on the legal regime of Eurasian economic integration and its overlap with European Union (EU) external policy in the EU–Russia shared neighborhood. One of her recent principal publications is *Eurasian Economic Integration: Law, Policy and Politics* (2013). Dragneva-Lewers is also actively engaged in policy advice in relation to these matters and has extensive experience in technical assistance and consultancy in the field of legal reform and rule of law postcommunism.

MICHAEL EWING-CHOW is Associate Professor and WTO Chair at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore (NUS), Singapore, as well as Head of Trade/Investment Law and Policy at the Centre for International Law, NUS. He has a First Class Honors degree in law from NUS and a master's degree from Harvard Law School. Michael worked in Allen & Gledhill before joining NUS, where he started the first World Trade Law course in Singapore and was involved in the negotiations for some of Singapore's early free trade agreements (FTAs). For his work, he was awarded the Social Entrepreneur of the Year 2007. He has received several Teaching Excellence Awards and was awarded the Inspiring Mentor Award in 2009.

OLE KRISTIAN FAUCHALD is Professor of International Law at the Department of Public and International Law, University of Oslo, Norway, and coordinator of PluriCourts – Centre of Excellence for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order in Oslo, Norway. Fauchald has published in different areas of international law, including international investment law, international trade law, international environmental law, and international human rights. He is also part of the Research Group on Internationalisation of Law and the



viii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Research Group on Natural Resources Law, both part of the Faculty of Law, University of Oslo.

ANDREAS FOLLESDAL, Ph.D., is Professor of Political Philosophy at the Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, Norway, and Co-Director of PluriCourts – Centre of Excellence for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order in Oslo, Norway. He holds a Ph.D. in philosophy from Harvard University and publishes in the field of political philosophy, mainly on issues of international political theory, globalization/Europeanization, human rights, and socially responsible investing.

JAMES THUO GATHII is Professor of Law and the Wing-Tat Lee Chair in International Law at Loyola University Chicago School of Law, Illinois, USA, since July 2012. He is on the Board of Editors of the *American Journal of International Law* and is an independent expert of the Working Group on Extractive Industries, Environment, and Human Rights Violations in Africa formed by the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights. His research and teaching interests are in public international law, international trade law, and third world approaches to international law and human rights.

HALVARD HAUKELAND FREDRIKSEN is Professor of EU and EEA law at the Faculty of Law, University of Bergen, Norway, and an associate of Bergen Centre of Competition Law and Economics. Besides his Norwegian law degree (2003) he holds the degrees Mag.iur. (2005) and Dr.iur. (2009) from the University of Göttingen in Germany and Ph.D. (2013) from the University of Bergen in Norway.

MAUREEN IRISH is Professor of Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Windsor, Ontario, Canada. She holds B.A. and LL.B. degrees from the University of Toronto, Canada, and LL.M. and D.C.L. degrees from McGill University, Canada. Professor Irish teaches international economic law, international business transactions, transportation law, and private international law (conflicts). She is the author of *Customs Valuation in Canada* (1985), as well as editor or coeditor of various publications with regard to economic law. She has served on dispute settlement panels under the Canada–United States Free Trade Agreement and the North American Free Trade Agreement.



More Information

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ix

P. J. KUIJPER is Professor of Law of International (economic) Organizations in the University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands since 2007. Before that, he had a long career in international organizations, first as the director of the Legal Affairs Division of the WTO Secretariat (1999-2002) and next as the director of the Division for External Relations and International Trade in the Legal Service of the European Commission (2002–2007). His main research interests are the comparative approach to international organizations; European Union (EU) institutional law, in particular foreign relations law (including trade policy); WTO law; and relations between EU law, WTO law, and general international law.

RETO MALACRIDA, Ph.D., is Counsellor (senior dispute settlement lawyer) in the Legal Affairs Division of the WTO Secretariat since 1999 and a part-time lecturer at the University of St. Gallen, Switzerland.

GABRIELLE MARCEAU is a counsellor in the Legal Affairs Division of the WTO Secretariat since 11 September 1994. Gabrielle Marceau is also Associate Professor at the Law Faculty of the University of Geneva, Switzerland, and has previously been Visiting Professor at the Graduate Institute in Geneva, the Sorbonne in Paris, Monash University in Melbourne, Australia, the World Trade Institute in Bern, Switzerland, and others. Professor Marceau is President of the Society of International Economic Law and is also involved with other associations and groups promoting international law.

OUSSENI ILLY is currently Assistant Professor of International Law at the University Ouaga II, Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso. He is also the cofounder and executive director of the African Centre of International Trade and Development (www.cacid.net), an independent and nonprofit think tank on Africa and international trade based in Burkina Faso. Illy holds a master of public law from the University of Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, and a Ph.D. in international trade law from the University of Geneva, Switzerland.

DONALD C. POGUE was appointed as a judge to the U.S. Court of International Trade (CIT) in 1995 and has obtained senior status as of July 1, 2014. Prior to his appointment to the CIT, he served as Judge in Connecticut's Superior Court and was Chairman of Connecticut's



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Commission on Hospitals and Health Care. He was also a partner of the

law firm Kestell, Pogue, & Gould. Judge Pogue is a magna cum laude, Phi Beta Kappa graduate of Dartmouth College, Hanover, New Hampshire, and holds a J.D. degree from Yale Law School and a master's of philosophy from Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut.

THERESA SQUATRITO is a lecturer in International Relations at the

THERESA SQUATRITO is a lecturer in International Relations at the University of Liverpool. She received her Ph.D. from the University of Washington, Seattle, USA, in political science, where she was a fellow with the Comparative Law and Society Studies Center. She is a former postdoctoral research fellow of the PluriCourts – Centre of Excellence for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order at the University of Oslo, Norway. Before that, she was a postdoc at Stockholm University, Sweden, on the Transdemos research program, which explores transnational actors in relation to questions on global democratic governance. She has published on topics related to international organizations and international law, as well as transnational actors.

MIGUEL ANTONIO VILLAMIZAR is a dispute settlement lawyer in the Legal Affairs Division of the WTO Secretariat, which he joined on October 1, 2013. He obtained his LL.B. and LL.M. degrees from the University of Los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia, in 2005 and 2009, respectively. Between 2005 and 2011, Miguel worked in different law firms in Colombia and served the Colombian government in the Bureau of International Legal Affairs of the Ministry of Trade Industry and Tourism. He has lectured on public international law, international economic law, and comparative law at University of Los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia and Francisco Marroquín University, Guatemala.

PAULA WOJCIKIEWICZ ALMEIDA is Professor of International Law, Getulio Vargas Foundation Law School in Rio de Janeiro (since 2008). Jean Monnet Chair, sponsored by the European Commission at the Getulio Vargas Foundation Law School. Associate Researcher at the Institute of International and European Law at the Sorbonne (IREDIES). Professor of International Law of the Masters in International Relations of the Faculty of Social Sciences, Getulio Vargas Foundation in Rio de Janeiro. Qualified as 'maître des conferences' in Public Law (France, CNU). Doctorate with honors *summa cum laude* in International and European



More Information

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

хi

Law at the *Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne*. Masters of Law (Master II Recherche – former DEA) in Public International and European Law – Université Paris XI, Faculté Jean Monnet. Post-doctoral visiting scholar at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law. Professor Almeida is also Chair of the Interest Group on International Courts and Tribunals of the Latin American Society of International Law.

RANYTA YUSRAN is a Research Fellow at the Centre for International Law (CIL), NUS, Singapore. Her research interests at CIL include Treaty Law and Practice, ASEAN Law and Policy, and International Dispute Settlement. She obtained her LL.B. in Public International Law from University of Indonesia, Depok, Indonesia, and her LL.M. in International Human Rights from Lund University, Sweden.