

Healthy Conflict in Contemporary American Society

US citizens perceive their society to be one of the most diverse and religiously tolerant in the world today. Yet seemingly intractable religious intolerance and moral conflict abound throughout contemporary US public life – from abortion law battles, same-sex marriage, post-9/11 Islamophobia, public school curriculum controversies, to moral and religious dimensions of the Black Lives Matter and Occupy Wall Street movements, and Tea Party populism. *Healthy Conflict in Contemporary American Society* develops an approach to democratic discourse and coalition-building across deep moral and religious divisions. Drawing on conflict transformation in peace studies, recent American pragmatist thought, and models of agonistic democracy, Jason Springs argues that, in circumstances riven with conflict between strong religious identities and deep moral and political commitments, productive engagement depends on thinking creatively about how to constructively utilize conflict and intolerance. The result is an approach oriented by the recognition of conflict as a constituent and life-giving feature of social and political relationships.

Jason A. Springs is Associate Professor of Religion, Ethics, and Peace Studies at the Kroc Institute for International Peace Studies, University of Notre Dame. Springs's articles appear in the *Journal of Religious Ethics*, *Journal for the American Academy of Religion*, *Journal of Religion*, and *Soundings: An Interdisciplinary Journal*. He is the author of *Toward a Generous Orthodoxy: Prospects for Hans Frei's Postliberal Theology* (2010), and co-author (with Atalia Omer) of *Religious Nationalism: A Reference Handbook* (2013).

Healthy Conflict in Contemporary American Society

From Enemy to Adversary

JASON A. SPRINGS
University of Notre Dame



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42442-4 — Healthy Conflict in Contemporary American Society
Jason A. Springs
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108424424

DOI: 10.1017/9781108334945

© Jason A. Springs 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42442-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42442-4 — Healthy Conflict in Contemporary American Society
Jason A. Springs
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Atalia, Yonatan, and Pnei'el Alois

I say we had best look our times and lands searchingly in the face, like a physician diagnosing some deep disease. Never was there, perhaps, more hollowness at heart than at present, and here in the United States. Genuine belief seems to have left us. The underlying principles of the States are not honestly believ'd in, (for all this hectic glow, and these melo-dramatic screamings,) nor is humanity itself believ'd in. What penetrating eye does not everywhere see through the mask?

The spectacle is appalling. We live in an atmosphere of hypocrisy throughout. The men believe not in the women, nor the women in the men. A scornful superciliousness rules in literature. The aim of all the *litterateurs* is to find something to make fun of. A lot of churches, sects, &c., the most dismal phantasms I know, usurp the name of religion. Conversation is a mass of [banter] ...

The depravity of the business classes of our country is not less than has been supposed, but infinitely greater. The official services of America, national, state, and municipal, in all their branches and departments, except the judiciary, are saturated in corruption, bribery, falsehood, mal-administration; and the judiciary is tainted. The great cities reek with respectable as much as non-respectable robbery and scoundrelism. In fashionable life, flippancy, tepid amours, weak infidelity, small aims, or no aims at all, only to kill time. In business, (this all-devouring modern word, business,) the one sole object is, by any means, pecuniary gain. The magician's serpent in the fable ate up all the other serpents; and money-making is our magician's serpent, remaining to-day sole master of the field ...

I say that our New World democracy, however great a success in uplifting the masses out of their sloughs, in materialistic development, products, and in a certain highly-deceptive superficial popular intellectuality, is, so far, an almost complete failure in its social aspects, and in really grand religious, moral, literary, and esthetic results. In vain do we march with unprecedented strides to empire so colossal, outvying the antique, beyond Alexander's, beyond the proudest sway of Rome ... It is as if we were somehow being endow'd with a vast and more and more thoroughly-appointed body, and then left with little or no soul.

Walt Whitman, *Democratic Vistas*

Of course, the old undying elements remain. The task is, to successfully adjust them to new combinations, our own days.

Walt Whitman, *Democratic Vistas*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	I
PART I PRAGMATIST REPERTOIRES	
1 The Difficulty of Imagining Other Persons, Reimagined: Moral Imagination as a Tool for Transforming Conflict	13
2 Turning the Searchlight Inward: Cultivating the Virtues of Moral Imagination	41
3 To Let Suffering Speak: Love, Justice, and Hope against Hope	62
4 The Prophet and the President: Prophetic Rage in the Age of Obama	99
5 Testing the Spirits: Discerning True Prophecy from False	128
6 “Dismantling the Master’s House”: Using the System to Transform the System	159
PART II BEYOND AMERICAN INTOLERANCE	
7 Giving Religious Intolerance Its Due: Agonistic Respect and the Transformation of Conflict in a Post-Secular Society	195
8 Looking It Up in Your Gut? Visceral Politics and Healthy Conflict in the Tea Party Era	226

9	Islamophobia, American Style: Tolerance as American Exceptionalism, and the Prospects for a Strenuous Pluralism	272
	Conclusion: Strenuous Pluralism and Healthy Conflict	311
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	321
	<i>Index</i>	343

Acknowledgments

This book project emerged in bits and pieces over the course of nearly a decade. Such a lengthy unfolding makes it challenging to thank adequately all the people whose input was indispensable to the final outcome. In the form of conversations, comments on drafts, invigorating paper panel discussions, or critical response to some piece of the project published along the way, many people lent their support. Each of them contributed vitally to the end result. The idea for this book first occurred during my conversation with Martin Kavka at the 2010 San Jose, CA, Ethics Societies meetings. I am grateful to Martin for countless further discussions throughout the process that ensued. John Kelsay and Aline Kalbian provided advice as well as opportunities to present portions of my research to the Florida State ethics colloquium. I benefited from engaging several excellent cohorts of Florida State University doctoral students, many of whom are now credentialed scholars themselves – Shannon Dunn, Rosemary Kellison, Ross Moret, Sam Houston, Carson Bay, among others. I am similarly grateful for intellectual friendship and countless discussions (as well as detailed feedback) with dear friends Cecelia Lynch and Slavica Jakelich that influenced these pages. Colleagues, friends, and interlocutors who read all or portions of chapter drafts, gave critical feedback on early papers I presented, or just took time for a helpful conversation and support along the way include Scott Appleby, David Cortright, David Decosimo, Beth Eddy, Eddie Glaude, Emmanuel Katongole, Asher Kaufman, Mark Lance, Bryan Langlands, John Paul Lederach, David Little, Ann Mische, Ebrahim Moosa, Atalia Omer, Robert Orsi, Dan Philpott, Christian Smith, Jeffrey Stout, Ernesto Verdeja, and Cornel West. Tom Tweed and Martin Kavka were kind enough to read the entire draft in the

final stages of the project. I was aided, as well, by dialogue with a stellar cast of students – now emerging scholars – Garrett FitzGerald, Chris Haw, Kyle Lambelet, Angela Lederach, Kelly McGee, Michael Yankoski – and by remarkably incisive feedback and editorial support from Ben Dillon. As always, I am grateful for the loving support from my parents and grandparents that made my work possible.

I am grateful for permission from each of the following publishers to adapt some earlier materials for this book, all revised and updated. Some passages from Chapters 1 and 2 come from “The Difficulty of Imagining Other Persons Reimagined: Moral Imagination as a Tool for Transforming Conflict” in Jacob Goodson and Brad Stone (eds.), *Rorty and the Religious: Christian Engagements with a Secular Philosopher* (Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2012), used by permission of Wipf and Stock publishers (www.wipfandstock.com). The first two chapters also adapt some paragraphs from “‘To Let Suffering Speak’: Can Peacebuilding Overcome the Un-representability of Suffering? Elaine Scarry and the Case of *Uncle Tom’s Cabin*,” *Peace and Change* 40, No. 4 (October 2015): 539–560. Chapter 3 draws material from an earlier essay published as “The Priority of Democracy to Social Theory,” *Contemporary Pragmatism*, special issue on Cornel West, ed. Eddie Glaude, Vol. 4, No. 1 (June 2007): pp. 47–71, and Chapter 5 takes three passages from “Prophetic Dialectic,” my contribution to a Contending Modernities book symposium on Cathleen Kaveny’s *Prophecy without Contempt*. Chapters 6–8 were originally drafted together and then split (somewhat artificially) into independent publication projects. These chapters draw upon “‘Dismantling the Master’s House’: Freedom as Ethical Practice in Robert Brandom and Michel Foucault,” *Journal of Religious Ethics* 37, No. 3 (September 2009): 419–448; “On Giving Religious Intolerance Its Due: Prospects for Transforming Conflict in a Post-secular Society,” *Journal of Religion* 92, No. 1 (January 2012): 1–30; “‘Next time, try looking it up in your gut!’: Tolerance, Civility, and Healthy Conflict in a Tea Party Era,” *Soundings: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 94, No. 3/4 (Fall/Winter 2011): 325–358. A version of Chapter 9 appeared as “A Tale of Two Islamophobias: Comparative Religious Ethics and the Paradoxes of Civic Nationalism in Contemporary Europe and the United States,” *Soundings: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, Vol. 98, No. 3 (2015): pp. 289–321.