

Human Rights on Trial

The first systematic analysis of the arguments made against human rights from the French Revolution to the present day. Through the writings of Edmund Burke, Jeremy Bentham, Auguste Comte, Louis de Bonald, Joseph de Maistre, Karl Marx, Carl Schmitt and Hannah Arendt, the authors explore the divergences and convergences between these ‘classical’ arguments against human rights and the contemporary critiques made both in Anglo-American and French political philosophy. *Human Rights on Trial* is unique in its marriage of the history of ideas with normative theory, and its integration of British–North American and continental debates on human rights. It offers a powerful rebuttal of the dominant belief in a sharp division between human rights today and the Rights of Man proclaimed at the end of the eighteenth century. It also offers a strong framework for a democratic defence of human rights.

Justine Lacroix is Professor of Politics at the Université libre de Bruxelles, Belgium. She is Associate Editor of the *European Journal of Political Theory*.

Jean-Yves Pranchère is Professor of Political Theory at the Université libre de Bruxelles, Belgium. He is Associate Editor of the *European Journal of Social Sciences*.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42439-4 — Human Rights on Trial
Justine Lacroix , Jean-Yves Pranchère
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Human Rights in History

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California, Berkeley
Samuel Moyn, Yale University, Connecticut

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at:
www.cambridge.org/human-rights-history

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42439-4 — Human Rights on Trial
Justine Lacroix, Jean-Yves Pranchère
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Human Rights on Trial

A Genealogy of the Critique of Human Rights

Justine Lacroix

Université libre de Bruxelles

Jean-Yves Pranchère

Université libre de Bruxelles

Translated by Gabrielle Maas



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42439-4 — Human Rights on Trial
Justine Lacroix, Jean-Yves Pranchère
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108424394

DOI: 10.1017/9781108334884

Originally published in 2016 by Editions du Seuil as *Le Procès des droits de l'homme: Généalogie du scepticisme démocratique*, written in the French language by Justine Lacroix and Jean-Yves Pranchère (ISBN 9782021181005)

© Editions du Seuil 2016

First published in English by Cambridge University Press in 2018, translation by Gabrielle Maas.

© Justine Lacroix and Jean-Yves Pranchère 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42439-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-43815-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	<i>page</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vi</i>
Introduction: From the Rights of Man to Human Rights?	1
1 Critiques of Human Rights in Contemporary Thought	25
2 Human Rights against Inheritance A Conservative Critique: Edmund Burke	59
3 Human Rights versus Social Utility A Progressivist Critique: Jeremy Bentham and Auguste Comte	91
4 Human Rights against the Rights of God A Theologico-Political Critique: Louis de Bonald and Joseph de Maistre	127
5 The Rights of Man against Human Emancipation A Revolutionary Critique: Karl Marx	157
6 Human Rights against Politics A Nationalist Critique: Carl Schmitt	187
7 The ‘right to have rights’ Revisiting Hannah Arendt	206
Conclusion: Towards a Political Understanding of Human Rights	229
<i>Index</i>	247

Acknowledgements

We gratefully acknowledge the support of the European Research Council, which funded this book with a Starting Grant entitled ‘*RESIST. Human Rights versus Democracy? Towards a Conceptual Genealogy of Skepticism about Human Rights in Contemporary Political Thought* (2010–2016). The Centre de théorie politique (CTP) at the Université libre de Bruxelles, our home institution, has provided us with an exceptionally inspiring and collegial working environment. The authors would like to thank all past and current CTP members, and in particular Christopher Hamel and Carlo Invernizzi-Accetti for their commitment to the RESIST project.

An earlier version of Chapter 5 was published as Justine Lacroix and Jean-Yves Pranchère, ‘Karl Marx fut-il un opposant aux droits de l’homme?’, *Revue française de science politique*, 3/2012 (vol. 62), pp. 433–451. Chapter 7 draws on arguments first explored in Justine Lacroix, ‘The Right to Have Rights and French Political Philosophy. Conceptualising a Cosmopolitan Citizenship with Arendt’, *Constellations. An International Journal of Democratic and Critical Theory*, 22/1, 2015, pp. 79–90. We would like to thank the editors of both journals for granting permission to develop these ideas further here.

Many colleagues have generously shared their ideas and time with us: Julie Allard, Sarah Al Matary, Carolina Armenteros, Isabelle Aubert, Catherine Audard, Serge Audier, Etienne Balibar, Olivier Beaud, Thomas Berns, Samuel Chambers, Bertrand Binoche, Antoon Braeckman, Emmanuelle Bribosia, Frédéric Brahami, Bruno Bernardi, Louis Carré, Manuel Cervera-Marzal, Anne-Sophie Chambost, Véronique Champeil-Desplats, Francis Cheneval, Antoine Chollet, Laurent Clauzade, Jean Cohen, Catherine Colliot-Thélène, Juliette Corsy, Philippe Crignon, Ludivine Damay, Robert Damien, Martin Deleixhe, Florence Delmotte, Isabelle Delpa, Helder De Schutter, Alexandre Escudier, Jean-Marc Ferry, Rainer Forst, Stéphanie Francq, Michael Freeden, Marie Gaille, Antoine Garapon, Raf Geenens, Raphaël Gely, Pierre Glaudes, Florent Guénard, Sophie Guérard de la

Acknowledgements

vii

Tour, Axel Gosseries, Ayten Gündoğdu, Michel Hastings, Bonnie Honig, James Ingram, Engin Isin, Bruno Karsenti, Jean-François Kervégan, Jan Kleinheisterkamp, Michael Kohlhauer, Cécile Laborde, Pieter Lagrou, Arnaud Leclercq, Annabelle Lever, Alain Loute, Lois McNay, Kalypso Nicolaïdis, Samuel Hayat, Murray Hunt, James Ingram, Léa Ipy, Pierre Manent, John Milbank, Nobutaka Miura, Samuel Moyn, Janie Pélabay, Anne Philipps, Arnd Pollman, Alain Policar, Jean-Claude Poizat, Olivier Rénaud, Isabelle Rorive, Pierre Rosanvallon, Denis Salas, Andrew Schaap, Diogo Sardinha, Réjane Sénac, Céline Spector, Tristan Storme, Etienne Tassin, André Tosel, Bernadette Tulkens, Françoise Tulkens, Yannick Vanderborght, Philippe Van Parijs, Hajime Yamamoto and Patrick Weil, as well as our students at the Université libre de Bruxelles, Université Saint-Louis–Bruxelles, Sciences Po Paris and Sciences Po Lille. Our thanks go to all.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42439-4 — Human Rights on Trial
Justine Lacroix , Jean-Yves Pranchère
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
