One of the most noted developments in international law over the past twenty years is the proliferation of international courts and tribunals. They decide who has the right to exploit natural resources, define the scope of human rights, delimit international boundaries, and determine when the use of force is prohibited. As the number and influence of international courts grow, so too do challenges to their legitimacy. This volume provides new interdisciplinary insights into international courts’ legitimacy: what drives and undermines the legitimacy of these bodies? How do drivers change depending on the court concerned? What is the link between legitimacy, democracy, effectiveness, and justice? Top international experts analyze legitimacy for specific international courts, as well as the links between legitimacy and cross-cutting themes. Failure to understand and respond to legitimacy concerns can endanger both the courts and the law they interpret and apply.

Nienke Grossman is an associate professor of Law and Deputy Director of the Center for International and Comparative Law at the University of Baltimore School of Law.

Harlan Grant Cohen holds the Gabriel M. Wilner/UGA Foundation Professorship in International Law at the University of Georgia School of Law.

Andreas Folliesdal is Professor of Political Philosophy in the Faculty of Law and Codirector of PluriCourts, a Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, at the University of Oslo.

Geir Ulfstein is Professor of International Law in the Department of Public and International Law and Codirector of PluriCourts, a Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, at the University of Oslo.
STUDIES ON INTERNATIONAL COURTS
AND TRIBUNALS

General Editors
Andreas Follesdal, University of Oslo
Geir Ulfstein, University of Oslo

Studies on International Courts and Tribunals contains theoretical and interdisciplinary scholarship on legal aspects as well as the legitimacy and effectiveness of international courts and tribunals.

Other Books in the Series
Mads Andenas and Eirik Bjorge (eds.) A Farewell to Fragmentation: Reassertion and Convergence in International Law
Cecilia M. Bailliet and Nobuo Hayashi (eds.) The Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals
Amrei Müller with Hege Elisabeth Kjos (eds.) Judicial Dialogue and Human Rights
Nienke Grossman, Harlan Grant Cohen, Andreas Follesdal and Geir Ulfstein (eds.) Legitimacy and International Courts
LEGITIMACY AND INTERNATIONAL COURTS

Edited by

NIENKE GROSSMAN
University of Baltimore School of Law

HARLAN GRANT COHEN
University of Georgia School of Law

ANDREAS FOLLESDAL
University of Oslo

GEIR ULFSTEIN
University of Oslo
CONTENTS

List of Contributors vii

1 Legitimacy and International Courts – A Framework 1

HARLAN GRANT COHEN, ANDREAS FOLLESDAL,
NIENKE GROSSMAN, AND GEIR ULFSTEIN

PART I The Legitimacy of Particular Dispute Settlement Mechanisms 41

2 Solomonic Judgments and the Legitimacy of the International Court of Justice 43

NIENKE GROSSMAN

3 The Global–Local Dilemma and the ICC’s Legitimacy 62

MARGARET M. DEGUZMAN

4 Justice as Legitimacy in the European Court of Human Rights 83

MOLLY K. LAND

5 Legitimacy and Jurisdictional Overlap: The ICC and the Inter-American Court in Colombia 114

ALEXANDRA HUNEES

6 The Legitimacy of the European Court of Justice: Normative Debates and Empirical Evidence 143

MARK A. POLLACK

7 The International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea: Seeking the Legitimacy of State Consent 174

ANASTASIA TELESETSKY

8 Who Decides Matters: The Legitimacy Capital of WTO Adjudicators versus ICSID Arbitrators 216

JOOST PAUWELYN
CONTENTS

9 The Legitimacy of the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes 234
   ANDREA K. BJORKLUND

10 The Human Rights Treaty Bodies and Legitimacy Challenges 284
   GEIR ULFSTEIN

PART 11 Legitimacy – Cross-Cutting Issues 305

11 Constitutionalization, Not Democratization: How to Assess the Legitimacy of International Courts 307
   ANDREAS FOLLESDAL

12 Democracy, Justice, and the Legitimacy of International Courts 338
   MORTIMER N. S. SELLERS

13 Stronger Together? Legitimacy and Effectiveness of International Courts as Mutually Reinforcing or Undermining Notions 354
   YUVAL SHANY

Index 372
CONTRIBUTORS

ANDREA K. BJØRKLUND is Full Professor and L. Yves Forties Chair in International Arbitration and International Commercial Law at McGill University Faculty of Law in Quebec, Canada.

HARLAN GRANT COHEN is Gabriel M. Wilner/UGA Foundation Professor in International Law at the University of Georgia School of Law, Georgia, USA.

ANDREAS FOLLESDAL is Professor and Co-Director of PluriCourts at the Centre for the Study of the Legitimacy of the International Judiciary at the University of Oslo, Norway.

NIENKE GROSSMAN is Associate Professor of Law and Deputy Director of the Center for International and Comparative Law at the University of Baltimore School of Law, Maryland, USA.

MARGARET M. DEGUZMAN is Associate Professor of Law at Temple University Beasley School of Law, Pennsylvania, USA.

ALEXANDRA HUNEUS is Associate Professor of Law and Director of the Global Legal Studies Center at the University of Wisconsin Law School, Madison, Wisconsin, USA.

MOLLY K. LAND is Professor of Law and Human Rights at the University of Connecticut School of Law and Associate Director of the University of Connecticut’s Human Rights Institute, Connecticut, USA.

JOOST PAUWELYN is Professor of International Law and Co-Director of the Centre for Trade and Economic Integration at The Graduate Institute Geneva, Switzerland.
MARK A. POLLACK is Professor of Political Science and Law, Jean Monnet Chair in European Integration Studies, as well as Director of the Global Studies Program at Temple University, Pennsylvania, USA.

MORTIMER N. S. SELLERS is Regents Professor of the University System of Maryland and Director of Center for International and Comparative Law at the University of Baltimore School of Law, Maryland, USA.

YUVAL SHANY is Professor of Law, Hersch Lauterpacht Chair in Public International Law, and Dean at The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel. Shany is also Vice-Chair of the UN Human Rights Committee.

ANASTASIA TELESETSKY is Professor of Law at the University of Idaho College of Law, Idaho, USA.

GEIR ULFSTEN is Professor of Law and Co-Director of PluriCourts at the Centre for the Study of the Legitimacy of the International Judiciary at the University of Oslo, Norway.