

RECONSIDERING REDD+

In *Reconsidering REDD+: Authority, Power and Law in the Green Economy*, Julia Dehm provides a critical analysis of how the REDD+ scheme operates to reorganise social relations and to establish new forms of global authority over forests in the Global South in ways that benefit the interests of some actors while further marginalising others. In accessible prose that draws on interdisciplinary insights, Dehm demonstrates how, through the creation of new legal relations, including property rights and contractual obligations, new forms of transnational authority over forested areas in the Global South are being constituted. This important work should be read by anyone interested in a critical analysis of international climate law and policy that offers insights into questions of political economy, power and unequal authority.

Julia Dehm is a Senior Lecturer at the School of Law, La Trobe University, Australia. Her research addresses international climate change law and regulation, transnational carbon markets and the governance of natural resources, as well as the relationship between human rights and economic inequality. She is the Co-Editor in Chief of the *Journal of Human Rights and the Environment*. Previously she was a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas at Austin and a Resident Fellow at the Institute for Global Law and Policy, Harvard Law School. Her work has been widely published in journals such as the *Leiden Journal of International Law*, *Humanity: An International Journal of Human Rights, Humanitarianism, and Development* and the *Journal of Human Rights and the Environment*.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND NATURAL
RESOURCES GOVERNANCE

Cambridge Studies on Environment, Energy and Natural Resources Governance publishes foundational monographs of general interest to scholars and practitioners within the broadly defined fields of sustainable development policy, including studies on law, economics, politics, history, and policy. These fields currently attract unprecedented interest due both to the urgency of developing policies to address climate change, the energy transition, food security and water availability and, more generally, to the progressive realization of the impact of humans as a geological driver of the state of the Earth, now called the “Anthropocene.”

The general editor of the series is Professor Jorge E. Viñuales, the Harold Samuel Chair of Law and Environmental Policy at the University of Cambridge and the Founder and First Director of the Cambridge Centre for Environment, Energy and Natural Resource Governance (C-EENRG).

Reconsidering REDD+

AUTHORITY, POWER AND LAW IN THE
GREEN ECONOMY

JULIA DEHM

La Trobe University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42376-2 — Reconsidering REDD+
Julia Dehm
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108423762

DOI: 10.1017/9781108529341

© Julia Dehm 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42376-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Introduction: Reconsidering REDD+	1
A Introduction	1
B Assembling REDD+	7
1 REDD+ As a Relation	7
2 REDD+: Between Vision and Actualisation	12
C Critiquing REDD+	18
D Understanding REDD+	29
1 Climate Justice	30
2 The Green Economy	39
3 Power	42
4 Authority	47
E Beyond REDD+	50
F Outline of the Book	56
1 Background to REDD+	59
A Introduction	59
B REDD+ As a Part of the UNFCCC Framework	60
1 Result-Based Actions	67
(a) Forest Emission Reference Levels and/or Forest Reference Levels	69
(b) Measuring, Reporting and Verification	71
(c) Safeguards and Non-carbon Benefits	71
2 Alternative Policy Approaches	74

C REDD+ As Experimental Practices, Preparatory and Market-Construction Activities	76
1 Demonstration Activities	77
2 REDD+-Readiness	80
(a) Forest Carbon Partnership Facility	81
(b) UN-REDD Programme	86
(c) Other Multilateral and Bilateral Channels	87
D REDD+ As a Concept, Idea and Way of Seeing	90
1 REDD+ As a Vision of Economic Valuation of Forests	91
2 REDD+ As a Vision of an 'Offset' in Transnational Carbon Markets	94
E REDD+ As Co-articulating Various Forms of Anthropocentric Governance	97
1 Conservation	100
2 Sustainable Management of Forests	102
F REDD+ As a Social Project	106
1 Debates in the UNFCCC and by NGOs	106
2 Debates within the UN Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues	112
3 The Gradual Elaboration of Safeguards	116
G Conclusion	121
2 Asserting Global Authority over the Carbon Sequestration Potential of Forests	122
A Introduction	122
B Common Concern	124
C Climate Change and Supranational Jurisdiction	130
1 Climate Change As a 'Global' Problem	132
2 Climate Change As a Current or Future Problem	134
3 Climate Change As a Problem of Emissions, Not Structural Causes	135
4 The Imperatives of 'Efficiency'	136
5 Substitution, Standardisation and Equivalence	140
6 The Differentiated Actualisation of This 'Common Concern'	142
D Forests, 'Common Concern' and Authority	144
1 Contestation and Authority over Forests	144
2 From Proprietorial Claims over Forests to 'Concern' for Their Function	153
3 Carbon Sequestration As a Global Concern	156
4 The Differentiated Actualisation of This 'Common Concern'	164
E Conclusion	166
3 Actualising Authority through Public and Private Law: REDD+ through the Lens of Property and Contract	168
A Introduction	168

B	Disrupting the Public–Private Boundary	170
C	REDD+ through the Lens of Transnational Carbon Contracting	177
	1 Challenges in Drafting Transnational Carbon Contracts for REDD+	178
	2 Establishing Norms through Carbon Contracting	184
D	REDD+ through the Lens of Property	191
	1 The Peculiar Properties of Rights in Carbon	192
	2 Initial Distribution and Unequal Allocation of Emission Allowances	196
	3 Carbon Units in a More Decentralised Climate Regime	201
	4 Inclusion of REDD+ in Post-Paris Markets	209
E	Conclusion	211
4	Responsibility and Capacity: Recasting North–South Difference	212
A	Introduction	212
B	The Contested Basis and Purpose of Differentiation in the Climate Regime	215
C	CBDR-RD: History of the Principle and Its Adoption in the Climate Regime	218
	1 Differentiation in the UNFCCC	218
	2 Kyoto Protocol: The ‘High-Water Mark’ of Differentiation	221
	3 The Road to Paris: Re-articulating Differentiation	223
	4 Differentiation in the Post-Paris Regime	227
D	Carbon Markets, Interests and Responsibility	230
	1 The Clean Development Mechanism (CDM), Offsets and Trade-Offs	232
	2 Post-Kyoto Discussions on Market Mechanisms	237
	3 REDD+: ‘first ripe fruit in the pledge-and-review architecture’	240
E	Redressing Differentiated Capacity: Capacity-Building As Governance Reform	243
	1 REDD+-Readiness, Capacity-Building and International Partnerships	244
	2 REDD+-Readiness, Rule of Law and ‘Good Governance’ Promotion	247
F	Conclusion	255
5	Scale, Multilevel Governance and the Disaggregation of Property Rights in REDD+	256
A	Introduction	256
B	Rights in Forest Carbon	259
	1 Carbon Rights	260
	2 Forest Tenure	266

C	Common Property Regimes and Natural Resources	269
1	Common Property Resources As a Development Strategy	272
2	Property Rights Regimes and Natural Resources	277
3	Decentralisation and Natural Resource Governance	280
4	Polycentric Governance and Nested, Multilevel Institutional Arrangements	283
5	Legal Pluralism and Customary Tenure	287
D	Conclusion	293
6	REDD+ at the ‘Local’ Level: Between Rights and Responsibilisation	294
A	Introduction	294
B	Managing Social Risks	296
C	Disciplinary Inclusion in the Green Economy	301
D	Indigenous Human Rights, Recognition and Cultural Difference	304
E	Identifying ‘Stakeholders’: The Constitution of Environmental Subjects	307
1	Indigenous Peoples	308
2	‘Local Communities’	315
3	Identifying the ‘Subjects’ of Safeguards in REDD+	318
F	Strategies to Manage the ‘Social’: Between Rights and Responsibilisation	322
1	Benefit Sharing	322
2	Tenure Reform	329
3	Free, Prior and Informed Consent	336
G	Conclusion	349
7	Conclusion: Possibilities for Climate Justice and Planetary Co-habitation	351
	<i>Bibliography</i>	357
	<i>Index</i>	411

Acknowledgements

The friend...precedes and enables thought itself... That one never thinks alone [but] always in common is an ancient truth of thought... With my friend... I may come to think anew and differently.¹

Writing is predominantly a solitary process, but the process of thinking through and formulating new ideas is necessarily a collective process grounded in collegial exchange. This project would not have been possible without the rich scholarly interactions I have been so fortunate to enjoy alongside the solidarity and support of family and friends. Unavoidably, too, one always writes from somewhere and with a specific orientation. I acknowledge that most of this book was written on the unceded lands of the Wurundjeri people of the Kulin nations, and I pay respects to their elders, past and present.

My passion for this project arose out of work with Friends of the Earth International on climate justice. Special thanks are due to Rebecca Pearse, Ellen Roberts and Holly Creanaune, as well as Pius Ginting, Muliardi, Norhadie, Deddy Ratih, Arie Rompas, Teguh Surya, Dipti Bhatnagar, Jeff Conant, Lucia Ortiz, Claudia Ramos-Guillén and Isaac Rojas for critical conversations on these themes. Thank you also to Teishan Ahearne and Jessica Malka Richter for travelling with me to Central Kalimantan, and to Daniel McIntyre for many discussions over many years.

This book developed out of a doctoral thesis, and particular thanks are due to Margaret Young, Maureen Tehan, Lee Godden and Kirsty Gover for their guidance throughout that project and for the freedom they allowed me to explore my ideas. Special thanks are due to Sundhya Pahuja for her continued support of this project, her critical encouragement and probing questions that opened up new lines of

¹ C. Casarino and A. Negri, *In Praise of the Common: A Conversation on Philosophy and Politics* (The University of Minnesota Press, 2008) p. 38.

enquiry. At Melbourne Law School I was fortunate to be part of an engaged community of scholars, including Tsegaye Regassa Ararssa, Marie Aronsson, Olivia Barr, Anna Driedzic, Debolina Dutta, Luis Eslava, Kathryn Greenman, Jake Goldenfein, Anne Kellis, Tim Lindgren, Liz MacPherson, Shaun McVeigh, Caitlin Murphy, Erin O'Donnell, Di Otto, Rose Parfitt, Connal Parsley, James Parker, Peter Rush, Oishik Sircar and Cait Storr. A Residential Fellowship at the Institute of Global Law and Policy (IGLP) at the Harvard Law School allowed me precious time to write, and I am grateful to David Kennedy for this opportunity and to my colleagues Lina Céspedes-Báez, Tomaso Ferrando and Maya Savevska.

The book started to take its current shape whilst I was a postdoctoral fellow at the Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas at Austin; this process of reformulation was enriched by conversations with Karen Engle as well as with Daniel Brinks, William Forbath and many others. The manuscript was finalised after I found a new academic home in the School of Law at La Trobe University, where I was welcomed and supported by Lola Akin Ojelabi, Madeline Chiam, Maria Elander, Fiona Kelly, Anita Mackay, Hannah Robert, Emma Russell, Kerstin Steiner, Savitri Taylor, Marc Trabsky and many others. Throughout the long process of writing, my thinking has been influenced in different ways by many colleagues, and I'm particularly grateful to Ben Golder, Rajshree Chandra, Deval Desai, Michael Fakhri, Isabel Feichtner, Anna Gear, Stephen Humphreys, Karin Mickelson, Usha Natarajan, Jordy Silverstein and Peer Zumbansen.

I was fortunate to present earlier versions of parts of this book at numerous academic conferences and workshops, including Law and Society Association annual meetings, the Third World Approaches to International Law Conferences (Cairo 2015 and Singapore 2018), the Institute for Global Law and Policy Workshops (2014 and 2015) and Conference (2015), the Transnational Law Summer School (2015), the Melbourne Doctoral Forum on Legal Theory (2010 and 2012), Critical Legal Conference (2014) and more. I am grateful to all my interlocutors and commentators, whose probing questions, insightful comments and constructive critiques provided generative impetus for deeper thinking.

Parts of Chapters 1, 6 and 7 build on arguments previously published in 'Indigenous peoples and REDD+ safeguards: Rights as resistance or disciplinary inclusion in the green economy?' (2016) 6(2) *Journal of Human Rights and the Environment* 170–217. Similarly, parts of the analysis in chapters 2 and 3 draws on my chapter 'One tonne of carbon dioxide equivalent' in Jessie Hohmann and Daniel Joyce (eds), *International Law's Objects* (Oxford University Press, 2018) pp. 305–18; and 'Carbon colonialism or climate justice?: Interrogating the international climate regime from a TWAIL perspective' (2016) 33(3) *Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice* 129–61. Finally, Chapter 4 further develops some themes initially discussed in 'Reflections on Paris: Thoughts towards a critical approach to climate law' (2018) *Quebec Journal of International Law* 61–91. Throughout this manuscript the 'I' in

‘Indigenous’ has been capitalised as a measure of respect and to reflect the plurality of diverse, sovereign peoples the term refers to. However, the lowercase ‘i’ has been retained in direct quotes from other materials.²

I am enormously indebted to those who generously read and provided comments on parts of earlier drafts, including Tom Andrews, Kathleen Birrell, Matt Canfield, Madelaine Chiam, Sara Dehm, Maria Elander, Lee Godden, Adil Hasan Khan, Sarah Mason-Case, Hannah Robert, Emma Russell and Ntina Tzouvava. I am enormously grateful to Stephanie Falconer, Julia Farrell, Laura Griffin, Carol Peterson and David Venema for all their assistance in finalising the manuscript. I was fortunate to enjoy the companionship of Tom Andrews, Polly Bennett, Katie Buckley, Vicky Huang, Jason Murphy as well as everyone at La Trobe Researchers Shut Up and Write, #melbwiteup and the Tuesday MLS Writing Group during the process of writing. Deep thanks are also due to Matt Gallaway, Cameron Daddis, Franklin Mathews Jebaraj and Catherine Smith everyone at Cambridge University Press for their support and patience throughout this process. I’m particularly grateful to Kathy McKenzie for her thoughtful, careful and perceptive edits on this manuscript.

My deepest thanks to my family: to Sara, Ben and Leo for their support, which has sustained me, to Anna for her patience, and to my parents, Doris and Burkhard, for their encouragement, belief in me and unwavering love. Finally, completing this project would not have been possible without the joy of countless conversations with Adil Hasan Khan as we work towards cultivating a companionship of care.

Finally, I acknowledge my daughter, Aalia, who was only a dream while this book was being written, but during the final pre-publication stages she has blessed my days with immense joy, providing a constant reminder of the fierce love that animates our ongoing struggles for ecologically just futures.

² G. Younging, *Elements of Indigenous Style: A Guide for Writing By an About Indigenous Peoples* (Brush Education, 2018)

Abbreviations

AAU	assigned amount unit
ADP	Ad Hoc Working Group on the Durban Platform for Enhanced Action
AFOLU	agriculture, forestry and other land use
A/R	afforestation and reforestation
AWG-KP	Ad Hoc Working Group on the Kyoto Protocol
AWG-LCA	Ad Hoc Working Group on Long-term Cooperative Action
BAU	business-as-usual
CAFI	Central African Forest Initiative
CBDR	common but differentiated responsibilities
CBDR-RC	common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CERs	certified emission reductions
CIFOR	Center for International Forestry Research
CMA	Conference of the Parties Serving as Meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement
CMP	Conference of the Parties Serving as Meeting of the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol
CO ₂	carbon dioxide
CO ₂ e	carbon dioxide equivalent
COP	Conference of the Parties
CORSIA	Carbon Offset and Reduction Scheme for International Aviation
CPF	Collaborative Partnership on Forests
CPR	common property regime
CPRNet	Common Property Resources Management Network
ER	emission reduction
ERPA	Emission Reduction Purchase Agreement

ER-PIN	Emission Reduction–Program Idea Note
ESF	Environmental and Social Framework
ESS7	Environmental and Social Standard 7
ETS	emissions trading scheme
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
FCPF	Forest Carbon Partnership Facility
FERL/FRL	forest emission reference level/forest reference level
FoEI	Friends of the Earth International
FPIC	free, prior and informed consent
FPP	Forest Peoples Programme
GHG	greenhouse gas
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
IEL	international environmental law
IETA	International Emissions Trading Association
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
IIPFCC	International Indigenous Peoples’ Forum on Climate Change
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
ILA	International Law Association
INDC	intended nationally determined contribution
ITMO	internationally transferred mitigation outcome
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature
JI	Joint Implementation
KFCP	Kalimantan Forest Carbon Partnership
LULUCF	land use, land-use change and forestry
MMRV/ MRV	monitoring, measuring report and verification/ measuring, reporting and verification
NAMA	nationally appropriate mitigation actions
NDC	nationally determined contributions
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NIEO	New International Economic Order
NMM	new market mechanisms
ODA	overseas development assistance
ODI	Overseas Development Institute
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PES	payment for environmental services
ppm	parts per million
PSNR	permanent sovereignty over natural resources
QELRC	quantified emission limitation or reduction commitments
RED	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation

List of Abbreviations

xvii

REDD+	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Degradation
REL/RL	reference emission levels/reference level
R-Package	Readiness Package
R-PIN	Readiness Plan Idea Note
R-PP	Readiness Preparation Proposal
RRI	Rights and Resources Initiative
SSAHUTLC	Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities
SBI	Subsidiary Body for Implementation
SBSTA	Subsidiary Body for Scientific and Technological Advice
SFM	sustainable forest management
tCO ₂ e	tonne carbon dioxide equivalent
TEEB	The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity
TFAP	Tropical Forest Action Plan
TWAIL	Third World Approaches to International Law
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNCITRAL	United Nations Committee on International Trade Law
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNFF	United Nations Forum on Forests
UNPFII	United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Peoples
UN-REDD	United Nations collaborative initiative on Reducing Emission from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD) in developing countries
US	United States of America
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VGGT	Voluntary Guidelines on the Responsible Governance of Tenure of Land, Fisheries and Forests in the Context of National Food Security
WRI	World Resources Institute
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature