The Cambridge Companion to Gershwin

George Gershwin is often described as a quintessentially American composer. This Cambridge Companion explains why, engaging with the ways in which his music was shaped by American political, intellectual, cultural, and business interests. As a composer and performer, Gershwin embraced technological advances and broke new ground in music business practices. In the decades preceding World War II, he captured the mechanistic pulse of modern life with his concert works and lay the groundwork for the Great American Songbook with his Broadway shows and film music. With his brother Ira, and his cousins Henry and B. A. Botkin, Gershwin explored various ethnic and cultural identities and contemplated their roles in US culture. His music confronted race during the Jim Crow era and continues to engage with issues of race today. This interdisciplinary exploration of Gershwin’s life and music describes his avowed pursuit of an “American” musical identity and its ongoing legacy.

Anna Harwell Celenza is the Thomas E. Caestecker Professor of Music at Georgetown University, where she also serves as core faculty in the American Studies Program. She is the author/editor of many scholarly books, including the award-winning Jazz Italian Style: From Its Origins in New Orleans to Fascist Italy and Sinatra (Cambridge, 2017). She has published numerous articles on a range of composers, from Franz Liszt and Gustav Mahler to Duke Ellington, Billy Strayhorn, and Louis Armstrong.
Cambridge Companions to Music

Topics

The Cambridge Companion to Ballet
Edited by Marion Kant

The Cambridge Companion to Blues and Gospel Music
Edited by Allan Moore

The Cambridge Companion to Choral Music
Edited by André de Quadros

The Cambridge Companion to the Concerto
Edited by Simon P. Keefe

The Cambridge Companion to Conducting
Edited by José Antonio Bowen

The Cambridge Companion to Eighteenth-Century Opera
Edited by Anthony R. DeLDonna and Pierpaolo Polzonetti

The Cambridge Companion to Electronic Music
Edited by Nick Collins and Julio D’Escriván

The Cambridge Companion to Film Music
Edited by Mervyn Cooke and Fiona Ford

The Cambridge Companion to French Music
Edited by Simon Trezise

The Cambridge Companion to Grand Opera
Edited by David Charlton

The Cambridge Companion to Hip-Hop
Edited by Justin A. Williams

The Cambridge Companion to Jazz
Edited by Mervyn Cooke and David Horn

The Cambridge Companion to Jewish Music
Edited by Joshua S. Walden

The Cambridge Companion to the Lied
Edited by James Parsons

The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Music
Edited by Mark Everist

The Cambridge Companion to Music in Digital Culture
Edited by Nicholas Cook, Monique Ingalls and David Trippett

The Cambridge Companion to the Musical, third edition
Edited by William Everett and Paul Laird

The Cambridge Companion to Opera Studies
Edited by Nicholas Till

The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra
Edited by Colen Lawson

The Cambridge Companion to Percussion
Edited by Russell Hartenberger

The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock
Edited by Simon Frith, Will Straw and John Street

The Cambridge Companion to Recorded Music
Edited by Eric Clarke, Nicholas Cook, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson and John Rink
The Cambridge Companion to the Singer-Songwriter
Edited by Katherine Williams and Justin A. Williams

The Cambridge Companion to the String Quartet
Edited by Robin Stowell

The Cambridge Companion to Twentieth-Century Opera
Edited by Mervyn Cooke

Composers

The Cambridge Companion to Bach
Edited by John Butt

The Cambridge Companion to Bartók
Edited by Amanda Bayley

The Cambridge Companion to the Beatles
Edited by Kenneth Womack

The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven
Edited by Glenn Stanley

The Cambridge Companion to Berg
Edited by Anthony Pople

The Cambridge Companion to Berlioz
Edited by Peter Bloom

The Cambridge Companion to Brahms
Edited by Michael Musgrave

The Cambridge Companion to Benjamin Britten
Edited by Mervyn Cooke

The Cambridge Companion to Bruckner
Edited by John Williamson

The Cambridge Companion to John Cage
Edited by David Nicholls

The Cambridge Companion to Chopin
Edited by Jim Samson

The Cambridge Companion to Debussy
Edited by Simon Trezise

The Cambridge Companion to Elgar
Edited by Daniel M. Grimley and Julian Rushton

The Cambridge Companion to Duke Ellington
Edited by Edward Green

The Cambridge Companion to Gershwin
Edited by Anna Harwell Celenza

The Cambridge Companion to Gilbert and Sullivan
Edited by David Eden and Meinhard Sarembe

The Cambridge Companion to Handel
Edited by Donald Burrows

The Cambridge Companion to Haydn
Edited by Caryl Clark

The Cambridge Companion to Liszt
Edited by Kenneth Hamilton

The Cambridge Companion to Mahler
Edited by Jeremy Barham
The Cambridge Companion to the Recorder
Edited by John Mansfield Thomson

The Cambridge Companion to the Saxophone
Edited by Richard Ingham

The Cambridge Companion to Singing
Edited by John Potter

The Cambridge Companion to the Violin
Edited by Robin Stowell
The Cambridge Companion to

GERSHWIN

..................

EDITED BY

Anna Harwell Celenza
Georgetown University, Washington DC
Contents

List of Figures xi
List of Tables xii
List of Music Examples xiii
List of Contributors xiv
Preface xvii
Acknowledgments xx

Part I Historical Context 1
1 The Unlikely Patriarch
   Michael Owen 3
2 Hearing Gershwin’s New York
   Ellen Noonan 16
3 Gershwin’s Musical Education
   Susan Neimoyer 29
4 Gershwin in Hollywood
   Jessica Getman 43

Part II Profiles of the Music 57
5 Blue Monday and New York Theatrical Aesthetics
   Kristen M. Turner 59
6 Broadway in Blue: Gershwin’s Musical Theater
   Scores and Songs
   Todd Decker 80
7 The Works for Piano and Orchestra
   Timothy Freeze 102
8 Harmonizing Music and Money: Gershwin’s Economic
   Strategies from “Swanee” to An American in Paris
   Mark Clague 130
9 Exploring New Worlds: An American in Paris, Cuban
   Overture, and Porgy and Bess
   Anna Harwell Celenza 153
10 Complexities in Gershwin’s Porgy and Bess: Historical
   and Performing Contexts
    Naomi André 182
11 Writing for the Big Screen: Shall We Dance and
   A Damsel in Distress
   Nathan Platte 197
Part III Influence and Reception

12 The Coverage of Gershwin in Music History Texts
   Howard Pollack

13 When Ella Fitzgerald Sang Gershwin: A Chapter from
   the Great American Songbook
   Will Friedwald

14 The Afterlife of Rhapsody in Blue
   Ryan Raul Bañagale

15 Broadway’s “New” Gershwin Musicals: Romance, Jazz,
   and the Ghost of Fred Astaire
   Todd Decker

16 Gershwin and Instrumental Jazz
   Nate Sloan
   Epilogue: The Gershwin I Knew, and the Gershwin I Know
   Michael Feinstein

Guide to Further Reading

Index
Figures


4.1 Music composer George Gershwin painting the portrait of fellow composer Arnold Schoenberg, 1936. Photo by Gabriel Hackett/Archive Photos/Getty Images

9.1 George Gershwin works on a score at the piano in his 72nd Street apartment, New York, New York, 1934. Photo by PhotoQuest/Getty Images

10.1 The cast of George Gershwin’s Porgy and Bess performing on stage, 1935. Photo by Pictorial Parade/Archive Photos/Getty Images
Tables

3.1 Composers most frequently represented in Gershwin’s concert program collection (arranged in order from most to least heard) page 35
3.2 Better-known composers with only one work in Gershwin’s concert program collection 36
3.3 Representative major works listed in Gershwin concert programs 37
6.1 “Production” numbers and published “hits” in five Gershwin scores (musical comedies staged between 1924 and 1930 included among reconstruction recordings) 86
7.1 George Gershwin, Concerto in F, Mvt. 1: formal overview 107
7.2 George Gershwin, Second Rhapsody: formal overview 115
7.3 Extant recordings of concerti with George Gershwin as soloist 122
8.1 Performances of An American in Paris 1928–1929 144
Music Examples

7.1a) C. Conrad and J. R. Robinson, “Singin’ the Blues”  page 104
b) Transcription of Gershwin’s roll recording 104

7.2a) George Gershwin, Concerto in F, Mvt. 1, R13-1–R14 110
b) Anton Rubinstein, Piano Concerto No. 4, Mvt. 1, mm. 130–36 111

7.3 George Gershwin, Concerto in F, Mvt. 1: Gradual Synthesis of P and S 112

7.4 George Gershwin, “I Got Rhythm” Variations, Piano Solo, R28+10–R28+13 121

7.5 Rhapsody in Blue, m. 302: voicing of final chord 126

16.1 “Fascinating Rhythm,” chorus, mm. 1–4 277

16.2 “I Got Rhythm,” chorus, mm. 1–4 278

16.3 Transcription of Lester Young’s solo on “I Got Rhythm,” 1944, Take 2, 00:20–00:25 279

16.4 “Rhythm-a-ning,” B section, mm. 17–24 281

16.5a) Gershwin chord changes, “But Not for Me,” chorus, mm. 1–4 282
b) Coltrane reharmonization, “But Not for Me,” chorus, mm. 1–4 282
Contributors

Naomi André is Professor in Afroamerican and African Studies, Women’s Studies, and the Residential College at the University of Michigan. Her research focuses on opera and issues surrounding gender, voice, and race. Her work focuses on opera from the nineteenth to the mid-twentieth centuries and explores constructions of gender, race, and identity. Her books include: *Voicing Gender: Castrati, Travesti, and the Second Woman in Early Nineteenth-Century Italian Opera* (Indiana University Press, 2006); *Blackness in Opera*, coedited with Karen M. Bryan and Eric Saylor (University of Illinois Press, 2012); and *Black Opera: History, Empowerment, Engagement* (University of Illinois Press, 2018).

Ryan Raul Bañagale is an Associate Professor of Music at Colorado College. His first book, *Arranging Gershwin: Rhapsody in Blue and the Creation of an American Icon*, was published by Oxford University Press in 2014. He also sits on the editorial board of the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition* and has edited the original jazz-band arrangements of *Rhapsody in Blue*.

Anna Harwell Celenza is the Thomas E. Caestecker Professor of Music at Georgetown University, where she also serves as a core member of the American Studies Program. She is the author of several scholarly books, the most recent being the award-winning *Jazz Italian Style, from Its Origins in New Orleans to Fascist Italy and Sinatra*. In addition to her scholarly work, she has served as a writer/commentator for National Public Radio and published eight award-winning children’s books. She is also an active curator, and her most recent exhibition catalogue, *Margaret Bonds and Langston Hughes: A Musical Friendship*, won a 2018 Leab Exhibition Award by the American Library Association.

Mark Clague is an Associate Professor of Musicology at the University of Michigan and the General Editor of the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition*, for which he has edited the composer’s *An American in Paris*. He is currently at work on a book for W. W. Norton on the “Star-Spangled Banner.”


Michael Feinstein, founder of the Great American Songbook Foundation in 2007, has built a career over the last three decades as a performer and writer as evidenced from recordings that have earned him five Grammy Award nominations to his Emmy nominated PBS-TV specials and NPR series. He is the
**List of Contributors**

Principal Conductor of the Pasadena Pops and Kravis Center Pops Orchestras. He is also author of the award-winning book *The Gershwin's and Me: A Personal History in Twelve Songs*.

**Timothy Freeze** currently holds the Pocock Family Distinguished Visiting Professorship at The College of Wooster. He has published research on Gustav Mahler, Viennese operetta, and Aaron Copland and is currently working on critical editions of Gershwin’s Concerto in F and “I Got Rhythm” Variations for the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition*.

**Will Friedwald** is a freelance critic and author with a special interest in the Great American Songbook. He writes about music and popular culture for *The Wall Street Journal* and *Vanity Fair*. He also is the author of eight books including the award-winning *A Biographical Guide to the Great Jazz and Pop Singers; Sinatra: The Song Is You; Stardust Melodies; Tony Bennett: The Good Life; Looney Tunes & Merrie Melodies; Jazz Singing: America’s Great Voices from Bessie Smith to Bebop and Beyond; and The Great Jazz and Pop Vocal Albums*. He has written over 600 liner notes for compact discs, received ten Grammy nominations, and appears frequently on television and other documentaries. He is also a consultant and curator for Apple Music.

**Jessica Getman** is the Managing Editor of the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition*. Before joining the staff of the University of Michigan, she worked as an editorial assistant for *Music of the United States of America*, a scholarly series of music editions published for the American Musicological Society by A-R Editions. Her research on music and film has been published in the *Journal of the Society of American Music*.

**Susan Neimoyer** is Visiting Professor of Music Composition and History at Brigham Young University – Idaho. A specialist in twentieth-century American music, her dissertation focused on Gershwin’s musical education. Her research in the areas of Gershwin and Canadian singer-songwriter Joni Mitchell has been published in *The Musical Quarterly, Journal of Musicology, American Music*, and the Canadian journal *Intersections*. She is currently preparing an edition of Gershwin’s *Lullaby for String Quartet* for the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition*.

**Ellen Noonan** is Clinical Associate Professor of History and Director of the Archives and Public History Program at New York University. Her award-winning book, *The Strange Career of Porgy and Bess* (University of North Carolina, 2012), examines the opera’s long history of invention and reinvention as a barometer of twentieth-century American expectations about race, culture, and the struggle for equality.

**Michael Owen** is the Historian and Archivist for the Ira and Leonore Gershwin Trusts, where he also curates www.gershwin.com, the official George and Ira Gershwin website. He is the author of *Go Slow: The Life of Julie London* (Chicago Review Press, 2017). He is currently preparing *The Gershwins Abroad*, an annotated version of Ira Gershwin’s 1928 travel journal, as a volume for the *George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition*, for which he is a member of the editorial board, and is at work on a full-length biography of the lyricist.
Nathan Platte is an Associate Professor of Music at the University of Iowa. His publications explore film music of Hollywood’s studio era and the collaborative process of film scoring. His books include The Routledge Film Music Sourcebook (coedited with James Wierzbicki and Colin Roust), Franz Waxman’s “Rebecca”: A Film Score Guide (co-authored with David Neumeyer) and Making Music in Selznick’s Hollywood. He is currently completing a critical edition of the film score to Damsel in Distress for the George and Ira Gershwin Critical Edition.

Howard Pollack is the John and Rebecca Moores Professor of Music at the University of Houston. He has published widely in the field of American music, including the award-winning books Aaron Copland: The Life and Work of an Uncommon Man, George Gershwin: His Life and Work, Marc Blitzstein: His Life, His Work, His World, and The Ballad of John Latouche: An American Lyricist’s Life and Work.

Nate Sloan is an Assistant Professor of Musicology at the University of Southern California. He is the author of articles on Harold Arlen and Cab Calloway and co-author of Switched on Pop: How Popular Music Works, and Why It Matters (Oxford University Press, 2019). He hosts the podcast Switched on Pop and is currently preparing a book on the history of the Cotton Club.

Kristen M. Turner is a lecturer at North Carolina State University. Her research centers on staged musical entertainment in the United States at the turn of the twentieth century. Her publications on American operatic culture have appeared in the Journal of Musicological Research and the Journal of the Society for American Music. The National Endowment for the Humanities and the Society for American Music have supported the research for her forthcoming book on the role of opera in American popular entertainment.
Preface

George Gershwin (1898–1937) is frequently defined as one of the most emblematically American composers of the twentieth century. An intuitive and inquisitive artist, he tapped into the pulse of the 1920s Jazz Age and created a range of works that straddled the supposed boundary between “high brow” and “low brow” cultures. In the decades preceding World War II, Gershwin became an international sensation with his concert works *Rhapsody in Blue* (1924), *Concerto in F* (1925), and *An American in Paris* (1928). To many listeners at the time, these compositions seemed to capture the mechanistic pulse of modern life, with its soaring skyscrapers, roaring automobiles, and pulsating rhythms. Similarly, his *Cuban Overture* (1932) tapped into the public’s growing interest in Latin America.

Gershwin’s work for Broadway and Hollywood, with collaborators such as his brother Ira and Fred and Adele Astaire, produced a series of sensational revues, light-hearted musical comedies, and satirical political operettas that reflected urban American popular culture of the 1920s and 1930s. In the realm of opera, Gershwin offered two works based on African American characters. The first, *Blue Monday* (1922), was a one-act, blackface “Afro-American Opera” that was roundly rejected by audiences and critics alike. The second, *Porgy and Bess* (1935), marked the acme of Gershwin’s compositional career. It is a work that is equally powerful and controversial and since its premiere has garnered both praise and criticism.

Gershwin also dominated the realm of popular music during the 1920s and 1930s, and his numerous tunes for stage and screen became standards in the canon of American popular song. His lyricist for nearly all of these works was his older brother, Ira. A few of their most memorable collaborations include: “I Got Rhythm,” “’S Wonderful,” “Strike Up the Band,” “Oh, Lady Be Good,” “Fascinating Rhythm,” “Someone to Watch Over Me,” “Embraceable You,” “Let’s Call the Whole Thing Off,” and “They Can’t Take That Away from Me.”

Gershwin’s interest and success in both “serious” and “popular” music often led to a muddled reception of his work among contemporary critics, which in turn impeded serious study of his music by scholars for several decades after his death. Consequently, his music is often referred to as quintessentially American without any in-depth exploration of what such a
classification actually means and how it has come into existence. For example, how did his music interact with the racial terrain of American culture during the Jim Crow era? And does it continue to engage with issues of race today? How has Gershwin’s legacy been shaped by American intellectual, political, and business interests? Did technology play a role in the shaping of an “American” sound? If yes, then how did this influence Gershwin’s creative identity? In pursuit of answers to questions such as these, the Cambridge Companion to Gershwin offers an interdisciplinary study of Gershwin’s life and music that explores, in various ways, his avowed pursuit of an “American” musical identity.

The son of Jewish immigrants from Russia, Gershwin was a product of multicultural New York. Eager to imbibe as wide an array of music influences as possible, he familiarized himself with the various traditions New York had to offer, from the European classics of the concert hall to the Yiddish Theater songs and Klezmer tunes of the Lower East Side, the music of Tin Pan Alley and Broadway, and the African American jazz of Harlem. Over the course of his career, Gershwin was praised and criticized in equal measure for his willingness to borrow and fuse musical elements from various cultural and ethnic realms: classical and jazz, white and black, Jewish and gentile, urban and rural. As the chapters in this volume collectively explain, this “melting pot” mentality affected not only the content of Gershwin’s music, but also its reception over the past century. Gershwin regularly tapped into the aesthetic values and popular tastes of his surroundings in an attempt to compose works that would connect with as broad and diverse a public as possible. This approach to composition produced mixed results. Although contemporary audiences embraced most of his works when they first appeared, and many of these compositions (most notably Rhapsody in Blue) have stood the test of time, other pieces (such as the blackface hit “Swanee”) have understandably received a cooler reception by twenty-first-century audiences. Still, all these works are important if we are to understand fully Gershwin’s place in the musical canon; collectively, all of these works contributed to his identity as a composer.

Ever since the premiere of Rhapsody in Blue, Gershwin’s compositions have been at the center of key developments in the history of jazz, although certain aspects of his style and legacy still sit uncomfortably within it. The question of whether Gershwin’s work deserves the appellation of “jazz” at all has occupied musicians and critics since the debut of Rhapsody in Blue. Consequently, the contributors to this volume explore Gershwin’s fluid status as a composer linked to jazz, popular music, and concert music and in so doing highlight disciplinary tensions that have developed in American scholarship over music, commerce, and race.
Preface

Gershwin came of age during the watershed years of recorded sound, and the differing technical innovations and limitations of gramophones, radio, and film noticeably influenced the structure, distribution, and preservation of his music. The Cambridge Companion to Gershwin engages with various extra-musical phenomena (i.e. technology, ethnicity, race, religion, politics, and the burgeoning music industry) in its discussions of the composer’s life and works. Consequently, the volume is divided into three primary parts: 1) “The Historical Context,” which explores Gershwin’s life, education, and connections with local communities in New York and Los Angeles; 2) “Profiles of the Music,” which offers discussions of his compositional practices as they pertained to specific genres and local stimuli; and 3) “Influence and Reception,” which examines various responses to and treatments of Gershwin’s music after his death.

Gershwin’s compositions do not sit easily in a single musical category. Because he consciously combined classical music, jazz, blues, and popular song – artistic traditions with different performance practices and conventions of musical notation – his compositions do not always speak to a clearly definable audience or evoke a particular moment in American history. Instead, they are shifting entities, whose content, orchestration, performance style, and cultural significance continue to change from one generation to the next.
Acknowledgments

The Cambridge Companion to Gershwin is the result of multiple generations of music scholarship. The insights revealed in each chapter are deeply indebted to the groundbreaking contributions made by previous scholars, most notably Richard Crawford, Steven Gilbert, Edward Jablonski, Howard Pollack, David Schiff, Wayne Schneider, and Larry Starr.

Special thanks also go to Harlan Greene and Stephanie Yuhl for their insights concerning Charleston, SC and Gershwin’s various visits there, my research assistant at Georgetown University, Leanne Almeida, and the Georgetown students who participated in my “Gershwin’s World” seminar in Fall 2018, especially Tory Broadus. Your insights and enthusiasm for the project kept me motivated. Thank you also to my colleagues in the Department of Performing Arts, the American Studies Program, and the Americas Initiative. The administration at Georgetown University offered what is most valuable to a scholar in the humanities: a semester of research leave. For this I am very grateful.

A volume such as this is dependent on the knowledge and insights of great archivists and librarians. Special thanks to the staff of the George and Ira Gershwin Collection at the Library of Congress, the Archives of American Art, the Archives & Special Collections at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln Libraries, the Special Collections Research Center at Syracuse University Libraries, the College of Charleston Special Collections, and the Booth Family Center for Special Collections at Georgetown University. Jessica Getman proved especially helpful, not only in her contribution of a chapter to this book, but also for reading drafts of chapters by other contributors and assisting in the acquisition of permissions for the volume’s music examples.

Once again, working with Cambridge University Press has been a wonderful experience, and this is largely due to the enthusiastic support I have received from my editor, and now great friend, Kate Brett. Gratitude also goes to Janice Baiton, Eilidh Burrett, Sunantha Ramamoorthy, and Lisa Sinclair for the copyediting and production of this book.

Finally, I would like to thank my husband, Chris, for all the years of love and encouragement. With each new project, you cheer me on, which makes the research and writing all the more enjoyable.