

Attitude Reports

Propositional attitude reports are sentences built around clause-embedding psychological verbs, like *Kim believes that it's raining* or *Kim wants it to rain*. These interact in many intricate ways with a wide variety of semantically relevant grammatical phenomena, and represent one of the most important topics at the interface of linguistics and philosophy, as their study provides insight into foundational questions about meaning. This book provides a bird's-eye overview of the grammar of propositional attitude reports, synthesizing the key facts, theories, and open problems in their analysis. Couched in the theoretical framework of generative grammar and compositional truth-conditional semantics, it places emphasis on points of intersection between propositional attitude reports and other important topics in semantic and syntactic theory. With discussion points, suggestions for further reading, and a useful guide to symbols and conventions, it will be welcomed by students and researchers wishing to explore this fertile area of study.

THOMAS GRANO is Associate Professor in the Department of Linguistics at Indiana University Bloomington. He is the author of *Control and Restructuring* (2015) and his work has appeared in numerous journals.

KEY TOPICS IN SEMANTICS AND PRAGMATICS

'Key Topics in Semantics and Pragmatics' focuses on the main topics of study in semantics and pragmatics today. It consists of accessible yet challenging accounts of the most important issues, concepts and phenomena to consider when examining meaning in language. Some topics have been the subject of semantic and pragmatic study for many years, and are re-examined in this series in light of new developments in the field; others are issues of growing importance that have not so far been given a sustained treatment. Written by leading experts and designed to bridge the gap between textbooks and primary literature, the books in this series can either be used on courses and seminars, or as one-stop, succinct guides to a particular topic for individual students and researchers. Each book includes useful suggestions for further reading, discussion questions and a helpful glossary.

Already published in the series:

Meaning and Humour by Andrew Goatly

Metaphor by L. David Ritchie

Imperatives by Mark Jary and Mikhail Kissine

Modification by Marcin Morzycki

Semantics for Counting and Measuring by Susan Rothstein

Irony by Joana Garmendia

Implicatures by Sandrine Zufferey, Jacques Moeschler and Anne Reboul

The Semantics of Case by Olga Kagan

Forthcoming titles:

Frame Semantics by Hans C. Boas

Proper Names and Direct Reference by Gregory Bochner

Semantics and Pragmatics in Sign Languages by Kathryn Davidson Zaremba

Propositional Logic by Allen Hazen and Jeffrey Pelletier

Indirect Speech Acts by Nicolas Ruytenbeek

Attitude Reports

THOMAS GRANO

Indiana University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42328-1 — Attitude Reports
Thomas Grano
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108423281

DOI: 10.1017/9781108525718

© Thomas Grano 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Grano, Thomas, author.

Title: Attitude reports / Thomas Grano.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021 |

Series: Key topics in semantics and pragmatics | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020049790 (print) | LCCN 2020049791 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108423281

(hardback) | ISBN 9781108437202 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108525718 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Propositional attitudes. | Semantics. | Pragmatics. |

Grammar, Comparative and general—Sentences. | Grammar, Comparative and general—Syntax. | Modality (Linguistics) | Intentionality (Philosophy) | Scope (Linguistics)

Classification: LCC P99.4.P72 G734 2021 (print) | LCC P99.4.P72 (ebook) |

DDC 401/.45—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020049790>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020049791>

ISBN 978-1-108-42328-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42328-1 — Attitude Reports
Thomas Grano
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Amanda

Contents

Acknowledgments page xi
List of Abbreviations Used in Glosses xiii

1. Introduction 1
 - 1.1 What Are Attitude Reports? 1
 - 1.2 Why a Book about Attitude Reports? 3
 - 1.2.1 Attitude Reports and Sentence Meaning 4
 - 1.2.2 Attitude Reports and Proper Names 6
 - 1.2.3 Attitude Reports and Grammar 7
 - 1.3 The Approach 8
 - 1.4 A Note on Readership and Topical Emphasis 9
 - 1.5 Guide to Logical Symbols and Notational Conventions 10
 - 1.6 Chapter Summaries 13
 - 1.7 Further Reading 14
2. Foundations 15
 - 2.1 Introduction 15
 - 2.2 Background on Possible Worlds Semantics 16
 - 2.2.1 Extensional Semantics and Its Limits 16
 - 2.2.2 Introducing Intensions 22
 - 2.3 Attitudes in Possible Worlds Semantics 26
 - 2.3.1 Logical Relations between Propositions 26
 - 2.3.2 The Hintikkan Approach to Attitude Semantics 29
 - 2.3.3 Predictions of the Hintikkan Approach 33
 - 2.4 The Problem of Logical Omniscience 36
 - 2.4.1 A Tension 36
 - 2.4.2 Strategy #1: Complicate the Hintikkan Semantics 39
 - 2.4.3 Strategy #2: Abandon the Hintikkan Semantics 41
 - 2.5 Hyperintensionality: Ways of Fine-Graining 42
 - 2.5.1 Motivation 42
 - 2.5.2 Propositional Concepts 47
 - 2.5.3 Impossible Worlds 49

- 2.5.4 Situations 51
- 2.5.5 Structured Propositions 52
- 2.5.6 Sententialism 53
- 2.5.7 Interpreted Logical Forms 54
- 2.5.8 Taking Stock 55
- 2.6 Attitudes, Event Semantics, and Decomposition 55
- 2.7 Discussion Questions 63
- 2.8 Further Reading 65
- 3. Attitude Reports and Proper Names 66
 - 3.1 Introduction 66
 - 3.2 The Non-rigid Designator Approach 68
 - 3.3 The Pragmatic Approach 71
 - 3.4 The Hidden Indexicals Approach 75
 - 3.5 Kripke's Puzzle 76
 - 3.6 Substitution in Simple Sentences 79
 - 3.7 Discussion Questions 80
 - 3.8 Further Reading 80
- 4. The *de dicto*/*de re* Ambiguity 82
 - 4.1 Introduction 82
 - 4.2 The Scope Theory 84
 - 4.3 Scope Mismatches 89
 - 4.3.1 Scope Islands 90
 - 4.3.2 Scope Paradoxes 93
 - 4.3.3 Third Readings 94
 - 4.3.4 Summary 96
 - 4.4 Resolving the Mismatches 97
 - 4.4.1 World Pronouns 97
 - 4.4.2 Split Intensionality 102
 - 4.4.3 Presupposition Projection 105
 - 4.5 Double Vision 106
 - 4.5.1 The Puzzle 107
 - 4.5.2 Acquaintance Relations 109
 - 4.5.3 The Shortest Spy 112
 - 4.5.4 *Res* Movement 115
 - 4.5.5 Concept Generators 117
 - 4.6 Taking Stock 119
 - 4.7 Discussion Questions 120
 - 4.8 Further Reading 121

5. *De se* Attitude Reports 122
 - 5.1 Introduction 122
 - 5.2 Divorcing *de se* from Semantic Binding 125
 - 5.3 Properties and Centered Worlds 126
 - 5.4 PRO as Author-/Addressee- or Center-Denoting 132
 - 5.5 The *de re* Blocking Effect 137
 - 5.6 *De se* as a Special Case of *de re*? 140
 - 5.6.1 The Argument from Agreement 141
 - 5.6.2 The *de se* Generalization 142
 - 5.7 Expanding the Empirical Coverage 143
 - 5.7.1 Logophors 144
 - 5.7.2 Shifted Indexicals 146
 - 5.7.3 Long-Distance Reflexives 151
 - 5.8 Discussion Questions 152
 - 5.9 Further Reading 153

6. Desire Reports and Beyond 154
 - 6.1 Introduction 154
 - 6.2 Belief-Relativity 154
 - 6.2.1 The Better-Worlds Approach 155
 - 6.2.2 The Best-World Approach 159
 - 6.2.3 A Doxastic Presupposition 160
 - 6.2.4 Refining the Presupposition 162
 - 6.3 Monotonicity 164
 - 6.4 Conjunction Introduction and Conflicting Desires 168
 - 6.5 Gradability 172
 - 6.6 Focus-Sensitivity 174
 - 6.7 Presupposition Projection 176
 - 6.8 The Typology of Attitude Predicates 177
 - 6.9 Discussion Questions 182
 - 6.10 Further Reading 183

7. Other Topics 184
 - 7.1 Introduction 184
 - 7.2 Attitude Reports and Embedded Tense 184
 - 7.2.1 Introduction 184
 - 7.2.2 Tense Basics 185
 - 7.2.3 Tense Binding in Attitude Reports 186
 - 7.2.4 Past under Past: Sequence of Tense 188
 - 7.2.5 Present under Past: Double Access 192

7.3	Neg Raising	193
7.3.1	Introduction	193
7.3.2	In Favor of a Syntactic Approach	194
7.3.3	Against a Syntactic Approach	196
7.4	Intensional Transitive Verbs	198
7.4.1	Introduction	198
7.4.2	Diagnosing Intensionality	199
7.4.3	Propositionalism	200
7.4.4	Intensionalism	203
7.5	Discussion Questions	204
7.6	Further Reading	205
	<i>Glossary</i>	207
	<i>Bibliography</i>	213
	<i>Index</i>	233

Acknowledgments

Many people helped make this book possible. First, I would like to thank (in alphabetical order) Alexander Williams, Ezra Keshet, Hazel Pearson, Kirk Ludwig, Larry Moss, Milo Phillips-Brown, Orin Percus, and Valentine Hacquard. Some of you offered concrete feedback on specific sections of this book. Some of you offered general advice and encouragement. All of you deserve some of the credit for the parts of this book that I got right. Of course, I assume 100% responsibility for those parts that – despite my best efforts – I inevitably got wrong.

I would like to thank Helen Barton at Cambridge University Press for her guidance, responsiveness, and encouragement throughout the preparation of this book, from the initial idea all the way through to the finished manuscript. I am also very grateful to two anonymous referees for their highly constructive feedback on the proposal and on the manuscript itself. Both of them helped improve the final product in important ways.

I would also like to thank my department colleagues and students at Indiana University for helping to create the kind of intellectually stimulating and collegial environment that makes writing a book like this possible. I wrote most of this book in my office at work, where you gave me the space that I needed, but also brought many forms of welcome relief that happily prevented this book from consuming my professional life for the past couple of years – even if world events compelled me to finish the book from home. At the time of this writing, I sorely miss your company, and hope that things get back to something like normal soon.

There is no way I can properly thank Amanda Grano, whose support (mental, emotional, and otherwise) since we met over twelve years ago goes beyond what words can express. (I know it's a cliché, but it's true.) It's been almost four years since I first had the idea for this book, and you've helped that time go by so quickly that it's hard to believe it represents almost a third of our lives together so far. At the time of this

writing, our lives are about to take an exciting turn, and finishing this book seems an appropriate way for me to help mark that transition.

Finally, thanks go to my dog Beatrix (who's now been in our lives almost as long as this book project), my cat Maggie (who's old enough to remember keeping me company while I wrote my dissertation), and my cat Polly (short for Polysemy). I thank the three of you not only for your companionship throughout the years of working on this project, but also for your unwitting roles as protagonists in many of the example sentences featured in this book. Your names endowed these examples with a vividness (perhaps, in Kaplan's 1968 sense) that helped me approach them with a fresh mind, and with that said, I hope that readers will be charitable with some examples in understanding that these names refer to dogs and cats (e.g. *Beatrix chases Maggie*), while humoring me by pretending that they are people when the examples make much more sense that way (e.g. *Beatrix believes that she left her keys in the car.*) To what extent nonhuman animals have propositional attitudes that we can report on is a fascinating topic, but not one that I mean to stumble into in this book.

List of Abbreviations Used in Glosses

- AREALS = areal subject (Navajo)
- COMPL = complementizer
- COP = copula
- FUT = future tense
- IMPF = imperfective aspect
- LOG = logophor
- NOM = nominative case
- NEG = negation
- OBL = oblique
- PERF = perfect aspect
- PFV = perfective aspect
- POSS = possessive
- PRES = present tense
- PST = past tense
- 1S = first-person singular
- 1SO = first-person singular object
- 3S = third-person singular
- 3SM = third-person singular masculine
- TOP = topic marker