

RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION AND CULTURAL CONTEXT

Generations of festering culture wars, compounded by actual wars in predominantly Muslim countries, the terrorism of ISIS and the ongoing migrant crisis, have all combined to make religious discrimination the most pressing challenge now facing many governments. For the leading common law nations, with their shared Christian cultural heritage balanced by a growing secularism, the threat presented by this toxic mix has the potential to destabilise civil society. This book suggests that the instances of religious discrimination, as currently legally defined, are constrained by that cultural context, exacerbated by a policy of multiculturalism and in practice conflated with racial, ethnic and other forms of discrimination. Kerry O'Halloran argues that many culture war issues – such as those that surround the pro-choice/pro-life debate and the rights of the LGBT community – can be viewed as rooted in the same Christian morality that underpins the law relating to religious discrimination.

KERRY O'HALLORAN is a professionally qualified lawyer and social worker, and Adjunct Professor at the Australian Centre for Philanthropy and Non-profit Studies at The Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane. He is the author of *Religion, Charity and Human Rights* (Cambridge, 2014).



Issues of religious discrimination – whether real or imaginary – have become ever more important in a world that is increasingly polarised between secularism and religious fundamentalism. This book is an important contribution to the debate on the "culture wars" as viewed through the lens of some of the major multi-cultural common law jurisdictions.

Frank Cranmer

Centre for Law and Religion, Cardiff University, UK

Religious Discrimination and Cultural Context tackles some of the most perplexing social issues that are facing liberal democracies today as Christianity wanes and the ISIS challenge to social cohesion grows. The laws of England and Wales, Ireland, the USA, Canada, Australia and New Zealand and their cultural context are examined in relation to the main areas of religious discrimination. The book tracks how infractions are processed through regulatory or judicial systems and considers the significance of any jurisdictional similarities or differences in the way issues are resolved. This poses questions such as: will governments be moved from a position of State neutrality to assert a positive policing role, regulating for the public benefit, in respect of religious matters? It is a thought-provoking contribution for our times.

Myles McGregor-Lowndes

Australian Centre for Philanthropy and Nonprofit Studies, QUT, Australia

This book is an intriguing and challenging assessment of the ability of the law to address the problem of religious discrimination in an increasingly multicultural society. In particular, O'Halloran explores the manner in which religion and culture are frequently intertwined in ways that often result in religious discrimination becoming a means of expressing cultural animus. The so-called "culture wars" provide the backdrop for a study of the ways in which the moral arguments advanced by its various participants often merely serve as proxies for religious or cultural discrimination. The book contains an exhaustive survey of legal prohibitions against religious discrimination across the common law world that will prove invaluable to researchers in religion, human rights and comparative law. More importantly, O'Halloran shows that the common law has not yet developed the tools to address claims of discrimination where culture and religion are intertwined. Religious Discrimination and Cultural Context is an important contribution to a debate that is sure to intensify as our society becomes ever more globalised in the years to come.

Matthew P. Harrington

Law Faculty, University of Montreal, Canada



RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION AND CULTURAL CONTEXT

A Common Law Perspective

KERRY O'HALLORAN

Queensland University of Technology





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108423052 DOI: 10.1017/9781108394871

© Kerry O'Halloran 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42305-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Introduction 1	
PART I Background	
Identity, Alienation and the Law: The Twentieth-Co Legacy 7	entury
Religion, Culture and Religious Discrimination	46

page vii

PART II Balancing Public and Private Interests

Religion: The Public and the Private

4 The International Framework and Themes of Religious Discrimination 111

PART III Contemporary Religious Discrimination in Common Law Jurisdictions: The Judicial Rulings

5 England and Wales 169

Acknowledgements

1

2

3

- 6 Ireland 225
- 7 The United States of America 274
- 8 Canada 331
- 9 Australia 380
- 10 New Zealand 426

V



526

Index

vi				CONTENTS			
		PART IV Religion and Discrimination: An Overview				ew	
	11	Themes of Jurisdictional Commonality and Difference				e	465
	12	Contexting	g Religi	on, Culture and Di	scrimination	492	
		Conclusion	n 5	21			



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A sincere debt of gratitude is owed to Professor Myles McGregor-Lowndes¹ for his support and friendship and to the Australian Centre for Philanthropy and Nonprofit Studies, my academic base as Adjunct Professor for the past thirteen years. This book has built on foundations laid in *Religion*, *Charity and Human Rights*,² as supplemented by other earlier publications, and I am mindful of the very many who advised and contributed along the way.

Particular thanks are due to those who offered comment on draft chapters: Neil Foster,³ Beth Gaze⁴ and Myles (Australia); Bill Atkins⁵ (New Zealand); Frank Cranmer⁶ and Maleiha Malik⁷ (England and Wales); Gerard Whyte⁸ and Eoin Daly⁹ (Ireland); Fred Gedicks¹⁰ and David Smolin¹¹ (USA); and Matthew Harrington¹² (Canada).

Your thoughtful contributions and encouragement have meant a lot and this book, and its author would have suffered without them.

I am very thankful to Cambridge University Press for commissioning the book and for the editorial diligence that has seen it through to completion. Responsibility for any mistakes, inconsistencies or other faults, and for all views expressed, must rest exclusively with me.

- ¹ Founder Director, the Australian Centre of Philanthropy and Nonprofit Studies, Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane, Australia.
- ² Cambridge University Press 2014.
- ³ Associate Professor, Newcastle Law School, the University of Newcastle, Australia.
- ⁴ Professor, Law School, University of Melbourne, Victoria, Australia.
- ⁵ Professor of Law, Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand.
- ⁶ Research Fellow at the Centre for Law & Religion, Cardiff and Director, Central Lobby Consultants, Wales.
- ⁷ Professor of Law, King's College London, England.
- ⁸ Professor of Law, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland.
- ⁹ Lecturer, the National University of Ireland, Galway, Ireland.
- 10 Professor of Law, J. Reuben Clark Law School, Brigham Young University, USA.
- ¹¹ Professor of Law, Director, Center for Biotechnology, Law, and Ethics, Samford University, USA.
- ¹² Professeur, Faculté de droit, Université de Montréal, Canada.

vii



viii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

As always, Elizabeth, I am hugely grateful to you for your endless patience, tolerance and good humour, when you had so many other worries and preoccupations – and thanks also to Maddy for your impromptu but always uplifting violin concertos.