In this book, Steven Levine explores the relation between objectivity and experience from a pragmatic point of view. Like many new pragmatists, he aims to rehabilitate objectivity in the wake of Richard Rorty’s rejection of the concept. But he challenges the idea, put forward by pragmatists like Robert Brandom, that objectivity is best rehabilitated in communicative-theoretic terms – namely, in terms that can be cashed out by capacities that agents gain through linguistic communication. Levine proposes instead that objectivity is best understood in experiential-theoretic terms. He explains how, in order to meet the aims of the new pragmatists, we need to do more than see objectivity as a norm of rationality embedded in our social-linguistic practices; we also need to see it as emergent from our experiential interaction with the world. Innovative and carefully argued, this book redeems and reactualizes for contemporary philosophy a key insight developed by the classical pragmatists.

Steven Levine is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts Boston. He has published articles on the work of Sellars, Brandom, McDowell, and Davidson, as well as on a range of issues in classical and contemporary pragmatism.
PRAGMATISM, OBJECTIVITY, AND EXPERIENCE

STEVEN LEVINE
University of Massachusetts Boston
For
Shawn Spencer,
Contents

Acknowledgments \hfill page viii

Introduction \hfill 1

PART I \hfill 19
1 Rorty and the Rejection of Objectivity \hfill 21
2 Brandom, Pragmatism, and Experience \hfill 43
3 Communication, Perception, and Objectivity \hfill 82

PART II \hfill 121
4 An Experiential Account of Objectivity \hfill 123
5 Pragmatism, Experience, and Answerability \hfill 157
6 Meaning, Habit, and the Myth of the Given \hfill 192
Conclusion \hfill 235

References \hfill 243
Index \hfill 254
Acknowledgments

Some of the material included in this book is drawn from previously published work. I am grateful for permission to use this work. Chapter 1 is a slightly altered version of “Rehabilitating Objectivity: Rorty, Brandom, and the New Pragmatists,” Canadian Journal of Philosophy, 40 (4), December 2010, while portions of Chapter 2 are drawn from “Norms and Habits: Brandom on the Sociality of Action,” European Journal of Philosophy, 23 (2), June 2015.

In writing this book, I racked up many intellectual debts – so many, in fact, that I am no longer responsible for any of my mistakes.

First off, I would like to thank all of my colleagues, past and present, at the University of Massachusetts Boston. It is a wonderful environment in which to work and think, and this book would have been very different had I been elsewhere. I single out two colleagues, Jeremy Wanderer and Danielle Bromwich, for special thanks. Jeremy not only read several chapters of the book but also has given me countless ideas and suggestions throughout the years. I thank Danielle not because I learned much from her about pragmatism (though she wrote her MA Thesis on Peirce, so I should have) but because she is such a great friend, intellectually and otherwise.

I am deeply grateful to Roberto Frega, Alex Klein, and Carl Sachs, each of whom read parts of the book. Their comments have been invaluable. I would also like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press. Their comments led to quite far-reaching changes in the book, making it much better than it would have otherwise been.

For philosophical conversation, criticism, and encouragement, I would also like to thank Doug Anderson, Maria Baghramian, Aude Bandini, Matt Boyle, Lee Braver, Robin Celikates, Shannon Dea, Bill DeVries, Paul Giladi, Mathias Girel, Russell Goodman, Federica Gregoratto, David Hildebrand, Christopher Hookway, Hans Joas, John Kaag, Buffalo Bob King, Jonathan Knowles, Robert Kraut, Mark Lance, David Macarthur,
Acknowledgments

Stéphane Madelrieux, Cheryl Misak, Dick Moran, Christian Neuhäuser, Mark Okrent, Pete Olen, Jim O’Shea, Gregory Pappas, Robert Pippin, Henrik Rydenfelt, Arvi Särkelä, Bob Stern, Italo Testa, and Jörg Volbers. My final intellectual debt is to my teachers Richard Bernstein, Alice Crary, and Jay Bernstein. Their impact on the content of this book is incalculable.

I also want to thank my editor Hilary Gaskin for seeing the value of this project and for skillfully shepherding it through to the end. I thank Sophie Taylor, Thomas Haynes, and Sriganesh Krishnamoorthy for all of their help with production, and Stefany Anne Golberg, Elizabeth Sharp-Levine, Elizabeth Kelly, and especially Shawn Spencer for countless hours of proofreading.

My greatest debts are of a more personal nature. My mother, Judy Levine, has been incredibly supportive of my intellectual efforts throughout the years. I cannot thank her enough. The same goes for my brother Paul Levine (keep on rocking), my fabulous sisters Elizabeth and Julia Sharp-Levine, and their mother, Pam Sharp. I would also like to thank my in-laws, Liz and Ed Spencer, my sister-in-law and brother-in-law, Shannon Spencer and Rich Wallace, as well as their children, Tucker and Jonah, for all of their support and encouragement.

However, it is the woman who has to put up with me on a daily basis, Shawn Spencer, who has my deepest gratitude. But hopefully, she already knows that.