

Buying Audiences

Scholars typically emphasize the importance of organized networks and long-term relationships for sustaining electoral clientelism. Yet electoral clientelism remains widespread in many countries despite the weakening of organized parties. This book offers a new account of how clientelism and campaigning work in weak party systems and in the absence of stable party-broker relationships. Drawing on an in-depth study of Peru using a mixed methods approach and cross-national comparisons, Muñoz reveals the *informational* and *indirect* effects of investments made at the campaign stage. By distributing gifts, politicians buy the participation of poor voters at campaign events. This helps politicians improvise political organizations, persuade poor voters of candidates' desirability, and signal electoral viability to strategic donors and voters, with campaign dynamics ultimately shaping electoral outcomes. Among other contributions, the book sheds new light on role of donations and business actors and on ongoing challenges to party building.

Paula Muñoz is Professor of Social and Political Sciences at the Universidad del Pacífico, Peru. Her research focuses on Latin American politics, political parties, and clientelism. Her dissertation received the 2014 Juan Linz Award for Best Dissertation in the Comparative Study of Democracy in the Comparative Democratization Section, American Political Science Association.

Buying Audiences

*Clientelism and Electoral Campaigns
When Parties are Weak*

PAULA MUÑOZ
Universidad del Pacífico



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-42259-8 — Buying Audiences
 Paula Muñoz
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025,
 India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108422598
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108525015

© Paula Muñoz 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019
 Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.
 A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Muñoz Chirinos, Paula, 1977– author.
 TITLE: Buying audiences : clientelism and electoral campaigns when parties are weak / Paula Muñoz.
 OTHER TITLES: Campaign clientelism in Peru
 DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Revision of author's thesis (doctoral)—University of Texas at Austin, 2013, titled Campaign clientelism in Peru : an informational theory. | Includes bibliographical references.
 IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018038596 | ISBN 9781108422598 (hardback)
 SUBJECTS: LCSH: Patronage, Political—Peru. | Patron and client—Peru. | Political campaigns—Peru. | Political culture—Peru.
 CLASSIFICATION: LCC JL348I .M86 2019 | DDC 324.70985—DC23
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018038596>

ISBN 978-1-108-42259-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*For my mom, Edda, who, among many other things,
taught me to be perseverant.*

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	I
2 An Informational Theory of Electoral Clientelism	17
3 Clientelistic Linkages in Peru and the Limits of Conventional Explanations	53
4 Convoing Voters and Establishing Electoral Viability	87
5 Persuasion from the Citizens' Point of View	124
6 Analyzing Campaigns	155
7 Conclusions	205
<i>Appendix 1: Calvo and Murillo's Method</i>	243
<i>Appendix 2: Balance Test of Survey Experiment Included in Ipsos 2012</i>	245
<i>Appendix 3: Figure 4.1 Data Table and Results</i>	246
<i>Appendix 4: Figure 4.2 Data Table and Results</i>	246
<i>Appendix 5: Figure 4.3 Data Table and Results</i>	246
<i>Appendix 6: Figure 4.4 Data Table and Results</i>	247
<i>Appendix 7: Figure 4.5 Data Table and Results</i>	247
<i>Appendix 8: Figure 4.6 Data Table and Results</i>	247
<i>Appendix 9: Figure 4.7 Data Table and Results</i>	248
<i>Appendix 10: Figure 4.8 Data Table and Results</i>	248

<i>Appendix 11: Focus Group Guide (Spanish)</i>	248
<i>Appendix 12: List of Interviews and Focus Groups</i>	251
<i>Interviews</i>	251
<i>Focus Groups</i>	261
<i>References</i>	263
<i>Index</i>	285

Figures

1.1	Latin America 2010: Percentage of vote-buying attempts by level of party organization	<i>page</i> 4
3.1	Salaries and capital investment in Peru (1970–2011)	56
3.2	Dendrogram describing the structure of networks in Peru	63
3.3	Plot of inter-group correlations in Peru	65
4.1	Turnout figures' effect on the likelihood to vote for the candidate	104
4.2	Likelihood to vote for the candidate	107
4.3	Likelihood to vote for the candidate by socioeconomic status	108
4.4	Likelihood that the candidate will win the race	108
4.5	Likelihood that the candidate will help poor people if elected	109
4.6	Likelihood that the candidate will help poor people if elected by socioeconomic status (ATE)	109
4.7	Likelihood that the candidate will deliver the public works that the district needs if elected, by socioeconomic status (ATE)	110
4.8	Likelihood that the candidate will fulfill his campaign promises if elected	111
5.1	Interest in politics among respondents who attended campaign clientelism events, by socio economic status	130
5.2	Frequency of news consumption by material wealth (linear prediction)	132

5.3	Political knowledge by socio economic status	143
6.1	Cusco's 2010 regional election: voting intention polls	172
6.2	Cusco's city 2010 municipal election: vote intention polls	177
6.3	2010 regional election in Piura: voting intention polls	191
6.4	Piura's city 2010 municipal election: voting intention polls	196
7.1	Percentage of population targeted with gifts, by poverty rate in Peruvian departments	228
7.2	Clientelistic offers by poverty rate in Latin America	229

Tables

2.1	Empirical implications: Conventional approaches	<i>page</i> 51
2.2	Empirical implications: Informational approaches	51
3.1	Political networks by sizes	62
3.2	Clientelistic offers during electoral campaigns	79
3.3	Attitudes toward vote buying by belief in the secrecy of the vote	81
3.4	Attitudes toward vote buying by experience of threat	82
4.1	Campaign clientelism by respondent's SES	90
4.2	Reasons for attendance by SES	90
4.3	Cues to evaluate electoral viability (2012)	95
4.4	Cues to evaluate electoral viability (2017)	96
4.5	Probability of voting for candidate by turnout (dichotomous)	103
5.1	Persuasion at campaign events	125
5.2	Frequencies of codes across focus groups	127
5.3	Interest in politics by SES	130
6.1	Case selection variables	157
6.2	Mechanisms at work in Cusco's campaigns	166
6.3	Cusco: 2006 regional elections results	168
6.4	Cusco: 2010 regional elections results	176
6.5	Cusco: 2010 municipal election results	183
6.6	Mechanisms at work in Piura's campaigns	184

6.7	Piura: 2006 regional elections results	186
6.8	Piura: 2010 regional elections results	194
6.9	Piura: 2010 municipal election results	200
6.10	Electoral results by district, poverty, and rurality	201

Acknowledgments

This book started with my doctoral dissertation research and has come a long way since. The story of this research project is indeed very entangled with important stages of my professional and personal life. As soon as I returned to Peru from the United States to start conducting fieldwork for my dissertation, my mom's cancer relapsed and she passed away a few months later. I postponed the date of my first field trip outside Lima for as long as I could, and made the best use I could of the Dissertation Fellowship (and, later on, of two Summer Research Fellowships) I was generously granted by the Department of Government at the University of Texas at Austin. When I went back at UT-Austin and started writing my dissertation, I soon had to accept that there was no escaping cervical spine surgery to deal with a painful problem in my neck and arm that were preventing me from typing and generally from living normally. My full recovery from this process took much longer than the doctors had expected and accompanied me throughout my dissertation writing process. After defending the dissertation in May 2013, I started along a new path in my professional life by joining the Universidad del Pacífico faculty in Peru. Coming back home and facing the challenges of a new job slowed down my progress with the book project. Nonetheless, winning the 2014 Juan Linz Best Dissertation Award from the Comparative Democratization Section of the American Political Science Association convinced me to invest more time and energy in the book project. A couple of years later, I managed to send the book manuscript to Cambridge University Press for revision from the maternity work-room (literally) hours before my son Ignacio was born. My baby and other professional

obligations distracted me more than I expected, so I had to make a special effort to find the time and energy to revise the manuscript in order to address the reviewers' criticisms and suggestions in 2017. But, although my progress was slow, I finally made it. The very last stage of this book project came along with more amazing news: a new pregnancy. I clicked the "send" button on my message to Sara Doskow, my editor, the final manuscript attached, when the onset of nausea, exhaustion, and other first-trimester symptoms convinced me I *had* to "finish finishing" revisions and send out the final manuscript. If everything goes well with the editing schedule, I thought, my book will see the light of day this year, after my baby daughter is born. This acknowledgment recognizes the different individuals and institutions that supported me in various ways and during the different stages of this long process, thus helping me successfully push through it.

The financial support for this project came from different sources. It was possible in the first place thanks to grants and fellowships provided by the Department of Government and the Lozano Long Institute of Latin American Studies at UT-Austin. I would also like to acknowledge the Instituto de Opinión Pública – Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú (IOP) for their genuine interest in supporting academic research in Peru, in particular my colleagues David Sulmont and Vania Martínez who were working there at the time. The IOP included (pro bono) several items related to my research in their 2012 national survey, without which finishing the first stage of the research project would have been infeasible. Finally, the support of the Centro de Investigación de la Universidad del Pacífico (CIUP) was crucial during the later stages of the book. Their institutional funds afforded me the time and assistance I needed to expand my research and finish the project. In addition, a collaborative effort in 2017 with *Proética*, aimed at designing and conducting a survey on perceptions of corruption and sponsored partially by our *Vicerrectorado de Investigación*, allowed me to include the most recent empirical data available. Thus, without the Universidad del Pacífico's support, this book project would not have come to fruition.

I am extremely grateful for the generous intellectual support of Raúl Madrid and Kurt Weyland, my dissertation co-supervisors. Since I started working on my dissertation proposal, Raúl and Kurt were great at providing me detailed, prompt, and constant feedback. Throughout all the stages of this intellectual process, my supervisors were extremely supportive and pushed me to keep working and making improvements. And they continued doing so even after I graduated. Thank you both for your

Acknowledgments

xv

mentorship. I could not have asked for more accessible and engaged advisors and colleagues. The other members of my dissertation committee – Henry Dietz, Wendy Hunter, Javier Auyero, and Ken Greene – also contributed to the development of this project. The comments, criticism, and suggestions they provided during my dissertation defense were exceptional and helped give me focus for my book project. As a good friend of mine, also a political scientist, used to tell me, I had *un comité de lujo* (a “deluxe committee”). I am particularly grateful to Javier, whom I also met several times while I was conducting field work and during the writing process. His experience in studying poor people’s politics in Latin America, as well as his intellectual generosity, were extremely helpful in clarifying my ideas.

Besides my chairs and the dissertation committee members, many other colleagues also gave me their insights, suggestions, and criticism at different stages of the project. I thank the participants of the Latin American Faculty–Student Group at UT-Austin for their constructive comments and criticisms of my work. Eduardo Dargent, my colleague and husband, has accompanied me throughout the entire project, giving me wise and useful advice (more on this later). Two very good friends and generous colleagues, Austin Hart and Ezequiel González-Ocantos, encouraged me and gave me insightful suggestions to improve my project during the most challenging stages of the research process. Daniel Nogueira-Budny read my first draft chapters and accompanied me very closely during the final stage of the dissertation writing. I am also indebted to Steve Levitsky, who discussed several dissertation-related products with me during his visiting year in Peru. I am likewise grateful to the participants and discussants at the Universidad de Los Andes-Bogotá seminar and the Latin American Studies Association (LASA) Conference. Moreover, I was very lucky to have a book workshop dedicated to my first manuscript at the Red de Economía Política Para América Latina (REPAL) 2016 Conference, planned by Ben Schneider, the host at MIT, and by Juan Pablo Luna and María Victoria Murillo, as program chairs. The generous criticism and comments I received there from two excellent and generous discussants, Juan Pablo Luna and Alisha Holland, encouraged me to push through the last stage of the book project.

I must also recognize the expertise and generosity of Ernesto Calvo who, without knowing me, shared the documents he used to conduct and analyze the networks estimation technique I replicate in Chapter 3. I am also grateful to José Luis Incio, now studying for his PhD at Pittsburgh University, who let me contribute to the design and discussion

of The Peruvian Voter survey while working at the *Jurado Nacional de Elecciones*, a project that informed my research. My friend and colleague Arturo Maldonado attended the IOP's survey design meetings in 2012 and gave me great feedback for the design of my first survey experiment. In addition, I want to acknowledge Samuel Rotta's interest for including more academic-driven questions in the design of Proética's National Corruption survey in Peru and inviting me to help with two survey designs.

While working in the book project, critical research assistance (and friendship) were provided by Yamilé Guibert, Viviana Baraybar, and Madaí Urteaga. I am particularly indebted to Vivi, who assisted me throughout the manuscript's final revision process as well as with very tedious details in the book editing process. Without her help and her smiling face, I would have gone crazy and postponed finishing this book even longer. I also want to express my gratitude for the great feedback and suggestions I received from two anonymous reviewers who certainly helped to make this book better. Finally, I recognize that I have been very lucky to have Sara Duskow as my editor. She has been professional, supportive, and effective throughout the revision and editorial process.

While conducting fieldwork, many people opened doors for me. Numerous politicians, experts, journalists, and citizens kindly shared their opinions and experience with me. This book would have been unthinkable without them. I cannot go on without singling out Sergio Sullca, Marco Zeisser, Roberto Romero, and Mario Carrión in Cusco, and Luis Loja, Elizabeth Rodríguez, and Rodrigo Urbina in Piura, for their help in the field. My work in Piura would have been extremely difficult without the generosity and kindness of Ceci Trelles and Raúl Aragón, my host family. I got to know the Aragón family circumstantially, but they became like a real family to me and made my stay in Piura unforgettable. I will always remember my conversations with Fernando, who sadly left us before I got back to Peru.

Other friends also made life more enjoyable throughout this research project. My friends Austin Hart, Laura Field, Erin Byrd, Ilana Lifshitz, Daniel Nogueira-Budny, Luis Camacho, Mary Slosar, Manuel Balán, Rodrigo Nunes, Sandra Botero, Rachel Sternfeld, and Kate Bersch made my stay at graduate school nicer, as too did other friends in Austin such as Carla, Solange, Lissette and Huáscar, Nora, María José, Isabel, Omar and Belén, Nino and Paola, Pucho and Kris, among others. My colleagues at the Universidad del Pacífico these past few years have also accompanied my academic progress with interest, caring advice, and friendship, particularly Cynthia Sanborn, Martín Monsalve, and César Guadalupe.

Acknowledgments

xvii

Finally, I cannot finish without thanking my closest family and friends for their emotional support and companionship during these years. My mom, Edda Chirinos-Gratta, was super strong during the time we were apart while I was pursuing my doctoral studies, which coincided with the relapse of her cancer. Despite this, she never stopped encouraging me to finish my dissertation and graduate. Mirella and Hilda, my mom's close friends, as well as Inés, all accompanied me in their own ways during the hardest time of my life. Ada, Matt, Noah, and Sofía made my final stay in Austin enjoyable. Felipe and Gabriela Dargent from Canada always kept in touch, as did my father, Jorge, from Chile. My parents-in-law, Leti and Yayo, have been extremely supportive, encouraging, and loving during all these years. Leti and Yayo also welcomed and took care of our "baby" dogs, Lucas, and more recently Kusi and Wayra, when we were not able to do so. My friendship with Pepa, Lorena, Alejandra, Elisa, and Zuly, my "sisters," only grew stronger during these years. Alberto and Miné were always there too. After coming back to Lima, I was welcomed into a group of friends at the university, the self-styled "*Tallas*," a new (and growing) family to us now. I was also able to meet more regularly with my godmother Dina and my godfather Chiqui, who left us last year but was always enthusiastic and proud of my professional accomplishments. I also want to thank Mónica and Lidia who lovingly helped me take care of Ignacio and the house this past year, making it possible for me to concentrate fully on my book project. Finally, and most importantly, I want to thank Eduardo Dargent, my loving husband, friend, and colleague. Eduardo has helped me in so many ways during these years that this book would have been impossible without him. For one, he has been the "hidden" advisor in this academic project: Eduardo has been patient enough to (endlessly) listen to me while trying to clarify my ideas and has given me extensive comments on tons of dissertation/book-related documents. Besides his intellectual generosity, Edu's lust for life, strength, love, and care helped me get through the many hardships that coincided with the project. And the happiness that we share with our son Ignacio, soon to be extended to our daughter, Agustina spurred me on to finish the book.