

From Triumph to Crisis

The postcommunist countries were among the most fervent and committed adopters of neoliberal economic reforms. Not only did they manage to overcome anticipated domestic opposition to "shock therapy" and Washington Consensus reforms, but many fulfilled the membership requirements of the European Union and even adopted avant-garde neoliberal reforms such as the flat tax and pension privatization. Neoliberalism in the postcommunist countries went farther and lasted longer than expected, but why? Unlike preexisting theories based on domestic political-economic struggles, this book focuses on the imperatives of reinsertion into the international economy. Appel and Orenstein show that countries engaged in "competitive signaling" by enacting reforms to attract foreign investment. This signaling process explains the endurance and intensification of liberal economic reforms in these countries for almost two decades, from 1989 to 2008, and their decline thereafter, when inflows of capital into the region suddenly began to dry up. This book will interest students of political economy and East European and Eurasian politics.

HILARY APPEL is Podlich Family Professor of Government and George R. Roberts Fellow at Claremont McKenna College. Her research examines the politics of postcommunist economic reform, fiscal governance, privatization, policies of retrospective justice, and issues of identity in Eastern Europe. Her publications include the books: *Tax Politics in Eastern Europe: Globalization, Regional Integration and the Democratic Compromise* (2011), *A New Capitalist Order: Privatization and Ideology in Russia and Eastern Europe* (2004), and two edited volumes. She has also published numerous articles appearing in journals including *World Politics*, *Comparative Politics*, and *Comparative Political Studies*.

MITCHELL A. ORENSTEIN is Professor and Chair of Russian and East European Studies at the University of Pennsylvania. His research focuses



on the political economy and foreign policy of postcommunist states. He is the author of two prize-winning books, Out of the Red: Building Capitalism and Democracy in Postcommunist Europe (2001) and Privatizing Pensions: The Transnational Campaign for Social Security Reform (2008), several prominent World Bank policy research publications on pension privatization and Roma poverty, and numerous articles appearing in journals including Comparative Politics, Comparative Political Studies, Governance, Journal of Common Market Studies, and Foreign Affairs.



From Triumph to Crisis

Neoliberal Economic Reform in Postcommunist Countries

HILARY APPEL Claremont McKenna College

MITCHELL A. ORENSTEIN University of Pennsylvania





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108422291 DOI: 10.1017/9781108381413

© Hilary Appel and Mitchell A. Orenstein 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42229-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-43505-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Martine R. Haas and Vincenzo Quadrini





Contents

List of Figures and Tables		page viii
List of Abbreviations		ix
Acknowledgments		X
1	Triumph and Crisis of Neoliberalism	1
2	First Phase: The Washington Consensus	33
3	Second Phase: Europeanization	65
4	Third Phase: Avant-Garde Neoliberalism	90
5	Competitive Signaling and Foreign Direct Investment	116
6	The Crisis of Neoliberalism	142
7	Revising Transition Theory	173
References		196
Index		239

vii



Figures and Tables

rigi	1105	
1.1	Liberalization 1980–2015 by World Region	page 10
1.2	Average Corporate Tax Rates	29
2.1	Gini Coefficients for Select East European Countries	42
2.2	EBRD Price Liberalization Ratings	43
2.3	EBRD Trade Liberalization Ratings	43
2.4	EBRD Large-Scale Privatization Ratings	44
4. 1	Ideological Orientation of Twenty-One Postcommunist	
	Flat Tax Adopters	107
4.2	PCEECs: Flat Tax and Pension Privatization - Cumulativ	e
	Count	108
4.3	Ten-Year Global Trends in Corporate Tax Rates	109
4.4	2016 Corporate Income Tax Rates (Nominal by Region)	110
5.1	FDI Flows to PCEECs, 1991–2016 (USD billions)	136
5.2	Regional Trends on FDI Flows from 1995 to 2016 (per capita	i) 137
5.3	Regional Trends on FDI Flows from 1995 to 2016 (USD	
	billions)	138
6.1	Support for Free Markets by Country	152
6.2	Support for Free Markets by Region	152
Tab	oles	
2.1	Voucher Privatization by Country	51
4.1	Postcommunist Countries Adopting Pension Privatization	ı
	and Flat Tax Reforms	94
4.2	Countries Adopting Pension Privatization and Flat Taxes	
	Outside the PCEECs	95
4.3	Pension Privatization in Postcommunist Countries, Initial	
	Reforms	99
4.4	Personal Income Taxes Before and After the Flat Tax	
	Revolution	103

viii



Abbreviations

CIT corporate income tax

DME(s) dependent market economy(ies)

EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ECB European Central Bank
EDBI Ease of Doing Business Index

EU European Union

FDI foreign direct investment

IFIs international financial institutions IMF International Monetary Fund

OECD Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

PCEEC(s) postcommunist European and Eurasian country(ies)

PIT personal income tax

USAID United States Agency for International Development

VAT value added tax VOC varieties of capitalism



Acknowledgments

We are filled with gratitude to numerous people who have helped us over many years of study, teaching, and writing. We wish to thank first and foremost our families, especially Vincenzo Quadrini and Martine R. Haas, for their love, patience, and support during our work on this book project and on all of our scholarly endeavors. We also wish to express our deep appreciation of our parents and our siblings.

We want to acknowledge the valuable assistance of many friends and colleagues who have read our manuscript at various stages of its development and contributed their thoughtful comments and suggestions. We know this project has benefited from the insightful contributions of our colleagues at Claremont McKenna College, the University of Pennsylvania, and Northeastern University. Special thanks go to Roderic Camp, Jennifer Taw, Aseema Sinha, William Ascher, and Minxin Pei, as well as to Peter Holquist, Ben Nathans, Kevin Platt, and Adam Leeds.

We would like to recognize the valuable feedback of those colleagues who have read parts or all of this manuscript, especially Juliet Johnson, Andrew Barnes, Richard Deeg, Wade Jacoby, R. Daniel Kelemen, Orfeo Fioretos, Mark Pollack, Julia Lynch, Jana Grittersova, David Ost, Cornel Ban, Peter Rutland, Sven Steinmo, Laura Seelkopf, Marc Berenson, Milada Anna Vachudova, Rachel Epstein, Monica Clua Losada, Cédric Durand, Besnik Pula, Yuko Adachi, and Joshua Tucker. We are also grateful for the comments by audience members in presentations of this research at our own institutions as well as at the Philadelphia Europeanist Workshop at Temple University, European Union Center of Southern California at Scripps College, Free University Berlin, King's College London, European University Institute, Northeastern University, University of Warwick Institute for Advanced Study, PONARS Eurasia workshops at the University of Helsinki and New York University Abu Dhabi, and national meetings of the Association for Slavic, East European and Eurasian



Acknowledgments

хi

Studies, the American Political Science Association, and the Council for European Studies. We are grateful to innumerable East European and Eurasian interlocutors over the years who have shared their insights and advice with us on postcommunist transformation.

In addition, we acknowledge the excellent research assistance of our undergraduate students at the University of Pennsylvania, Northeastern University, and Claremont McKenna College, with special recognition for the contributions of Nicholas Emery, Tara Roslin, Edgar Palomino, James Bilko, and Samuel Fraser.

We would like to thank John Haslam at Cambridge University Press for his interest and support of our work and Stephanie Taylor, Bronte Rawlings, and Sunantha Ramamoorthy for their assistance in moving our project along to publication. Finally, we wish to thank the publishers of the following articles for their permission to include some of our material that appeared in previous forms:

- 2016. "Why Did Neoliberalism Triumph and Endure in the Post-Communist World?" *Comparative Politics* 48 (3): 313–331. Reprinted by permission of *Journal of Comparative Politics*. http://jcp.gc.cuny.edu/2016/04/01/volume-48-number-3-april-2016/.
- 2013. "Ideas Versus Resources Explaining the Flat Tax and Pension Privatization Revolutions in Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union." *Comparative Political Studies* 46 (2): 123–152. Reprinted by permission of SAGE Publications. http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0010414012453036.

