

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
<i>A Note on the Cover</i>	xx

Part I	Foundations	1
1	Introduction: Bayesian Reasoning for Qualitative Research	3
1.1	Placing Our Approach in Perspective	6
	1.1.1 Process Tracing	7
	1.1.2 Qualitative Methods	8
	1.1.3 Multi-Method Research	9
1.2	A Guide for Readers	10
1.3	Scope of the Book	11
	1.3.1 Foundations	11
	1.3.2 Operationalizing Bayesian Reasoning in Qualitative Research	15
	1.3.3 Bayesianism in Methodological Perspective	23
	1.3.4 Bayesian Implications for Research Design	26
1.4	A Spotlight on Low-Tech Best Practices	29
2	Fundamentals of Bayesian Probability	31
2.1	Introduction	31
2.2	Deductive Logic	34
	2.2.1 Boolean Algebra	34
	2.2.2 Deductive Structure	37
2.3	Probability Theory	39
	2.3.1 Disjunction Rule	41
	2.3.2 Law of Total Probability (Marginalization)	43
	2.3.3 Bayes' Rule (Conditionalization)	44

2.4	Applying the Laws of Probability	46
2.4.1	A Walk in the Park	47
2.4.2	Partisan Coupling	50
2.4.3	Game Show	52
2.4.4	A Rare Disease	55
	Appendix 2.A Deduction, Induction, and Abduction	57
	Appendix 2.B Deriving the Product and Sum Rules from the Rationality Desiderata	59
2.B.1	Conjunction	60
2.B.2	Logical Negation	64
2.B.3	Emergence of the Product and Sum Rules	66
	Appendix 2.C Deriving the Principle of Indifference from the Rationality Desiderata	67

Part II Operationalizing Bayesian Reasoning in Qualitative Research

71

3	Heuristic Bayesian Reasoning	73
3.1	Introduction	73
3.2	Bayes' Rule for Updating Degrees of Belief in Hypotheses	75
3.3	The Hypothesis Space	78
3.3.1	Hypotheses as Logical Propositions	78
3.3.2	Specifying Concrete Alternatives	81
3.3.3	Mutual Exclusivity and Exhaustiveness	83
3.4	Prior Odds	96
3.5	Evidence	101
3.6	Likelihood Ratios	105
3.6.1	Inhabit the World of Each Hypothesis	105
3.6.2	Testimonial Evidence: Assess the Likelihood That Source S Stated X	109
3.6.3	Condition on Previously Incorporated Evidence	111
3.7	Drawing an Inference from Multiple Pieces of Evidence	116
3.8	Conclusion	117
3.9	Exercises: Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses from Contributing Causes	119
3.10	Exercises: Envisioning Discriminating Evidence	120
	Appendix 3.A Scenarios Within Worlds: Partitioning Likelihoods	122
4	Explicit Bayesian Analysis	124
4.1	Introduction	124

4.2	Bayes' Rule in Log-Odds Form	126
4.3	Quantifying Probabilities on a Logarithmic Scale	129
4.4	Consistency Checks	137
	4.4.1 Parsing the Evidence Differently	138
	4.4.2 Altering the Order of Evidence	139
	4.4.3 Considering Other Pairs of Hypotheses	140
	4.4.4 Additional Guidance	142
4.5	Application: Tax Reform in Chile	143
	4.5.1 Research Question and Hypotheses	143
	4.5.2 Weighing the Evidence	145
	4.5.3 Aggregating Weights of Evidence	155
	4.5.4 Assessing Whether a Joint Hypothesis Is Merited	155
	4.5.5 Key Conceptual Points	158
4.6	How Much Evidence to Collect and When to Stop	159
4.7	Conclusion	164
4.8	Exercise: <i>Silver Blaze</i> Weights of Evidence	167
5	Bayesian Analysis with Multiple Cases	171
5.1	Introduction	171
5.2	Cross-Case Inference: Democratic Mobilization in Southeast Asia	173
	5.2.1 The Philippines	175
	5.2.2 Vietnam	182
	5.2.3 Aggregating Weights of Evidence Across Cases	184
	5.2.4 Overview of Cross-Case Analysis	185
5.3	Cross-Case Inference: State-Building in Latin America	186
	5.3.1 Peru and Chile	189
	5.3.2 Conceptual and Practical Lessons for Bayesian Inference	199
5.4	Generalizing Scope Conditions	204
	5.4.1 State-Building in Latin American and Beyond: Prussia	208
	5.4.2 Evaluating the Results and Deciding How to Move Forward	212
5.5	Comparative Thinking in Bayesian Analysis	217
5.6	Conclusion	220
6	Hypotheses and Priors Revisited	224
6.1	Introduction	224
6.2	Hypothesis Space	225
	6.2.1 What MEE Means	225
	6.2.2 What MEE Does Not Mean	226

6.2.3	Why We Need MEE Hypotheses	229
6.2.4	Strategies for Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses	233
6.2.5	Contributing Causes vs. Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses	238
6.3	Occam Factors: A Conceptual Introduction	239
6.4	Occam Penalties in Bayesian Model Comparison	243
6.4.1	The Six of Spades Example	244
6.4.2	The Chilean Tax Reform Case	246
6.5	Joint Hypotheses and Priors: Democratic Mobilization Revisited	255
6.5.1	Rival Hypotheses	255
6.5.2	Weights of Evidence	258
6.6	Conclusion	264
6.7	Exercise: <i>Silver Blaze</i> Priors	265
7	Scrutinizing Qualitative Research	267
7.1	Introduction	267
7.2	A Framework for Scrutiny	269
7.2.1	Assessing Whether Inference Follows Bayesian Logic	269
7.2.2	Scrutinizing Weight of Evidence	271
7.2.3	Sensitivity Analysis	277
7.3	Scrutinizing Narrative Form Analysis: The Fashoda Crisis	282
7.3.1	Hypotheses, Evidence, and Suggested Exercises	285
7.3.2	Weights of Evidence	288
7.3.3	Evaluation	296
7.4	Scrutinizing Narrative Form Analysis: Land Reform in Egypt	299
7.4.1	The Power Consolidation Hypothesis	300
7.4.2	Power Consolidation vs. Humanitarianism	302
7.4.3	Power Consolidation vs. US Pressure	311
7.4.4	Power Consolidation vs. Developmental Goals	316
7.4.5	Evaluation	321
7.5	Writing Bayesian Case Narratives	325
7.6	Conclusion	328
7.7	Exercises	331
Part III Bayesianism in Methodological Perspective		333
8	Contrasting Logical Bayesianism and Frequentism	335
8.1	Introduction	335
8.2	Conceptualizations of Probability	336

8.3	Frequentist Inference	339
	8.3.1 Null Hypothesis Significance Testing	339
	8.3.2 Parameter Estimation	343
8.4	Critique of Frequentism	346
	8.4.1 Probability as Relative Frequency	346
	8.4.2 Alternative-Free Hypothesis Testing	349
	8.4.3 Hypothetical Data	353
	8.4.4 Pre-Data Questions and Long-Run Answers	360
	8.4.5 Arbitrariness and Subjectivity	363
	8.4.6 Meta-Analysis	367
8.5	Conclusion	369
8.6	Exercise: Opening a Can of Beans – What Is Random?	374
	Appendix 8.A Example: <i>P</i> -Values vs. Weights of Evidence	374
	Appendix 8.B Example: Frequentist vs. Bayesian Rocket Science	376
	Appendix 8.C Example: Frequentist Confidence Intervals vs. Bayesian Credible Intervals	379
9	A Unified Framework for Inference	382
9.1	Introduction	382
9.2	The Intellectual Terrain of Multi-Method Research	384
9.3	Synthesizing Quantitative vs. Qualitative and Cross-Case vs. Within-Case Analysis	387
9.4	Toward a Unified Approach to Qualitative Methods	398
	9.4.1 Surveying the Terrain	399
	9.4.2 Bayesianism and Process Tracing	405
	9.4.3 Remapping the Qualitative Methods Landscape from a Bayesian Perspective	410
9.5	Bridging the Experimental vs. Observational Divide	412
	9.5.1 Randomization Is Not a Silver Bullet	414
	9.5.2 Where “No Learning from Observational Research” Goes Wrong	419
	9.5.3 Learning from Both Observational and Experimental Research: John Snow on Cholera	421
	9.5.4 Control and Informativeness	435
9.6	A More Fundamental Dimension: Objective vs. Subjective Likelihoods	440
9.7	Conclusion	445
	Appendix 9.A Distinctions between Logical Bayesianism and Earlier Bayesian Process-Tracing Literature	448
	Appendix 9.B Irrelevance of Randomization to Post-Data Inference	454

	Appendix 9.C Objective Likelihoods from Categorical Data: A Party Preference Survey	458
<hr/>		
Part IV	Bayesian Implications for Research Design	461
10	Iterative Research	463
10.1	Introduction	463
10.2	Perspectives on Iterative Research	467
10.3	Bayesian Logic of Iterative Research	470
	10.3.1 Old vs. New Evidence and Prior vs. Posterior Probabilities	470
	10.3.2 “New” vs. “Independent” Evidence	475
	10.3.3 Curtailing Confirmation Bias and Ad Hoc Theorizing	478
10.4	Iteration in Practice	482
	10.4.1 Assigning Prior Log-Odds after Devising a New Hypothesis	485
	10.4.2 Weights of Evidence for the New Hypothesis	485
	10.4.3 Posterior Log-Odds	487
	10.4.4 Conceptual and Practical Lessons	487
10.5	Common Concerns	489
	10.5.1 Biased Priors	490
	10.5.2 Biased Likelihoods	494
	10.5.3 Intellectual Integrity	499
10.6	Conclusion	500
	Appendix 10.A Extending the Hypothesis Space	502
11	Test Strength	507
11.1	Introduction	507
11.2	Van Evera’s Tests	508
	11.2.1 Bayesian Intuition	509
	11.2.2 Subsequent Interpretations	511
11.3	Sensitivity and Specificity: Advances and Limitations	512
	11.3.1 From Certainty and Uniqueness to Sensitivity and Specificity	513
	11.3.2 Shortcomings of Sensitivity and Specificity Coordinates	516
11.4	Improved Coordinates for Generalizing Van Evera’s Tests	521
	11.4.1 Likelihood Ratios or Weights of Evidence	521
	11.4.2 Relative Entropies	532
	11.4.3 Expected Information Gain and Asymmetry	534
11.5	Comparison of Test Coordinates and Numerical Examples	537

11.6	Social Science vs. Medical Diagnosis: Decisions, Utility, and Test Strength	542
11.7	Conclusion	544
	Appendix 11.A Dinosaur Extinction	545
	11.A.1 The Chicxulub Crater	546
	11.A.2 Tanis Fossil Site	547
12	Case Selection	551
12.1	Introduction	551
12.2	Touring the Terrain	553
12.3	Optimal Bayesian Case Selection	556
	12.3.1 The Information-Theoretic Perspective	557
	12.3.2 Relative Entropy	560
	12.3.3 Expected Information Gain	564
	12.3.4 Practical Caveats and Principled Insights	565
12.4	Heuristic Bayesian Case Selection	567
	12.4.1 There Is No Need to Begin by Listing All Known Cases	568
	12.4.2 Diversity Among Cases Is Generally Good	569
	12.4.3 Similarities Across Cases Can Also Contribute to Strong Tests	571
	12.4.4 There Is No Need to Avoid Cases with Multiple Plausible Causes or Confounders	573
	12.4.5 Use Model-Conforming Cases for Mechanistic Inferences and Deviant Cases for Building or Testing Higher-Level Theory	574
	12.4.6 At the End of the Day, Worry Less about Case Selection and Prioritize Practical Concerns as Needed	578
	12.4.7 Give a Clear and Honest Rationale for Focusing on Particular Cases and Excluding Others	579
12.5	A Requiem for Most-Likely and Least-Likely Cases	581
	12.5.1 Scope Conditions	584
	12.5.2 Prior Probabilities	585
	12.5.3 Likelihood of Case Evidence	587
	12.5.4 Marginal Likelihood of Case Evidence	588
	12.5.5 Divergent Likelihoods	589
	12.5.6 Van Evera Tests	590
	12.5.7 Nested Regression Models	592
	12.5.8 Rethinking the “Sinatra Inference”	593
	12.5.9 Hard Tests vs. Strong Tests: Bayes, Popper, and Van Evera	597
	12.5.10 Moving Forward: Retire the Most/Least-Likely Case	600

12.6	Conclusion	601
	Appendix 12.A Prevalent Case Selection Strategies	603
	Appendix 12.B Mutual Information	605
	Appendix 12.C Definitions of Most-Likely Cases and Least-Likely Cases	606
	Appendix 12.D Understanding Why Prior Probabilities Do Not Vary Across Cases	613
	Appendix 12.E Understanding Marginal Likelihoods in the Context of Case-Based Research	616
	12.E.1 Handling Case-Specific Evidence	617
	12.E.2 Bayesian Probabilities vs. Relative Frequencies	618
	Appendix 12.F More on “Hard” Tests and “Bold” Theories	620

Part V Supplemental Material

623

13	Worked Examples	625
13.1	Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses (Chapter 3)	625
13.2	Envisioning Discriminating Evidence: The Empty Cookie Jar (Chapter 3)	627
13.3	<i>Silver Blaze</i> Exercises (Chapters 4 and 6)	629
	13.3.1 Weights of Evidence	630
	13.3.2 Prior Log-Odds	635
	13.3.3 Posterior Log-Odds	638
13.4	Campaign Contributions and Austerity Reforms (Chapter 7)	639
13.5	Opening a Can of Beans: What Is Random? (Chapter 8)	642
	<i>References</i>	645
	<i>Index</i>	659