Climate and energy policy needs to be durable and flexible to be successful, but these two concepts often seem to be in opposition. One venerable institution where both ideas are apparent is the Clean Air Act, first passed by the United States Congress in 1963, with amendments in 1970 and 1990. The Act is a living institution that has been hugely successful in improving the environment. It has programs that reach across the entire economy, regulating various sectors and pollutants in different ways. This illuminating book examines these successes – and failures – with the aim to offer lessons for future climate and energy policymaking in the US at the federal and state level. It provides critical information to legislators, regulators and scholars interested in understanding environmental policymaking.

Ann Carlson is the Shirley Shapiro Professor of Environmental Law at the University of California, Los Angeles School of Law. She is the faculty co-director of the Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment and has written extensively on climate change, air pollution and energy law.

Dallas Burtraw is the Darius Gaskins Senior Fellow at Resources for the Future. Burtraw has worked to promote efficient control of air pollution and has written extensively on electricity industry regulation and environmental outcomes.
Lessons from the Clean Air Act

BUILDING DURABILITY AND ADAPTABILITY INTO
U.S. CLIMATE AND ENERGY POLICY

Edited by

ANN CARLSON
University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law

DALLAS BURTRAW
Energy and Climate Program, Resources for the Future

American Academy of Arts and Sciences, Cambridge, Massachusetts
To Bob Fri (1935–2014), our intellectual leader on this project and our dear friend
Contents

List of Figures  page viii
List of Tables ix
List of Contributors x
Acknowledgments xii

1 Introduction
   Ann Carlson and Dallas Burtraw  1

2 The Clean Air Act’s National Ambient Air Quality Standards
   A Case Study of Durability and Flexibility in Program Design and Implementation
   William Boyd  15

3 Stationary Sources, Movable Rules
   Intransigence and Innovation under the Clean Air Act
   Hannah J. Wiseman  57

4 Leveraged Federalism and the Clean Air Act
   The Case of Vehicle Emissions Control
   Barry G. Rabe  113

5 Promoting Environmental Quality through Fuels Regulations
   Lessons for a Durable Energy and Climate Policy
   Joseph E. Aldy  159

6 The Clean Air Act’s Use of Market Mechanisms
   Eric M. Patashnik  201

7 Conclusion
   Ann Carlson and Dallas Burtraw  225

Index  239
## Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>NAAQS framework</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Current NAAQS</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>NAAQS review process</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Progress in reducing criteria pollutants</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Selected criteria pollutant emissions from selected stationary sources</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>RFG and low-volatility fuel markets in the United States</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Structure of nested requirements under RFS2</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>SO$_2$ emissions from Acid Rain Program sources, 1980–2009</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Ozone season NO$_x$ emissions from all NO$_x$ Budget Trading Program sources</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables

3.1 Major CAA Provisions for Stationary Sources, Excluding SIPs and the Acid Rain Program


4.2 EPA Decisions on California Waiver Requests, 1968–2017


4.4 Average Age of Motor Vehicles in Operation in the United States, 1969–2015

5.1 Outline of the Boutique Fuels Program

5.2 Volume Requirements under RFS\textsubscript{1} and RFS\textsubscript{2}
Contributors

Joseph E. Aldy is Associate Professor of Public Policy at the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, University Fellow at Resources for the Future, Faculty Research Fellow at the National Bureau of Economic Research and Senior Adviser at the Center for Strategic and International Studies. Aldy served as the Special Assistant to the President for Energy and Environment in the White House in 2009–10.

William Boyd is Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law and Professor at the UCLA Institute of the Environment and Sustainability. He teaches and conducts research in the areas of energy law and regulation, climate change law and policy and environmental law.

Dallas Burtraw is the Darius Gaskins Senior Fellow at Resources for the Future. Burtraw has worked to promote efficient control of air pollution and has written extensively on electricity industry regulation and environmental outcomes.

Ann Carlson is the Shirley Shapiro Professor of Environmental Law at the UCLA School of Law. She is Faculty Codirector of the Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment and has written extensively on climate change, air pollution and energy law.

Eric M. Patashnik is the Julis-Rabinowitz Professor of Public Policy and Professor of Political Science at the Watson Institute for International and Public Affairs at Brown University and Director of the Master of Public Affairs Program. He is the author of several books, including Reforms at Risk: What Happens after Major Policy Changes Are Enacted (2008).

Barry G. Rabe is the J. Ira and Nicki Harris Family Professor of Public Policy at the Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy at the University of Michigan. Rabe is
List of Contributors

a political scientist who studies federalism and is the author, most recently, of *Can We Price Carbon?* (2018).

**Hannah Wiseman** is the Attorneys’ Title Professor at the Florida State University College of Law. Her research focuses on choice of governance level and effective regulation of risk in the areas of energy and environmental law.
Acknowledgments

This book is the culmination of a multiyear study convened by the American Academy of Arts and Sciences as part of its Alternative Energy Future initiative. We are grateful to the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, whose support not only allowed the Academy to commission this research but also allowed us to organize several meetings of the study group to refine our thinking and identify connections among our various case studies. These meetings were particularly critical to our work given the strong interdisciplinary nature of this project. We also thank the Kresge Foundation for supporting a series of workshops to discuss our conclusions with scholars and policymakers across the country.

We are grateful to the other members of our research team – Joseph E. Aldy, William Boyd, Eric M. Patashnik, Barry G. Rabe and Hannah J. Wiseman – who devoted countless hours to research and writing and patiently responded to several rounds of review and requests for revisions. We are also indebted to Academy members Maxine Savitz and Granger Morgan, cochairs of the Alternative Energy Future project, and project advisors Barbara Kates-Garnick and Judson Jaffe for generously sharing their advice and expertise.

Myron Gutmann, former Associate Director for Social, Behavioral, and Economic Sciences at the National Science Foundation, encouraged us to pursue this study and funded an initial workshop in February 2013 to shape its design. We thank the participants in that workshop, as well as those who attended a workshop in Washington, DC, in March 2017 to discuss our preliminary analysis. Their many comments and suggestions had a tremendous influence on our final conclusions.

The Academy provided extraordinary organizational support for this study. We are especially grateful to John Randell, John E. Bryson Director of Science, Engineering, and Technology Programs at the Academy, for his strong facilitation of this project, as well as his colleagues Alison Leaf, Greg Savageau, Zackory Burns, Shalin Jyotishi and Rachel Johnson. Kristen McCormack and Amelia Keyes from Resources for the Future provided critical analytical support and offered substantial
feedback on the chapter drafts. Matthew Schneider, Simon Vickery and Christi Zaleski provided important research support at the beginning of the project, and their thorough analysis of the prior scholarship, legislation and key judicial decisions pertaining to the Clean Air Act provided a strong foundation for this study.

Above all, we owe an incalculable debt of gratitude to the late Robert W. Fri, who chaired the Academy’s Alternative Energy Future project from 2010 until his death in October 2014. Bob was the intellectual driver behind this research, and his vision and spirit have continued to guide this project. We and countless others benefited from his extraordinary wisdom and leadership over the course of his long career. This book is dedicated to his memory.