

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

LESSONS FROM THE CLEAN AIR ACT

Building Durability and Adaptability into U.S. Climate and Energy Policy

Climate and energy policy needs to be durable and flexible to be successful, but these two concepts often seem to be in opposition. One venerable institution where both ideas are apparent is the Clean Air Act, first passed by the United States Congress in 1963, with amendments in 1970 and 1990. The Act is a living institution that has been hugely successful in improving the environment. It has programs that reach across the entire economy, regulating various sectors and pollutants in different ways. This illuminating book examines these successes – and failures – with the aim to offer lessons for future climate and energy policymaking in the US at the federal and state level. It provides critical information to legislators, regulators and scholars interested in understanding environmental policymaking.

Ann Carlson is the Shirley Shapiro Professor of Environmental Law at the University of California, Los Angeles School of Law. She is the faculty co-director of the Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment and has written extensively on climate change, air pollution and energy law.

Dallas Burtraw is the Darius Gaskins Senior Fellow at Resources for the Future. Burtraw has worked to promote efficient control of air pollution and has written extensively on electricity industry regulation and environmental outcomes.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Lessons from the Clean Air Act

BUILDING DURABILITY AND ADAPTABILITY INTO
U.S. CLIMATE AND ENERGY POLICY

Edited by

ANN CARLSON

University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law

DALLAS BURTRAW

Energy and Climate Program, Resources for the Future

American Academy of Arts and Sciences, Cambridge, Massachusetts



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
 Edited by Ann Carlson, Dallas Burtraw
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108421522

DOI: 10.1017/9781108377195

© American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Carlson, Ann E., editor. | Burtraw, Dallas, editor.

TITLE: Lessons from the Clean Air Act : building durability and adaptability into US climate and energy policy / edited by Ann Carlson, Dallas Burtraw.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge [UK] ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018045900 | ISBN 9781108421522 (hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: United States. Clean Air Act. | Air–Pollution – Law and legislation – United States. | Air – Pollution – Law and legislation – Compliance costs – United States. | Air quality management – United States. | Climatic changes – Government policy – United States. | Energy policy – United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCG KF3812 .L47 2018 | DDC 344.7304/642– dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018045900>

ISBN 978-1-108-42152-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-43266-5 Paperback

The views expressed in this volume are those of the contributors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Officers and Members of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Bob Fri (1935–2014), our intellectual leader on this
project and our dear friend

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xii
1 Introduction	1
Ann Carlson and Dallas Burtraw	
2 The Clean Air Act’s National Ambient Air Quality Standards A Case Study of Durability and Flexibility in Program Design and Implementation	15
William Boyd	
3 Stationary Sources, Movable Rules Intransigence and Innovation under the Clean Air Act	57
Hannah J. Wiseman	
4 Leveraged Federalism and the Clean Air Act The Case of Vehicle Emissions Control	113
Barry G. Rabe	
5 Promoting Environmental Quality through Fuels Regulations Lessons for a Durable Energy and Climate Policy	159
Joseph E. Aldy	
6 The Clean Air Act’s Use of Market Mechanisms	201
Eric M. Patashnik	
7 Conclusion	225
Ann Carlson and Dallas Burtraw	
<i>Index</i>	239

Figures

2.1	NAAQS framework	<i>page</i> 28
2.2	Current NAAQS	30
2.3	NAAQS review process	32
2.4	Progress in reducing criteria pollutants	48
3.1	Selected criteria pollutant emissions from selected stationary sources	92
5.1	RFG and low-volatility fuel markets in the United States	167
5.2	Structure of nested requirements under RFS2	173
6.1	SO ₂ emissions from Acid Rain Program sources, 1980–2009	209
6.2	Ozone season NO _x emissions from all NO _x Budget Trading Program sources	211

Tables

3.1	Major CAA Provisions for Stationary Sources, Excluding SIPs and the Acid Rain Program	<i>page</i> 81
4.1	Political Leadership and Partisan Control of US Federal and State of California Executive Branches, 1966–2016	118
4.2	EPA Decisions on California Waiver Requests, 1968–2017	131
4.3	US Federal and California Light-Duty Vehicle Emission Standards, 1966–2010	142
4.4	Average Age of Motor Vehicles in Operation in the United States, 1969–2015	145
5.1	Outline of the Boutique Fuels Program	166
5.2	Volume Requirements under RFS1 and RFS2	172

Contributors

Joseph E. Aldy is Associate Professor of Public Policy at the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, University Fellow at Resources for the Future, Faculty Research Fellow at the National Bureau of Economic Research and Senior Adviser at the Center for Strategic and International Studies. Aldy served as the Special Assistant to the President for Energy and Environment in the White House in 2009–10.

William Boyd is Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law and Professor at the UCLA Institute of the Environment and Sustainability. He teaches and conducts research in the areas of energy law and regulation, climate change law and policy and environmental law.

Dallas Burtraw is the Darius Gaskins Senior Fellow at Resources for the Future. Burtraw has worked to promote efficient control of air pollution and has written extensively on electricity industry regulation and environmental outcomes.

Ann Carlson is the Shirley Shapiro Professor of Environmental Law at the UCLA School of Law. She is Faculty Codirector of the Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment and has written extensively on climate change, air pollution and energy law.

Eric M. Patashnik is the Julis-Rabinowitz Professor of Public Policy and Professor of Political Science at the Watson Institute for International and Public Affairs at Brown University and Director of the Master of Public Affairs Program. He is the author of several books, including *Reforms at Risk: What Happens after Major Policy Changes Are Enacted* (2008).

Barry G. Rabe is the J. Ira and Nicki Harris Family Professor of Public Policy at the Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy at the University of Michigan. Rabe is

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

List of Contributors

xi

a political scientist who studies federalism and is the author, most recently, of *Can We Price Carbon?* (2018).

Hannah Wiseman is the Attorneys' Title Professor at the Florida State University College of Law. Her research focuses on choice of governance level and effective regulation of risk in the areas of energy and environmental law.

Acknowledgments

This book is the culmination of a multiyear study convened by the American Academy of Arts and Sciences as part of its Alternative Energy Future initiative. We are grateful to the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, whose support not only allowed the Academy to commission this research but also allowed us to organize several meetings of the study group to refine our thinking and identify connections among our various case studies. These meetings were particularly critical to our work given the strong interdisciplinary nature of this project. We also thank the Kresge Foundation for supporting a series of workshops to discuss our conclusions with scholars and policymakers across the country.

We are grateful to the other members of our research team – Joseph E. Aldy, William Boyd, Eric M. Patashnik, Barry G. Rabe and Hannah J. Wiseman – who devoted countless hours to research and writing and patiently responded to several rounds of review and requests for revisions. We are also indebted to Academy members Maxine Savitz and Granger Morgan, cochairs of the Alternative Energy Future project, and project advisors Barbara Kates-Garnick and Judson Jaffe for generously sharing their advice and expertise.

Myron Gutmann, former Associate Director for Social, Behavioral, and Economic Sciences at the National Science Foundation, encouraged us to pursue this study and funded an initial workshop in February 2013 to shape its design. We thank the participants in that workshop, as well as those who attended a workshop in Washington, DC, in March 2017 to discuss our preliminary analysis. Their many comments and suggestions had a tremendous influence on our final conclusions.

The Academy provided extraordinary organizational support for this study. We are especially grateful to John Randell, John E. Bryson Director of Science, Engineering, and Technology Programs at the Academy, for his strong facilitation of this project, as well as his colleagues Alison Leaf, Greg Savageau, Zackory Burns, Shalin Jyotishi and Rachel Johnson. Kristen McCormack and Amelia Keyes from Resources for the Future provided critical analytical support and offered substantial

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgments

xiii

feedback on the chapter drafts. Matthew Schneider, Simon Vickery and Christi Zaleski provided important research support at the beginning of the project, and their thorough analysis of the prior scholarship, legislation and key judicial decisions pertaining to the Clean Air Act provided a strong foundation for this study.

Above all, we owe an incalculable debt of gratitude to the late Robert W. Fri, who chaired the Academy's Alternative Energy Future project from 2010 until his death in October 2014. Bob was the intellectual driver behind this research, and his vision and spirit have continued to guide this project. We and countless others benefited from his extraordinary wisdom and leadership over the course of his long career. This book is dedicated to his memory.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42152-2 — Lessons from the Clean Air Act
Edited by Ann Carlson , Dallas Burtraw
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
