

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42149-2 — Advising Governments in the Westminster Tradition
Jonathan Craft, John Halligan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Practitioners and students of government have long waited for a comprehensive study on how public policy now takes shape. Jonathan Craft and John Halligan have answered the call with a lucid, timely and well documented book. Advising Government in the Westminster Tradition should be on the reading list of practitioners and all senior students of public policy looking for answers to the challenges now confronting policy makers, from a comparative perspective.

Donald J Savoie, Canada Research Chair in Public Administration (tier 1), Université de Moncton

Jonathan Craft and John Halligan have provided a thorough and thoughtful account of policy advice in Westminster-style governments. Their analysis demonstrates the complexity of advice structures in these governments, and the ways in which they have adapted to changing political styles and policy demands. This is essential reading for anyone interested in how policy actually gets made in these countries.

Guy Peters, Maurice Falk Professor of Government,
Department of Political Science, University of Pittsburgh

Any government needs policy advice in order to function. This volume is a richly researched analysis of policy advisory systems in the world of Westminster polities. Craft and Halligan are to be applauded for their detailed incisions into the varieties of advisory systems, the different types of actors involved in purveying advice but most importantly, how these systems evolve and transform over time. This study is thoughtful and authoritative in its coverage of Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the UK. It is a 'must read' for those interested in understanding how government use, and do not use, advice.

Diane Stone, Dean, School of Public Policy,
Central European University

'Who advises whom, what, when and how' represents a long-standing concern in the study and practice of executive government. This volume offers a fascinating investigation into the world of Westminster political systems. Craft and Halligan's comparative study of policy advisory systems offers an exciting major contribution for anyone interested in how executive government operates.

Martin Lodge, Professor of Political Science and Public Policy,
London School of Economics and Political Science

Advising Governments in the Westminster Tradition

In turbulent environments and unstable political contexts, policy advisory systems have become more volatile. The policy advisory system in anglophone countries is composed of different types of advisers who have input into government decision-making. Government choices about who advises them vary widely as they demand contestability, greater partisan input and more external consultation. The professional advice of the public service may be disregarded. The consequences for public policy are immense depending on whether a plurality of advice works effectively or is derailed by narrow and partisan agendas that lack an evidence base and implementation plans. The book seeks to address these issues within a comparative country analysis of how policy advisory systems are constituted and how they operate in the age of instability in governance and major challenges with how the complexity policy issue can be handled.

JONATHAN CRAFT is Associate Professor with the Department of Political Science and jointly appointed to the Munk School of Global Affairs & Public Policy. He is also the founding director of Policy Ready – a research and learning platform focused on revitalising public sector policy making. Jonathan specialises in comparative public policy and administration, policy analysis and Canadian politics. He is particularly interested in the study of the policy process, political-administrative relations, policy advice and the intersection of technology and policy making. He is the author of *Backrooms and Beyond: Partisan Advisers and the Politics of Policy Work in Canada* (2016) and is a co-editor of *Policy Work in Canada: Professional Practices and Analytical Capacities* (2017) and *Issues in Canadian Governance* (2018).

JOHN HALLIGAN is Emeritus Professor of Public Administration and Governance at the Institute for Governance and Policy Analysis, University of Canberra. John publishes on comparative public management, policy and governance, including public sector reform, performance management and political-bureaucratic relationships. He specialises in the anglophone countries of Australia, Canada, New

Zealand and the United Kingdom. He has authored *Reforming Public Management and Governance: Impact and Lessons from Anglophone Countries* (2020) and co-authored *Performance Management in the Public Sector* (2010, 2015); *Public Sector Governance in Australia* (2012); *Managing Performance: International Comparisons* (2008); *Parliament in the 21st Century: Institutional Reform and Emerging Roles* (2007); *Political Management in the 1990s* (1992); and *Political Leadership in an Age of Constraint: The Australian Experience* (1992).

Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy

The **Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy** series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalisable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

General Editors: M. Ramesh, National University of Singapore; Xun Wu, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology; Michael Howlett, Simon Fraser University and National University of Singapore

In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and Its Media Coverage By
Éric Montpetit

Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy Edited by
Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

*The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested
Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack* By Andreas Goldthau

*Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in
a Comparative Perspective 2018* By Philipp Trein

Policy Accumulation and the Democratic Responsiveness Trap By
Christian Adam, Steffen Hurka, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

*Hyper-Active Governance: How Governments Manage the Politics of
Expertise* By Matthew Wood

*Policy Consultancy in Comparative Perspective: Patterns, Nuances and
Implications of the Contractor State* By Caspar van den Berg,
Michael Howlett, Andrea Migone, Michael Howard, Frida Perner and
Helen M. Gunter

A Matter of Style? Organizational Agency in Global Public Policy By
Louisa Bayerlein, Christoph Knill and Yves Steinebach

Advising Governments in the Westminster Tradition

Policy Advisory Systems in Australia,
Britain, Canada and New Zealand

JONATHAN CRAFT
University of Toronto

JOHN HALLIGAN
University of Canberra



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42149-2 — Advising Governments in the Westminster Tradition
Jonathan Craft, John Halligan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108421492

DOI: 10.1017/9781108377133

© Jonathan Craft and John Halligan 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-42149-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42149-2 — Advising Governments in the Westminster Tradition
Jonathan Craft , John Halligan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The book is dedicated with thanks to the family members who gave us the time to make this work possible, our wives Zoiey Craft and Penelope St Clair, and the very young children Béatrice and Elliot Craft.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
<i>Glossary and Acronyms</i>	xvi
1 Policy Advisory Systems: An Introduction	1
2 Comparative Contexts	17
3 Approaches to Understanding PAS and Change over Time	37
4 Public Services and Policy Advice	52
5 Ministerial Partisan Advisers and the Politicisation of PAS	84
6 Alternative Advice from within Government	113
7 External Advice	134
8 Understanding Westminster PAS Change	159
9 Trends, Tensions and the State of Neo-policy Advisory Systems	178
<i>Appendix A Interview List</i>	215
<i>Appendix B Cases of Independent Reviews</i>	218
<i>Notes</i>	220
<i>References</i>	224
<i>Index</i>	265

Figures

7.1 UK spending on consultants 2009–10 to 2017–18.	<i>page</i> 139
7.2 Consulting and temporary staff costs by UK department, 2014–15.	141
7.3 Public service staff versus consultant spends in Australia (2008–18).	144

Tables

1.1	Components of policy advisory systems and relationship and roles as policy advisers.	<i>page 7</i>
1.2	Policy advisory system: dimensions and directions of change.	13
2.1	Structures relevant to policy advice within the government system.	27
2.2	Central agencies of government and functions by country.	29
3.1	Location of advice and degree of government influence.	41
3.2	Policy advisory system members organised by policy content.	45
4.1	Models of officials' policy advising.	54
4.2	Modes of policy roles.	58
5.1	Ministerial office staff in Australia, Canada, New Zealand and the United Kingdom.	86
6.1	Types of review and inquiry agencies and accountability.	118
6.2	Government reviews and specialist inquiry agencies: use by country.	119
6.3	Royal commissions and commissions of inquiry at national level 1960s–2010s.	121
6.4	Rate of tsar appointments in the United Kingdom 1997–2012.	124
6.5	Trends in government policy reviews and inquiries and specialised bodies.	132
7.1	Consultant contracts by stated reason 2007–17.	145
8.1	PAS politicisation.	170
8.2	Forms of PAS externalisation.	173
9.1	Emergent dimensions of Westminster PAS.	180
9.2	Comparing Westminster policy advisory systems.	183

Acknowledgements

We benefited greatly from the invaluable reflections of past and present ministers, public servants, partisan advisers, and those in firms and think tanks outside of government. In all four countries participants were keen to share their views and appreciated our objective of offering a fresh and contemporary appraisal of how advisory systems are operating in these Westminster systems. Scheduling them for interviews was another matter. The book would not be possible without their generous contributions.

There is now a thriving community of scholars who work specifically on advisory systems and particular advisers. This is a welcome development, and the book has drawn from advances in how they think about advisory systems and empirical work on various advisers that work within them. We gained much from exchanges, both formal and informal, with Michael Howlett, Evert Lindquist and Amanda Clarke in Canada; Mark Evans, Maria Maley and Anne Tiernan in Australia; Jonathan Boston, Chris Eichbaum, Derek Gill, Bob Gregory and Richard Shaw in New Zealand; Patrick Dunleavy, Catherine Haddon and Jill Rutter in the United Kingdom; and, more generally, Thuriid Hustedt. Comments on working papers and presentations of draft materials sharpened our analysis and challenged us to extend it.

Our thanks also go to the three independent reviewers who provided constructive feedback. The book is much improved as a result of their probing questions and thoughtful suggestions. We would also like to thank our Cambridge University Press editor Joe Ng and the series editors Michael Howlett, M. Ramesh and Xun Wu for their support and patience as we revised the manuscript to address changes in government and emergent issues. We also gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the Humanities and Social Sciences Council of Canada.

Completing this book required considerable time away from family and friends. Our biggest thanks are reserved for our respective

Acknowledgements

xv

partners, Penelope and Zoiey. Thank you for your support, for your encouragement and for reviewing materials as they developed. Penelope's extensive editorial work is particularly appreciated. Any errors or omissions are the authors' alone.

We know more remains to be done and cannot claim this to be an exhaustive account of Westminster PAS. This book aspires to significantly advance our understanding about how these systems operate and change and to enrich our comparative understanding. Where there are shortfalls, we encourage our colleagues internationally to respond in kind and to continue the stimulating debates of recent years.

Glossary and Acronyms

ADM	assistant deputy minister
APS	Australian Public Service
APSC	Australian Public Service Commission
AU	Australia
BIS	Department for Business, Innovation and Skills
CA	Canada
CAG	Comptroller and Auditor General (UK)
CCMD	Canadian Centre for Management Development
central agency	cross-government agencies at the centre
CEO	chief executive officer
CFIB	Federation of Independent Business
civil service	used in the United Kingdom – the preferred term elsewhere is ‘public service’
CO	Cabinet Office
CPA	Committee of Public Accounts (UK)
CPF	Contestable Policy Fund
CPU	Cabinet Policy Unit
DoF	Department of Finance (AU)
DCLG	Department for Communities and Local Government
DCMS	Department for Culture, Media and Sport
DECC	Department of Energy and Climate Change
Defra	Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
deputy minister	head of department (CA)
department head	Generic term for chief executive officers (NZ), departmental secretaries (AU), deputy ministers (CA) and permanent secretaries (UK)
DfE	Department for Education
DFID	Department for International Development

DfT	Department for Transport
DoH	Department of Health
DPMC	Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet (AU, NZ)
DRAP	Deficit Reduction Action Plan
DWP	Department for Work and Pensions
EBP	evidence-based policy (as opposed to PBE, policy-based evidence)
EMOs	extended ministerial offices
EU	exempt staff – Canadian term for staff appointed by a minister
FCO	Foreign and Commonwealth Office
G8	Group of Eight
G20	Group of Twenty
GDP	gross domestic product
GFC	global financial crisis
Gomery Report	inquiry into ‘sponsorship scandal’, with accountability focus (CA)
HC	House of Commons
HMRC	HM Revenue and Customs
HMT	HM Treasury
HO	Home Office
HRSDC	Human Resources and Skills Development Canada
IDC	interdepartmental committee
IGO	international governmental organisation
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IRPP	Institute for Research on Public Policy
IT	information technology
MAC	Management Advisory Committee (AU)
MBIE	Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment
Ministry	co-exists with departments in NZ and for some agencies in the UK; the term ‘department’ covers both
MoD	Ministry of Defence
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MP	Member of Parliament

NAO	National Audit Office (see CAG)
NHS	National Health Service
NGO	non-government organisation
NPM	new public management
No 10	Downing Street, Prime Minister's Office (UK)
NZ	New Zealand
OAG	Office of the Auditor General (CA)
OBR	Office for Budget Responsibility
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PAG	policy advisory group
PAS	policy advisory system
PBE	policy-based evidence (as opposed to EBP, evidence-based policy)
PBO	parliamentary budget office
PCO	Privy Council Office (CA)
PMD	prime minister's department, generic term that covers the Australian and New Zealand Department of the Prime Minister and the Cabinet (DPMC), the Canadian Privy Council Office (PCO) and the UK Cabinet Office (CO)
PPS	principal private secretary
PSI	public sector innovation
PMO	prime minister's office, a term in standard use across the four
PWGSC	Public Works and Government Services Canada
reform era	Early 1980s until the present
SCS	senior civil service (UK)
SDP	single department plan(s) (UK)
Spad	special adviser (UK) (also SpAd)
SSC	State Services Commission, a leading central agency in New Zealand
TBS	Treasury Board of Canada Secretariat
UK	United Kingdom
WTO	World Trade Organization