DOUBLE TAXATION AND THE LEAGUE OF NATIONS

Modern-day tax treaties have their foundations in one of the three Model Tax Treaties developed by the League of Nations in 1928. Using previously unexplored archival material, Sunita Jogarajan provides the first in-depth examination of the development of the League’s Models. This new research provides insights into questions such as the importance of double taxation versus tax evasion, the preference for source-taxation versus residence-taxation, the influence of theory and practice on the League’s work, the development of bilateral rather than multilateral treaties, the influence of developing countries on the League’s work, the role of Commentary in interpreting Model Tax Treaties, and the influential factors and key individuals involved. A better understanding of the development of the original Models will inform and help guide interpretation and reform of modern-day tax treaties. Additionally, this book will be of interest to scholars of international relations and the development of law at international organisations.

SUNITA JOGARAJAN is Associate Professor at Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne. She has published in the Oxford Journal of Legal Studies, British Tax Review, and World Tax Journal.
CAMBRIDGE TAX LAW SERIES

Tax law is a growing area of interest, as it is included as a subdivision in many areas of study and is a key consideration in business needs throughout the world. Books in this series will expose the theoretical underpinning behind the law to shed light on the taxation systems, so that the questions to be asked when addressing an issue become clear. These academic books, written by leading scholars, will be a central port of call for information on tax law. The content will be illustrated by case law and legislation. The books will be of interest for those studying law, business, economics, accounting and finance courses.

Series Editor
Professor Peter Harris, Law Faculty, University of Cambridge, Director of the Centre for Tax Law

Professor Harris brings a wealth of experience to the Series. He has taught and presented tax courses at a dozen different universities in nearly as many countries and has acted as an external tax consultant for the International Monetary Fund for more than a decade.
DOUBLE TAXATION AND THE LEAGUE OF NATIONS

SUNITA JOGARAJAN
University of Melbourne
CONTENTS

List of Tables viii
Preface ix
Acknowledgements x
List of Abbreviations xi

1 Introduction 1
   I Introduction 1
   II Structure of the Book 4

2 Background 7
   I Introduction 7
   II International Double Taxation 7
   III The Economics and Politics of the 1920s 11
   IV The League of Nations 14

3 Personality, Politics, and Principles: The Drafting of the 1925 Resolutions on Double Taxation 22
   I Introduction 22
   II The 1925 Experts 24
   III Guiding Principles 27
   IV The Chicken or the Egg: Double Taxation or Tax Evasion? 30
   V Impact of the Economists’ Report 31
   VI Classification of Sources of Income in Relation to Schedular Taxes 34
   VII General Income Tax 58
   VIII Interaction of Schedular Taxes and General Income Tax 65
   IX Fiscal Domicile 72
   X Conclusion 81

4 The ICC and the Development of the 1928 Models 85
   I Introduction 85
   II The Merchants of Peace 86
   III The ICC and Double Taxation 87
CONTENTS

IV The ICC and the League of Nations 90
V Conclusion 95

5 Turning Resolutions into Treaties: The Drafting of the First Model Convention on Double Taxation 98
   I Introduction 98
   II The 1927 Experts 100
   III General Observations 104
   IV New Experts’ Views 107
   V Evolution of the First Model Tax Convention 117
   VI Alternative Draft Conventions 161
   VII Conclusion 164

6 The ‘Great Powers’ and the Development of the 1928 Models 167
   I Introduction 167
   II Participation in the League 168
   III Participation on Double Taxation 170
   IV Transatlantic Bridge Rules and the Failure to Form an Anglo-American Alliance 177
   V Impact of the 1928 Models on Treaty Practice 179
   VI Conclusion 181

7 One Beget Three: The Drafting of the 1928 Model Tax Treaties on Double Income Taxation 182
   I Introduction 182
   II The 1928 Experts 183
   III General Views on Draft Convention I 188
   IV Detailed Consideration of Draft Convention I 192
   V Revisiting Draft Convention I 231
   VI Alternative Draft Conventions 234
   VII Conclusion 241

8 Lessons from History: Where to from Here? 243
   I Introduction 243
   II Impact of Model Ic on the OECD Model 243
   III Observations 249
   IV Looking Forward 253
   V Conclusion 256

Appendix 1 Timeline/Cast of Characters 257
Appendix 2 1925 Report Final Resolutions 270
Contents

Appendix 3 1921 ICC Resolutions 274
Appendix 4 1922 ICC Resolutions 276
Appendix 5 1923 ICC Resolutions 278
Appendix 6 1924 ICC Resolutions 280
Appendix 7 1925 ICC Resolutions 283
Appendix 8 1927 ICC Resolutions 286
Appendix 9 1927 Draft Model Convention 287
Appendix 10 1925 UK Finance Act 298
Appendix 11 Thompson Article 10 Proposal 299
Appendix 12 USSR Article 5 Proposal 300
Appendix 13 USSR Articles 10 and 11 Proposals 302
Appendix 14 Dorn and Borduge Draft Convention 303
Appendix 15 Thompson Draft Convention 306
Appendix 16 Adams Draft Convention 308
Appendix 17 Draft Convention Ia 311
Appendix 18 Draft Convention Ib 315
Appendix 19 Draft Convention Ib Commentary 318
Appendix 20 Draft Convention Ic 320
Appendix 21 Draft Convention Ic Commentary 323

Bibliography 325
Index 332
TABLES

2.1 Allocation of taxing rights in the Economists’ Report 20
3.1 List of 1925 Experts 26
3.2 Summary of possible tax systems 67
5.1 List of 1927 Experts 102
7.1 List of 1928 Experts 185
This book is the result of a desire to understand the original motivations that led countries to engage in a broad, international effort to target double taxation, and a frustration with being unable to find satisfactory answers to this fundamental question. This book is, to the author’s knowledge, the first comprehensive study of the League of Nations’ work on double taxation in the 1920s. The League’s work resulted in the publication of the first model tax treaties on double taxation, which have had an enduring (but somewhat forgotten) influence on the modern-day international tax regime.

This book is based on extensive archival research. The League of Nations Archives was the primary source of documents; I also visited the United Kingdom National Archives (London) and the Seligman Archives, Columbia University (New York). Unfortunately, there are gaps in the archival material. The League’s work on international double taxation was not considered significant and the documents are archived under ‘financial’, ‘economic’, and ‘miscellaneous’ in the League’s Archives. Most of the early archival material was available in French only. Meticulous care was taken in translating the original French documents, but French is not my first, second, or third language. The translations are undoubtedly influenced by knowledge of the later English content.

The importance of tax treaty history has been well articulated and the primary purpose of this book is to provide a comprehensive account of the drafting of the first model tax treaties. The historical analysis will assist with tax treaty interpretation. The book also answers prevailing questions about the League’s work and confirms, and, in many cases, corrects assumptions about the League’s work. It is hoped that, at a broader level, the historical analysis provides insights into policy considerations for further reforms of the international tax regime.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I am grateful to Richard Vann. This book would not have been completed without his encyclopaedic knowledge of tax treaty developments. His enthusiasm for tax history sparked my curiosity and ongoing interest in the topic.

I am also thankful to John Avery Jones for his encouragement of my research and for assistance in understanding aspects of UK tax history.

I am extremely fortunate to be a faculty member at Melbourne Law School with colleagues who have supported and encouraged me throughout the process. I am especially grateful to my friend and colleague Chantal Morton for her insightful comments, and to the Academic Legal Research Service (particularly Cate Read) for assistance in finding obscure historical documents and manuscript preparation.

I am appreciative of the assistance provided by Jacques Oberson and Colin Wells at the League of Nations Archives, United Nations Office at Geneva.

Finally, I am indebted to my family and friends for their support and forbearance during what seemed (to them) like a never-ending quest. Special thanks to my mother and to my husband, Dr Robert Richardson.
ABBREVIATIONS

BEPS    base erosion and profit shifting
DMC    draft model convention
DTA    double tax agreement
G20    Group of Twenty
GIT    general income tax
ICC    International Chamber of Commerce
IFS    Irish Free State
ISC    international shipping conference
OECD   Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OECD Model   OECD Model Tax Convention on Income and on Capital
PE    permanent establishment
PIO    permanent international organisation
SA    South Africa
UN    United Nations
US    United States
USSR   Union of Soviet Socialist Republics