

```
a'Beckett, William 148-49, 151, 154, 157, 173,
                                                  Barry, Redmond 151 n. 40, 153, 156 n. 77, 158
                                                  Benjamin, Josiah 242
       174, 175
Adams, Charles Francis 48-49, 50, 62-63, 66
                                                  Bennett, J. M. 118-19, 122, 131, 134 n. 92, 143
Admiralty, Court of 17, 82, 120
                                                  Bentham, Jeremy 72
                                                 Bigge, John 123
aequitas 52
America. See also CHANCERY, COURTS
                                                  Blackstone, Sir William
                                                    equity 359, 397
       OF; UNITED STATES OF
       AMERICA.
                                                    influence in United States 58, 359
  colonies
                                                    reporter 203 n. 1, 220
     New York 144 n. 1
                                                 Blake, William Hume 11
     Pennsylvania 53
                                                 Bodin, Jean 11
Archibald, E. M. 100-1
                                                 bonds
Aristotle
                                                    acquittance 10, 265
  Aristotelianism distinguished 32
                                                    Crown 262, 270, 277
                                                    disuse 269
    nice adjustment 32, 395-96
  epieikeia 3, 52, 395
                                                    enforced strictly 10, 256, 262-64, 266-71, 277
  like cases treated alike 54, 379
                                                    forfeiture 256
  on equity 34, 311, 312, 353, 359, 360, 369, 370,
                                                    penal 256, 257-58
       395, 397, 413-16
                                                    penalty a debt at law 10, 257, 263, 268-71
Ashburner, W. W. 68, 398, 400
  fluvial metaphor 68, 398-99
                                                      payment after the day (solvit post diem)
Atherton, William 75-76
                                                        264-65, 275
Australia
                                                      tender 258
                                                    performance 256
     New South Wales 118-43
                                                    relief
     Port Philip 128, 144-78
                                                      Chancery, Court of 10, 256, 264, 265, 266,
    Victoria 144-78
                                                        271-73, 275-77, 278
Ayres, Ian 327
                                                      Common Pleas, Court of 257, 266, 270
                                                      'common law', disappearance in England
Bacon, Francis (Lord Verulam) 6, 400, 410 n.
                                                        261-62, 277
       101, 412 n. 115, 414 n. 137
                                                      customary courts 263-64
Bacon, Francis (J.K.B.) 260
                                                      Elizabeth I 256
Bacon, Nicholas 4
                                                      Exchequer, Court of 264, 265
Bankton, Lord (Andrew McDouall) 182 n. 15,
                                                      false contrasts of common law and equity
                                                        272-73
                                                      Henry VIII 262
  Institute of the Laws of Scotland 182 n. 15
```



bonds (cont.)	Eldon 176, 235, 271, 397
Judicature Act system 273–79	Ellesmere 2, 4, 5, 11, 12, 16, 309
King's Bench, Court of 257–62, 270, 277	Nottingham (Finch) 6, 11–12, 16, 231–32, 254
late fourteenth century 256	257–58, 260–62, 265, 397–405, 410
legislation 255, 257, 264–79	Chancery, Court of. See also CANADA;
payment into court 258-62, 265, 275,	EQUITY, COURTS OF; NEW
278	BRUNSWICK; NEW SOUTH
Restoration period 254-55, 257-58	WALES; NOVA SCOTIA; UPPER
wish of Sir Matthew Hale 264	CANADA; VICTORIA.
simple 256	absence
unconscionable 10, 256, 263	Massachusetts 50, 52, 53 n. 22
Bracton 20	Pennsylvania 50, 52–53, 115
Brady, Matthew 48	western provinces (of Canada) 98
Bramwell, Lord (George Bramwell) 237,	western states (of United States) 50
273–74, 278, 294, 300	abuses of procedure 6
British North America. See CANADA.	Acts of <i>praemunire</i> 4–5
Burrows, Andrew 245–46, 298 n. 134, 379–80,	common injunction 124, 132, 259, 368
385–86	trials at law in breach 259 n. 36
	corruption of officers 8
Cairns, Lord (Hugh Cairns) 60 n. 65, 83–84,	Delaware 39–40, 68, 144 n. 1
92–94, 95, 298 n. 134, 401	Earl of Oxford's Case 5, 16, 31-32
Calabresi, Guido 326	Illinois 68, 69
Campbell, Lord (John Campbell) 78, 289–90	Latin 'side' 4 n. 8
Canada	medieval 3–4, 394–95
American Civil War 98	New Jersey 50, 60, 66–67, 103, 116
American Revolution 97–98, 110, 255 n. 6	New York 50, 60, 66–67, 103, 116
British immigration 98, 112	procedural powers
critiques of Chancery courts 104–5, 107–10	documentary evidence 124, 280–305
Dominion 98	examination of witnesses 103, 284
English colonies	St German, Christopher
Cape Breton Island 98	theory of Chancery and equity 5, 9–11, 12 n. 81
New Brunswick 98–101, 104–5, 108	
Newfoundland 98	settlement of jurisdiction, early modern 4–7
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
and a	
Clarendon 6	legislative statement 390, 392
Nova Scotia 98, 99–101, 104–7, 110, 112–14 Prince Edward Island (Île St-Jean) 98, 99–101 Rupert's Land 98 Upper Canada 98, 101–3, 107–10 fusion legal colonialism 110 variable 103, 110 legal innovation 103 Lower Canada (Quebec) 98, 103 provinces 98 responsible government 99, 103, 107 Chafee, Jr, Zechariah 38–39, 311 n. 7 Chancellor, Lord church official 15, 52, 358 king's conscience, keeper of 5, 11, 34, 52 Chancellors, Lord Clarendon 6	15–16, 57 n. 47, 397, 405, 410 Chancery, courts of See also EQUITY,



public benefit 388–89	mechanical failures 12
personal nexus doctrine 389	pleading
Church	character 20
early Chancellors 15, 52, 358	declaration 141 n. 130, 206, 207, 211, 214,
equitable relief against 67	218, 259, 261, 287, 288
Clarendon, Lord (Edward Hyde) 6	issue 20, 222, 258, 264
Clark, Charles E. 51, 69, 126	payment 10, 209, 258–59, 264–65, 268, 275
Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 1938 51, 69	tender 218, 233–35, 257–60, 264, 268
opinions on fusion 69	strictness 266, 267, 269
Cockburn, Alexander 84–88, 290, 293–95, 300,	procedure
401, 417	cause of action 17-20, 23, 26-27, 60, 61, 398
codification 46-69, 72, 79 n. 50, 88, 208 n. 43,	discovery 39, 43 n. 56, 60, 61, 62 n. 76,
356, 402	120–21, 124, 168, 280–305, 334 n. 12,
Coke, Edward 2, 4-6, 309	402 n. 57
Coleridge, Lord (John Coleridge) 87, 93, 94, 405	evidence 74, 76, 95, 103, 121, 156, 280–305,
colonies. See also AMERICA; CANADA;	412
NEW SOUTH WALES; NOVA	examination of witnesses 62, 71, 103, 156,
SCOTIA; VICTORIA.	280-84, 285, 287, 288, 289, 295-96, 302,
early administration of equity 3–8, 119–37,	305, 409
145–51, 154–60	forms of action 18–19, 23, 24, 27, 52, 54, 58,
copying England 94–110	63, 68–69, 192, 285 n. 30
diverging from England 99–110	imparlance 260
governors	interrogatories 101, 106, 156, 282, 305
equitable jurisdiction 7, 99–102	perpetual imparlance 258, 260–61
common law	stay 76 n. 35, 127, 258 n. 36, 260–61, 265,
actions	
common counts 207–19	271, 272 relief
debt 23, 111, 206–10, 215, 217, 219, 220, 221,	conditional judgments in Pennsylvania 53
225, 229, 257–72, 275, 277–79, 292, 336,	entitlement as of right 21, 25, 303 trial
360	
formulations of common counts 207, 211–12,	breach of common injunction 259 n. 36
213–14	writ of inquiry 276
indebitatus assumpsit 206–19	Common Law Commission
money lent 208–9, 218	first 284 n. 18
money paid 208–9, 214, 218	second 74, 285
quantum meruit 209–12, 214, 218	third 76–78
quantum valebant 209–12, 214, 218	conscience. See also CHANCELLOR;
assimilation to equity 23–24, 309–10, 326–27,	DOCTOR AND STUDENT; ST
372-73	GERMAN, CHRISTOPHER.
bail 65, 259 n. 36, 263, 265, 267	Chancellor's 34, 57, 409
claims, contrasted with equitable 19–27	Christian 9, 15–16, 34
conflicts with equity 71–72, 76, 80–94, 120,	culture of 8–9, 16, 32 n. 7
185, 230, 240, 247, 275, 279, 283, 294,	king's, keeper of 5, 11, 34, 52
298, 300, 331–36, 346–47, 349–50, 367,	St German, Christopher 5, 9–11, 12 n. 81
402, 404, 416	Doctor and Student 5 n. 20, 10, 256 n. 16,
conscience 10, 12, 120, 185, 203-5, 222-23,	396–97
226–28, 230, 240, 247, 275, 279, 283	J7" 7/
	medieval concept 9–11, 12
'equitable common law' doctrines	
'equitable common law' doctrines money had and received 204, 223–26	medieval concept 9–11, 12
	medieval concept 9–11, 12 contempt of court 31, 34–35, 53, 58, 61, 104, 361,



contract (cont.)	Bleak House 130
binding quality 231, 240	disclosure. See DISCOVERY.
coronation cases 249	discretion. See also EQUITABLE
equitable power to modify 230, 231–33	DISCRETION.
ebb and flow 230–31	discovery (disclosure)
forfeitures 21–24, 76, 78, 233–36, 256, 288,	Chancery power 280–81, 283, 286–87
293, 367	common law courts 283–85, 287–93
Lord Nottingham 231–33	discretionary 281, 284, 287, 289, 293, 296,
misrepresentation 81, 89–90, 95, 246–49	297, 299–302, 304–5
mistake 241–46, 357, 361, 363, 365, 372	fishing expeditions 281, 288, 290, 293, 305
money-lending contracts 231	fusion
penalties 186, 234, 236–38, 254–79, 332 n.	consequences 294–305
5, 402	modern shortcomings 282, 305
selective history 231	oppressiveness 282
unjust enrichment 26, 212, 230, 236, 239,	privilege 287, 292–93, 297–99, 304
241, 246–49, 251	purpose 286, 288, 291
flexibility 233, 237–38, 240, 246, 250	Doctor and Student
freedom of contract	bonds 10
rival values 241	conscience 9–10, 396
sanctity 231, 241	medieval common law 9–11, 12
good faith 251–53	Replication of a Serjeant at Law 10 n. 67
	Dowling, James 129, 130, 147
objective 253 rectification 14, 40	Downing, James 129, 130, 14/
reform where parliamentary legislation	Earl of Oxford's Case 5, 16, 31-32
unlikely 239–40	Edward VII 249
rescission 25–26, 95, 242–49, 361	Egerton, Thomas. See ELLESMERE, LORD
rules, qualities required 357–58	Eldon, Lord (John Scott) 176, 235, 271, 397
unfairness doctrines	rigid attitude towards equity 235, 397
frustration 249	Elizabeth I 11, 52, 233 n. 14, 256 Ellesmere, Lord (Thomas Egerton, Viscount
mistake 230, 231, 241–46, 248–51, 253	
Court of Conscience (Middlesex) 220, 222, 224 Court of Session	Brackley) 2, 4–5, 11, 12, 16, 309
	Epieikeia. See ARISTOTLE.
court of law and equity 179, 184, 188–89	equitable discretion
nobile officium 9, 10, 185, 190	meaning 36, 53–54, 72, 197–98, 411–14
Courts. See also CHANCERY, COURT OF;	open-endedness denied 41–42, 418
EQUITY, COURTS OF;	predictability 55, 193, 234–35, 272, 397, 418
EXCHEQUER, COURT OF.	range of choice 36, 42–43, 57, 74, 411
Coventry, Lord (Thomas) 6	relief on terms 24, 25, 75–77, 132, 250, 302
Cromwell, Oliver 6	equitable estates and interests
custom	divided ownership 180, 195
equity (analogy) 322	Hohfeld 333–34, 336, 338, 350–51
penalty bonds	Hohfeldian analysis 333–47
City of Bristol 263	Equity, courts of 2, 9, 10, 12, 15 n. 96, 17, 38, 55
City of London 263	61, 75, 82, 83, 95, 99, 126, 175, 225,
City of Norwich 263–64	230–32, 241, 247, 251, 254, 268, 273,
D. II i D	279, 286–87, 315, 322–24, 327, 359, 361
Darvall, J. B. 133	Equity: Doctrines and Remedies 119, 141,
Deakin, Simon 324	234–35
Deane, William 140	equity. See also CONSCIENCE; EPIEIKEIA
Denning, Lord (Alfred) 140, 243	EQUITABLE DISCRETION;
Dickens, Charles 130, 159	TRUSTS.



Index 425

abuse of right 230, 239, 251-53, 318, 321-24, accident of history 13 n. 91, 337, 364, 403 agent of legal change 325, 416 Aristotelian 34, 311, 312, 353, 359, 360, 369, 370, 395, 397, 413–16 assimilation to common law 17-27 autonomy (as value) 374-75, 380-93 balancing equities 326 bona fide purchase for value without notice 335–36, 338, 341 Chancery mends no man's bargain 231 charity law 386-93 civilian idea 182, 192, 204-5, 224-25, 252-53, claims, contrasted with common law 19-21 codification 46-69, 72, 79, 86, 356, 402 Coke-Ellesmere dispute 2, 4-6, 309 commercial morality 313, 322-24 constitution Commonwealth of Australia 8, 392 judicature 3–9 United States 7, 36-38, 46, 206 n. 28, 360 n. 22 covert 368-70 culture of 7, 8, 9, 16, 32 n. 7, 375, 385, 386, 390, 408 custom 263-64, 322 decrees 35, 50, 75-76, 128, 131, 221 defences 38, 76, 275, 277, 285, 315-16, 326 n. 56, 360, 361-64, 368-69, 372 desuetude in United States 39-40, 41-43 diffusion in United States 61-62, 63-65, 68 distinct normative perspectives 32-35, 229-53, 309-30, 374-86, 394-419 doctrines and remedies accident 22, 256 accounts 106, 168, 177, 376-79 assignment 120, 335-37, 345-47, 349-50 constructive fraud 312-14, 321-22, 359 n. 20 constructive trusts 154, 314, 360, 364 discovery 39, 43 n. 56, 60, 61, 62 n. 76, 120-21, 124, 168, 280-305, 334 n. 12, 402 n. 57 estoppel 310, 315, 323, 351 n. 91 fiduciary doctrines 139, 227, 321, 338, 360, 364-65, 377-78, 381 n. 32, 383 n. 37, 398-99, 403, 407-8 forfeiture, relief from 21-24, 233-36 fraud 16, 21, 22, 48, 65-66, 89, 93, 118, 216, 218, 223, 226, 241, 247, 248, 256,

263, 287, 312-14, 323, 326-28, 361, 364, 368 injunctions 39-43, 54, 61-62, 65, 75-76 laches 38, 69, 315, 323 misrepresentation 81, 89-90, 95, 246-49 mistake 241-46, 357, 361, 363, 365, 372 penalties, relief from 236-38, 254-79 receivers 48-49, 65, 165, 168 rectification 14, 40 specific performance 14, 53, 75-76, 100, 101, 136, 138 n. 113, 162, 167, 247, 280, 327, 361–63, 376 unclean hands 158, 196-97, 231, 312, 329, 361 undue influence 312, 315, 322, 360 n. 23, 363, 360 waste 83, 89, 334 dynamism 182, 234–35, 272, 314, 325, 415–16 equity of the statute 271, 395 extraordinary justice 32-33, 37, 42, 52, 53-56, 58, 190, 199, 230, 362–63, 411, 415 ex post specification 14-15, 311-12, 321, 366, 368, 411, 415 factual particularity 32-36, 309, 313, 407 form v. substance 14, 31-32, 33, 34, 39, 47, 56, 58, 236, 238 n. 34 found indispensable 8 gloss on the common law 33, 359 n. 19 good faith 251-53, 313, 318, 322, 335 n. 22, 355, 372, 417 in personam quality 35, 361, 364, 366, 368 informality 4, 10, 17, 20 intellectual separateness from law 181-86, 190-91, 198-200 judicial command 32, 34-35, 40-41, 43-44 king as fountain of 32, 34-36, 40-41, 43-44 Legal Realism 62 n. 76, 309-10, 326, 330, 353, 370-73 maxims 51, 72, 313, 412 n. 115 mitigation of law 33, 224, 348-51, 359, 412-13 money had and received, action for 204-5, 223-26 moral standards 3, 13, 15-16, 31-32, 34, 51, 92, 314, 321-24, 327, 408-10 multiple Chancellors 41 natural law 180-84, 192-94, 199, 322, 396 n. opportunism 312-14, 318, 321, 324-25, 328-29, 348, 357–58, 365–68, 369–70 popular awareness 368-70



Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-42131-7 — Equity and Law Edited by John C. P. Goldberg , Henry E. Smith , P. G. Turner Index More Information

equity. (cont.)	penalties
positive law 3, 11, 58–59, 93, 182–83, 224,	relieved 264, 265, 271, 273, 275 n. 144
396–98, 405–6, 416	upheld 264
procedure	sides
bill 4, 10, 17, 20	equity 254
Protestant Reformation 2, 409	Pleas 264
relief on terms 22, 24, 25, 75–77, 132, 210	•
safety valve 42, 229, 313, 314, 324	Fawkner, John Pascoe 145–46
Scotland 179–299, 274, 396, 402, 405	Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 1938 73, 281
second-order character 309–30, 367–68,	culmination of Field's endeavours 7, 12, 47
396–97, 415, 417	drafters 51, 69
sovereignty and 5–8, 11	equity 38, 43, 69, 359–60
teaching in universities 43, 45, 142, 333,	fusion 38, 43, 359–60, 368
395 n. 6	purpose 38
technical equity 14–15, 24, 193–94, 204–5,	Federal Farmer 37
	Field Code
224, 395, 413 terminology 28, 20, 41, 42, 106	adoption
terminology 38–39, 41, 42, 196	
dispensable 15, 310	Arkansas 64
range of meanings 418	Indiana 52
theories of	lowa 52, 64
composite 13–14	Kentucky 52, 64
dualism 15, 23, 419	New York state 46–68
failed 9–13	Ohio 52
Field, D. D. 12, 56–61, 64, 66–67	Oregon 64
monism 15, 17–27, 419	Tennessee 64
nominalism 15 n. 96, 57, 59, 74 n. 23, 90,	basis of Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 193
335 n. 19, 417	7, 12, 47
Nottingham, Lord 6–7, 11–12	distinction between law and equity 50–65,
prerogative 11	68–69
supplement to common law 20, 33, 35,	Field, Barron 124
230, 244, 334, 337, 344, 351, 359, 360,	Field, David Dudley. See also 'FUSION';
365, 411, 415, 417	NEW YORK; EQUITY, THEORIES
St German, Christopher 5, 9–11, 12 n. 81	OF.
unitary 13, 15, 17–27, 419	attorney 48
torts derived from 325–30	Erie raid 48–50
unconscionability	law reformer 70
disgracefulness 252	opponents 53–56
wrongdoing 251–52	supporters 56–63
United States	legal statesman 48
concerns in early republic 7, 36-37	nominalism 57, 59
distinctiveness 40, 47, 68-69, 358-65	views on fusion, merger and union 59-61,
future 44–45	63–65, 417
Erle, William 71, 292, 294	Finch, Heneage. See NOTTINGHAM,
Esten, James 108	LORD.
Exchequer, Court of	Finn, Paul 140, 142, 383 n. 37
injunctions 124	Fisher, T. J. 133
jurisdiction, common law and equitable 71,	Fisk, Jim 48–49, 67 n. 97
123	fission
model of 'fused' court	differentiation of legal rules 374, 375–86,
New South Wales 121, 124	394, 397–400, 404, 408, 415, 416, 419
Upper Canada 102–3	division of labour 55–56, 59, 78, 93, 94, 35
1.1	



obverse of 'fusion' 395	insolubility of fusion/fission debate 230-31,
rules of court 124–32, 176–78	253
separation of courts 138, 401	New South Wales
'sides' of courts 119, 122, 124–32, 138	delayed enactment 139–43
Fonblanque, John 194 n. 68	New York State 46-69
forfeiture, equitable relief from	procedural 70, 72–79, 80–81
appropriation of collateral 21-22	remedies 47, 53, 58, 63, 110–15
company shares 21-22	revolution 2, 6, 50, 255
conditions 23	substantive 17, 75, 77–78, 81, 83–90, 119, 279,
fusion	281, 394–419
consequences 23–24	meaning among nineteenth-century English
manifestation 23-24	reformers 70–96
heads 22	meaning among nineteenth-century New
land 22, 233	York reformers 50–63
terms 22, 24	obverse of 'fission' 395
Forbes, Francis 100, 124–26, 129, 144	theories of
administration of equity 100–1, 118–19,	federal analogy 46
124–26, 129, 144	procedure 71, 83, 94, 95
Chief Justice of Newfoundland 100	transubstantiation 330, 401, 414
Chief Justice of New South Wales 118, 124,	
129, 144	Gilmore, Grant 310, 373 n. 65
Forsyth, William 93	Gipps, George 129, 149
Francis, H. J. 79	Gould, Jay 48–49, 67 n. 97
fusion	government
administrative 72 n. 9, 73–78, 86, 119	Chancery, Court of 8, 32
America 31–45, 46–69, 309–30, 353, 358–73	equity, place of 8–9
appellate tribunals 60, 66–67, 79–80, 88,	institutions of 8–9, 145
90, 105, 107–8, 110, 120, 121, 128, 132,	Green, Leon 310
139, 146, 149, 155, 158, 184, 188, 245, 274,	Gummow, W. M. C. 119 n. 4, 220, 235
295, 341	II I Made a
Australia 139–43	Hale, Matthew 264
breach of trust 379, 385	Hamilton, Alexander 37
Canada	Harcourt, Lord (Simon Harcourt) 266
predominance of eastern solutions 98	Harcourt, Vernon 87, 94
convergence, by 91, 96, 117, 254, 400,	Hargrave, John 133
402	Hastings, G. W. 73, 85
diffusion 61–62, 63–65, 68	Hatherley, Lord (William Page Wood) 81–82,
England	90, 134, 294, 400 Hamming C. W. as as
piecemeal approach 74, 75	Hemming, G. W. 90–92
equitable defences at common law 74–77,	Hesselink, Martijn 252–53
132, 262 n. 63, 264	Heydon, J. D. 142
failed bills (England)	High Court of Justiciary 199
Atherton/Campbell 75–79	Higinbotham, George 170, 174
Hatherley 79–87, 88, 294–95	Higgins, Henry Bourne 139, 171–72
Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 1938 38,	Hoddesdon, Christopher 260
43, 359–60, 368	Hodges, Henry 175
Field Code 33–63 Field David Dudley 50, 61, 62, 65, 417	Hoffman, Michael 58, 59 Hohfeld, W. N.
Field, David Dudley 59–61, 63–65, 417	conflict of law and equity 333–45
functional analysis 312–30, 372, 374–93 fusion fallacy 68, 119, 141	means v. ends 334–49
hyper-fusion 310, 326, 328	Maitland, F. W. 333–34



> 428 Holroyd, Edward 158, 170, 173, 174, 175 unjust judicial rulings 239 Holt, John 207, 215-19 modify contracts 229-53 narrow view of money had and received iuries competence to decide equity questions Hood, Joseph 175 20 n. 127, 36, 55–56, 59, 62, 66, 67, Huskisson, William 102 72-74, 206 Hyde, Edward. See CLARENDON, LORD. right to 37, 38, 47, 69, 121, 204–5, 276, 360 n. 22 waiver of 61 Ibbetson, David 16, 31 n. 2, 210 jurisprudence cognitive bias 355-56 Jackson, Maria Teresa 158-59 general rules and particular cases 354-70 Jacobs, Kenneth 140, 141 n. 130 James I 5, 7, 10 n. 70 human reasoners 355 Jameson, Robert 102-3, 108 legal rules Jeffcott, William 147-48 advantages 329, 354-58 Jessel, George 87, 94, 95, 232, 247, 298, 300, contextual 15, 42 formal 309, 311, 414 301, 303, 401 Jordan, Frederick 138, 140 formalism as matter of degree 311, 313 judges imperfect 354-58 colonial 99, 105, 107-9, 124-37, 145-53, 170-76 Kames, Lord (Henry Home) 182-83, 186, 198, common law judges 4-5, 6 313 n. 15, 325 n. 54, 359, 405–6, 409, resistance to nineteenth-century reforms 410, 415-16, 419 63, 74-75, 77, 81 Principles of Equity 182-83 Keener, W. A. 224 equity judges resistance to nineteenth-century reforms Keeper, Lord 63, 74-75, 77, 78-79, 81, 85 Bacon 46 Judicature Acts 1873-1875, England Coventry 6 Egerton 4, 5 parliamentary debates 88, 90-91 Finch 6, 254 Harcourt 266 press 90-94 common law judges 95-96 North 264 Somers 266 numerousness 91 contrast with Statute of Uses 86 n. 92, 400-1, Williams 6 Keeton, Page 326-37, 328 courts abolished 94, 120 Kent, James 38 n. 33, 108, 113 Kindersley, Richard 76 effects 94-96 enacted in colonies Kitto, Frank 140 New South Wales 122 Victoria 169-76 Lamont, George 158-59 penalties, relief from 273-78 Law Amendment Society 70, 72, 78, 85, 401 Trower, Charles Francis 72, 401 subject matter aside from equity 120 Judicature Commission law reform appointment 79 colonial enactment of English reforms 102, first report 79-81, 121, 294-95 fusion envisaged 80-81, 294 New South Wales 121-22, 138-39 remit 70 colonial experiments 103, 109 judicial power New South Wales 122-30 amendment of law 238-41 lawyers analogies from statute 240 attitudes towards fusion 88, 95-96, 170-71 parliamentary amendment speculative 240 Chancery practitioners 70-71, 91-92



common law practitioners 70-71, 92-93	Malins, Richard 82
Law Magazine 92	Manning, William 135
Law Times 73, 78, 84, 92	Mason, Anthony 140
Saturday Review 84, 85–86, 90	maxims
Solicitors' Journal 73–74, 75–76, 78, 90,	aequitas sequitur legem (equity follows the law)
92-93	254, 399
attitudes towards procedural	equity acts in personam 35, 361, 364, 366,
retorm	308
England 71–72, 73, 78–79, 87	lex sequitur equitatem (the law follows
New York (state) 52–65, 69	equity) 254
Victoria (state) 169–76	nemo debet locupletari ex aliena jactura
bush 146	192–93
Laycock, Douglas 281, 327	of equity 72
Leake, S. M. 242	Meagher, R. P. 119, 235
Leff, Arthur 358 n. 15	Melamed, Douglas 326
legal history	merger. See 'FUSION', AMERICA.
perpetually controverted questions 231	Michie, Archibald 148–49
legal practice	Milsom, S. F. C. 12–13, 15
equity	mixed legal systems
New South Wales 142–43	Cape of Good Hope 274
United States 48–51, 65–69	Ceylon 274
Victoria (state) 154–58	decisions on penalty doctrine 274
Legal Realism (movement)	Scotland 179, 188, 396
equity	Molesworth, Robert 145, 150-53, 157, 158, 165,
open-endedness 309, 325	168, 170, 173, 176, 178
potential to swallow private law 310	biography 150–51
formalist potential 241	dispatch of work 151, 153, 173-74, 176
fusion as transubstantiation 330, 401, 414	judicial style 151–53
Gilmore, Grant 310, 373 n. 65	Lamont will case 158-59
Green, Leon 310	opinions on English procedure 153
Llewellyn, Karl 372, 373 n. 65	More, Thomas 4
Prosser, William 310, 327, 328	Morgan, J. P. 39, 49, 65
Restatements 329, 372	Morgan, Osborne 94
tort	Morris, Clarence 326–28
assimilation to equity 310, 372	mortgages
potential to swallow private law 310	enforcement without equity court 21–22, 102
Lehane, J. R. F. 235	equity of redemption 100, 102, 110, 111
Llewellyn, Karl 372, 373 n. 65	foreclosure
Lonsdale, William 145	foreclosure and sale 111
Loomis, Arphaxad 57, 417	strict foreclosure 111, 112
Lush, Robert 86–87	legislation 21, 102, 112
Edsii, Robert 60 0/	litigation
Madden, John 174–75	New York (state) 112
Madison, Kristen 327	Nova Scotia 106–7
Maitland, F. W.	
	Upper Canada 102
equity as fulfilling the common law 230, 415	Victoria (state) 168
equity as gloss on the common law 33	redemption 112, 168
harmony of equity with common law 312,	relief from forfeiture 21–23
331, 350	sale
Hohfeld, W. N. 333–34	mortgage bid 112–15
Maitland, Peregrine 102	New York 112–14



430 *Index*

mortgages (cont.) Primary Judge in Equity 128-35, 146-48 Nova Scotia 112-14 rules of court 125-26, 127 undervalue 111-12, 138 volume of equity litigation 132-33, 135 Upper Canada 114-15 New York (state) civil procedure reforms 47, 73, 97, 156 Moses v. Macferlan constitutional convention 1846 47, 51-59 antecedents 206-19 absent statute 203, 204, 221, 224, 227 Court of Chancery 50, 60, 66-67, 103, 116, novel situation 205 144 n. 1 reasoning of Lord Mansfield 220-27 Province 12 n. 110 conscience 203-4, 222-27 State 46-69, 97, 112-14 New York Code of Civil Procedure. See equity 204, 223-26 Roman law 205, 224-25 FIELD CODE. Murdoch, Beamish 104 New Zealand volume of equity litigation 163 nobile officium. See also COURT OF Nast, Thomas 48 natural law 180–84, 193–94, 199, 322, 396 n. 12, SESSION; EQUITY. Nottingham, Lord (Heneage Finch) 405 Newfoundland theory of equity 6, 11-12 administration of equity Nova Scotia circuit sittings 100 administration of equity equity court 99, 144 n. 1 concurrently with common law 100 governor 99-100 governor 99 Forbes, Francis 100 Chancery Court governor 99-100 abolition 105-7 Supreme Court complaints 104-5 of 1792 100 predominance of mortgage litigation 106-7 of 1824 100 reception of English legal arrangements 99 equity 'side' 101 Supreme Court New Brunswick circuit sittings 106 administration of equity equity court 99, 104-5 O'Conor, Charles 57-58, 69 governor 99 Owen, William 134-36 Chancery Court Palmer, George E. 242, 249 abolition 105 complaints 104-5 penalty doctrine bail 259 n. 36, 263, 265, 267 Supreme Court 105 New South Wales breach requirement, alleged 277 equity common law favours penalties 10, 256, 263, statutes 121–22, 128–29, 131–32, 134–37, 138–39 268-71 equity jurisdiction 122-39 Crown 262, 270, 277 First Charter of Justice 123 equity as basis of 'common law' doctrine New York reforms 133 271-79 Port Philip District 129-30 executorship 263, 268-69 pre-Judicature Act system 118, 122-38 false contrasts of common law and equity reception of English law 121-22 Second Charter of Justice 123, 125 fusion by convergence 254-55 Supreme Court mixed jurisdictions, decisions from 274 Court of Exchequer (Westminster) penalty as debt in law 10, 257, 263, 268-71 compared 121, 123-24 prevailing understanding 254-55, 272-73 jurisdictional separation of common law Chancery, Court of 10, 256, 264, 265, 266 and equity 124-39



common law 261–62, 264–76, 277	railroads 48–49, 62–63, 65–67
Common Pleas, Court of 257, 266, 270	Ramsey, Joseph 49, 65
Exchequer, Court of 264, 265	Randall, John 324
King's Bench, Court of 257-62, 270, 277	restitution, law of. See also
statutory 255, 257, 264-79	SCOTLAND, UNJUSTIFIED
statutory, in Judicature Act system 275-79	ENRICHMENT.
quantum damnificatus 262	abstract value 27
security 252, 266, 275	actions
Penzance, Lord (James Wilde) 82–84, 90	assimilation to forms of action 19, 24-27
Plater, Zygmunt 315	equitable claims recast 24–27
Polden, Patrick 95, 166	counter-restitution 26
positivism 15, 59–60, 179, 183–84, 235	fusion
prerogative	consequences 24–27
royal 4	manifestation 24–27, 342
theory of equity 5–7, 11, 13	knowing receipt of trust assets 26–27,
United States 7, 11	,
Prince Edward Island	341–43
	money had and received
administration of equity 99	before Moses v. Macferlan 206–8, 213–19
Privy Council	common law or equitable action 204–5
proposed power to make rules of court 82,	conscience, determinant of liability 205,
84, 294–95	222–23, 226–28
Privy Council (Scotland) 187–88	conscience, explanatory idea 203–4
procedure	descended from account 213
cause of action	illegality 217
common law pleading 17–18	implied contract 204, 210, 218, 221
Judicature Act pleading 17–18, 173	implied obligation 210
conditional judgments 53	mistake 216, 224–26, 342, 344, 347–49
course of the court 257–58	modern rationale 226–67
differences in common law and equitable	money or money's worth 218–19
17–18, 280–365	request unnecessary 214
form of action 18–19, 23, 24, 27, 52, 54, 57, 58,	Story, Joseph 225
63, 68–69, 192, 285 n. 30	money paid and money lent 208–9
fusion in Judicature Acts 18, 281	request 208–9
imparlance 260	quantum meruit 209–19
Judicature Act 17–18, 88, 95, 172, 280–305	request 212
payment into court 211, 259–62, 264	quantum valebat (or valebant) 209–12
perpetual imparlance 258, 260-61	request 212
stay 76 n. 35, 127, 259 n. 36, 260–61, 265, 271,	restitutio in integrum 14, 26
272	Roman law 193, 204–5, 221, 223–25
wager of law 206	aequitas 52
property. See also EQUITABLE ESTATES	praetor 52
AND INTERESTS.	Romilly, Lord (John Romilly) 76, 83, 85,
conflicts of law and equity 331–52	86–89, 95, 134
easements 338, 352	rules of court
land	implementing 'fission' 124–26
title in colonial Newfoundland 100	New South Wales 124–26
married women's property 110	power to make 81–82
numerus clausus 337–38	Privy Council 82, 84, 294–95
ownership 90, 169, 180, 195–96, 312, 333–41	Victoria (state) 155, 173, 176
restrictive covenants 352	Russell, Lord (John Russell) 127 n. 48,
Prosser, William 310, 327, 328	128 n. 53, 129 n. 61, 129 n. 62



St German, Christopher 12, 15, 405 <i>Doctor and Student</i> 5 n. 20, 10, 256 n. 16, 396–97	Tasmania volume of equity litigation 161–63 Therry, Roger 121 n. 20, 132, 148, 150, 158 n. 83, 163
Little Treatise on the Writ of Subpoena	Topp, Samuel St John 173–74
10 n. 67, 15 n. 97	tort
theory of conscience 5, 9–11, 12 n. 81	abuse of right 318, 321-24
St Leonards, Lord (Edward Sugden) 71 n. 6,	appropriation of likeness 327–28
78, 83	balancing tests 326 n. 56
Scotland	doctrines derived from equity 325-30
courts	ex ante specification 311, 321
Court of Session 184-90, 199, 402	formality 311 n. 5, 313
High Court of Justiciary 199	liability rules 326-27
nobile officium 185, 190, 199	libel 318–19
Union with England in 1707 180, 183, 187, 188	misappropriation of news 324
unjustified enrichment, doctrines	nature of rules 412 n. 117
191–94	first-order 310, 311, 326, 327
Selborne, Lord (Roundell Palmer) 79-80,	generality 311, 313
87–93, 134, 232, 295, 400, 405	negligence 95, 140–41, 246 n. 73, 289, 310, 313
Selden, Henry 63, 66	damage of trust assets 336
Selden, John	duty of care 319–20
Chancellor's foot 36 n. 20, 57, 309	express assumption of risk 316 n. 23, 320–21
Shearman, Thomas 48, 49, 65	pure economic loss 141, 340
Shepherd, Lorenzo	nuisance 315–18, 328, 341 n. 47
analysis of equity 54	coming to the nuisance 315–18
Simmons, George	product liability
analysis of equity 53–56	privity rule 319–20
Smith, Henry E. 177, 348, 365–67, 374	property rules 326–29
equity, 'second order' role 396	privilege to defame
opportunism 348, 365–67	absolute 318
Social Science Association 87	qualified 318–19
Somers, Lord (John Somers) 266	slander 318–19
Spragge, John 108	trespass 20, 138, 140-41, 209, 310-11, 329, 336,
Stair, Viscount (James Dalrymple) 181, 182, 183,	394
185, 194, 396, 397	unfair competition 322-24, 329
Institutions of the Law of Scotland 181–82, 396	waivers of liability 321
statutes	tracing 25 n. 151
charity law 386–88	'negative assets' 27
equity of the statute 271, 395	Treitel, Guenter 245
mandatory or directory 255	Trower, Charles Francis 72, 401
penalties, relief	trusts (constructive) 154, 180, 342-43, 364, 369,
equitable jurisdiction invested in	382 n. 31
common law courts 271–72	trusts (express) 333-45
picking up equitable doctrines 204, 227, 276,	autonomy 380–93
390	beneficiaries' entitlements 177, 333-45
tax 390, 392	breach of trust
Stawell, William 152, 153, 158, 169	accounting 26–27, 375–80
Stephen, Alfred 131–34, 136, 138, 149	dishonest assistance 180, 343
Story, Joseph 38, 46, 113, 225, 242, 312, 359,	receipt of trust assets 26–27, 341–45
360 n. 23	damage of trust assets 336–41
Stuart, John 76	enforcement of trust 14, 101, 177, 336, 346
subrogation 27	Hohfeld, W. N. 333–36



Maitland, F. W. 8, 333–36 ownership under 333–45	Vanderbilt, Cornelius 48–49 Van Diemen's Land. See TASMANIA.
recipient of trust assets	Victoria (state)
innocent 341–45	equity jurisdiction
knowing 26–27, 341–45	delay 159–60
unjust enrichment 26–27, 341–45	efficient administration 157-60
rules	equity practice in nineteenth century 154–60
modular 381	gold 149–50
signalling function 43, 383–84	Judicature Act system
Scotland	doubtfully needed 157–58, 178
as nominate contract 194	reception 169–76
as patrimony 194	Melbourne 148–50
self-dealing 365	mining law 151, 168
traditional trusts 383–84	New York reforms 156
transactional trusts 383–84	Royal Commission into the Supreme Court
Victoria (state) 164, 168–69	1880 169–70
	Royal Commission into the Administration
union. See 'FUSION', AMERICA.	of Justice 1899 171–76
United States of America. See also AMERICA.	rules of court 155–56, 170–71, 173, 176
Congress 37, 44	Supreme Court 147–50, 154–56
Constitution 7, 36–38, 46, 206 n. 28,	volume of equity litigation 160–66
360 n. 22	
Declaration of Independence 7	Webb, George 174
equity 6–8, 31–45, 46–69, 359–60,	Wechsler, Steven 113–14
368–73	Westbury, Lord (Richard Bethell) 81–82, 83,
distinction between law and equity 6-8,	85, 86, 242
206 n. 28	Williams, Edward 153, 158, 170
federal courts 36-38	Williams, Hartley 174
prerogative theory of equity 7, 11	Williams, John (Bishop) 6
republicanism, effect on equity 7, 11	Willis, John Walpole 126–29, 133, 143, 146–47,
state courts 38, 61–62, 68–69	154
Supreme Court	author 126, 146
equity 37	catalyst for 'fission' in
Upper Canada	New South Wales 128–29, 143, 146
administration of equity 101–3, 144 n. 1	Chancery practice 126–27
Blake reforms 107–9	Chief Baron proposal 128
Court of Chancery	drafter general rules in equity 127
Circuit sittings 109	troublesome 127, 143, 146–47
reform 107–10	Wilson, Arthur 90
equity not received 101	writs
colonial secretary 102	prohibition 6 n. 28
Court of Exchequer as model 103	quo warranto 66
equity received 102	
reception of English law 101	Yale, D. E. C. 232
responsible government 103–4	Young, William 106