The absence of a globally recognized right to a healthy environment has not prevented the development of human rights norms relating to the environment. Indeed, one of the most noteworthy aspects of human rights law over the last twenty years is that UN treaty bodies, regional tribunals, special rapporteurs, and other human rights mechanisms have applied human rights law to environmental issues even without a stand-alone, justiciable human right to a healthy environment. In *The Human Right to a Healthy Environment*, a diverse set of scholars and practitioners, all of whom have been instrumental in defining the relationship between human rights and the environment, provide their thoughts on what is, or should be, the role of an international human right to a healthy environment. The right to a healthy environment could be a capstone to this field of law, could help to provide structure to it, or could move it in new directions.

John H. Knox is Henry C. Lauerman Professor of International Law at Wake Forest University, North Carolina, and has written extensively on human rights and environmental issues. The first UN Special Rapporteur on human rights and the environment, he has led the effort to understand and promote the application of human rights to environmental issues. He won the Francis Deák Prize for scholarship in 2003. Between 1999 and 2005, he chaired a national advisory committee to the US Environmental Protection Agency, and from 2008 to 2012 he was of counsel to the Center for International Environmental Law.

Ramin Pejan is a staff attorney at Earthjustice’s International Program, based in San Francisco. He is also an adjunct clinical professor at the University of California, Irvine, School of Law, in its International Justice Clinic. Prior to Earthjustice, Ramin worked for the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights and the United Nations Environment Programme on the links between human rights and environmental issues. From 2010 to 2012, Ramin worked in Bushbuckridge, South Africa, as legal counsel for the Association for Water and Rural Development, a non-profit organization focusing on water resource management issues in rural South Africa.
The Human Right to a Healthy Environment

Edited by

JOHN H. KNOX
Wake Forest University

RAMIN PEJAN
Earthjustice
Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Contributors</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John H. Knox and Ramin Pejan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Catalyst for Change: Evaluating Forty Years of Experience in Implementing the Right to a Healthy Environment</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David R. Boyd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Learning from Constitutional Environmental Rights</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erin Daly and James R. May</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Right to a Satisfactory, Healthy, and Sustainable Environment in the African Regional Human Rights System</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lilian Chenwi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The European Court of Human Rights and International Environmental Law</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ole W. Pedersen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Complexities and Uncertainties in Matters of Human Rights and the Environment: Identifying the Judicial Role</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dinah Shelton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Reasoning Up: Environmental Rights as Customary International Law</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca M. Bratspies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

**Sumudu Atapattu** University of Wisconsin

**David R. Boyd** University of British Colombia, Vancouver

**Rebecca M. Bratspies** Center for Environmental Reform, City University of New York School of Law

**Lilian Chenwi** University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

**Erin Daly** Widener University School of Law, Delaware

**Louis J. Kotzé** North-West University, South Africa; University of Lincoln, UK

**Marc Limon** Universal Rights Group, Geneva

**Daniel Magraw** Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore

**James R. May** Widener University School of Law, Delaware

**Marcos Orellana** Human Rights Watch, USA

**Ole W. Pedersen** Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University, UK

**Lavanya Rajamani** Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi

**César Rodríguez-Garavito** University of Los Andes, Colombia

**Dinah Shelton** George Washington University, Washington, DC

**Kristina Wienhöfer** International Justice Initiative
Table of Cases

Acción de tutela instaurada por Orlando José Morales Ramos, contra la Sociedad Drummond Ltda, Decision No. T-154 – 2013 (Constitutional Court of Colombia, Sixth Chamber of Appeals, 2013).

Advocate Prakash Mani Sharma v. Cabinet Secretariat, No. 3027/2059 (Supreme Court of Nepal, 1997).


Anjum Irfan v. LDA, PLD 2002 Lahore 555 (Pakistan, 2002).

Appeal No. 575-998, Minas Gervais (Brazil Supreme Court of Justice, 2004).

Appeal No. 70011759842, Rio Grande do Sul (Brazil Supreme Court of Justice, 2005).

Asghar Leghari v. Pakistan, No. 25501/2015 (Lahore High Court Green Bench, 2015).

Ashworth and Others v. United Kingdom, No. 39561/98 (European Court of Human Rights, 2004).

Askew v. Game & Fresh Water Fish Comm’n, 336 So. 2d 556 (Fla. 1976).

Asociación Interamericana para la Defensa del Ambiente y otros (Costa Rican Constitutional Court, 2009).

Asylum Case (Colombia v. Peru), [1950] ICJ Rep. 266.

Atanasov v. Bulgaria, No. 12853/03 (European Court of Human Rights, 2011).

Baba Dam Case, No. 1212–2007-RA (Constitutional Court of Ecuador, 2008).

Bankovic and Others v. Belgium and Others (Admissibility), No. 52207/99 (European Court of Human Rights, 2001).


Beatriz Silvia Mendoza v. Argentina, M. 1569 (Supreme Court of Argentina, 2008).
x Table of Cases

Brândusa v. Romania, No. 6586/03 (European Court of Human Rights, 2009).
Budayeva and Others v. Russia, Nos. 15339/02, 21166/02, 2005/02, 11673/02 and 15343/02 (European Court of Human Rights, 2008).
Bulankulama and Six Others v. Ministry of Industrial Development and Seven Others, S.C. Application No 584/99 (F.R) (Supreme Court of the Democratic Socialist Republica of Sri Lanka).

City of Elgin v. County of Cook, 660 N.E.2d 875 (Ill. 1995).
Clean Air Foundation Limited & Gordon David Oldham v. Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, HCAL 35/2007 (Court of First Instance, Constitutional and Administrative Law List, Hong Kong, 2007).
Concerned Residents of Manila Bay et al. v. Metropolitan Manila Development Authority and Others, Nos. 171947–8 (Supreme Court of the Philippines, 1998).
Concerned Residents of Manila Bay et al. v. Metropolitan Manila Development Authority and Others, Nos. 171947–8 (Supreme Court of the Philippines, 2008).
Constitutional Court of Colombia, sentencia no. C-443/09 (2009).
Constitutional Court of Colombia, sentencia no. T-291/06, 96 (2009).
Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc. (Daubert II), 43 F.3d 131, 136 (9th Cir. 1995).
Demir and Baykara v. Turkey, No. 34503/97 (European Court of Human Rights, 2008).
Di Sarro v. Italy, No. 30765/08 (European Court of Human Rights, 2012).
Dubetsk a and Others v. Ukraine, No. 30499/03 (European Court of Human Rights, 2011).
**Table of Cases**


Ethyl Corp. v. EPA, 541 F2d 1 (D.C. Cir. 1976).

Expediente D-8019 (Colombia Constitutional Court, 2010).

Fadeyeva v. Russia, No. 55723/00 (European Court of Human Rights, 2005).

Fägerskiöld v. Sweden, No. 37664/04 (admissibility), (European Court of Human Rights, 2008).


Fuel Retailers Association of Southern Africa v. Director-General Environmental Management, Department of Agriculture, Conservation and Environment, Mpumalanga Province and Others, Case No. CCT 67/06 (South Africa, 2007).


Giacomelli v. Italy, No. 59909/00 (European Court of Human Rights, 2007).

Glisson v. City of Marion, 720 N.E.2d 1034, 1041 (Ill. 1999).

Golder v. United Kingdom, No. 4451/70 (European Court of Human Rights, 1975).

Greenwatch v. Attorney General and National Environmental Management Authority, Miscellaneous Application 140 (Uganda, 2002).

Hardy and Maile v. United Kingdom, No. 31965/07 (European Court of Human Rights, 2012).


Hatton and Others v. United Kingdom, No. 36022/07 (European Court of Human Rights, 2003).

H. M. Henares, Jr. et al. v. Land Transportation Franchising and Regulatory Board et al., G.R. No. 158290 (Supreme Court of Philippines, 2006).

Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Advisory Opinion OC-23-17 of November 15, 2017, para. 62.


Issa and Others v. Turkey, No. 31821/96 (European Court of Human Rights, 2004).

Jacobs v. Flemish Region, No. 80.018 (Belgium, Council of State, 1999).


## Table of Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ledaye, Dobrokhotova, Zolotareva and Romashina v. Russia, Nos. 53157/99, 53247/99, 53695/00 and 56850/00 (European Court of Human Rights, 2006).</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation (LETCO) v. Liberia, ARB 83/2, Award (ICSID, 1986).</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loizidou v. Turkey, No. 15318/89 (European Court of Human Rights, 1996).</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case of the S.S. Lotus (France v. Turkey), [1927] P.C.I.J. (ser. A) No. 10.</td>
<td>Internation</td>
<td>1927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthews v. United Kingdom, No. 24833/94 (European Court of Human Rights, 1999).</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. C. Mehta v. Union of India, No. 2002 (4) SCC 356 (India).</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. C. Mehta v. Union of India, No. AIR 1988 SC 1115 (India).</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. C. Mehta v. Union of India, No. AIR 1988 SC 1031 (Supreme Court of India).</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minors Oposa v. Secretary of the Department of Environmental and Natural Resources, 33 ILM 173 (Supreme Court of the Philippines, 1995).</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreno Gomes v. Spain, No. 4143/02 (European Court of Human Rights, 2005).</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Murli S. Deora v. Union of India, 8 SCC 765 (Supreme Court of India, 2001).</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Cases

Okay et al. v. Turkey, No. 36220/07 (European Court of Human Rights, 2005).
Oneryildiz v. Turkey, No. 48939/99 (European Court of Human Rights, 2004).

The Paquete Habana, 175 U.S. 677 (1900).
Pavel Ocepek, Breg pri Komendi, No. Up-344/96 (Slovenia Constitutional Court, 1999).
Powell and Rayner v. United Kingdom, No. 9310/81 (European Court of Human Rights, 1990).
Presidente de la sociedad Marlene S.A. v. Municipalidad de Tíbas, No. 6918/94 (Constitutional Chamber of Supreme Court, Costa Rica, 1994).

Reserve Mining v. EPA, 514 F.2d 492 (8th Cir. 1975).


Shehla Zia v. WAPDA, PLD 1994 SC 693 (Supreme Court of Pakistan, 1994).
Social and Economic Rights Action Centre (SERAC) and the Centre for Economic and Social Rights (CESR) v. Nigeria, Communication No. 155/96 (ACHPR, 2001).

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
Taşkin and Others v. Turkey, No. 46117/99 (European Court of Human Rights, 2006).

Tătar v. Romania, No. 67021/01 (European Court of Human Rights, 2009).

T. N. Godavarman Tirumulpad v. Union of India, No. AIR 1999 SC 43 (India).


Tyrer v. United Kingdom, No. 5856/72 (European Court of Human Rights, 1978).


Venter, No. 82.130 (Belgium, Council of State, 1999).


T. V. Zlotnikova, K. E. Lebedeva et al. v. Russian Federation, No. GPKI 97–249 (Supreme Court of Russia, 1998).
Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treaty/Protocol</th>
<th>Date of Adoption</th>
<th>Date of Entry into Force</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Protocol on Amendments to the Protocol on the Statute of the African Court of Justice and Human Rights</td>
<td>June 27, 2014</td>
<td>not in force</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) Human Rights Declaration</td>
<td>November 18, 2012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
xvi  Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments

Constitutive Act of the African Union, July 11, 2000, in force May 26, 2001,
Convention on the Preservation of Wild Animals, Birds, and Fish in Africa, May 19, 1900, not in force.
Convention Relative to the Preservation of Fauna and Flora in their Natural State, November 8, 1933, in force January 14, 1936.


Malé Declaration on the Human Dimension of Global Climate Change, November 14, 2007.


Statute of the International Court of Justice, June 26, 1945, 33 UNTS 993.
**Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments**
