

MODELS, MATHEMATICS, AND METHODOLOGY IN ECONOMIC EXPLANATION

This book provides a practitioner's foundation for the process of explanatory model building, breaking down that process into five stages. Donald W. Katzner presents a concrete example with unquantified variable values to show how the five-stage procedure works. He describes what is involved in explanatory model building for those interested in this practice, while simultaneously providing a guide for those actually engaged in it. The combination of Katzner's focus on modeling and on mathematics, along with his focus on the explanatory performance of modeling, promises to become an important contribution to the field.

Donald W. Katzner is Professor of Economics and former Department Chair at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. His published research spans several areas, including microeconomic and general equilibrium theory; the methodology of building models and of analyzing phenomena when measures of appropriate variables are neither available nor reasonably constructible; the analysis of uncertain economic phenomena when it is inappropriate to employ notions of probability; the impact of culture on economic behavior; and organizational issues within the economic firm.



Models, Mathematics, and Methodology in Economic Explanation

DONALD W. KATZNER

University of Massachusetts, Amherst





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108418775 DOI: 10.1017/9781108291422

© Donald W. Katzner 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-41877-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my grandchildren:
Sadie Alexandra
Ethan Benjamin
and
Chloe Emerson



Contents

Prej	ace	page 1X
Intr	oduction	1
1	Science and Economics	7
2	Economic Models and Explanation	29
3	The Stages of Model Building in Economics 3.1 Model Construction 3.2 The Difficulty with Ignoring Stages (i), (ii), and (v) 3.3 Models and Their Relation to the Real World 3.4 Recapitulation and Further Commentary	50 52 65 70 74
4	Models and Mathematics	80
5	Models and Measurement (or Lack Thereof) 5.1 Simultaneous Relations 5.2 Change Over Time 5.3 Optimization 5.4 Empirical Testing 5.5 Concluding Remark	101 108 115 119 119
6	Issues Relating to the Construction of Models from Scratch 6.1 Arithmomorphic Abstraction 6.2 Time and Change 6.3 From Process to Function 6.4 Limits and Power	125 128 133 136 139
7	An Example: The Efficiency of Organizational Forms 7.1 Preliminaries: Stage (i)	144 147

vii



viii Contents

	7.2 The Model: Stage (ii)	152	
	7.3 Administrative Cost Efficiency: Stage (iii)	158	
	7.4 Allocative Efficiency: Stage (iii)	163	
	7.5 The Potential for Empirical Testing: Stage (iv)	170	
	7.6 Cogency and Relevance: Stage (v)	174	
8	The Implicit Assumption Requirements of Later-Stage		
	Model Building	176	
	8.1 The Problem in Physics Terms	178	
	8.2 The Problem in Economic Terms	181	
	8.3 Concluding Remark	190	
9	Ordinality and the Adequacy of Analytic Specification	192	
	9.1 The Three Approaches	196	
	9.2 Scale Transformations under Approach C	203	
	9.3 Preserving Functional Forms	206	
	9.4 Recapitulation and Further Commentary	210	
10	Categories of Models	212	
	10.1 Individualism Versus Structuralism	213	
	10.2 Static Models Versus Dynamic Models	217	
	10.3 Certainty versus Uncertainty	221	
11	Conclusion	234	
Ind	dex	241	



Preface

My objective in this book is to bring into focus the interrelations between three elements or areas of investigation involved in economic explanation as well as the connections between those areas and economic explanation itself: first, the building of models as part of one possible approach to explaining economic phenomena; second, certain critical aspects of the mathematization that model construction frequently employs; and third, some features of the relevant methodological foundations upon which the model building explanatory program is based. I have commented on those aspects more expansively in the introduction and subsequent chapters that follow, and I have made some suggestions regarding the need to take a new view, not only of the status of economics as an explanatory discipline, but of the process of model building and in some respects the conceptual traps that arise in moving to real-world explanation.

In all that, of course, considerable and highly valuable contributions have been made by scholars whose efforts have preceded mine, and it is part of my intention to give full acknowledgment to the objectives that work has commanded. My present concern, however, is in the more practical and operational aspects of economic model building in a how-to-do-it sense, and while the more abstract issues of methodology that scholars have examined elsewhere inform my present argument, they do not engage my primary interest.

I should state that for the most part, I am an economic theorist who addresses methodological and philosophical issues that relate to my work through the lens of a practicing model builder. I believe that what I do and should be doing as an economist is to attempt to explain economic reality and thereby indirectly contribute to the making of economic policy and to matters that relate to the improvement of the human lot. The



x Preface

methodological and philosophical issues that I confront are those that bear upon the pursuit of this goal, namely, those that are concerned with the real-economic-world meaning and significance of the analytical approaches and techniques that I use. Over the years, many of my methodological and philosophical ruminations have found their way in bits and pieces, some considerably more extensive than others, into various parts of my published work. Parts of that previous work will be reflected in the present volume and I therefore record my thanks to the publishers and the holders of copyright for permission to reproduce from the following:

"In Defense of Formalization in Economics," *Methodus* 3, no. 1 (June, 1991), pp. 17–24. Published by the International Network for Economic Method.

"Our Mad Rush to Measure: How Did We Get into this Mess?" *Methodus* 3, no. 2 (December, 1991), pp. 18–26. Published by the International Network for Economic Method.

"The Misuse of Measurement in Economics," *Metroeconomica* 49 (1998), pp. 1–2. © John Wiley and Sons.

"The Significance, Success, and Failure of Microeconomic Theory," *Journal of Post Keynesian Economics* 24 (2001), pp. 41–58. © Taylor and Francis.

"Introduction: Science, Social Science, and Measurement," in my *Unmeasured Information and the Methodology of Social Scientific Inquiry* (Boston: Kluwer, 2001). © Springer.

"Why Mathematics in Economics?," *Journal of Post Keynesian Economics* 25 (2003), pp. 561–574. © Taylor and Francis.

An Introduction to the Economic Theory of Market Behavior: Microeconomics from a Walrasian Perspective (Cheltenham: Elgar, 2006).

"Introduction: Culture, Economics, and Economic Behavior," in *Culture and Economic Explanation* (London: Routledge, 2008). © Taylor and Francis.

Acknowledgments of more substantial reproductions of my earlier work appear in footnotes where appropriate.

Finally, I would like to thank Douglas Vickers for his extensive help and guidance in preparing this book.