Camera Power is the first book to tackle the policy questions raised by two ongoing revolutions in recording the police: copwatching and police-worn body cameras. Drawing on original research from over two hundred jurisdictions and more than one hundred interviews – with police leaders and officers, copwatchers, community members, civil rights and civil liberties experts, industry leaders, and technologists – Mary D. Fan offers a vision of the great potential and perils of the growing deluge of audiovisual big data. In contrast to the customary portrayal of big data mining as a threat to civil liberties, Camera Power describes how audiovisual big data analytics can better protect civil rights and liberties and prevent violence in police encounters. With compelling stories and coverage of the most important debates over privacy, public disclosure, proof, and police regulation, this book should be read by anyone interested in how technology is reshaping the relationship with our police.

Mary D. Fan is the Henry M. Jackson Professor of Law at the University of Washington. She served as a federal prosecutor in the Southern District of California, and as an associate legal officer at a United Nations (UN) tribunal. Professor Fan was elected to the American Law Institute (ALI) in 2012 and is an Advisor to the ALI’s Model Penal Code: Sexual Assault and Related Crimes Project.
Camera Power

PROOF, POLICING, PRIVACY, AND AUDIOVISUAL
BIG DATA

MARY D. FAN
University of Washington
For every person who just wants their beloved to come home safely.

And for Andy and Dean, always.
Contents

List of Figures
List of Tables
Acknowledgments

**Introduction: Dual Revolutions in Recording the Police**
- Life and Death on Body Camera
- Copwatching, Spontaneous and Organized
- Toutveillance
- Changing the Balance of Power over Proof
- Audiovisual Big Data Analytics for Justice and Harm Prevention
- Recurrent Challenges and Frameworks for the Future

**PART I TOUTVEILLANCE POWER AND POLICE CONTROL**

1 **Policing in the Camera Cultural Revolution**
- Peaceful Weapons – and Shields
- The Radical Cultural Change on Recording the Police
- A Violent Revolution
- The Future Will Be Recorded

2 **Copwatching and the Right to Record**
- Community Countersurveillance
- The Rise of Copwatching
- Correcting – or Creating – the Record
- Arrested for Recording the Police
- Growing Recognition of the Right to Record the Police
- The Continued Risk of Retaliation for Recording and Judicial Pushback
- A New Generation of Cops on Camera
- Going Viral: The Race for Public Perceptions
Table of Contents

3 Democratizing Proof, Taking the Case to the People
   Game-Changing Evidence 82
   The Side of the Story That Traditionally Gets Told 91
   Damaging Credibility Contests, Malleable Memory 94
   Addressing Judicial Blind Spots 98
   Surmounting Barriers to Civil Damages 103
   The Court of Public Opinion and Civil Settlements 105

PART II AUDIOVISUAL BIG DATA’S GREAT POTENTIAL AND PERILS 113

4 Audiovisual Big Data Analytics and Harm Prevention
   Big Data, Better Harm Detection and Prevention 115
   Smarter Early Intervention Systems 121
   Crowdsourcing Accountability 128
   An Independent Repository to Pool Community Member Videos 131

5 Partisan Perceptions: How Audiovisual Evidence and
   Big Data Can Mislead
   The Case of the Amazing Robber Who Grew from 5’6” to 6’3” 135
   The Fantasy of the Camera’s Objectivity 144
   The Partisanship of Audience Perceptions 146
   The Legally Relevant Perspectives and Proper Fact-Finders 149
   Subtle Persuasion Effects 151
   Data That Can Lead Us Astray Also Can Lead Advanced Analytics Astray 153

6 Privacy and Public Disclosure
   The Privacy Costs of Regulation by Recording 156
   After the Recording Revolution: Public Disclosure and Privacy Dilemmas 161
   Protections for Victims, Witnesses, and Minors 180
   Comparative Perspective: How the United Kingdom Strikes the Balance 186

PART III FRAMEWORKS FOR MOVING FORWARD 193

7 Controlled Access, Privacy Protection Planning, and
   Data Retention
   The Health Sciences Approach to Protecting Privacy While Advancing Harm Prevention 195
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Epicrim Insights: The Marriage of Epidemiology and Criminology</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Architecture of Protection</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Preservation</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Ethical and Policy Frontiers</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8 Nonrecording and Officer Monitoring and Discipline Dilemmas</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When Officers Do Not Record</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Disciplinary Dilemma</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Murk between Legitimate Mistake and Subversion</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond Individual Blame</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automate Everything</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion: Beyond Technological Silver Bullets</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Are We Buying?</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Multiple Visions of the Public Good</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transforming Proof</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining for Justice and Accountability</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Appendix: The Collection and Coding of 213 Body Camera Policies</strong></td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Index</strong></td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures

0.1 An officer in West Baltimore tags police-worn body camera with metadata between handling calls for service  
0.2 In the Anacostia neighborhood of Washington, DC, officers link body camera video to police reports  
0.3 A West Baltimore resident records the police talking to witnesses and searching for bullets after a shooting  
1.1 Longitudinal trends in the risk of death by race, 1999–2016  
1.2 Racial disparities in the risk of death by race, longitudinal trends, 1999–2016  
1.3 View from patrol vehicle dash camera  
1.4 View from officer-worn body camera  
2.1 Copwatchers Elsa Wairthe and Anthony Beckford on patrol  
3.1 Still image from body camera video of the search of Kenneth Simmons showing officer’s hand between Simmons’s buttocks  
3.2 Still image from body camera video of the search of Kenneth Simmons showing Simmons’s pants pulled down  
4.1 Law enforcement officers from around the nation and world attending the International Association of the Chiefs of Police Convention in 2017 watch a video debuting software that permits officers to share links with citizens to upload their video footage into secure storage  
5.1 What led to a ten-year-old child being pressed to the ground by two officers in Athens-Clarke County, Georgia? The difference in the stories conveyed of the same incident by a cell phone video and an officer’s body camera shows the partiality of perspectives  
5.2 How tall is this robber from a surveillance video? Differing methods reach sharply different conclusions  
5.3 Powell, 6’3″, against the 7-Eleven doorway
List of Figures

5.4 The robber against the 7-Eleven doorway 143
6.1 A woman who called the police about an assault shows her injuries from the altercation 157
6.2 Automatically overredacted Seattle Police Department body camera video using an image-blurring technique and no sound 171
6.3 Automatically overredacted Seattle Police Department body camera video using a technique to eliminate sound and only show outlines 172
6.4 Body camera mounted on an officer 178
8.1 Demonstration of a device that can automatically activate body cameras upon the drawing of a weapon from the holster 245
Tables

1.1 Deaths Due to Legal Intervention, by Race, 1999 to 2016  
1.2 Approaches to Officer Discretion over Recording, 213 Body Camera Policies  
1.3 Law Enforcement Activities That Must Be Recorded, 213 Body Camera Policies  
3.1 Officer Access to Body Camera Videos for Report Writing and Court Preparation  
6.1 Privacy Protections in State Body Camera Laws as of February 2018  
6.2 Contexts Where Recording Must Cease, 213 Body Camera Policies  
6.3 Limits on Surreptitious Recording of Conversations, 213 Body Camera Policies  
6.4 Notice Regarding Recording, 213 Body Camera Policies  
7.1 Examples of Body Camera Data Retention Provisions in State Laws  
7.2 Nonevidentiary Data Retention, 213 Body Camera Policies  
7.3 Retention of Data for Civil Suit or Complaint, 213 Body Camera Policies  
8.1 Sanctions for Failure to Follow Body Camera Policy  
8.2 Supervisorial Review or Compliance Audits, 213 Body Camera Policies  
A.1 The 213 Jurisdictions Represented in the Body Camera Policies Collected and Coded
Acknowledgments

Expressing thanks is one of the most pleasurable tasks – but also one of the most challenging for fear of inadvertently omitting someone deeply appreciated and because it is hard to express the full strength of my gratitude. I will err on the side of brevity rather than lengthy name lists because many of your names already appear in the citations in the text. I hope you know how grateful I am to you.

Thank you to the people, named and unnamed in the pages of this book, who contributed powerful stories, deep expertise, and excellent insights. You are law enforcement officers, activists, copwatchers, community members, civil libertarians, civil rights advocates, industry leaders, and technologists. Thank you for your important work. You may not agree with each other on some of the big issues dividing our nation. But each of you from a different perspective has amazed me with your courage, vision, and crucial work. I wish each side could see what I have witnessed about how brave, hard, and crucial your work is. It has been a beautiful gift to learn from each of you and to share your time.

Many thanks to my editor, Matt Gallaway. This book exists because of your outreach. Your brilliant vision, judgment, grace, and responsiveness have guided me throughout this process. You are a writer’s dream editor.

This work has benefited from presentation at many fora and from commentary by scholars and leaders in the field. Thank you to the faculty and students at the University of Alabama, UCLA, University of Colorado, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, University of North Carolina, and Vanderbilt for your excellent comments and suggestions. I am especially grateful to my wonderful faculty hosts and the masterminds behind the gatherings, David Ardia, Jean-François Blanchette, Snowden Becker, Frederic M. Bloom, Jason Mazzone, Dean Jennifer Mnookin, Richard Ernest Myers II, Mary-Rose
Papandrea, Stephen Rushin, and Chris Slobogin. Thanks also to the Sousveillance Task Force of the National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers (NACDL) for great questions, insights, and suggestions.

I want to particularly give a shout-out to three brilliant scholars and giants in my field who have inspired me, mentored me, and helped shape this project from its inception to completion with their insights: Barry Friedman, Richard Myers, and Chris Slobogin.

I also am deeply grateful and influenced by my mentors Drs. Fred Rivara and Ali Rowhani-Rahbar at the Harborview Injury Prevention and Research Center and Dr. David Hemenway and Cathy Barber at the Harvard Injury Control Center. You inspire me with your vision and dedication to violence prevention and have helped shape the soul of this project. Thank you, David and Cathy, for the wonderful daily lunches, which I miss, and the great talks as I developed this work. Thank you, Fred and Ali, for teaching me and inspiring my interest in violence prevention – and understanding when I became a hermit to finish this project.

Thanks also to advanced analytics industry leader Peter T. Parker, who read all of Chapter 4 and all the sections on audiovisual big data, machine learning, and artificial neural networks and gave extensive illuminating comments. Many thanks to Brian Sweeney, who brought an engineer’s precise mind to checking facts and figures in the book. You keep me grounded and stalwartly catch me on the rock walls and beyond.


I am deeply grateful to the outstanding librarians of the Gallagher Law Library at the University of Washington, especially Maya Swanes, Alena Wolotira, and Cheryl Nyberg, who have been intrepid and resourceful in
tracking down and amassing a library of 213 body camera policies. You have been invaluable on so many projects.

Thanks to my superb Hazelton Fellows Francesco Carriedo, Ali Gaffney, Garrett Heilman, Michelle Hur, Sophie Jin, Taryn Jones, Alyssa Nevala, Geoff Wickes, and Jake Willard. You inspired me with your enthusiasm and ideas and were stalwart, dedicated, and careful coders. Francesco and Garrett, your initiative, outreach, and intrepid ability to secure information were stellar. Michelle Hur was a particular rock star in taking on a lion’s share of work and cross-checking with impeccable grace, skill, and an eagle’s eye. Officer Jake Willard never ceased to amaze me with the excellence of his work and initiative in administering surveys and coding while finishing law school and also serving full time as a patrol officer with the Tacoma Police Department.

I have been blessed to work under inspirational deans. Many thanks to Dean Kellye Testy for your encouragement and leadership, which has fostered a productive environment to write this book, and to incoming Dean Mario Barnes, whose motivating check-ins (during your first weeks as dean!) spurred me to the finish line.

Thank you to Andy for the hugs and the sweet everythings that give me perspective and inspire me to slow down, at least for a little while. And thanks always to Dean, my best friend for almost half my life now and the first reader for much of my work.

Finally, thanks to my amazing students in criminal law and procedure and evidence and the outstanding law review editors who have worked on my articles over the years. You energize me with your curiosity, enthusiasm, and passions; inspire (and sometimes horrify) me with your stories; and make me so optimistic for our future. I love your fascination with innovative technology-enhanced approaches to addressing long-burning problems. I am so proud to see all that you are accomplishing in making hopes and ideas a reality in the field and in the legislature.