

#### ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS IN A NEOLIBERAL WORLD

The rise of neoliberal policy and practice simultaneously with the growing recognition of economic and social rights presents a puzzle. Can the rights to food, water, health, education, decent work, social security, and the benefits of science prevail against market fundamentalism? *Economic and Social Rights in a Neoliberal World* is about the potential of these rights to counter the adverse impacts of neoliberal policy and practice on human well-being. Cutting across several lines of human rights literature, the chapters address normal development, court decision-making, policymaking, advocacy, measurement, and social mobilization. The analyses reveal that neoliberalism infiltrates management practices, changes international policy goals, flattens public school curricula, and distorts the outputs of UN human rights treaty bodies. Are economic and social rights successful in challenging neoliberalism, are they simply marginalized, or are they co-opted and incorporated into neoliberal frameworks? This multidisciplinary work by a geographically diverse group of scholars and practitioners begins to address these questions.

Gillian MacNaughton is an Assistant Professor in the School for Global Inclusion and Social Development and a Senior Fellow with the Center for Peace, Democracy and Development at the University of Massachusetts, Boston. She works on economic and social rights, and human rights-based approaches to social justice. Her recent research is published in Health and Human Rights Journal, International Journal of Human Rights, and Georgetown Journal of International Law. MacNaughton has consulted for WHO, UNDP, UNICEF and the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health. She received her doctorate in law from the University of Oxford.

Diane F. Frey is a Lecturer in Labor and Employment Studies at San Francisco State University and an adjunct lecturer at the Harvard University Extension School. Previously, she was the Director of Labor Studies at the National Labor College. Frey's research examines worker rights in comparative perspective, drawing on international labor standards and human rights law, and appears in Global Labour Journal, International Journal of Human Rights, and Georgetown Journal of International Law, as well as edited volumes published by the ILO and UNESCO. She received a Ph.D. in International Comparative Employment Relations from the London School of Economics and Political Science.





# Economic and Social Rights in a Neoliberal World

Edited by

## **GILLIAN MACNAUGHTON**

University of Massachusetts Boston

DIANE F. FREY

San Francisco State University





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108418157

DOI: 10.1017/9781108284691

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: MacNaughton, Gillian, editor. | Frey, Diane F., 1959- editor.

Title: Economic and social rights in a neoliberal world / edited by Gillian MacNaughton, University of Massachusetts Boston, Diane F. Frey, San Francisco State University.

 $Description: Cambridge, United \ Kingdom\ ; New \ York, \ NY: Cambridge\ University\ Press, 2018.$ 

 $Identifiers: LCCN\ 2018009859\ |\ ISBN\ 9781108418157\ (hardback: alk.\ paper)$ 

Subjects: LCSH: Equality--Economic aspects. | Human rights. | Economic

development-Moral and ethical aspects. | Neoliberalism.

Classification: LCC HM821 .E26 2018 | DDC 323–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009859

ISBN 978-1-108-41815-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> Dedicated to the loving memory of John H. Frey, Penelope B. MacNaughton, and Margaret (Peg) Franzen





## Contents

List of Figures p		page ix
List	of Tables	xi
Note	Notes on Contributors	
Ackı	nowledgments	xix
1	Introduction Gillian MacNaughton and Diane F. Frey	1
	PART I. ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS UNDER NEOLIBERALISM	25
2	Inequality, Neoliberalism, and Human Rights  James Heintz	27
3	Neoliberalism's Law in Peru: A Model Felipe Ford Cole	41
4	Governing Risky Childhoods: How Neoliberal Governance Prescriptions Rule Out Social Rights in Israel Asa Maron	59
5	Neoliberalism and the Privatization of Social Rights in Education  James Murphy	81
6	Equality Rights beyond Neoliberal Constraints Gillian MacNaughton	103
	PART II. ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS IN TIMES OF CRISI	S 125
7	A Hierarchy of Comfort? The CESCR's Approach to the 2008 Economic Crisis Ben T. C. Warwick	127

vii



viii Contents

8	Do Metrics Matter? Accountability for Economic and Social Rights in Post-Revolution Egypt Allison Corkery and Heba Khalil	150
9	Contesting Neoliberalism: Bringing in Economic and Social Rights to End Violence against Women in Mexico Ana María Sánchez Rodríguez	173
10	Challenging Neoliberalism: Making Economic and Social Rights Matter in the Peacebuilding Agenda Amanda Cahill-Ripley	192
	PART III. ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS IN DEVELOPMENT	215
11	Developmental States, Neoliberalism, and the Right to Food: Brazil and South Africa Sakiko Fukuda-Parr	217
12	Human Rights Informed the Sustainable Development Goals, but Are They Lost in New Zealand's Neoliberal Aid Program? Carmel Williams and Alison Blaiklock	236
13	Neoliberal Developmentalism in South Korea and the Unfulfilled Promise of Economic and Social Rights Joo-Young Lee	261
	PART IV. ACCOUNTABILITY FOR ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS	283
14	Social Justice, Neoliberalism, and Labor Standards at the International Labour Organization  Diane F. Frey	285
15	Neoliberal Geographies and the Justiciability of Economic and Social Rights Jean Carmalt	304
16	Can Human Rights Challenge Neoliberal Logics? Evidence from Water and Sanitation Rulings in São Paulo, Brazil LaDawn Haglund	3 <sup>2</sup> 3
17	Conclusion Diane F. Frey and Gillian MacNaughton	338
Inde	ex	355



# Figures

4.1	Governing the risk problem: from a rights-focused	page 72
	prescription to an agency-centered prescription	
7.1	CESCR use of "progress" and "progressive realization"	134
	before and after May 2008	
7.2	Nature of CESCR use of "progressive realization"	135
7.3	CESCR use of "minimum core" and "retrogression"	137
7.4	CESCR use of "discrimination" and "take steps" obligations	140
8.1	Economic, social, and labor protests per month, 2013–15	163
8.2	Trends in GDP per capita versus well-being, 2005–11	167
12.1	Frequency of human rights and neoliberal terms in the	242
	Millennium Declaration, Transforming Our World (TOW),	
	and New Zealand aid documents	
13.1	Gini coefficient trends and relative poverty rates	270
16.1	Rulings on basic services cases with human rights language	330
16.2	Rulings for cases without human rights language	332





# Tables

1.1	Comparison of neoliberalism and holistic human rights	page 10
	frameworks	
7.1	CESCR comfort hierarchy compared to values of	144
	neoliberalism	
11.1	SERF index scores for Brazil and South Africa, 2012	223
12.1	How the term "participation" is used in New Zealand Aid	247
	Investment Priorities 2015–19	
13.1	Employed persons by status (thousands/percent)	267
13.2	Hourly wages of nonregular workers relative to those of regular	r 268
	workers (regular workers = 100)	
13.3	Coverage of the three major social insurance schemes by	271
	employment status in 2016	
13.4	Coverage of the three major social insurance schemes by	272
	wage level in 2015 and 2016	
14.1	Ratification of ILO core conventions	292
14.2	Summary of commitments in Convention No. 122 (1964)	298
16.1	When human rights are invoked, who raises them, and how?	333





## Notes on Contributors

Alison Blaiklock, MPHTM, MNZCPHM, FAFPHM (RACP), is a New Zealand public-health physician with special interests in the well-being and rights of children, the right to health, global health, health promotion, health equity, and climate health. She has worked in New Zealand, India, and Samoa and was formerly Executive Director of the Health Promotion Forum of New Zealand and founding chair of the child rights coalition, Action for Children, and Youth Aotearoa. She has been recognized by the Public Health Association of New Zealand as a Public Health Champion for "outstanding service to public health," especially child health.

Amanda Cahill-Ripley is Lecturer in Law at Lancaster University, UK. Her area of expertise is international human rights law, especially economic, social, and cultural rights. Dr Cahill-Ripley's research examines economic and social rights and the intersections with peacebuilding and sustainable development, as well as the right to an adequate standard of living. She is author of a monograph entitled Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and Peacebuilding (forthcoming, Cambridge University Press). Other publications include, The Human Right to Water and Its Application in the Occupied Palestinian Territories (Routledge 2011) and articles in journals such as Human Rights Law Review, Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights, and the International Journal of Human Rights.

Jean Carmalt is Assistant Professor of Law and Society at John Jay College of Criminal Justice and a member of the Earth and Environmental Sciences faculty at the Graduate Center, City University of New York (CUNY). She holds a PhD in Geography from the University of Washington and a JD from Cornell University School of Law. Carmalt's area of expertise is in international law and society, including the right to health, UN human rights processes, and



xiv

Notes on Contributors

environmental disasters. Her work can be found in journals such as *Antipode*, *Human Rights Quarterly*, and *Studies in Law*, *Politics*, *and Society*.

Felipe Ford Cole studies the legal and financial history of the United States and Latin America across the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. He is a student in the JD–PhD program at Northwestern University as a Law and Humanities fellow and a Mellon Cluster fellow in Latin American Studies. Cole holds a BA in History from New York University and an MPhil in Latin American Studies from the University of Cambridge.

Allison Corkery is Director of the Rights Claiming and Accountability Program at the Center for Economic and Social Rights, where her work focuses on strengthening strategies and tactics to advance economic and social rights. Previously, she was a recipient of the David W. Leebron Human Rights Fellowship from Columbia Law School. She has also worked at the Australian Human Rights Commission and the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. She holds a BA/LLB from the University of New South Wales and an LLM from Columbia Law School.

Diane F. Frey is Lecturer in Labor Studies at San Francisco State University and an adjunct lecturer at the Harvard University Extension School. Previously, she was the Director of Labor Studies at the National Labor College. Frey's research examines worker rights in comparative perspective, drawing on international labor standards and human rights law, and appears in the Global Labour Journal, Advances in Industrial and Labor Relations, and the Georgetown Journal of International Law, as well as in edited volumes published by the ILO and UNESCO. She received a PhD in International Comparative Employment Relations from the London School of Economics.

Sakiko Fukuda-Parr is Professor of International Affairs at The New School in New York City. She is a development economist interested in approaches focusing on human rights and capabilities. She was a member of the UN High Level Task Force on the Right to Development. Her recent publications include: *The Millennium Development Goals: Ideas, Interests and Influence* (2017); and *Fulfilling Social and Economic Rights* (2016), coauthored with T. Lawson Remer and S. Randolph, which won the 2016 American Political Science Association Award for Best Book in Human Rights Scholarship.

**LaDawn Haglund** is Associate Professor of Justice and Social Inquiry at Arizona State University. Her research investigates legal, institutional, and



#### Notes on Contributors

ΧV

political mechanisms for promoting the human right to water. Her work has received support from the US National Science Foundation, the Fulbright Foreign Scholarship Board, and the Brazilian Fulbright Commission. She is coeditor (with Robin Stryker) of Closing the Rights Gap: From Human Rights to Social Transformation (2015) and author of Limiting Resources: Market-Led Reform and the Transformation of Public Goods (2010), and has published in Latin American Perspectives, Journal of Human Rights, Water Policy, and European Journal of Sociology.

James Heintz is Andrew Glyn Professor of Economics at the University of Massachusetts Amherst. He has written on a wide range of economic policy issues, including employment and labor market policies, the distributive consequences of macroeconomic dynamics, and the intersection between economics and human rights. He has worked on collaborative projects with numerous national and international institutions, including the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the ILO, the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, UNDP, the South African Human Rights Commission, the International Development Research Center (Canada), and UN Women.

Heba Khalil is a researcher and editor at the Egyptian Center for Economic and Social Rights. She is also currently pursuing her PhD in Sociology at the University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign. Her research focuses on rural movements, labor mobilization, class politics, and counter-movements. She holds a BA in Political Science from the American University in Cairo, and an LLM from the University of York in the United Kingdom.

Joo-Young Lee is Advisor to the Human Rights Center at Seoul National University. She received her PhD in International Human Rights Law at the University of Essex in the United Kingdom, an MA in Human Rights at the University of Sussex in the United Kingdom, and a BA in Social Policy at Seoul National University in South Korea. Her research interests include socioeconomic rights, the intersection between health and human rights, and issues relating to equality. She is the author of A Human Rights Framework for Intellectual Property, Innovation and Access to Medicines (2015), among other publications.

Gillian MacNaughton is Assistant Professor in the School for Global Inclusion and Social Development and a senior fellow at the Center for Peace, Democracy, and Development at the University of Massachusetts Boston. She



xvi

#### Notes on Contributors

works on economic and social rights, and human rights-based approaches to social justice. Her recent research is published in journals such as the *Health and Human Rights Journal*, the *International Journal of Human Rights*, and the *Georgetown Journal of International Law*. MacNaughton has consulted on projects for WHO, UNDP, UNICEF, the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to health, governments, and nongovernmental organizations. She received her doctorate in law from the University of Oxford.

Asa Maron is Lecturer in the Sociology Department at the University of Haifa. Previously he has held postdoctoral positions at Stanford University, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. He is a political sociologist specializing in the sociology of the welfare state and neoliberalism, with an emphasis on the transformation of the state, its politics, institutional dynamics, and consequences for state–society relations. He recently coedited Neoliberalism as a State Project: Changing the Political Economy of Israel (2017). He has published in journals including Law & Society Review, and Social Policy & Administration.

James Murphy has worked for thirty years as a public school teacher and administrator in Massachusetts, and is currently the K-12 Director of Social Studies in the Everett (MA) Public Schools. He holds a Bachelor of Arts in Social Thought and Political Economy (STPEC) from the University of Massachusetts Amherst, and a Master's Degree in Teaching and Curriculum from Harvard University. Murphy is currently a PhD student at the School for Global Inclusion and Social Development at the University of Massachusetts Boston

Ana María Sánchez Rodríguez is currently a postdoctoral research fellow at Maynooth University, working in partnership with Handicap International. She holds a PhD in Public Policy from the University of Massachusetts Boston and an MSc in NGO Management from the London School of Economics and Political Science. She was selected as an Inter-American Grassroots Development fellow for the 2015–16 cycle and a Marie Skłodowska-Curie Actions COFUND Collaborative Research Fellow for a Responsive and Innovative Europe (CAROLINE) 2017. She has also worked in human rights and social development at the federal and local government levels in Mexico.

**Ben T. C. Warwick** is Lecturer in Law at the University of Birmingham in the United Kingdom. He predominantly researches the international system(s) of protection for socioeconomic rights, with a particular focus on how these legal



### Notes on Contributors

xvii

rights interact with resource questions. This has led to a number of strands of research on the most recent financial and economic crises, austerity, and the trends of which they are a part. He is Co-Coordinator of the Collaborative Research Network on Economic and Social Rights at the Law and Society Association, and a member of the Economic and Social Rights Academic Network, United Kingdom and Ireland.

Carmel Williams, PhD, is Executive Editor of the *Health and Human Rights Journal* and a fellow at the FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Harvard University. Her global health and development work in the Pacific region informed her PhD, which focused on the operationalization of the right to health. She has a senior research position in the Human Rights, Big Data and Technology Project in the School of Law, University of Essex, and an honorary appointment at the School of Population Health, University of Auckland, New Zealand.





# Acknowledgments

This volume is the product of the International Research Collaborative on Economic and Social Rights in a Neoliberal World (IRC 22) initiated in the summer of 2015 by Gillian MacNaughton, Diane F. Frey, and Angela Duger, and approved later that year by the Law and Society Association. We are grateful to the Law and Society Association for creating the IRC program and for providing travel grants to several IRC 22 participants from developing countries to attend the 2016 and 2017 annual meetings, in New Orleans and Mexico City, respectively, to present their chapters and discuss common themes emerging in the volume.

We especially wish to thank Angela Duger, who cofounded the Collaborative Research Network on Economic and Social Rights (CRN 47) with us in 2013 under the auspices of the LSA, and co-coordinated the network for four years. She was an amazing network coordinator, as so many CRN 47 members have remarked over the years, highly organized, technologically savvy, and endlessly resourceful in domestic and international contexts. IRC 22 – and also this volume – grew out of CRN 47. We are also thankful that LaDawn Haglund and Ben T. C. Warwick volunteered to take over as co-coordinators of CRN 47 in 2016. They have provided inspired leadership to the group of committed social and economic rights scholars and advocates, as well as critical advice at various stages during the production of this volume.

As IRC 22 and this volume began in the LSA, the volume is interdisciplinary, including work from scholars and practitioners in economics, education, labor studies, geography, history, law, public health, public policy, and sociology. A key objective of the project was also to provide opportunities for junior scholars to publish, and we have. We include works by five PhD students (two who graduated since the IRC was established in 2015) as well as four junior faculty members. We are also pleased to have practitioners – in health, education, and human rights – who have grounded the volume in the experiences



Acknowledgments

XX

of the people denied enjoyment of their economic and social rights. Finally, our authors come from eight countries and their chapters examine economic and social rights in the context of neoliberalism in eleven countries (Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Egypt, Israel, South Korea, Mexico, New Zealand, Peru, South Africa, and the United States), as well as at the international level at the International Labour Organization and at the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. To all of the chapter authors, we are grateful for your participation in the IRC over the past three years and for your contributions to this volume. In preparing the volume for publication, Mariah McGill, a tireless researcher and advocate for health as a human right, provided tremendous support.

Gillian is also thankful for many engaging and inspirational discussions on economic and social rights over the past decade with Audrey Chapman, Carmel Williams, Maria Green, Paul Hunt, Courtenay Sprague, Fiona Haigh, Lisa Forman, Benjamin Mason Meier and Inga Winkler, among others. And she is especially grateful to be an affiliate of the Research Program on Economic and Social Rights in the Human Rights Institute at the University of Connecticut, which has provided a venue to present her work and been an intellectual home for her since 2009.

Finally, Gillian also wishes to thank her family and friends, especially her brother Andrew, her father Angus and her cousin Margaret. And many thanks also to Diane, the volume coeditor, for collaborating on this challenging project.

Diane expresses her deep gratitude to the many rank-and-file workers, labor leaders, union activists, coworkers and students for the support, learning, and love that comes from struggling together for a better world for workers and their families. She is also thankful for the new tools and perspectives that she had the opportunity to gain through studying comparative employment relations at the London School of Economics with the guidance and support of its faculty, especially Richard Hyman. Like Gillian, Diane is grateful to be an affiliate of the Research Program on Economic and Social Rights in the Human Rights Institute at the University of Connecticut.

Diane also wishes to thank her family, especially her mother, Nancy, her sister Martha and brother-in-law Scott, her brothers Bill and John, nephews Will, Jared, and Ben, niece Katie, and grandniece Mila. Many thanks also to Anne Herbst, Barbara McCarthy, Roberta Klix, Liam and Patrick Twomey and Joyce Werntgen. Finally, Diane expresses appreciation to Gillian for the opportunity to work together on this project.