A Secular Age beyond the West

This book traces the experiences of religion and secularity in eleven countries not primarily shaped by Western Christianity (Japan, China, Indonesia, India, Pakistan, Iran, Russia, Turkey, Israel, Egypt, and Morocco), and examines how the status of religion and the emergence of secularity have evolved in the course of the 20th century in these societies. All chapters do so in conversation with Charles Taylor’s grand narrative of the North Atlantic World in his A Secular Age (2007). The case studies indicate that in all eleven cases, the state – building on colonial and imperial legacies – highly determines religious experience, by variably regulating religious belief, practice, property, education, and/or law. The book identifies the major critical junctures and path dependencies that have led to the different levels and modes of state regulation of religion and discusses the consequences of these for the possible emergence of something approaching Taylor’s core condition of secularity – namely, the social acceptance of open religious unbelief and switching between religious affiliations (Secularity III).

Mirjam Künkler is a senior research fellow at the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study (SCAS). Before joining SCAS, she taught Near Eastern Studies at Princeton University, where she also directed the Oxford-Princeton research cluster on “Traditional authority and transnational religious networks in contemporary Shi‘i Islam” and co-directed the Luce Program on “Religion and International Affairs” for several years. Her publications include Democracy and Islam in Indonesia (co-edited with Alfred Stepan, 2013), and many articles, inter alia in Comparative Studies in Society and History, the Asian Studies Review, the American Behavioral Scientist, Jahrbuch des Öffentlichen Rechts, British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies, Democratization, Party Politics, and the Journal of Law and Religion.

John Madeley taught at the LSE for some three decades. Starting as a specialist in the government and politics of the Nordic countries, during the second half of his career he concentrated on researching and teaching the linkages between and contrasting patterns of religion and politics, especially across Europe’s 50-plus countries. In addition to many journal articles and book chapters, he edited Church and State in Contemporary Europe: The Chimera of Neutrality (with Zsolt Enyedi;
2003), Religion and Politics (2003), and Religion, Politics and Law in the European Union (with Lucian Leustean; 2009).

Shylashri Shankar is the author of Scaling Justice: India’s Supreme Court, Anti-Terror Laws, and Social Rights (2009), and co-author of Battling Corruption (2013). In the past she has been a Fellow at the Rockefeller Foundation’s Bellagio Center in Italy and a co-convenor (together with Mirjam Künkler and Hanna Lerner) of a research group on constitutionalism and religion at the Center for Interdisciplinary Research (ZiF) in Bielefeld, Germany. She has published widely on law, religion, and development in India.
The most enduring and illuminating bodies of late nineteenth-century social theory – by Marx, Weber, Durkheim, and others – emphasized the integration of religion, polity, and economy through time and place. Once a staple of classic social theory, however, religion gradually lost the interest of many social scientists during the twentieth century. The recent emergence of phenomena such as Solidarity in Poland, the dissolution of the Soviet empire, various South American, Southern African, and South Asian liberation movements, the Christian Right in the United States, and Al Qaeda have reawakened scholarly interest in religiously based political conflict. At the same time, fundamental questions are once again being asked about the role of religion in stable political regimes, public policies, and constitutional orders. The series *Cambridge Studies in Social Theory, Religion and Politics* will produce volumes that study religion and politics by drawing upon classic social theory and more recent social scientific research traditions. Books in the series offer theoretically grounded, comparative, empirical studies that raise “big” questions about a timely subject that has long engaged the best minds in social science.

**Titles in the series**

Mikhail A. Alexseev and Sufian N. Zhemukhov, *Mass Religious Ritual and Intergroup Tolerance: The Muslim Pilgrims’ Paradox*


David E. Campbell, John C. Green, and J. Quin Monson, *Seeking the Promised Land: Mormons and American Politics*


Darren W. Davis and Donald B. Pope-Davis, *Perseverance in the Parish? Religious Attitudes from a Black Catholic Perspective*

Paul A. Djupe and Christopher P. Gilbert, *The Political Influence of Churches*

Joel S. Fetzer and J. Christopher Soper, *Muslims and the State in Britain, France, and Germany*

François Foret, *Religion and Politics in the European Union: The Secular Canopy*

Jonathan Fox, *A World Survey of Religion and the State*

Jonathan Fox, *Political Secularism, Religion, and the State: A Time Series Analysis of Worldwide Data*

Anthony Gill, *The Political Origins of Religious Liberty*

Brian J. Grim and Roger Finke, *The Price of Freedom Denied: Religious Persecution and Conflict in the 21st Century*

Kees van Kersbergen and Philip Manow, editors, *Religion, Class Coalitions, and Welfare States*

Karrie J. Koesel, *Religion and Authoritarianism: Cooperation, Conflict, and the Consequences*
Mirjam Künkler, John Madeley, and Shylashri Shankar, editors, A Secular Age beyond the West: Religion, Law and the State in Asia, the Middle East and North Africa
Ahmet T. Kuru, Secularism and State Policies toward Religion: The United States, France, and Turkey
Andrew R. Lewis, The Rights Turn in Conservative Christian Politics: How Abortion Transformed the Culture Wars
Damon Maryl, Secular Conversions: Political Institutions and Religious Education in the United States and Australia, 1800–2000
Jeremy Menchik, Islam and Democracy in Indonesia: Tolerance without Liberalism
Pippa Norris and Ronald Inglehart, Sacred and Secular: Religion and Politics Worldwide
Amy Reynolds, Free Trade and Faithful Globalization: Saving the Market
Sadia Saeed, Politics of Desecularization: Law and the Minority Question in Pakistan
David T. Smith, Religious Persecution and Political Order in the United States
Peter Stamatov, The Origins of Global Humanitarianism: Religion, Empires, and Advocacy
A Secular Age beyond the West: Religion, Law and the State in Asia, the Middle East and North Africa

Edited by

MIRJAM KÜNKLER
Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study

JOHN MADELEY
London School of Economics and Political Science

SHYLASHRI SHANKAR
Centre for Policy Research, New Delhi
Alfred C. Stepan (1936 to 2017): inspired teacher, scholar, and friend
Contents

List of Tables and Figures page xi
List of Contributors xii
Preface xvii

1 Introduction Mirjam Künkler and Shylashri Shankar 1
2 Secularity I: Varieties and Dilemmas Philip Gorski 33
3 The Origins of Secular Public Space: Religion, Education, and Politics in Modern China Zhe Ji 61
4 The Formation of Secularism in Japan Helen Hardacre 86
5 Law, Legitimacy, and Equality: The Bureaucratization of Religion and Conditions of Belief in Indonesia Mirjam Künkler 107
6 Secularity and Hinduism’s Imaginaries in India Shylashri Shankar 128
7 Secularity without Secularism in Pakistan: The Politics of Islam from Sir Syed to Zia Christophe Jaffrelot 152
8 Charles Taylor’s A Secular Age and Secularization from Below in Iran Nader Hashemi 185
## Contents

9 The Politics of Jewish Secularization in Israel  
_Hanna Lerner_  
213

10 A Kemalist Secular Age? Cultural Politics and Radical Republicanism in Turkey  
_Aslı Bâli_  
234

11 Enigmatic Variations: Russia and the Three Secularities  
_John Madeley_  
265

12 Piety, Politics, and Identity: Configurations of Secularity in Egypt  
_Gudrun Krämer_  
295

13 The Commander of the Faithful and Moroccan Secularity  
_Jonathan Wyrtzen_  
317

14 Conclusions: The Continued Prevalence of the “Marker State”  
_Mirjam Künkler and John Madeley_  
342

15 Afterword and Corrections  
_Charles Taylor_  
385

Appendix: A Quantitative Take on the Incidence of Taylor’s Three Secularities in the Eleven Country Studies  
_Mirjam Künkler and John Madeley_  
396

_Index_  
414
Tables and Figures

**TABLES**

1.1 Differences between Taylor’s approach and the approach taken in this volume  
    *page 11*

7.1 Numbers of students and teachers of Qur’an schools in different years and provinces  
    *177*

A.1 Secularity I by country  
    *397*

A.2 Secularities II and III by country  
    *404*

**FIGURES**

A.1 Secularity I by country  
    *402*

A.2 Secularity II by country  
    *408*

A.3 Secularity III by country  
    *411*
Contributors

Aslı Bâli is Professor of Law at UCLA School of Law, and Director of the UCLA Center for Near Eastern Studies. She is the co-editor of Constitution Writing, Religion and Democracy (Cambridge University Press, 2017) and author of numerous peer-reviewed and law review articles, including “The Perils of Judicial Independence: Constitutional Transition and the Turkish Example,” in The Virginia Journal of International Law (2012); “Courts and Constitutional Transitions: Lessons from the Turkish case,” in the International Journal of Constitutional Law (2013), and “Shifting into reverse: Turkish constitutionalism under the AKP,” Theory and Event (2016).

Philip Gorski is Professor of Sociology, International Studies, and Religious Studies at Yale University. He received an AA from Deep Springs College, a BA from Harvard College, and a PhD from the University of California at Berkeley. His most recent book is American Covenant: A History of Civil Religion from the Puritans to the Present (2017).

Helen Hardacre is the Reischauer Institute Professor of Japanese Religions and Society at Harvard University. She earned her doctorate from the University of Chicago in 1980. She has done extended field study of contemporary Shinto, Buddhist religious organizations, and the religious life of Japan’s Korean minority. She has also researched State Shinto and contemporary ritualizations of abortion in Japan. Before moving to Harvard in 1992, she taught at Princeton University (1980–1989) and Griffith University (Australia) (1990–1991). Her publications include...
List of Contributors


Nader Hashemi is the Director of the Center for Middle East Studies and an Associate Professor of Middle East and Islamic Politics at the Josef Korbel School of International Studies at the University of Denver. He obtained his doctorate from the Department of Political Science at the University of Toronto and previously was an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow at Northwestern University and a Visiting Assistant Professor at the UCLA Global Institute. He is the author of Islam, Secularism and Liberal Democracy: Toward a Democratic Theory for Muslim Societies (Oxford University Press, 2009) and co-editor of The People Reloaded: The Green Movement and the Struggle for Iran’s Future (Melville House, 2011), The Syria Dilemma (MIT Press, 2013), and Sectarianization: Mapping the New Politics of the Middle East (Oxford University Press, 2017).

Christophe Jaffrelot is Senior Research Fellow at CERI-Sciences Po/CNRS in Paris. He teaches South Asian politics at Sciences Po and King’s College. Among his most recent publications are Religion, Caste and Politics in India (2010) and The Pakistan Paradox – Instability and Resilience (2015) and as editor, Pakistan: Nationalism Without a Nation? (2002); A History of Pakistan and its origins (2004); Hindu Nationalism. A Reader (2007); with L. Gayer (eds), Muslims of India’s Cities. Trajectories of marginalization (2012); and Pakistan at the Crossroads – Domestic Dynamics and External Pressures (2016).

Zhe Ji is Associate Professor of Chinese Studies at the Institut National des Langues et Civilisations Orientales in Paris. His main study areas are Buddhism and the relationship between state and religion. He has published numerous articles regarding Buddhism in contemporary China and co-founded the Centre d’Etudes Interdisciplinaires sur le Bouddhisme. His books include Religion, Modernité et Temporalité: une sociologie du bouddhisme chan contemporain (CNRS Editions, 2016) and Making Saints in Modern China (co-edited with David Ownby and Vincent
List of Contributors

Goossaert, Oxford University Press, 2017). In 2014, he was nominated as Junior Member of the Institut Universitaire de France.

Gudrun Krämer is Professor of Islamic Studies at Freie Universität Berlin and director of the Berlin Graduate School Muslim Cultures and Societies. She has worked and published on modern Middle Eastern history and on Islam, democracy, and modernity. Her books include Der Vordere Orient und Nordafrika ab 1500 (2016), Hasan al-Banna (2010), A History of Palestine: From the Ottoman Conquest to the Founding of the State Israel (2008), The Jews in Modern Egypt (1989), Responsabilité, égalité, pluralisme: Réflexions sur quelques notions-clés d’un ordre islamique moderne (2000), and the edited volume (with Sabine Schmidtke) Speaking for Islam: Religious Authorities in Muslim Societies (2006). She is a member of the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences and Humanities, the Tunisian Academy of Sciences (Bayt al-Hikma), and an Executive Editor of the Encyclopaedia of Islam Three. In 2010 she received the Gerda Henkel Prize.

Mirjam Künkler is a senior research fellow at the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study (SCAS). Before joining SCAS, she taught Near Eastern Studies at Princeton University, where she also directed the Oxford-Princeton research cluster on “Traditional authority and transnational religious networks in contemporary Shi’i Islam” and co-directed the Luce Program on “Religion and International Affairs” for several years. Her books include Democracy and Islam in Indonesia (co-edited with Alfred Stepan, 2013; published in Arabic as Al-Dimokratia va al-Islam fi Indonisia, 2015); Women’s Juristic Authority in Shi’ite Islam (with Devin Stewart, Edinburgh University Press, forthcoming 2018); as well as two volumes co-edited with Tine Stein: Selected Writings by Ernst-Wolfgang Böckenförde, 2017 (Vol. I) and 2018 (Vol. II). Künkler has guest-edited special issues and symposia for the journals Party Politics (March 2013), Cambridge Journal of Law and Religion (January 2013), the American Behavioral Scientist (July 2016), Asian Studies Review (December 2016), the British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies (January 2018), Constellations (June 2018) and the German Law Journal (May 2018).

Hanna Lerner is a senior lecturer of Political Science at Tel Aviv University. She is the author of Making Constitutions in Deeply Divided Societies (Cambridge University Press, 2011), co-editor of Global Justice and International Labour Rights (Cambridge University Press, 2016), and co-editor of Constitution Writing, Religion and Democracy (Cambridge University Press, 2017). Her research focuses
on comparative constitution-making, Israeli constitutional politics, religion and democracy, global justice, and international labor.

John Madeley retired as Senior Lecturer in Government at the London School of Economics and Political Science in 2009, where he also served as the Dean of the Graduate School for three years. Starting as a specialist in the government and politics of the Nordic countries, during the second half of his career he concentrated on researching and teaching the linkages between and contrasting patterns of religion and politics, especially across Europe’s 50-plus countries. In addition to many journal articles and book chapters, he edited Church and State in Contemporary Europe: The Chimera of Neutrality (with Zsolt Enyedi, 2003), Religion and Politics (2003), and Religion, Law and Politics in the European Union (with Lucian Leustean, 2010). Recent publications include “Constitutional Models and the protection of religious freedom” in S. Ferrari (ed.) Routledge Handbook of Law and Religion (2015) and “The curious case of religion in the Norwegian Constitution” in A. Bâli and H. Lerner (eds.) Constitution Writing Religion and Democracy (2017).

Shylashri Shankar is a senior fellow at the Centre for Policy Research in New Delhi. She has held academic positions at the University of Texas at Austin and the Center on Religion and Democracy, University of Virginia. In June 2011, she was a Bellagio Fellow at the Rockefeller Centre in Bellagio (Italy). She has a PhD in Political Science from Columbia University, an MSc from the London School of Economics and Political Science, an MA (Cantab) from the University of Cambridge, and a BA (Hons) from Delhi University. She is the author of Scaling Justice: India’s Supreme Court, Anti-Terror Laws and Social Rights (2009) and co-author of Battling Corruption (2013). In the past she has been a Fellow at the Rockefeller Foundation’s Bellagio Center in Italy and a co-convenor of a research group at the Center for Interdisciplinary Research (ZiF) in Bielefeld, Germany. She is currently working on a food biography of India (Speaking Tiger, 2017).

Charles Taylor is Professor em. of Philosophy at McGill University, Montreal. His most influential books are Explanation of Behaviour (1967), Sources of the Self (1989), and A Secular Age (2007). His newest book is The Language Animal (2016). He has been a recipient of numerous prizes and awards, among them the 2007 Templeton Prize, the 2008 Kyoto Prize in Arts and Philosophy, the 2015 John W. Kluge Prize for
Achievement in the Study of Humanity, and the 2016 Berggruen Prize for philosophy.

Jonathan Wyrtzen is an associate professor of Sociology, International Affairs, and History at Yale University. He received a BA and MA from the University of Texas at Austin and a PhD from Georgetown University. His research interests center on empire and colonialism, state formation and non-state forms of political organization, ethnicity and nationalism, and religion and socio-political activism in North Africa and the Middle East. His first book, Making Morocco: Colonial Intervention and the Politics of Identity (2015), examines the relationships among European imperial expansion, colonial policies of modernization and state formation, and the rise of Arabo-Islamic nationalism in Morocco. His current book project focuses on the making of the modern Middle East during the Long Great War (1911–31), examining the clash between colonial and local political projects set in motion during this period to replace the Ottoman Empire. His recent publications include “Colonial Legitimization-Legibility Linkages and the Politics of Identity in Algeria and Morocco” in the European Journal of Sociology (2017) and “Colonial War and the Production of Territorialized Space in North Africa” in Political Power and Social Theory (2017).
Preface

The inspiration for this book was born on a warm autumn day in the guesthouse of Boğaziçi University, in the early 2010s, where, overlooking the Bosphorus, many of the authors assembled, and other friends and colleagues gathered to discuss books that deeply stirred them and to which they wished to formulate a response. The group, made up mostly of sociologists and political scientists working on the nexus between politics, religion, and law, each an expert on a different country of the Middle East and Asia, soon settled on Charles Taylor’s *A Secular Age*, a book that offers manifold entry points and intellectual foils to argue with and against, a book which with each reading takes on a new colour and evokes new imagery and insights. The path of working on this book together soon became an endpoint in itself, as the group grew closer and many of its members met again summer after summer in different constellations, working on new projects as this one came to completion, and with subsets of its members crafting new cooperations in research, publishing, and joint teaching. As editors we are deeply grateful for this gift of companionship, both with one another and the wider group of fellow-travelers, creating a net of interlocutors with whom it was a pleasure and honor to agree and disagree, to understand and to occasionally misunderstand. Thus, over time, these intellectual companions became companions also of the heart, and we hope the group will live on in its various manifestations for many years to come.

While producing this volume, numerous debts were incurred. We thank Marian Burchardt, Markus Dressler, Prasenjit Duara, Hadi Enayat, Aaron Glasserman, Matthias Koenig, Eric Lob, Roman Loimeier, David Martin, Tamir Moustafa, Eva Nisa, Saskia Schäfer, Benjamin Schonthal, Clemens
Preface

Six, Kristina Stoeckl, and Richard Wood for reading different drafts of the Introduction and/or Conclusion and for offering excellent comments. We further discussed various aspects of our comparative theses with Murat Akan, Said Arjomand, L. Carl Brown, José Casanova, Mark Farha, Şükrü Hanioglu, Robert Hefner, Khaled Helmy, Amaney Jamal, Hans Joas, Franz-Xaver Kaufmann, Bill Kissane, André Laliberté, David Mednicoff, Pratap Bhanu Mehta, Matt Nelson, Detlef Pollack, Yüksel Sezgin, Tine Stein, Alfred Stepan, Narendra Subramanian, Bryan Turner, Björn Wittrock, Monika Wohlrab-Sahr, and Qasim Zaman, and benefited immensely from spirited conversations with them.

Princeton University’s Center for the Study of Religion generously funded a retreat at the International Institute for the Sociology of Law (IISJ) in Oñati, Spain, where draft chapters were first presented. We thank the center and Robert Wuthnow for its support, and the IISJ for having offered an idyllic conference venue in one of the oldest universities on the Iberian peninsula. We thank Charles Taylor for having given us the opportunity to present some of our draft chapters at a conference he convened at the Institute for Human Sciences (IWM) in Vienna in June 2014. John Bowen, Craig Calhoun, Bernice Martin, David Martin, Michael Warner, and Charles Taylor generously offered comments and ideas that sharpened our ways of thinking about the relationship between Secularities I and III.

Finally, we thank Lew Bateman for supporting this project from the beginning and Sara Doskow for having seen it through. Anonymous readers and the series editors, Kenneth Wald, Richard Wood, and David Leege, asked compelling questions which forced us to re-think and re-draft. Helen Belgian-Cooper completed a superb job as copy-editor, and Velmurugan Inbasigamoni and Thomas Haynes were reliable contacts at the press for whose support and ideas we are deeply grateful.

The meaning of religion and non-religion and the sociocultural, economic and political consequences that flow from it remain at the core of intellectual quests both in the social sciences and humanities. We thank Charles Taylor for having nudged us into the conversation.

Mirjam Künkler, John Madeley, and Shylashri Shankar,
September 2015