Art and Identity in Scotland

This lively and erudite cultural history of Scotland, from the Jacobite defeat of 1745 to the death of an icon, Sir Walter Scott, in 1832, examines how Scottish identity was experienced and represented in novel ways. Weaving together previously unpublished archival materials, visual and material culture, dress and textile history, Viccy Coltman re-evaluates the standard clichés and essentialist interpretations which still inhibit Scottish cultural history during this period of British and imperial expansion. The book incorporates familiar landmarks in Scottish history, such as the visit of George IV to Edinburgh in August 1822, with microhistories of individuals, including George Steuart, a London-based architect, and the East India Company servant, Claud Alexander. It thus highlights recurrent themes within a range of historical disciplines, and by confronting the broader questions of Scotland’s relations with the rest of the British state it makes a necessary contribution to contemporary concerns.

Viccy Coltman is a professor of history of art at the University of Edinburgh, where she is an authority on eighteenth-century visual and material culture in Britain. The author of four books including two monographs, an edited and a co-edited volume, Coltman has been awarded fellowships by the Whitney Humanities Center at Yale, the Huntington Library, the National Gallery of Washington DC and the British School at Rome, amongst others. In 2006 she was awarded a Philip Leverhulme Prize in recognition of her outstanding contribution to History of Art. Coltman is currently the academic lead on a MOOC, a Massive Open Online Course on ‘Bonnie Prince Charlie and the Jacobites’, in collaboration with the National Museums Scotland.
Art and Identity in Scotland

A Cultural History from the Jacobite Rising of 1745 to Walter Scott

Viccy Coltman
University of Edinburgh
Contents

List of Plates  [page vii]
List of Figures  [x]
Acknowledgements  [xvi]

Introduction  [1]

PART I  BEYOND SCOTLAND  [21]

1 Scots in Europe  [23]
‘Making a Figure’: Painted Portraiture on the Grand Tour

2 Scots in London  [62]
‘The Means of Bread with Applause’: George Steuart’s Architectural Elevation

3 Scots in Empire  [104]
‘Good Fishing in Muddy Waters’: Claud Alexander in Calcutta and Catrine

PART II  WITHIN SCOTLAND  [137]

4 The Prince in Scotland  [139]
‘Daubed with Plaid and Crammed with Treason’: The Visual and Material Culture of Embodied Insurrection

5 The Monarch in the Metropolis  [178]
A Scopic Spectacle: George IV’s Visit to Edinburgh, August 1822
vi  

Contents

6 Borders Bard  [220]
‘The Exactness of the Resemblance’: Sir Walter Scott and the Physiognomy of Romanticism

Conclusion: Scott-Land  [253]

Bibliography  [263]
Index  [292]

The plate section can be found between pp 142 and 143
Plates


III Pompei Batoni, *John, Lord Mountstuart*, 1767. 236.4 × 144.7 cm. The Bute Collection at Mount Stuart.


VI View of the red drawing room at Hopetoun House, showing Nathaniel Dance’s portraits of the Hope brothers to either side of the chimney-piece by Michael Rysbrack and flanking a central portrait of the Doge of Venice, attributed to Jacopo Palma, 1612–15. 247 × 172 cm (James); 247 × 173 cm (Charles). In the care of the Hopetoun House Preservation Trust at Hopetoun House. Photograph by John McKenzie.


VIII Nathaniel Dance, *James Grant, John Mytton, Thomas Robinson and Thomas Wynn*, c. 1760. 98.1 × 123.8 cm. Yale Centre for British Art, Paul Mellon Collection.

viii  List of Plates


XII Richard Newton, ‘A Flight of Scotchmen!’, 1796. 32.1 × 45.3 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved.

XIII Richard Newton, ‘Progress of a Scotsman’, 1794. 40.4 × 52.3 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved.

XIV ‘Ossian’s furniture’: part of the suite made by the London firm of Chipchase and Lambert for Ossian’s Hall in the early 1780s. Photograph by John McKenzie.


XVI Tilly Kettle, *Claud Alexander*, mid-1770s. 74 × 61.5 cm. Private collection. Photograph by John McKenzie.


XVIII Staffordshire salt-glazed teapot, c. 1775. 9 cm (height) × 10.5 cm (diameter) × 18 cm (length; spout to handle). Image courtesy of The Potteries Museum and Art Gallery, Stoke-on-Trent.

XIX Tin-glazed earthenware punch bowl, 1749, exterior (a) and interior (b). Diameter 26 cm, height 10.1 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved.

XX Snuffbox. Height 3.2 cm; diameter 6.5 cm. © National Museums Scotland.

XXI Inside of the front cover of *Lyon in Mourning*, 18.5 × 22.5 cm. © National Library of Scotland. Licensor www.scran.ac.uk.

XXII Robert Strange, Jacobite fan of paper mounted on ivory, with its original case, depicting Prince Charles Edward Stuart surrounded by classical gods, c. 1745. 26.5 cm (height) × 41.5 cm (width) × 2.5 cm (depth). © National Museums Scotland.

XXIII Fan. Mid-eighteenth century or slightly later. 29.5 cm (height) × 45 cm (width) × 3 cm (depth). © National Museums Scotland.

List of Plates

XXV J. W. Eubank, *The Entry of George IV into Edinburgh from the Calton Hill*, 1822. 150.5 × 240 cm. City Art Centre, City of Edinburgh Museums & Galleries.

XXVI George Cruickshank, ‘Bonnie Willie’. 35.3 × 25 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved.


XXVIII David Wilkie, *George IV*, 1829. 279.4 × 179.1 cm. Royal Collection Trust/© Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II 2019.


Figures


3. Pompeo Batoni, Douglas, 8th Duke of Hamilton, 1776. 246.4 × 165.1 cm. By kind permission of the Duke of Argyll, and with credit to the photographer, Nick Hugh McCann. [38]


5. Pompeo Batoni, James Moray, 13th Laird of Abercairny, before 1762. 73.7 × 62.2 cm. Private collection. [40]

6. Pompeo Batoni, James Francis Edward Moray, 1762. 74.3 × 62.2 cm. Private collection. [41]

7. Farnese Mercury; plate LVII from Domenico de Rossi, Raccolta di statue antiche e moderne (Rome, 1704). 31.5 × 15.8 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [43]


9. Pompeo Batoni, Adam Fergusson of Kilkerran, 1757. 76.2 × 65.5 cm. [59]


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Benedetto Pastorini, <em>A View of the Adelphi Terrace: late Durham Yard</em>, June 1771. 46.5 × 85 cm. © Museum of London/Benedetto Pastorini. [77]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Adelphi lottery ticket, signed by William Adam, 1774. Royal Society of Arts (RSA/AD/MA/305/10/73). [78]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>'View from Taymouth of Kinmore and Loch-Tay', Thomas Pennant’s 1776 edition of <em>A Tour in Scotland and Voyage to the Hebrides</em>, plate IV. 19.1 × 12 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [80]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>'View of Dunkeld, Birnam Wood, and Dunsinane at a distance', Thomas Pennant’s 1776 edition of <em>A Tour in Scotland and Voyage to the Hebrides</em>, plate VI. 19.1 × 12 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [81]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>'Cascade near Taymouth', Thomas Pennant’s 1769 edition of <em>A Tour in Scotland and Voyage to the Hebrides</em>, plate III. 19.1 × 12 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [86]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Engraved by Peter Mazell after a painting by Paul Sandby. 'A view from the King’s seat near Blair', Thomas Pennant’s 1769 edition of <em>A Tour in Scotland and Voyage to the Hebrides</em>, plate IV. 19.1 × 12 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [88]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>John Cheere, <em>Farnese Hercules</em>, 1743. © HES. [91]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>View of the dining room at Blair Castle, from the south. © HES. [93]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Charles Steuart, <em>Black Lynn Fall on the Bran</em>, 1766. © HES. [94]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>'Ossian’s Hall near Dunkeld'. Engraved plate from Robert Heron’s <em>Observations made in a journey through the western counties of Scotland</em> (Perth, 1799), volume I. 16.2 × 10.5 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [97]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

24 Sketches by Revd John Sime showing the ‘Grounds of Ossian’s Hall near Dunkeld 1806’ and on the left, a longitudinal section and elevation. © HES. [97]

25 Attributed to Luciano Borzone, Blind Belisarius receiving the alms, 1640s. 208.2 × 226.3 cm. © Devonshire Collection, Chatsworth. Reproduced by permission of Chatsworth Settlement Trustees. [98]

26 Plan of Ballochmyle House from Vitruvius Scoticus, plate 63. 48.4 × 32.3 cm © HES. [120]

27 View of Ballochmyle House. Private collection. Photograph by John McKenzie. [121]

28 Catrine Mill, view of entrance block from northwest. © HES. [122]

29 ‘The Unhappy Contrast’, published by Henry Brookes, 1791. 20.3 × 36.3 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved. [125]

30 Photograph showing the Zoffany portrait (Plate XV) in situ at Ballochmyle House. Private collection. Photograph by John McKenzie. [131]


32 William Aikman, Richard Boyle, 3rd Earl of Burlington and his wife, Lady Dorothy Savile, 1723. 96.5 × 116.8 cm. Harris Museum and Art Gallery, Preston. [141]

33 Ottone Hamerani, silver medal on the birth of Prince Charles, the Young Pretender, 1720. 4.1 cm. © National Museums Scotland. [148]

34 Otto Hamerani, bronze medal, ‘Micat inter omnes’, 1729. 4.1 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved. [149]

35 Jean-Baptiste Lemoyne II, Plaster bust of Prince Charles Edward Stuart, c. 1748. 49.53 cm. The Drambuie Collection, Edinburgh, Scotland/Bridgeman Images. [150]
List of Figures


38 Jacobite tumbler. 1745. Height 9.5 cm, mouth 7.6 cm. © National Museums Scotland. [157]


41 Anonymous, ‘Scotch female gallantry’, 1745–6. 21.3 × 28.7 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved. [173]

42a–c Cameo ring inscribed ‘DUM SPIRAT SPERO’ [while he breathes I hope], c. 1750. Diameter 2.2 cm. © National Museums Scotland. [176]


44 W. H. Lizars, ‘View of the royal procession advancing by Picardy Place, from the barrier where the keys of the city were delivered by the Lord Provost to His Majesty, 15th August 1822’, from Robert Mudie’s *Historical Account of his Majesty’s visit to Scotland*. 55 × 21.3 cm. © The University of Edinburgh. [183]


47 Alexander Carse, *George IVth Landing at Leith*, 1822. 160.1 × 362 cm. City Art Centre, City of Edinburgh Museums & Galleries. [189]
xv

List of Figures

48 Ticket for a seat on Leith Pier to see the landing of George IV, 15 August 1822. 5.6 × 7.7 cm. Trinity House. © Crown Copyright HES. [190]

49a–d Four panoramic views of the city of Edinburgh (Edinburgh, 1823). (a) View from the door of Nelson’s monument on the Calton Hill looking to the east; (b) View from the top of the Calton Hill, looking to the north; (c) View from the top of the Calton Hill by Nelson’s monument looking to the west; (d) View from the walk on the top of Calton Hill, looking to the south. 1823. 22.1 × 60.2 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved. [193]

50 Charles Williams, 'Equipt for a Northern Visit', c. 1822. 30.5 × 21.43 cm. City Art Centre, City of Edinburgh Museums & Galleries. [201]


52 Alexander Nasmyth, The Erection of Westmacott’s Statue of Achilles, 1822. 17 × 26.9 cm. National Galleries of Scotland. [203]

53 ‘A Thousand warm receptions in the North’, 1822. 23.6 × 33.4 cm. © The City of Edinburgh Council. Licensor www.scran.ac.uk. [205]

54 George Cruickshank, Kilts and Philibegs!!!, c. 1822. 13.3 × 20.8 cm. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved. [207]


56 Francis Chantrey, Pedestrian bronze statue of George IV on a granite plinth, 1831. Photograph by John McKenzie. [216]

57 C. R. Leslie, Sir Walter Scott, 1824. 91.5 × 71.1 cm. Photograph © 2019 Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. [236]

58 Sir Thomas Lawrence, Sir Walter Scott, 1821–6. 161.7 × 132.9 cm. Royal Collection Trust/© Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II, 2019. [237]

59 Frontispiece from the Scott exhibition catalogue, 1871. Showing portraits of Scott from age six to sixty arranged on an altar-like bookcase, from the top: a miniature painted in
List of Figures

watercolour on ivory; marble bust by Francis Chantrey, 1820–1 (Figure 61); full-length oil on canvas by William Allan, 1831 and half-length oil on canvas by John Watson Gordon, 1830. © The City of Edinburgh Council. [239]


61 Francis Chantrey, Sir Walter Scott, 1820. Height 76.2 cm. With the kind permission of the Abbotsford Trust. [247]

62 Bust of Sir Walter Scott in the library at Abbotsford. 1831. The Miriam and Ira D. Wallach Division of Art, Prints and Photographs: Print Collection, the New York Public Library, Image 3937729. [249]

63 John Burnet. Sir Walter Scott, 1st bt. Line engraving, printed by R. Lloyd, published by Hodgson, Boys & Graves, after Sir William Allan (Plate XXXII), published 25 March 1835. Plate size 56.2 × 40.9 cm; paper size 68.3 × 51 cm. © National Portrait Gallery, London. NPG D40595. [251]

64 Design for Scott Monument. Lithograph presentation perspective issued to subscribers from a drawing by George Meikle Kemp. © HES and the Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland. [256]

65 View of Scott Monument from the north. © HES. [257]

66 John Steell, Sir Walter Scott, Scott Monument, Edinburgh. c. 1846. © HES. [258]
I have accrued many debts in the writing of this book, which has been in various stages of progress and stasis since as far back as 2003. Thank you to those colleagues who generously read earlier drafts of individual chapters and gave feedback, Stuart Allan, Michèle Cohen, Penny Fielding, Margot Finn, Caroline McCracken-Flesher and Kate Teltscher. Margot and Caroline have also written references more times than I care to remember, as have John Brewer and Giorgio Riello. I am indebted to all of them for their continued belief in this project and in me to deliver it even when their enthusiasm was not shared by external funding bodies. Margot, Ludmilla Jordanova and Marcia Pointon have been driving forces behind it in so many ways as mentors, scholars, collaborators and friends. As an external advisor to the Leverhulme-funded ‘East India Company at Home’ project, I worked with Margot and her team at UCL, Helen Clifford, Kate Smith and Ellen Filor, across a number of years and events; Chapter 3 is my modest contribution to our theme which has been shaped by our collaboration. Margot first put me in touch with Cambridge University Press, where the manuscript has been nurtured with Liz Friend-Smith as editor. I also thank Kathleen Fearn for copyediting the whole manuscript. CUP operates a rigorous peer review system and I would like to thank the readers for their informed interventions and their generous praise for the manuscript at different stages, especially their admiration for the archival work that I have undertaken. This would not have been possible without the support of many archivists and owners and I must mention Alison Rosie, Tessa Spencer and Josephine Dixon at the National Register of Archives for Scotland (NRAS) who have facilitated access to the private collections listed elsewhere in the book. Thank you to those owners who placed their private papers on temporary deposit in Edinburgh; or who allowed me to access them in situ, especially Eatin Hagart Alexander and Ianthe Alexander who allowed me to work on their family archive when it was unlisted. Visiting these archives, I have travelled the length and breadth of the Highlands, Lowlands and Borders of Scotland, sometimes with the photographer John Mckenzie, who has been endlessly patient as I arranged for objects to be moved and photographed, sometimes for the first time in
their history. I have also made extensive use of the papers in the National Records of Scotland; quotations from material on permanent deposit in this repository are with the permission of the following owners: Sir Robert Clerk of Penicuik, Mr Drummond Moray, Thomas Fotheringham, John Home Robertson and the Earl of Seafield. Sir Alastair Gordon Cumming has granted permission for quotations from the National Library of Scotland, Dep. 175.

The following colleagues provided invaluable assistance of one sort or another, so thank you Jane Anderson, John Arthur, Stephen Astley, Adam Budd, Peter Burman, Aude Claret, Pat Crichton, Fintan Cullen, George Dalgleish, Christopher Dingwall, John Fisher, John Getley, Christopher Johns, Sarah Kay, Sarah Laurenson, the late Susan Manning, the late Hamish Miles and Jean Miles, Catriona Murray, Charles Noble, David Patterson, Murray Pittock, Ian Riches, Tracy Smith, Ruth Stewart, Susie West and Lucy Wood; Imogen Gibbon, Sarah Jeffcott, Lucinda Lax and Helen Smailes at the Scottish National Galleries; Elaine MacGillivray, when she was responsible for the Bogle papers at the Mitchell Library, Glasgow City Archives.

The Carnegie Trust of the Universities of Scotland funded a week’s research at the British Library in the summer of 2009. Short-term fellowships at the Huntington Library and Colonial Williamsburg followed a three-year term as Head of History of Art, which coincided with the merger between the University of Edinburgh and Edinburgh College of Art. Thanks to the brilliant input of Chris Breward, Tamara Trodd and Heather Pulliam, I survived this period more-or-less unscathed. During my period at the Huntington, Simon Macdonald was my partner-in-crime and Yoga Kingdom Sanctuary my second home. Vincent and Marilyn Harris have allowed me to cat-sit, house-sit and then just sit with my manuscript as it emerged over a number of writing retreats at their home in Eskdalenuir, within easy walking distance of Samye Ling Monastery and Tibetan Centre.


The Moray Endowment Trust, the Pasold Foundation, the Strathmartine Trust and the William Grant Foundation covered the
image costs and enabled the inclusion of the colour insert; I could not have delivered this illustrated book without their generous support. Elisabeth Gernerd provided initial input into the sourcing of the images and Emily Goetsch delivered the fiddly task with characteristic grace. Elisabeth is a former postgraduate student whose thesis nurtured my thinking, as has the work of Heather Carroll, Hannah Lund, Maeve O’Dwyer and particularly Freya Gowerley. My current PhD cohort, Sydney Ayers, Joyce Dixon, Lillian Elliott, Anna Myers, Danielle Smith and Georgia Vullinghs ensure that I am forever reading drafts.

As ever in these acknowledgements, you save the best until last. So Stanley Wynd, thank you for everything all the time.