The Cambridge Companion to the First Amendment and Religious Liberty

This book is an interdisciplinary guide to the religion clauses of the First Amendment with a focus on its philosophical foundations, historical developments, and legal and political implications. The volume begins with fundamental questions about God, the nature of belief and worship, conscience, freedom, and their intersections with law. It then traces the history of religious liberty and church–state relations in America through a diverse set of religious and nonreligious voices from the seventeenth century to the most recent Supreme Court decisions. The Companion concludes by addressing legal and political questions concerning the First Amendment and the court cases and controversies surrounding religious liberty today, including the separation of church and state, corporate religious liberty, and constitutional interpretation. This scholarly yet accessible book will introduce students and scholars alike to the main issues concerning the First Amendment and religious liberty, offering incisive new insights into one of the most important topics in American culture.

Michael D. Breidenbach is Assistant Professor of History at Ave Maria University, Florida, and Visiting Scholar at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. His work has been published in the William and Mary Quarterly, and his book on American religious liberty and church–state relations is under contract with Harvard University Press. He has held research positions at the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Princeton.

Owen Anderson is Professor of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Arizona State University. He has published seven books, including The Natural Moral Law (Cambridge University Press, 2012) and The Declaration of Independence and God (Cambridge University Press, 2015). He studies rational presuppositionalism and how it approaches basic questions about God and the good.
Cambridge Companions to Law

*Cambridge Companions to Law* offers thought-provoking introductions to different legal disciplines, invaluable to both the student and the scholar. Edited by world-leading academics, each offers a collection of essays which both map out the subject and allow the reader to delve deeper. Critical and enlightening, the *Companions* library represents legal scholarship at its best.

The Cambridge Companion to European Private Law  
Edited by Christian Twigg-Flesner

The Cambridge Companion to International Law  
Edited by James Crawford and Martti Koskenniemi

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Law  
Edited by Mauro Bussani and Ugo Mattei

The Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law  
Edited by Conor Gearty and Costas Douzinas

The Cambridge Companion to Public Law  
Edited by Mark Elliott and David Feldman

The Cambridge Companion to International Criminal Law  
Edited by William A. Schabas

The Cambridge Companion to Natural Law Jurisprudence  
Edited by George Duke and Robert P. George

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Family Law  
Edited by Shazia Choudhry and Jonathan Herring

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law  
Edited by Roger Masterman and Robert Schütze

The Cambridge Companion to the First Amendment and Religious Liberty  
Edited by Michael D. Breidenbach and Owen Anderson
The Cambridge Companion to
the First Amendment and
Religious Liberty

Edited by

Michael D. Breidenbach
Ave Maria University

Owen Anderson
Arizona State University
For Paul Thomas, with love

– M.D.B.

For Alyssa, with many thanks

– O.A.
## Contents

1. Notes on Contributors
2. Acknowledgments
3. Introduction: Assessing the First Amendment and Religious Liberty in America
   - Michael D. Breidenbach and Owen Anderson
4. Part I Philosophical Foundations
   1. The First Amendment and Natural Religion
      - Owen Anderson
   2. The Philosophical Meaning of Religious Exercise
      - Janice Tzuling Chik
   3. Freedom of Religion: Special, Valuable, and Qualified
      - John Finnis
5. Part II Historical Interpretations
   4. Religious Exercise and Establishment in Early America
      - Glenn A. Moots
   5. The Historical Context of the Religion Clauses of the First Amendment
      - Chris Beneke
      - Michael D. Breidenbach
   7. Church and State in the Nineteenth Century
      - Jonathan Den Hartog
viii  Contents

8  The First Amendment Religion Clauses in the United States
   Supreme Court  219
   Zoë Robinson

Part III  Law, Politics, and Economics  249

9  Religious and Secular Presuppositions in First Amendment
   Interpretations  251
   Paul E. Kerry

10  Two Concepts of Religious Liberty: The Natural Rights
    and Moral Autonomy Approaches to the Free Exercise
    of Religion  276
    Vincent Phillip Muñoz

11  The Economic Origins of Religious Liberty  307
    Anthony Gill

12  Corporate Religious Liberty and the Culture Wars  334
    Steven D. Smith

13  Which Original Meaning of the Establishment Clause Is the
    Right One?  365
    Donald L. Drakeman

14  The Two Separations  396
    Marc O. DeGirolami

15  The Challenge Ahead: Reconnecting Religion, Reason,
    and Truth  428
    Gerard V. Bradley

Index  457
Notes on Contributors

Owen Anderson is Professor of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Arizona State University. He is the author of several books, including *The Declaration of Independence and God* (Cambridge University Press, 2015) and *The Natural Moral Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2012). He has been a research fellow at Princeton University and a visiting scholar at Princeton Seminary. He teaches philosophical theology at Phoenix Seminary and is currently interested in the role of reason and general revelation in social and individual life.


Gerard V. Bradley is Professor of Law at the University of Notre Dame, where he is the co-director of the Natural Law Institute. He is also an editor-in-chief of *The American Journal of Jurisprudence*. His most recent book is *Catholic Social Teaching: A Volume of Scholarly Essays*, edited with Christian Brugger (Cambridge University Press, 2019).

Michael D. Breidenbach is Assistant Professor of History at Ave Maria University and Visiting Research Scholar at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. His research interests concern the history of political, legal, and religious thought in the Atlantic World. His work has been published in the *William and Mary Quarterly*, and his current book, a history of American religious liberty and church-state relations, is under contract with Harvard University Press. He received his PhD from King’s College, Cambridge, and has held research positions at Princeton University; the Rothermere American Institute, Oxford; St John’s College, Oxford; and Wolfson College, Cambridge.
Notes on Contributors

Janice Tzuling Chik is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Ave Maria University; Associate Member of the Aquinas Institute at Blackfriars Hall, University of Oxford; and a research fellow at the University of Pennsylvania. Her research spans the philosophy of action, metaphysics and philosophy of science, and human rights. She holds degrees in philosophy, public policy, and music performance from Princeton University, the University of Texas at Austin, and the University of St Andrews.

Marc O. DeGirolami is the Carey Fields Professor of Law at St. John’s University School of Law, where he is the Associate Director of the Center for Law and Religion. His book *The Tragedy of Religious Freedom* was published in 2013 by Harvard University Press. His writing concerns the First Amendment, constitutional interpretation, and constitutional history. He is now working on an account of American church–state relations, focusing on the thought of George Washington, Patrick Henry, and John Marshall.

Jonathan Den Hartog is Professor of History at Samford University in Birmingham, Alabama. He is the author of *Patriotism and Piety: Federalist Politics and Religious Struggle in the New American Nation* (University of Virginia Press, 2015). He is also the co-editor, with Carl Esbeck, of *Disestablishment and Religious Dissent: Church-State Relations in the New American States, 1776–1833* (University of Missouri Press, 2019).

Donald L. Drakeman is Distinguished Research Professor in the Program on Constitutional Studies at the University of Notre Dame and a fellow in Health Management at the University of Cambridge. He is the author of numerous works on religion and law, including, most recently, *Church, State, and Original Intent* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) and, with John F. Wilson, *Church and State in American History*, fourth edition (Routledge, 2020). His church–state writings have been cited by the Supreme Courts of the United States and the Philippines. He received his AB from Dartmouth, JD from Columbia, and PhD from Princeton.

John Finnis is Professor Emeritus of Law and Legal Philosophy at the University of Oxford and Biolchini Family Professor of Law at the University of Notre Dame, Indiana. His books include *Natural Law and Natural Rights* (Oxford University Press, 1980, 2011); *Fundamentals of Ethics* (Clarendon Press, 1983); *Moral Absolutes: Tradition, Revision, and Truth* (Catholic University of America Press, 1991); and *Aquinas: Moral, Political and Legal Theory* (Oxford University Press, 1998). To accompany the second edition of his first book, Oxford University Press in 2011 published *Collected Essays of John Finnis* in five volumes: vol. V is *Religion and Public Reasons*. He is a Fellow of...
Notes on Contributors

the British Academy (in the Philosophy as well as the Law section) and an honorary Queen’s Counsel.

Anthony Gill is Professor of Political Science at the University of Washington and Distinguished Senior Fellow at Baylor University’s Institute for Studies of Religion. He hosted the podcast series Research on Religion from 2010 to 2018 and is author of Rendering unto Caesar: The Catholic Church and the State in Latin America (University of Chicago Press, 1998) and The Political Origins of Religious Liberty (Cambridge University Press, 2007). He is currently interested in the topic of how informal norms act as a substitute for formal regulation and law, and is a spirited writer on the topic of gratuities.

Paul E. Kerry is Associate Professor of History at Brigham Young University and a visiting fellow at the University of Oxford in the Programme for the Foundations of Law and Constitutional Government as well as the Centre for Theology and Modern European Thought. He researches in intellectual history, historiography, and the transatlantic transmission of ideas in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. He is a fellow of the Royal Historical Society and honorary secretary to the All-Party Parliamentary Group for the Prevention of Sexual Violence in Conflict. He has held fellowships at Princeton, Cambridge, Edinburgh, and the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Glenn A. Moots is Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at Northwood University in Midland, Michigan, and has served as William E. Simon Visiting Fellow in the James Madison Program at Princeton University in 2013–14. He is co-editor of Justifying Revolution: Law, Virtue, and Violence in the American War of Independence (University of Oklahoma Press, 2018) and author of Politics Reformed: The Anglo-American Legacy of Covenant Theology (University of Missouri Press, 2010) and of essays in American Political Thought, Locke Studies, and Hebraic Political Studies. He earned his undergraduate degree at the University of Michigan and graduate degrees in political science and philosophy from Louisiana State University.

Vincent Phillip Muñoz is the Tocqueville Associate Professor of Political Science and Concurrent Associate Professor of Law at the University of Notre Dame. He is the founding director of Notre Dame’s Program in Constitutional Studies and author of God and the Founders: Madison, Washington, and Jefferson (Cambridge University Press, 2009).

Zoë Robinson is Professor of Political Science at the School of Politics and International Relations, Australian National University. She also holds positions as Professor of Law at DePaul University College of Law and Professorial Research Fellow at Deakin University.
Steven D. Smith (JD, Yale; BA, Brigham Young) is the Warren Distinguished Professor of Law at the University of San Diego and co-director of the Institute for Law and Religion. His works on law and religion include *Foreordained Failure: The Quest for a Constitutional Principle of Religious Freedom* (Oxford University Press, 1995), *The Rise and Decline of American Religious Freedom* (Harvard University Press, 2014), and *Pagans and Christians in the City: Culture Wars from the Tiber to the Potomac* (Eerdmans, 2018).
Acknowledgments

The idea of this volume began while we were fellows at the James Madison Program at Princeton University. We would like to thank the Madison Program, particularly Robert P. George and Bradford P. Wilson, for offering us the fellowship that inspired this collaboration. We would also like to thank John Berger and our editorial team at Cambridge University Press.

M.D.B. and O.A.