

UN PEACEKEEPING OPERATIONS AND THE PROTECTION OF CIVILIANS

This book is based on the author's experience of working for more than two decades in conflict and post-conflict zones. It was written for those involved in the development of UN peacekeeping and the protection of civilians. It is intended to be accessible to non-lawyers working in the field who may need to know the applicable legal standards relating to issues such as the use of force as well as arrest and detention powers on the one hand and the delivery of life-saving assistance according to humanitarian principles on the other. It will also be of interest to scholars and students of peacekeeping, international law and international relations on the practical dilemmas facing those trying to operationalize the various conceptions of 'protection' during humanitarian crises in recent years.

Conor Foley is a Visiting Professor at the Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro. He has worked on legal reform, human rights and protection issues in more than thirty conflict and post-conflict states for a variety of UN, human rights and humanitarian agencies. His previous books include *The Thin Blue Line: How Humanitarianism Went to War* (2010).



UN Peacekeeping Operations and the Protection of Civilians

SAVING SUCCEEDING GENERATIONS

CONOR FOLEY

Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108416245 DOI: 10.1017/9781108236126

© Conor Foley 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in The United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-41624-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Daniel



Contents

ACR	nowleagments	page xi
List	t of Abbreviations	xiii
	Introduction	1
	Purpose and Structure of This Book	8
	Road Map	11
	PART I THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN 'PROTECTION' AND 'PEACEKEEPING'	
1	Laws and Wars and Rights and Wrongs: The General	
	International Legal Framework Relevant to Protection	17
	Introduction	17
	Historical Overview	18
	'Humanitarian Interventions' and the UN Charter	26
	The 'Protection Provisions' of the UN Charter	36
	A Responsibility to Protect?	43
	R ₂ P, POC and 'Humanitarian Interventions'	52
	Conclusions	57
2	The Evolution and Conceptual Development of UN	
	Peacekeeping and the Protection of Civilians	59
	Introduction	59
	The First Phase of Peacekeeping	60
	The 'Core Principles' of UN Peacekeeping and Their Evolution	n 72
	The Challenges of the 1990s	74
	Chapter VII and Humanitarian Crises	84
	Humanitarian Interventionism	95



viii	Contents	
	Kosovo and East Timor	98
	Conclusions	104
3	Competing Conceptions: The Protection of Civilians	
	in UN Peacekeeping Operations	106
	Introduction	106
	The First Protection of Civilians Mandate Protection and the 'Third Phase' of UN Peacekeeping	107
	POC's Normative Significance	113 116
	POC and 'Rights-Based' Protection	125
	The Right of Humanitarian Access	133
	Rules of Engagement, IHL and International Human Rights Law	139
	Conclusions	150
	PART II THE APPLICABLE LEGAL FRAMEWORK GOVERNING THE USE OF FORCE FOR PROTECTIVE PURPOSES	
4	Relevant Provisions of International Humanitarian,	
•	Human Rights and Refugee Law	155
	Introduction	155
	Relevant Provisions of IHL	156
	Relevant Provisions of International Human Rights Law The Inter-Relationship between International Human Rights	165
	and Humanitarian Law	182
	Extraterritorial Application of International Human Rights Law	189
	Refugee Law, Human Rights and Internal Displacement	199
	Conclusions	205
5	The UN's Legal Authority and Obligations to Protect	
	Civilians	207
	Introduction	207
	The Powers, Principles and Purposes of the UN Security	
	Council	208
	Reviewing the Security Council's Decisions	214
	The UN's Legal Personality and Liability	216
	Attribution for Conduct and Conflicts	225
	Use of Force and Detention Powers	232
	Sanctions, Travel Bans and Asset Seizures	241
	Sexual Exploitation and UN Accountability	247

Conclusions

252



Contents ix

PART III PROTECTION OF CIVILIANS MANDATES IN FOUR CONTEMPORARY CASE-STUDY MISSIONS

6	Peacekeeping or War-Fighting: The UN Missions in the	
	Democratic Republic of Congo and Côte d'Ivoire	257
	Introduction	257
	Democratic Republic of Congo	258
	Côte d'Ivoire	280
	Peacekeeping or War-Fighting?	289
7	Acting with Moral Courage? The UN Missions to Darfur	
	and South Sudan	297
	Introduction	297
	Sudan (UNMIS)	298
	Darfur	305
	South Sudan	3 2 4
	The 'Positive Obligations' of UN Missions	333
	Conclusions	340
Apţ	bendix A: International Treaties and Soft-Law Instruments	347
Appendix B: Cases		356
App	bendix C: UN Security Council and General Assembly	
1	Resolutions and Presidential Statements	37 ²
Bibliography		379
Index		407



Acknowledgments

This book is mainly based on my own experiences working for more than two decades in conflict and post-conflict zones. Humanitarian aid work has become increasingly dangerous during this time, and many of my friends and colleagues have lost their lives serving the cause of peace and human dignity. It would be impossible to acknowledge everyone that I have worked with and learned from during this period individually, but I owe a debt of gratitude to them all.

The field research for the book was carried out while I was working as a consultant for the UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations (DPKO) to design a set of scenario-based training exercises on Protection of Civilians. I would like to thank DPKO's Policy Evaluation and Training Division in its head-quarters and the Protection staff in the four field missions that I worked with in the UN Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic Republic of Congo (MONUSCO), the UN Organization in Cote d'Ivoire (UNOCI), the UN Mission South Sudan (UNMISS) and the UN/AU Mission in Darfur (UNAMID). I draw on material gathered during this time, but I have not cited directly from or named any individuals as the purpose of the work was different to the research undertaken for this study. I have also not used any documents that were not publicly available.

The book is also based on my PhD thesis, and I would like to thank my two supervisors at the University of Essex, Scott Sheeran and Noam Lubell, who patiently coaxed my initial random thoughts into a coherent structure. The book benefits from presentations that I made during the course of the research at academic seminars and training events, including the law faculties at Michigan State University, Warwick University, Birmingham University, Leicester University, Igarapé and the Brazilian Centre for International Relations, the Canadian Defence Academy, the Brazilian Peacekeeping Training Centre (CCPOAB), the Brazilian Foreign Affairs Ministry (Itamaraty),



xii

Acknowledgments

the Harvard University Advanced Training Program on Humanitarian Action (ATHA) and Conectas/SUR. I am also grateful to my students and colleagues at the Pontifícia Universidade Católica (PUC) Rio de Janeiro where I teach a programme of classes on conflict and international law.

Research and writing require, above all, time and patience. The tolerance and support of a loving family makes the process much easier. My mother was diagnosed with cancer as I was starting out on the research of this book. She saw the final draft of this manuscript before it went to the publisher, but died while it was still in production. She and my father have been my constant inspiration and guiding stars throughout my life. I should say thank you more often to my wife Gláucia and son Daniel for putting up with my long absences in the field and long silences locked in my office while at the same time giving me hope of a peaceful future for succeeding generations.



Abbreviations

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

AMIS AU monitoring mission in Sudan

AU African Union

BRICS Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa

CANs Community Alert Networks

CIVPOL UN Civilian Police

CLAs Community Liaison Advisers

CNDP Congrès National pour la Défense du Peuple

CONOPS Concept of operations

CPA Comprehensive Peace Agreement CRSV Conflict-related sexual violence

C₃₄ Special Committee for Peacekeeping Operations

DDPD Doha Document for Peace in Darfur

DDRRR Demobilization, disarmament, repatriation, resettlement,

and reintegration

DFS UN Department of Field Support
DHA UN Department of Humanitarian Affairs

DMS/CMS UN Director of Mission Support/Chief of Mission Support

DPA Darfur Peace Agreement

DPA UN Department of Political Affairs

DPKO UN Department of Peacekeeping Operations

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

DSRSG UN Deputy Special Representative(s) of the Secretary-

General

EC European Commission

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice



More Information

xiv Abbreviations

ECOMOG Economic Community of West African States Monitoring

Group

ECOSOC UN Economic and Social Council

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agricultural Organisation

FARDC Forces Armées de la République Démocratique du Congo

FCO Foreign and Commonwealth Office

FDLR Forces Democratiques de Liberation du Rwanda

FRY Federal Republic of Yugoslavia GPC Global Protection Cluster HPG Humanitarian Policy Group

HRDDP Human rights due diligence policy

HRW Human Rights Watch

IASC Inter-Agency Standing Committee ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural

Rights

ICGLR International Conference on the Great Lakes Region
ICISS International Commission on Intervention and State

Sovereignty

ICI International Court of Justice

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR International Criminal Tribunals for Rwanda
ICTY International Criminal Tribunals for Yugoslavia

IDPs Internally Displaced Persons

IEMF Interim Emergency Multinational Force

IHL International Humanitarian Law
 ILC International Law Commission
 ILO International Labour Organization
 INTERFET International Force for East Timor
 IOM International Organisation for Migration

IRA Irish Republican Army IPTs Ioint Protection Teams

KFOR Kosovo Force

KLA Kosova Liberation Army

LJM Liberation and Justice Movement

LMA Linas-Marcoussis Accord LRA Lord's Resistance Army



More Information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-41624-5 — UN Peacekeeping Operations and the Protection of Civilians Conor Foley Frontmatter

Abbreviations xv

LTTE Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam MINUCI UN Mission in Côte d'Ivoire

MINUSMA UN Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission

in Mali

MINUSTAH UN Stabilization Mission in Haiti
MLC Movement pour la Liberation du Congo

MOBs Mobile Operating Bases

MONUC UN Mission in the Democratic Republic of Congo

MONUSCO UN Organization Stabilization Mission in the Democratic

Republic of Congo

MPCI Mouvement patriotique de Côte d'Ivoire

MSF Médecins Sans Frontiers

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organisation NGO Non-Governmental Organization

OCHA UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OHCHR UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

OIOS UN Office of Internal Oversight Services

ONUC UN Mission in the Congo

OPA Ouagadougou Political Agreement
PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PKK Kurdish Workers Party

PLO Palestine Liberation Organization

POC Protection of Civilians

POW Prisoner of War

PWGs Protection Working Groups

RCD Rassemblement Congolais pour la Démocratie

RoE Rules of engagement
RPF Rwandan Patriotic Front
R2P Responsibility to Protect
RUF Revolutionary United Front
RWP Responsibility While Protecting

SADC Southern African Development Community

SALC Southern Africa Litigations Centre

SAS Special Air Services
SOFA Status of forces agreement
SOMA Status of mission agreement
SOP Standard Operating Procedure
SPLA Sudan People's Liberation Army
SPLM Sudan Peoples' Liberation Movement

TCCs Troop Contributing Countries



More Information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-41624-5 — UN Peacekeeping Operations and the Protection of Civilians Conor Foley Frontmatter

xvi Abbreviations

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations

UNAMID African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur

UNAMIR UN Assistance Mission in Rwanda UNAMSIL UN Mission in Sierra Leone

UNCT UN Country Team
UNDT UN Dispute Tribunal
UNEF UN Emergency Force

UNFICYP UN Peacekeeping Force in Cyprus UNHCR UN High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF UN Children's Fund

UNIFIL UN Interim Force in Lebanon
UNISFA UN Interim Security Force for Abyei

UNITAF Unified Task Force
UNMIK UN Mission in Kosovo
UNMIL UN Mission in Liberia
UNMIS UN Mission in Sudan
UNMISS UN Mission in South Sudan

UNMOGIP UN Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan

UNOCI UN Operation in Côte d'Ivoire

UNOMSIL UN Observer Mission in Sierra Leone

UNOSOM UN Operation in Somalia

UNPROFOR UN Protection Force for the former Yugoslavia
UNTAC UN Transitional Authority in Cambodia
UNTAET UN Transitional Administration in East Timor

UNTAG UN Transition Group

UNTSO UN Truce Supervision Organization

US United States

USG DPKO Under Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Operations