In recent years, law and religion scholarship has increasingly emphasised the need to study the interaction of legal and religious ideas and institutions, norms and practices. The overall question that this scholarship explores may be stated as follows: how do legal and religious ideas and institutions, methods and mechanisms, beliefs and believers influence each other, for better and for worse, in the past, present and future?

This volume engages this area of scholarship by examining how law regulates religion, and how religion responds to such regulations. It examines underlying norms influencing state regulation of religion, and challenges emerging from such regulation. Importantly, this volume will go beyond the conventional enquiries that draw upon the Anglo-European approaches and experiences, and emphasise instead Asian perspectives in order to expand and build upon existing understandings about the complex relationship between law and religion.


Arif A. Jamal is Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore. He serves on the Executive Committee of NUS’s Centre for Asian Legal Studies and as an editor of the Asian Journal of Comparative Law. His research and teaching interests include legal and political theory, law and religion and law in Muslim contexts. Arif’s publications are forthcoming or have appeared in the American Journal of Comparative Law, the Oxford Journal of Law and Religion and the Journal of Law, Religion and State. His most recent book is Islam, Law and the Modern State: (Re)imagining Liberal Theory in Muslim Contexts (2018).

Daniel P. S. Goh is Associate Professor of Sociology at the National University of Singapore. He specialises in comparative-historical sociology and studies state formation, race and multiculturalism, Asian urbanisms, and religion, and has published more than forty articles on these subjects in journals and books. He has edited and co-edited several books, including Race and Multiculturalism in Malaysia and Singapore (2009), Worlding Multiculturalisms: The Politics of Inter-Asian Dwelling (2015), Precarious Belongings: Affect and Nationalism in Asia (2017) and Urban Asias: Essays on Futurity: Past and Present (2018).
Regulating Religion in Asia

NORMS, MODES, AND CHALLENGES

Edited by

JACLYN L. NEO
National University of Singapore

ARIF A. JAMAL
National University of Singapore

DANIEL P. S. GOH
National University of Singapore
Contents

Notes on Contributors page vii
Acknowledgements xiii
List of Abbreviations xiv

Introduction: Regulating Religion in Asia 1

PART I THEORIZING REGULATION 17

1 Regulatory Markers 19
Arif A. Jamal

2 Conceptualizing the Regulation of Religion: A Preliminary Framework for Inquiry 38
Jaclyn L. Neo

3 The Role of Authority and Sanctity in State–Religion Conflicts 59
Shai Wozner and Gilad Abiri

4 Jurisdictional versus Official Control: Regulating the Buddhist Sangha in South and Southeast Asia 79
Benjamin Schonthal

5 Defining and Regulating Religion in Early Independent Indonesia 99
Kevin W. Fogg

PART II REGULATING RELIGION: STATE PRACTICE AND LEGAL NORMS 117

6 Principled Pluralism, Relational Constitutionalism and Regulating Religion within Singapore’s Secular Democratic Model 119
Thio Li-ann
### Contents

**7 Legal Regulation of Religion in Vietnam**  
Bui Ngoc Son  
146

**8 Regulating Buddhism in Myanmar: The Case of Deviant Buddhist Sects**  
Nyi Nyi Kyaw  
169

**9 The Bureaucratization of Religious Education in the Islamic Republic of Iran**  
Mirjam Künlker  
187

**10 Managing Religious Competition in China: Regulating Provisions of Charitable Activities by Religious Organizations**  
Jianlin Chen and Loveday J. Liu  
207

**PART III CHALLENGES TO STATE REGULATION**  
231

**11 Regulating Religion through Administrative Law: Religious Conversion in Malaysia beyond Fundamental Rights**  
Matthew Nelson and Dian A. H. Shah  
233

**12 Legal Pluralism, Patronage Secularism, and the Challenge of Prophetic Christianity in Singapore**  
Daniel P. S. Goh  
256

**13 Equality in Secularism: Contemporary Debates on Social Stratification and the Indian Constitution**  
M. Mohsin Alam Bhat  
276

**14 Beyond the State and the Hawza: Legal Pluralism and the Ironies of Shi‘i Law**  
Haider Ala Hamoudi  
298

**Index**  
313
Notes on Contributors

Gilad Abiri is a JSD candidate at Yale Law School, where he also completed his LLM degree in 2016. Before coming to Yale, Gilad earned his LLM degree, summa cum laude, from Tel Aviv University; his master’s thesis developed an account of deliberative democracy based on the moral theory of value pluralism. Gilad is a graduate of the Interdisciplinary Program for Outstanding Students at Tel Aviv University and has served as a research assistant and a teaching assistant in the fields of contract law, law and religion, and political theory. Gilad’s academic interests lie in the intersection of political theory and law, and focus on constitutional law, law and religion, and democratic law. In his JSD dissertation, he develops a new theoretical account of the tensive relationship between liberal states and religious groups.

M. Mohsin Alam Bhat is an assistant professor of law and Executive Director of the Centre for Public Interest Law at Jindal Global Law School (India). His research focuses on discrimination and exclusion, minority rights, and constitutional law and politics. He obtained his LLM and JSD from Yale Law School, where he worked on the law and social movement politics of Muslim affirmative action in India. He was Yale’s Gruber Fellow in Global Justice and Women’s Rights in 2015–16. He has previously clerked at the Supreme Court of India, and worked as a legal research assistant at the Permanent Mission of India at the United Nations.

Bui Ngoc Son is an assistant professor at the Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law. He was previously a Senior Research Fellow in the Centre for Asian Legal Studies of the Faculty of Law at the National University of Singapore. He holds a PhD in law from the University of Hong Kong. His research focuses on comparative constitutional law and theory, and comparative law from an interdisciplinary perspective. His monograph Confucian Constitutionalism in East Asia (2016) explores constitutional ideas and practices in the Confucian tradition and their contemporary relevance in East Asia. His second in progress monograph titled Constitutional Change in the Contemporary Socialist World examines changes to
Jianlin Chen is an Associate Professor at the University of Melbourne Law School, joining in 2017 after starting his academic career at the University of Hong Kong in 2011. He obtained his LLB from National University of Singapore, and his LLM and JSD from the University of Chicago. He is qualified to practice in Singapore and New York. Bilingual in English and Chinese, Jianlin publishes widely, including a monograph titled *The Law and Religious Market Theory: China, Taiwan and Hong Kong* with Cambridge University Press, and nearly thirty journal articles with law journals such as *Columbia Journal of Asian Law, Law & Social Inquiry, Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, among many others. His primary research interests include employing a combination of comparative perspectives and economic analysis to examine law and religion in Asia.

Kevin W. Fogg is a researcher on Southeast Asia based in the Faculty of History and Brasenose College, University of Oxford. His research looks at the place of Islam in Indonesia since independence, including his forthcoming monograph on the role of Islam in Indonesia’s war of independence. Other articles and chapters have discussed subjects such as Indonesia’s third Minister of Religion, script change and its impact on Muslim communities, Islamic socialism in Indonesia, and the convergence of Islamic and state education. His next major project focuses on mass Islamic organizations based outside of Java and what their evolution says about religious organizational life in Indonesia over the last century.

Daniel P. S. Goh is Associate Professor of Sociology at the National University of Singapore. He specializes in comparative-historical sociology and studies state formation, race and multiculturalism, Asian urbanisms, and religion, and has published more than forty articles on these subjects in journals and books. He has edited and coedited several books, including *Race and Multiculturalism in Malaysia and Singapore* (2009), *Worlding Multiculturalisms: The Politics of Inter-Asian Dwelling* (2015), *Precairous Belongings: Affect and Nationalism in Asia* (2017), and *Urban Asias: Essays on Futurity: Past and Present* (2018).

Haider Ala Hamoudi is Professor of Law and the Vice Dean at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law. He teaches contracts, commercial law, and Islamic law. Professor Hamoudi’s scholarship focuses on Middle Eastern and Islamic law.
He has coauthored a casebook on Islamic law titled *Islamic Law in Modern Courts* and published numerous articles and book chapters in a wide variety of law school journals, university presses, and other scholarly venues, including a full length book on the Iraqi constitution entitled *Negotiating in Civil Conflict: Imperfect Bargaining and Constitutional Construction in Iraq*. He is also under contract to author a nutshell on Islamic law, focusing on Islamic law as it is relevant in modern legal systems. Professor Hamoudi is also the author of a blog on Islamic law titled *Islamic Law in Our Times*.

**Arif A. Jamal** is an Associate Professor of Law at the National University of Singapore (NUS). His research and teaching interests include legal and political theory, law and religion, and law in Muslim contexts. Arif’s publications include *Islam, Law and the Modern State* (2018), and a range of book chapters and articles in journals including the *American Journal of Comparative Law*, the *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, and the *Journal of Law, Religion and State*. Arif serves on the Executive Committee of the Centre for Asian Legal Studies (CALS) at NUS and as an editor of the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*.


**Nyi Nyi Kyaw** is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Centre for Asian Legal Studies at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore. He specializes on Myanmar and is interested in religion, nationalism, human rights, law, social movements, and constitutionalism. His research has been published in the *Review of Faith & International Affairs, Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, and *Social Identities*. 

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
He has also contributed to and plans to contribute to several edited volumes on Muslims, religion, Buddhist nationalism, and constitutionalism—all relating to Myanmar.

Thio Li-ann holds a BA (Hons., Jurisprudence) from the University of Oxford; a Masters of Law from Harvard Law School, and a PhD from the University of Cambridge. She is Provost Chair Professor at the National University of Singapore, where she teaches and researches public international law, human rights law in Asia, constitutional and administrative law, and comparative public law, with a focus on law and religion. She is a barrister (Gray’s Inn, UK) and was a Nominated Member of the Singapore Parliament (2007–09). She is currently chief editor of the Singapore Journal of Legal Studies and formerly general editor of the Asian Yearbook of International Law and Chief Editor, Singapore Journal of International & Comparative Law. A prolific scholar, she has published more than 100 law review articles/book chapters and several books. She is the sole author of monographs including Managing Babel: The International Legal Protection of Minorities in the Twentieth Century (2005) and A Treatise on Singapore Constitutional Law (2012). She has also authored Constitutionalism in Asia (2014, with Kevin Y. L. Tan, Wen-Chen Chang, and Juinn-rong Yeh); Constitutional Law in Malaysia and Singapore (with Kevin Y. L. Tan, 2010); and The Evolution of a Revolution: 40 Years of the Singapore Constitution (Li-ann Thio and Kevin Y. L. Tan, eds., 2009).

Loveday J. Liu is a trainee solicitor at K&L Gates Hong Kong office. She graduated from the University of Hong Kong (PCLL, LLB) and LSE (MSc, Hons), and as an undergraduate spent one year at Tsinghua University School of Law for foundational studies. From 2016 to 2018, Loveday participated in the Supreme People’s Court’s project Compilation of Chinese Legal System Judicial Decisions, responsible for editing large volumes of judicial memoirs (“Shuotie”) of late Tsing Dynasty. Loveday is developing an interdisciplinary research interest that looks to other social science subjects for understanding the working of law. Her publications include an article discussing the socio-legal impact of Uber entering Hong Kong that was published in 法律适用, and an co-authored piece on how Chinese Charity Law would shape the domestic charitable market in 财经法学.

Matthew Nelson (PhD, Columbia) is a Reader in Politics at SOAS (School of Oriental and African Studies), University of London. Before SOAS Dr Nelson taught at University of California at Santa Cruz, Bates College, and Yale University. At SOAS, Dr Nelson is a founding member of the Centre for Comparative Political Thought and the Centre for the International Politics of Conflict, Rights, and Justice. In 2009–10 he was the Wolfensohn Family Member in the School of Social Science at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton; in 2011 he was a Resident Fellow at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars in
Washington, DC; in 2014 and 2015, he was a Resident Fellow at the Zentrum für Interdisziplinäre Forschung (ZiF) in Germany. Dr Nelson has also served as an elected board member for the American Institute of Pakistan Studies (AIPS), the South Asia Council of the Association for Asian Studies (AAS), and the Religion and Politics Section of the American Political Science Association (APSA). His current research focuses on comparative constitutional politics and the politics of sectarian and doctrinal diversity in Islamic law and education.


Benjamin Schonthal is Associate Professor of Buddhism and Asian Religions and Associate Dean (International) for the Humanities Division at the University of Otago in New Zealand. Ben’s research examines the intersections of religion, law, and politics in late colonial and contemporary Southern Asia, with a particular focus on Buddhism and law in Sri Lanka. His work has appeared in journals such as the Journal of Asian Studies, Modern Asian Studies, the International Journal of Constitutional Law, and others. Ben’s first book, Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law (Cambridge University Press), appeared in 2016.

Dian A. H. Shah is an Assistant Professor at the National University of Singapore (NUS). She previously taught at the Faculty of Law, University of Malaya, where she remains a faculty appointee. Her research interests span the fields of constitutional history, comparative constitutional law, and human rights, focusing on issues arising from the interactions among constitutional law, religion, and politics in selected Asian jurisdictions. She is the author of Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka (Cambridge University Press, 2017) and coeditor of the book Law and Society in Malaysia: Pluralism, Ethnicity and Religion (2018). Dian currently serves as the deputy editor of the Asian Journal of Comparative Law.

Shai Wozner is a senior lecturer in Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law and the director of the Taubenschlag Institute of Criminal Law, Tel Aviv University. He received his BA in Talmud and Philosophy from Bar-Ilan University, and LLB, LLM, and LLD (cum laude) from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He was a fellow at the Shalom Hartman Institute in Jerusalem until 2007. In 2012–13 he was a Berkowitz Fellow at the Tikvah Center for Law and Jewish Civilization, New York.
University School of Law. Shai Wozner is the coauthor (with H. Ben-Menahem and N. Hecht) of the three volumes *Controversy and Dialogue in the Halakhic Sources* (2002), and the author of *Legal Thinking in the Lithuanian Yeshivoth* (2016).
Acknowledgements

Most of the chapters in this volume were presented at a conference titled “Regulating Religion: Normativity and Change at the Intersection of Law and Religion”, which was held at the Faculty of Law of the National University of Singapore (NUS Law) on 14 and 15 December 2015. The conference and this edited volume both benefitted from the generous support of a research grant provided by the Centre for Asian Legal Studies (CALS) at NUS Law.

We would like to thank the authors, both those who were present at the conference as well as those whose chapters were solicited thereafter, for their contributions to this volume. We also thank Cambridge University Press for its support in bringing this volume to fruition.

The research project and this edited volume would not have been possible without the help of several dedicated student assistants from NUS Law, and we thank the following for their work, especially for their assistance in preparing the essays contained in this volume for publication: Christopher Khew Wei Luen, Jacqueline Gwee Li Ling, Nguyen Vu Lan, Andrea Ong Hui Xian, KarLuis Quek, Sheiffa Safi Shirbeeni, Rachel Tan Xi’En, and Thaddaeus Tan Yong Zhong. Last but not least, we are grateful to Muhammad Nurshazny Bin Ramlan, research assistant at the Centre for Asian Legal Studies, for managing the editorial and publication process with great aplomb.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADJAR</td>
<td>Agama Djawa Asli Republik Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMLA</td>
<td>Administration of Muslim Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>Barisan Nasional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSPP</td>
<td>Burma Socialist Programme Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHC</td>
<td>City Harvest Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Country of Particular Concern or Communist Party of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCBC</td>
<td>Faith Community Baptist Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDF</td>
<td>Israel Defense Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRO</td>
<td>Inter-Religious Organization (Singapore)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAKIM</td>
<td>Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JAWHAR</td>
<td>Jabatan Waqaf, Zakat dan Haji</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>lesbian, gay bisexual, and transgender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOM</td>
<td>Ministry of Manpower (Singapore)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORA</td>
<td>Ministry of Religious Affairs (Indonesia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRHA</td>
<td>Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act (Singapore)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MUI</td>
<td>Majelis Ulama Indonesia (Indonesian Ulama Council)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYR</td>
<td>Malaysian ringgit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLD</td>
<td>National League for Democracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRD</td>
<td>National Registration Department (Malaysia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NU</td>
<td>Nahdatul Ulama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCB</td>
<td>other backward classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAS</td>
<td>Parti Islam Se-Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRC</td>
<td>People's Republic of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC</td>
<td>Revolutionary Council</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

SC  Scheduled Castes
SSMNC  State Sangha Maha Nayaka Committee
UDHR  Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UMNO  United Malay Nationalist Organization
USCIRF  United States Commission on International Religious Freedom