

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo, Arif A. Jamal, Daniel P. S. Goh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

REGULATING RELIGION IN ASIA

In recent years, law and religion scholarship has increasingly emphasised the need to study the interaction of legal and religious ideas and institutions, norms and practices. The overall question that this scholarship explores may be stated as follows: how do legal and religious ideas and institutions, methods and mechanisms, beliefs and believers influence each other, for better and for worse, in the past, present and future?

This volume engages this area of scholarship by examining how law regulates religion, and how religion responds to such regulations. It examines underlying norms influencing state regulation of religion, and challenges emerging from such regulation. Importantly, this volume will go beyond the conventional enquiries that draw upon the Anglo-European approaches and experiences, and emphasise instead Asian perspectives in order to expand and build upon existing understandings about the complex relationship between law and religion.

Jaclyn L. Neo is Associate Professor of Law at the National University of Singapore (NUS). She specialises in constitutional law, human rights law and comparative constitutional law and religion. She is the sole editor of *Constitutional Interpretation in Singapore: Theory and Practice* (2017) and has been a guest editor for special issues of the *Singapore Academy of Law Journal*, *Journal of International and Comparative Law* and the *Journal of Law, Religion, and State*. Her articles have been published in the *International Journal of Constitutional Law* (I-CON), *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, *Human Rights Quarterly* and the *Singapore Journal of Legal Studies*.

Arif A. Jamal is Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore. He serves on the Executive Committee of NUS's Centre for Asian Legal Studies and as an editor of the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*. His research and teaching interests include legal and political theory, law and religion and law in Muslim contexts. Arif's publications are forthcoming or have appeared in the *American Journal of Comparative Law*, the *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion* and the *Journal of Law, Religion and State*. His most recent book is *Islam, Law and the Modern State: (Re)imagining Liberal Theory in Muslim Contexts* (2018).

Daniel P. S. Goh is Associate Professor of Sociology at the National University of Singapore. He specialises in comparative-historical sociology and studies state formation, race and multiculturalism, Asian urbanisms, and religion, and has published more than forty articles on these subjects in journals and books. He has edited and co-edited several books, including *Race and Multiculturalism in Malaysia and Singapore* (2009), *Worlding Multiculturalisms: The Politics of Inter-Asian Dwelling* (2015), *Precarious Belongings: Affect and Nationalism in Asia* (2017) and *Urban Asias: Essays on Futurity: Past and Present* (2018).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo, Arif A. Jamal, Daniel P. S. Goh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Regulating Religion in Asia

NORMS, MODES, AND CHALLENGES

Edited by

JACLYN L. NEO

National University of Singapore

ARIF A. JAMAL

National University of Singapore

DANIEL P. S. GOH

National University of Singapore



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo, Arif A. Jamal, Daniel P. S. Goh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108416177

DOI: 10.1017/9781108235983

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-41617-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiv
Introduction: Regulating Religion in Asia	1
PART I THEORIZING REGULATION	17
1 Regulatory Markers Arif A. Jamal	19
2 Conceptualizing the Regulation of Religion: A Preliminary Framework for Inquiry Jaclyn L. Neo	38
3 The Role of Authority and Sanctity in State–Religion Conflicts Shai Wozner and Gilad Abiri	59
4 Jurisdictional versus Official Control: Regulating the Buddhist Saṅgha in South and Southeast Asia Benjamin Schonthal	79
5 Defining and Regulating Religion in Early Independent Indonesia Kevin W. Fogg	99
PART II REGULATING RELIGION: STATE PRACTICE AND LEGAL NORMS	117
6 Principled Pluralism, Relational Constitutionalism and Regulating Religion within Singapore’s Secular Democratic Model Thio Li-ann	119

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
7	Legal Regulation of Religion in Vietnam Bui Ngoc Son	146
8	Regulating Buddhism in Myanmar: The Case of Deviant Buddhist Sects Nyi Nyi Kyaw	169
9	The Bureaucratization of Religious Education in the Islamic Republic of Iran Mirjam Künkler	187
10	Managing Religious Competition in China: Regulating Provisions of Charitable Activities by Religious Organizations Jianlin Chen and Loveday J. Liu	207
	PART III CHALLENGES TO STATE REGULATION	231
11	Regulating Religion through Administrative Law: Religious Conversion in Malaysia beyond Fundamental Rights Matthew Nelson and Dian A. H. Shah	233
12	Legal Pluralism, Patronage Secularism, and the Challenge of Prophetic Christianity in Singapore Daniel P. S. Goh	256
13	Equality in Secularism: Contemporary Debates on Social Stratification and the Indian Constitution M. Mohsin Alam Bhat	276
14	Beyond the State and the Hawza: Legal Pluralism and the Ironies of Shi'i Law Haider Ala Hamoudi	298
	<i>Index</i>	313

Notes on Contributors

Gilad Abiri is a JSD candidate at Yale Law School, where he also completed his LLM degree in 2016. Before coming to Yale, Gilad earned his LLM degree, *summa cum laude*, from Tel Aviv University; his master's thesis developed an account of deliberative democracy based on the moral theory of value pluralism. Gilad is a graduate of the Interdisciplinary Program for Outstanding Students at Tel Aviv University and has served as a research assistant and a teaching assistant in the fields of contract law, law and religion, and political theory. Gilad's academic interests lie in the intersection of political theory and law, and focus on constitutional law, law and religion, and democratic law. In his JSD dissertation, he develops a new theoretical account of the tense relationship between liberal states and religious groups.

M. Mohsin Alam Bhat is an assistant professor of law and Executive Director of the Centre for Public Interest Law at Jindal Global Law School (India). His research focuses on discrimination and exclusion, minority rights, and constitutional law and politics. He obtained his LLM and JSD from Yale Law School, where he worked on the law and social movement politics of Muslim affirmative action in India. He was Yale's Gruber Fellow in Global Justice and Women's Rights in 2015–16. He has previously clerked at the Supreme Court of India, and worked as a legal research assistant at the Permanent Mission of India at the United Nations.

Bui Ngoc Son is an assistant professor at the Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law. He was previously a Senior Research Fellow in the Centre for Asian Legal Studies of the Faculty of Law at the National University of Singapore. He holds a PhD in law from the University of Hong Kong. His research focuses on comparative constitutional law and theory, and comparative law from an interdisciplinary perspective. His monograph *Confucian Constitutionalism in East Asia* (2016) explores constitutional ideas and practices in the Confucian tradition and their contemporary relevance in East Asia. His second in progress monograph titled *Constitutional Change in the Contemporary Socialist World* examines changes to

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
 Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo, Arif A. Jamal, Daniel P. S. Goh
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

the constitutional systems in five current socialist countries (China, Cuba, Laos, North Korea, and Vietnam). His work also includes articles on Confucian law, socialist law, constitutional mobilization, popular constitutionalism, constitution-making, globalization of constitutional identity, and global diffusion of constitutional rights, published by *American Journal of Comparative Law*, *Law & Social Inquiry*, *University of Illinois Law Review*, *Fordham International Law Journal*, *Washington University Global Studies Law Review*, *Washington International Law Journal*, among others.

Jianlin Chen is an Associate Professor at the University of Melbourne Law School, joining in 2017 after starting his academic career at the University of Hong Kong in 2011. He obtained his LLB from National University of Singapore, and his LLM and JSD from the University of Chicago. He is qualified to practice in Singapore and New York. Bilingual in English and Chinese, Jianlin publishes widely, including a monograph titled *The Law and Religious Market Theory: China, Taiwan and Hong Kong* with Cambridge University Press, and nearly thirty journal articles with law journals such as *Columbia Journal of Asian Law*, *Law & Social Inquiry*, *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, among many others. His primary research interests include employing a combination of comparative perspectives and economic analysis to examine law and religion in Asia.

Kevin W. Fogg is a researcher on Southeast Asia based in the Faculty of History and Brasenose College, University of Oxford. His research looks at the place of Islam in Indonesia since independence, including his forthcoming monograph on the role of Islam in Indonesia's war of independence. Other articles and chapters have discussed subjects such as Indonesia's third Minister of Religion, script change and its impact on Muslim communities, Islamic socialism in Indonesia, and the convergence of Islamic and state education. His next major project focuses on mass Islamic organizations based outside of Java and what their evolution says about religious organizational life in Indonesia over the last century.

Daniel P. S. Goh is Associate Professor of Sociology at the National University of Singapore. He specializes in comparative-historical sociology and studies state formation, race and multiculturalism, Asian urbanisms, and religion, and has published more than forty articles on these subjects in journals and books. He has edited and coedited several books, including *Race and Multiculturalism in Malaysia and Singapore* (2009), *Worlding Multiculturalisms: The Politics of Inter-Asian Dwelling* (2015), *Precarious Belongings: Affect and Nationalism in Asia* (2017), and *Urban Asias: Essays on Futurity: Past and Present* (2018).

Haider Ala Hamoudi is Professor of Law and the Vice Dean at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law. He teaches contracts, commercial law, and Islamic law. Professor Hamoudi's scholarship focuses on Middle Eastern and Islamic law.

He has coauthored a casebook on Islamic law titled *Islamic Law in Modern Courts* and published numerous articles and book chapters in a wide variety of law school journals, university presses, and other scholarly venues, including a full length book on the Iraqi constitution entitled *Negotiating in Civil Conflict: Imperfect Bargaining and Constitutional Construction in Iraq*. He is also under contract to author a nutshell on Islamic law, focusing on Islamic law as it is relevant in modern legal systems. Professor Hamoudi is also the author of a blog on Islamic law titled *Islamic Law in Our Times*.

Arif A. Jamal is an Associate Professor of Law at the National University of Singapore (NUS). His research and teaching interests include legal and political theory, law and religion, and law in Muslim contexts. Arif's publications include *Islam, Law and the Modern State* (2018), and a range of book chapters and articles in journals including the *American Journal of Comparative Law*, the *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, and the *Journal of Law, Religion and State*. Arif serves on the Executive Committee of the Centre for Asian Legal Studies (CALS) at NUS and as an editor of the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*.

Mirjam Künkler is a senior research fellow at the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Study (SCAS). Before joining SCAS, she taught Near Eastern Studies at Princeton University, where she also directed the Oxford–Princeton research cluster on “Traditional Authority and Transnational Religious Networks in Contemporary Shi’i Islam” and codirected the Luce Program on “Religion and International Affairs” for several years. Her books include *Democracy and Islam in Indonesia* (coedited with Alfred Stepan, 2013; published in Arabic as *Al-Dimokratia va al-Islam fi Indonisia*, 2016); *A Secular Age Beyond the West* (coedited with John Madeley and Shylashri Shankar, 2018); *Female Religious Authority in Shi’i Islam* (with Devin Stewart, forthcoming 2019); as well as two volumes coedited with Tine Stein: *Selected Writings by Ernst-Wolfgang Böckenförde*, Vol. I (2017) and Vol. II (2019). Künkler has guest-edited special issues and symposia for the journals *Party Politics* (March 2013), the *American Behavioral Scientist* (July 2016), *Asian Studies Review* (December 2016), the *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* (January 2018), *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion* (February 2018), the *German Law Journal* (May 2018), *Constellations: An International Journal of Critical and Democratic Theory* (June 2018), and *Cambridge Journal of Law and Religion* (August 2018). She sits on the boards of various academic journals.

Nyi Nyi Kyaw is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Centre for Asian Legal Studies at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore. He specializes on Myanmar and is interested in religion, nationalism, human rights, law, social movements, and constitutionalism. His research has been published in the *Review of Faith & International Affairs*, *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, and *Social Identities*.

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
 Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo, Arif A. Jamal, Daniel P. S. Goh
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

He has also contributed to and plans to contribute to several edited volumes on Muslims, religion, Buddhist nationalism, and constitutionalism—all relating to Myanmar.

Thio Li-ann holds a BA (Hons., Jurisprudence) from the University of Oxford; a Masters of Law from Harvard Law School, and a PhD from the University of Cambridge. She is Provost Chair Professor at the National University of Singapore, where she teaches and researches public international law, human rights law in Asia, constitutional and administrative law, and comparative public law, with a focus on law and religion. She is a barrister (Gray's Inn, UK) and was a Nominated Member of the Singapore Parliament (2007–09). She is currently chief editor of the *Singapore Journal of Legal Studies* and formerly general editor of the *Asian Yearbook of International Law* and Chief Editor, *Singapore Journal of International & Comparative Law*. A prolific scholar, she has published more than 100 law review articles/book chapters and several books. She is the sole author of monographs including *Managing Babel: The International Legal Protection of Minorities in the Twentieth Century* (2005) and *A Treatise on Singapore Constitutional Law* (2012). She has also authored *Constitutionalism in Asia* (2014, with Kevin Y. L. Tan, Wen-Chen Chang, and Juinn-rong Yeh); *Constitutional Law in Malaysia and Singapore* (with Kevin Y. L. Tan, 2010); and *The Evolution of a Revolution: 40 Years of the Singapore Constitution* (Li-ann Thio and Kevin Y. L. Tan, eds., 2009).

Loveday J. Liu is a trainee solicitor at K&L Gates Hong Kong office. She graduated from the University of Hong Kong (PCLL, LLB) and LSE (MSc, Hons), and as an undergraduate spent one year at Tsinghua University School of Law for foundational studies. From 2016 to 2018, Loveday participated in the Supreme People's Court's project Compilation of Chinese Legal System Judicial Decisions, responsible for editing large volumes of judicial memoirs ("Shuotie") of late Tsing Dynasty. Loveday is developing an interdisciplinary research interest that looks to other social science subjects for understanding the working of law. Her publications include an article discussing the socio-legal impact of Uber entering Hong Kong that was published in 法律适用, and an co-authored piece on how Chinese Charity Law would shape the domestic charitable market in 财经法学.

Matthew Nelson (PhD, Columbia) is a Reader in Politics at SOAS (School of Oriental and African Studies), University of London. Before SOAS Dr Nelson taught at University of California at Santa Cruz, Bates College, and Yale University. At SOAS, Dr Nelson is a founding member of the Centre for Comparative Political Thought and the Centre for the International Politics of Conflict, Rights, and Justice. In 2009–10 he was the Wolfensohn Family Member in the School of Social Science at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton; in 2011 he was a Resident Fellow at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars in

Washington, DC; in 2014 and 2015, he was a Resident Fellow at the Zentrum für Interdisziplinäre Forschung (ZiF) in Germany. Dr Nelson has also served as an elected board member for the American Institute of Pakistan Studies (AIPS), the South Asia Council of the Association for Asian Studies (AAS), and the Religion and Politics Section of the American Political Science Association (APSA). His current research focuses on comparative constitutional politics and the politics of sectarian and doctrinal diversity in Islamic law and education.

Jaclyn L. Neo is Associate Professor of Law at the National University of Singapore (NUS). She specializes in constitutional law, human rights law, and comparative constitutional law and religion. She is the sole editor of *Constitutional Interpretation in Singapore: Theory and Practice* (2017) and has been a guest editor for special issues in the *Singapore Academy of Law Journal*, *Journal of International and Comparative Law*, and the *Journal of Law, Religion and State*. Her articles have been published in the *International Journal of Constitutional Law* (I-CON), *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*, *Human Rights Quarterly*, and the *Singapore Journal of Legal Studies*.

Benjamin Schonthal is Associate Professor of Buddhism and Asian Religions and Associate Dean (International) for the Humanities Division at the University of Otago in New Zealand. Ben's research examines the intersections of religion, law, and politics in late colonial and contemporary Southern Asia, with a particular focus on Buddhism and law in Sri Lanka. His work has appeared in journals such as the *Journal of Asian Studies*, *Modern Asian Studies*, the *International Journal of Constitutional Law*, and others. Ben's first book, *Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law* (Cambridge University Press), appeared in 2016.

Dian A. H. Shah is an Assistant Professor at the National University of Singapore (NUS). She previously taught at the Faculty of Law, University of Malaya, where she remains a faculty appointee. Her research interests span the fields of constitutional history, comparative constitutional law, and human rights, focusing on issues arising from the interactions among constitutional law, religion, and politics in selected Asian jurisdictions. She is the author of *Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka* (Cambridge University Press, 2017) and coeditor of the book *Law and Society in Malaysia: Pluralism, Ethnicity and Religion* (2018). Dian currently serves as the deputy editor of the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*.

Shai Wozner is a senior lecturer in Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law and the director of the Taubenschlag Institute of Criminal Law, Tel Aviv University. He received his BA in Talmud and Philosophy from Bar-Ilan University, and LLB, LLM, and LLD (cum laude) from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He was a fellow at the Shalom Hartman Institute in Jerusalem until 2007. In 2012–13 he was a Berkowitz Fellow at the Tikvah Center for Law and Jewish Civilization, New York

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo , Arif A. Jamal , Daniel P. S. Goh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

University School of Law. Shai Wozner is the coauthor (with H. Ben-Menahem and N. Hecht) of the three volumes *Controversy and Dialogue in the Halakhic Sources* (2002), and the author of *Legal Thinking in the Lithuanian Yeshivoth* (2016).

Acknowledgements

Most of the chapters in this volume were presented at a conference titled “Regulating Religion: Normativity and Change at the Intersection of Law and Religion”, which was held at the Faculty of Law of the National University of Singapore (NUS Law) on 14 and 15 December 2015. The conference and this edited volume both benefitted from the generous support of a research grant provided by the Centre for Asian Legal Studies (CALS) at NUS Law.

We would like to thank the authors, both those who were present at the conference as well as those whose chapters were solicited thereafter, for their contributions to this volume. We also thank Cambridge University Press for its support in bringing this volume to fruition.

The research project and this edited volume would not have been possible without the help of several dedicated student assistants from NUS Law, and we thank the following for their work, especially for their assistance in preparing the essays contained in this volume for publication: Christopher Khew Wei Luen, Jacqueline Gwee Li Ling, Nguyen Vu Lan, Andrea Ong Hui Xian, KarLuis Quek, Sheiffa Safi Shirbeeni, Rachel Tan Xi’En, and Thaddaeus Tan Yong Zhong. Last but not least, we are grateful to Muhammad Nurshazny Bin Ramlan, research assistant at the Centre for Asian Legal Studies, for managing the editorial and publication process with great aplomb.

Abbreviations

ADJAR	Agama Djawa Asli Republik Indonesia
AMLA	Administration of Muslim Law
BN	Barisan Nasional
BSPP	Burma Socialist Programme Party
CHC	City Harvest Church
CPC	Country of Particular Concern or Communist Party of China
FCBC	Faith Community Baptist Church
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
IDF	Israel Defense Force
IRO	Inter-Religious Organization (Singapore)
JAKIM	Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia
JAWHAR	Jabatan Waqaf, Zakat dan Haji
LGBT	lesbian, gay bisexual, and transgender
MOM	Ministry of Manpower (Singapore)
MORA	Ministry of Religious Affairs (Indonesia)
MRHA	Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act (Singapore)
MUI	Majelis Ulama Indonesia (Indonesian Ulama Council)
MYR	Malaysian ringgit
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NLD	National League for Democracy
NRD	National Registration Department (Malaysia)
NU	Nahdatul Ulama
OCB	other backward classes
PAS	Parti Islam Se-Malaysia
PRC	People's Republic of China
RC	Revolutionary Council

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41617-7 — Regulating Religion in Asia
Edited by Jaclyn L. Neo , Arif A. Jamal , Daniel P. S. Goh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

List of Abbreviations

xv

SC	Scheduled Castes
SSMNC	State Sangha Maha Nayaka Committee
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UMNO	United Malay Nationalist Organization
USCIRF	United States Commission on International Religious Freedom