

INDEX

Abakarova v. Russia, 285 Aristotle, 175, 180 Abdulkhanov and Others v. Russia, ART. See assisted reproductive 269 - 70technology Aslakhanova v. Russia, 287 Abuyeva v. Russia, 284-5 acculturation, 21-3 assisted reproductive technology activism. See judicial activism; social (ART), 79-82 activism in Korolevy v. Russia, 82-4 Austin, John, 170 administrative regime, Russia as, 127, Austria, Constitutional Court in, 210, 129 - 32384 judicial efficiency in, 129-30 authoritarian rule judicial loyalty in, 130-1 judicial transparency in, 131-2 human rights under, 156-7 Agramunt, Pedro, 50 Russian civilization influenced by, Albekov v. Russia, 268 xvii-xviii Alekseyev v. Russia, 327, 331-4 Zorkin on, 156-7, 181, 192-3 Alexander II (Tsar), 177 autocracy, in nativist approach, 372-3 abolition of serfdom under, 177 property rights reform under, 296 Bakoyannis, Theodora, 216 All-Russian Congress of Judges, 148-9 Baltic States, 163 Alvarez, Jose, 196 Bartik v. Russia, 105 Amuyeva and Others v. Russia, 263-4, Bastrykin, Alexander, 146-7 274, 279 Belgium, seizure of Russian assets in, Ananyev and Others v. Russia, 207-8, 211 366 anti-gay propaganda laws, in Russia, Bentham, Jeremy, 170 332-3, 335-44 Berdiaev, Nikolai, 182 at federal level, 336-7 Bergbohm, Carl, 170 public arguments for, 337-8 Berman, Harold J., 193-4 at regional level, 335-6 Bindig, Rudolf, 40-1 RF Supreme Court response to, black letter law, 93-4 338-9 blackmail state, in Ukraine, 125-6 Russian CC response to, 339-44 Boillat, Phillipe, 246 Antonov, Mikhail, 390 Bolshevik revolution, 296 archaism Bondar, Nikolai, 112, 144 ECtHR and, xxi on LGBT rights, 349 Russian civilization influenced by, Borgn', Pierre-Yves Le, 216 xix-xxi Bourdieu, Pierre, 161, 182–3 social separation as sign of, xx bourgeois accumulation instinct, xvii



INDEX 401

Bowman v. UK, 142–3
Bowring, Bill, 13, 388
Brasseur, Ann, 45–6, 49, 209–10
Bratza, Nicolas, 191
breach of legal certainty, in supervisory proceedings, 308–9
Browder, William, 220
Burdov v. Russia, 204–5, 211
burial rites, 274–6
le capital symbolique, 161
Carothers, Thomas, 361
case law, in Strasbourg Court.
See ECtHR cases; Strasbourg

Court
Catherine II (Empress), 201
Central and Eastern European (CEE)
countries, 368

Chatzivassiliou, Despina, 257 Chechnya

Abakarova v. Russia, 285 Abdulkhanov and Others v. Russia, 269–70

269–70 Abuyeva v. Russia, 284–5 Albekov v. Russia, 268

Amuyeva and Others v. Russia, 263-4, 274, 279

Aslakhanova v. Russia, 287

CoE and, 257–60

PACE and, 257–8 Russia within, 258–60

Russian accession to, 257-8

Esmukhambetov and Others v. Russia, 269, 277

Finogenov and Others v. Russia, 270-1

Gakayeva and Others v. Russia, 264, 278-9

human rights issues, in ECtHR cases, 260–87, 289–94

admissibility criteria, 262–5 burial rites, 274–6

evidential issues in, 277–83

fact-finding for, 277–83 family rights, 274–6

investigations into, inadequacy of,

272–4 redress for, 283–7 right to life, protection of, 265–72 use of force abuses in planning operations, 268–72

Inderbiyeva v. Russia, 274, 278

Isayeva v. Russia, 284-5

Kadirova and Others v. Russia, 278

Kerimova and Others v. Russia, 264–5, 268, 272–3

Khashiyev & Akayeva v. Russia, 262 Malsagova and Others v. Russia, 265 Maskhadov and Others v. Russia,

274–6 Medov v. Russia, 266–8 Mezhiyeva v. Russia, 273

Petimat Ismailova and Others v. Russia, 288

Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, 276, 292

Sultygov and Others v. Russia, 288–9 Tagayeva and Others v. Russia, 271 Tashukhadzhiyev v. Russia, 273–4, 280

Tovsultanova v. Russia, 280 Tsechoyev v. Russia, 267–8

Chernishova, Olga, 281–3

Chicherin, Boris, 156–7, 171, 359 Civil Code of 1994, Russia, 297

Civil Procedure Code, 62, 100, 132–3 challenges to, 102

civil society, Russian CC influenced by,

119–22 civil unions, as LGBT right, 329

civilization. See also Russian civilization integral features of, xviii

Russian contributions to, xviii social progress and, xviii

civilization of law, 164

clientelist nondemocratic regimes, 127

Russian CC and, 128–9 Code of Civil Procedure, 309

Code of Commercial Procedure, 309

codification, of international law, 158

CoE. See Council of Europe Cold War, CoE during, 3

collective rights, 157, 164

Commena, Anna, 375

Commissioner for Human Rights, 38–9



402

Compensation Act. See Law on
Compensation
compliance
ECtHR judgments and, 17–18
of international human rights law,
15–18
Conception of Judicial Reform,
133–4
concession limits, in Russian legal
system, 169

confiscatory measures, in criminal or administrative proceedings, 315–17

Conflict Resolution Board, 233–4 conjugal meetings, as right, 78–86 in *Dickson v. the United Kingdom*, 81–4 in *Khoroshenko v. Russia*, 84–6

in Korolevy v. Russia, 82–4 Constant, Benjamin, 164

Constitution of the Russian Federation

(RF Constitution), 3–4 ECHR and, 61–4

compliance under, 360-1 ECtHR cases and, 106-8

international law as supreme to national law under, 62, 202

as living document, 172 Zorkin on, 172

Constitutional Court, in Russia (Russian CC), 9. See also Zorkin, Valery

All-Russian Congress of Judges in, 148–9

anti-gay propaganda laws and, 339-44

black letter law, 93-4

Civil Procedure Code under, 62, 100, 132–3

challenges to, 102

in clientelist nondemocratic regimes, 128-9

CoE member states and, 14–15 courts under, definitions of, 134 Criminal Procedure Code under, 132–3

ECHR and, 142, 166-7 legal positions on, 64-7

INDEX

ECtHR cases and, as influence on, 14–15, 94–111, 138–48, 223–4, 387–90

civil society as influence on, 119–22 in enforcement of judgments, 96–7

integrating of judgments into legal system, 97–106

legal incompatibility with, 212–15 through literal citations, 98–9 perception of provisions and, 99–100

reevaluation of, 117–19 restriction and limitations of constitutional rights, 104–6

RF Constitution and, 106–8 Federal Constitutional Law and, 115 Federal Law on "Insolvency

(Bankruptcy)" and, 101 Federal Law "On the Minimum

Wage" and, 101

international human rights law and, 14–15

international law in, 94 legal amendments to, 115–16

LGBT rights and, 350–1 anti-gay propaganda laws, 339–44 constitutional defense against,

339–44

judges' responses, 347–51 Mikhaylova v. Russia case, 66, 86–91 presumed consent under, 77–8 reform of, 128

Russian legal theory in, 167–8 Russian public law influenced by,

Strasbourg Court and, 14–15, 94–111, 138–48, 223–4

suspension of activities, 128–9 Yukos Oil Company v. Russia and, 217

Zorkin and, 17–18 Constitutional Courts in Austria, 210, 384

in Germany, 210 in Italy, 210

constitutional law, Strasbourg Court influenced by, 234–5



INDEX 403

constitutional regime, Russia as, 125-6, 132 - 7judicial independence in, 133-4 suppression of, 148 constructivism. See social constructivism constructivist spiral model of socialization, 200-1 Convention of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, 144 Council of Europe (CoE), 3-6. See also Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe CEE countries in, 368 during Cold War, 3 ECHR and, 26 ECtHR and, 11-13, 26 enlargement of, arguments against, 257-8 establishment of, 3 European Commission and, 31 - 2functions of, 3 Law on the Constitutional Court and, 192-3 LGBT rights and, 349-50 minority protection criteria for, 34 PACE, 40-1 as methodology source, 26 on Russian annexation of Crimea, Russian involvement in, 45 Yukos Oil Company v. Russia and, 216 as political body, 222 Russian accession to, xix-xx, 3-5, 59-61, 164-70 entry process for, 40-3 historical context for, 4-5 membership compared to other countries, 43-7 opponents of, 146-7 political context for, 4-5 positive aspects of, 199–200 social reform context for, 4 Russian Constitutional Court and, 14 - 15

courts, in Russia. See also Constitutional Court, in Russia; judges ECHR as influence on, 166-7 ECtHR as influence on, 166-7 judicial efficiency in, 129-30 judicial loyalty and, 130-1 judicial transparency in, 131-2 Coynash, Halya, 209 Crimea, annexation of, 47-51 PACE response to, 48-50 sanctions for, 52-4 Criminal Procedure Code, 132–3 The Crisis of Parliamentary Democracy (Surkov), 364 cultural capital, 161 death and damage by bombing, 261

deep socialization, 33 "deep state," in Turkey, 125-6 democracy in Russia, 38-9 as state-centered, 229 social progress and, as integral feature of, xviii Denikin, Anton, 375-6 Derrida, Jacques, 173 Desnitsky, Yefimovich, 201 destruction of property, during antiterrorism operations, 309-12 Dickson v. the United Kingdom, 81-4 Donald, Alice, 191-2 dual government regime in Russia, 126-37 in US, 125-6 Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom, 327-8

deaths in custody, 261

Dedov, Dmitry, 225

Eastern Partnership, 44–5, 55
ECHR. See European Convention on
Human Rights
ECJ. See European Court of Justice
economic control rights, for unitary
enterprises, 317–19

Dzehtsiarou, Kanstantin, 215-16

Durkheim, Emile, 153

Dworkin, Ronald, 185



INDEX 404 ECtHR. See European Court of Human Rights ECtHR cases. See also Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender rights Abakarova v. Russia, 285 Abdulkhanov and Others v. Russia, 269 - 70Abuyeva v. Russia, 284-5 Albekov v. Russia, 268 Amuyeva and Others v. Russia, 263-4, 274, 279 Ananyev and Others v. Russia, 207-8, 211 Aslakhanova v. Russia, 287 Burdov v. Russia, 204-5, 211 Esmukhambetov and Others v. Russia, 269, 277 Finogenov and Others v. Russia, 270-1 Gakayeva and Others v. Russia, 264 Gusinskiy v. Russia, 204 Illaşcu and Others v. Moldova and Russia, 204 Inderbiyeva v. Russia, 274, 278 Isayeva v. Russia, 284-5 Kadirova and Others v. Russia, 278 Kerimova and Others v. Russia, 264-5, 268, 272-3 Konstantin Markin v. Russia, 65, 143-4, 206-7, 239-41, 377 Malsagova and Others v. Russia, 265 Maskhadov and Others v. Russia, 274 - 6Medov v. Russia, 266-8 Mezhiyeva v. Russia, 273 Mikhaylova v. Russia case, 66, 86-91 Mikheyev v. Russia, 211 Petimat Ismailova and Others v.

for destruction of property during anti-terrorism operations, 309-12 economic control rights for unitary enterprises, 317–19 enforcement mechanisms and, 304 - 5failure to redeem state debt in. under Soviet bonds, 306-7 liability for state debts, 317-19 non-execution of court decisions, 302 - 6Panasenko v. Russia, 308-9 revocation of bona fide purchaser's title in, 312-15 Roman Zakharov v. Russia, 209 Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, 276, 292 Shamayev and 12 Others v. Russia, 204 Shtukaturov v. Russia, 144, 205 Sultygov and Others v. Russia, 288-9 Tagayeva and Others v. Russia, 271 Tashukhadzhiyev v. Russia, 273-4, Tovsultanova v. Russia, 280 Tsechoyev v. Russia, 267-8 Yukos Oil Company v. Russia, 139, 215-18, 320-3 PACE response to, 216 Russian CC and, 217 efficiency. See judicial efficiency Egorova, Aleksandrovna, 70 Elberte v. Latvia, 75-7 enforced disappearances, 261 enforcement, of Russian property rights, 304-5 equality. See also gender equality social progress and, as integral feature of, xviii Erdoğan, Tayyip, 12 Esmukhambetov and Others v. Russia, 269, 277 EU. See European Union Eurasianism, 375 European Commission CoE and, 31-2 on Human Rights, 327

Russia, 288 for property rights, 302–23

308 - 9

315 - 17

breach of legal certainty in

supervisory proceedings in,

confiscatory measures, in criminal

or administrative proceedings,



INDEX 405

European consensus on human rights, 167 on Strasbourg Court decisions, 249 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) CoE and, 26 evolution of interpretation of, 248 implementation of legal norms, 61–9 legislation, 61-4 Plenum of RF Supreme Court explanations, 67–9 RF Constitution, 61-4 Russian CC and, legal positions of, integration in Russian law, 202 invented rights under, 248 Kovler on, 202-4 regional human rights law and, 16, 18 - 19RF Constitution and, 61-4 compliance under, 360-1 RF Supreme Court and, 166-7, 208 - 12Russian CC and, 142, 166-7 legal positions of, 64-7 in Russian courts, 69-91 Federal Act "On Transplantation of Human Organs and/or Tissues," 71-8 NGO and, 70 for organ donations and transplantations, 71-8 for right to conjugal meetings, 78 - 86for right to legal counsel, 86-91 Russian courts influenced by, 166-7 Russian legal system's incompatibility with, 212-15 Russian ratification of, 3 compliance under, 360-1 under RF Constitution, 360-1 Russian state sovereignty and, 360-1 Strasbourg Court and, 234–5 European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). See also ECtHR cases archaism and, xxi authority of, questions about, 10 in Chechnya. See Chechnya

CoE and, 11-13, 26 compliance with judgments problems with, 17-18 by Russia, 206-8 human rights influenced by, 390-4 definitions of, 183-4 Illaşcu and Others v. Moldova and Russia, 204, 365 international human rights law compliance issues for, 15-18 Russian involvement in, 13-15 international law and, 13-14 jurisdiction of, 18-19 Kovler on, 202-4 legitimacy of decisions by, 120-1 LGBT rights and CoE in conflict with, 349-50 evolutionary approach to, 327-31 institutional approach to, 326-7 legal contributions to, 326-7 Russian CC and, 339-44, 347-51 proportionality tests and, 167-8 RF Supreme Court and, 68-9, 166-7, 208 - 12Russian CC influenced by, 14-15, 94-106, 108-11, 138-48, 223-4, 387-90 civil society as influence on, 119-22 in enforcement of judgments, 96-7 integrating of judgments into legal system, 97-106 legal incompatibility of, 212-15 through literal citations, 98-9 perception of provisions and, 99-100 reevaluation of, 117-19 restriction and limitations of constitutional rights, 104-6 RF Constitution and, 106-8 Russian courts influenced by, 166-7 Russian experience with, 6-24, 164-70, 202-12, 394-5 compared to other countries, 11–14 compliance issues, 15-18 Constitutional Court's role in, 14 - 15cultural context for, 18-19 historical context for, 18-19



INDEX

406

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). (cont.) in human rights cases, 5-6 international human rights law and, 13-15 socialization effects of, 19-24 Russian legal system and, 94-6 civil society as influence on, 119-22 incompatibility with, 212-15 legislative guidelines and recommendations, 102-3 political reactions to ECtHR decisions, 112-15 prescriptions to courts, 103-4 recognition of unconstitutional legal norms, 101 Russian CC and, integrating of judgments into, 97-106 socialization theories and, 385-6 Strasbourg effect and, 4 in Russia, 24 Strasbourg law and, 106-8 UK and dissatisfaction with, 13 prisoner voting rights and, 35, 213 - 14Zorkin and, 244-50, 365 European Court of Justice (ECJ), 229-30 European human rights law, 14-15 European law, Russian law influenced by, 201 European Partnership, 44-5 European Union (EU) integration in Eastern Europe, 357-8 minority protection criteria, for prospective members, 34 Russian norms and values influenced by, 36-40 Europeanisation, 28-9. See also socialization effects research on, 30-1 exceptionalism, of Russian legal system, 151-2, 154-64, 395-9

family rights, 274–6 FARA. See Foreign Agents Registration Act

extra-judicial executions, 261

Federal Act "On Transplantation of Human Organs and/or Tissues," 71-8 Federal Compensation Act (2009), Russia, 211 Federal Constitutional Law (1994), Russia, 115 amendments to, 365 Federal Law on "Insolvency (Bankruptcy)," 101 Federal Law "On the Minimum Wage," 101 Fedotova v. the Russian Federation, 346 filtering processes, of Strasbourg Court, 225 - 7Finogenov and Others v. Russia, 270-1 first positivism, 162-3, 167-70 foreign agents' law, 355, 357, 368 Foreign Agents Registration Act (FARA) (1938), US, 159-60 formal legal orders, 178 Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, 51 freedom social progress and, as integral feature of, xviii Zorkin on, 175 Fribergh. Erik, 260 Gakayeva and Others v. Russia, 264, 278 - 9gender equality, 239-41 genocide, 374 Georgia, Rose Revolution in, 363, 368-9 Germany Constitutional Court in, 210 Russian legal education influenced by, 162-3 Gibb, Nick, 192 Gideon, Clarence Earl, 87-8 Gideon v. Wainwright, 87-8 Gilligan, Emma, 255 Gitonas v. Greece, 105 Gladkov and Anchugov v. Russia, 139

Gladysheva v. Russia, 313

Goodman, Ryan, 21, 195 Gorbachev, Mikhail, 219, 236–7



INDEX 407

governance models. See traditional governance models Greenhill, Brian, 197–8 Gusinskiy v. Russia, 204

Habermas, Jürgen, 182-3 Hacke, Christian, 363 Hart, H. L. A., 185 Harvest-90 commodity bonds, 306 Harzl, Benedikt, 390 Hayek, Friedrich, 178 Helsinki effect, 4, 24 Helsinki Final Act of 1975, 4 Henry, Michèle, 259 Heri, Corina, 280-1 Hillebrecht, Courtney, 17 Hirst v. United Kingdom, 213-14 Hobbes, Thomas, 175, 182-3 human rights. See also Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender rights under authoritarian rule, 156-7 backlash against, 28 in Chechnya, in ECtHR cases. See Chechnya collective rights compared to, 157, 164 ECtHR as influence on, 390-4 definitions of, 183-4 European Commission on Human Rights, 327 European consensus on, 167 nativist approach to, 356

Petimat Ismailova and Others v. Russia, 288 Sultygov and Others v. Russia, 288-9

autocracy in, 372-3

Solzhenytsin and, 370-2

models, 369-78

on, 372-3

foreign agents' law, 355, 357, 368

Slavophile movement as influence

through traditional governance

in North Caucasus region, 287-9

Aslakhanova v. Russia, 287

PIR scores for, 197–8 propagandist context for, 356

ROC doctrine for, 381–2 Russian government response to, in ECtHR, 5–6 Russian legal education in conflict with, 162

Russian state sovereignty compared to, 358-69

social progress and, as integral feature of, xviii spiral model of, 20–1

Zorkin on, 157 democratic interpretations of, 179–80

foundational arguments against, obsolescence of, 185–6 liberalization of, 175–6 socialist conception of, 162 state endorsement of, 169

human rights change. See spiral model of human rights change

human rights law. See also European Convention on Human Rights; European human rights law; international human rights law

CoE and, obligations to, 59–61 ECHR and, 16, 18–19 expansion of, in Russia, 150 Zorkin on, 156

Human Rights Watch, 265
Huntington, Samuel, on Russian
civilization, authoritarian rule
as influence on, xvii–xviii

as influence on, xvii–xviii hyperpositivism defined, 300–1 Russian property rights and, 300–1

Ibragimov, Sayd-Salekh, 266
Illaşcu and Others v. Moldova and
Russia, 204, 365
Ilyin, Ivan, 182, 376
implementation of legal norms, under

ECHR, 61-9

legislation, 61–4 Plenum of RF Supreme Court explanations, 67–9 RF Constitution, 61–4

Russian CC and, legal positions of, 64–7



INDEX

408

independent bar, in Russian legal system, 201 Inderbiyeva v. Russia, 274, 278 individual human rights, Zorkin on, foundational arguments against, obsolescence of, 185-6 liberalization of, 175-6 socialist conception of, 162 state endorsement of, 169 informal legal orders, 178 informational wars, 152-3 International Crisis Group, 289 international human rights law. See also European Convention on Human Rights aims of, 60-1 compliance issues, 15-18 ECtHR and, 13-14 in Russia, 13-15 Western influences on, 23-4 socialization effects on acculturation, 21-3 ECtHR and, 19-24 material inducement, 21-2 persuasion, 21 in US, 13-14 international law codification of, 158 ECtHR and, 13-15 monist approach to, 202 positivation of, 158-9 under RF Constitution, 62, 202 in Russian CC, 94 Strasbourg Court influenced by, 234 - 5invented rights, under ECHR, 248 Isayeva v. Russia, 284-5 Italy Constitutional Court in, 210 parapolitics in, 125-6 Ivanov, Anton, 129 on unfair competition, 155 Jagland, Thorbjørn, 9–10, 192–3, 213, 398

judges. See also Ivanov, Anton; Mavrin, Sergej; Zorkin, Valery legal consciousness of, 153-4 perception of human rights by, 150 - 1secondment of, in Strasbourg Court, 226 - 7in Strasbourg Court dialogue between, 233-5 Russian, 225 judicial activism, 249 judicial efficiency, 129–30 judicial loyalty, 130-1 judicial transparency, 131-2 judiciary, in Russia efficiency of, 129-30 legal consciousness of, 153-4 loyalty of, 130-1 transparency of, 131-2 Zorkin's criticism of, 136 jury trial, 201 jus publicum europaeum, 15

Kadirova and Others v. Russia, 278 Kadyrov, Ramzan, 281-2 Kalashnikov case, 235-6 Kara-Murza, Vladimir, 191-3 Karamzin, Nikolay, 371-2 Katyn massacres, 236-9 Keller, Helen, 280-1 Kelsen, Hans, 178, 185 Kerimova and Others v. Russia, 264-5, 268, 272-3 Khashiyev & Akayeva v. Russia, 262 Khodakov, Aleksandr, 60 Khodorkovsky, Mikhail, 191, 320 Khokhriakova, Olga, 170-1 Khomiakov, Aleksei, 182, 372 Khoroshenko, Andrey, 84-6 Khoroshenko v. Russia, 84-6 Khramraev, Viktor, 192-3 Kireevsky, Ivan, 182, 372 Kirill I (Patriarch), 6 Koh, Harold Hongju, 195 Konchalovsky, Andrey, xvii Konovalov, Alexander, 365 Konstantin Markin v. Russia, 65, 143-4, 206-7, 239-41, 377

Jinks, Derek, 21, 195

Judd, Frank, 289-90



INDEX 409

Korolev, Nikolay, 78-86 Koroleva, Veronika, 78-86 Korolevy v. Russia, 82-4 Kovalev, Nikolai, 52-3 Kovler, Anatolij, 8, 69-70, 108, 113-14, 130-1, 143-4 on ECHR participation, 202-4 on ECtHR jurisdiction, 202–4 as Strasbourg Court judge, 225 Kuzmina, Luydmila, 170-1 Land Code of 2001, Russia, 297 Lavrov, Sergei, 50, 366 Law on Amendments to Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation regarding the Regulation of the Activities of Non-Profit Organizations Performing the Functions of a Foreign Agent, 355, 357, 368 Law on Compensation (2010), Russia, 206, 305 Law on Counteraction to Terrorism (2006), Russia, 311 Law on Enterprises on Business Activity (1990), in Russia, 296-7 Law on International Treaties (1995 Law), Russian Federation, 63 Law on Land Reform (1990), Russia, 296 - 7Law on Privatization of State and Municipal Enterprises (1991), Russia, 296-7 Law on Property (1990), Russia, 296-7 Law on the Constitutional Court amendments to, 190-3 CoE response to, 192-3 deployment of, 190 media responses to, 191-2 Putin approval of, 190 lawyers, secondment of, 226-7 Leach, Philip, 191-2 Lebedev, Viacheslav, 132-3 legal counsel, as fundamental right, 86-91 legal education, in Russia German influences on, 162-3 human rights and, 162

legal orders, 178 legal positivism, 169. See also first positivism legal socialization academic development of, as concept, 193-5 early applications of, 193-4 NGOs and, 199-200 Russia and, 193-201 social constructivism and, 193-5 legal theory. See also Soviet legal theory postmodernism and, 173, 180 Leontiev, R. N., 181 Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender (LGBT) rights. See also anti-gay propaganda Alekseyev v. Russia, 327, 331-4 to civil unions, 329 constitutional defense against, 345-50 through Russian CC, 339-44 Dudgeon v. the United Kingdom, 327 - 8ECtHR and CoE in conflict with, 349-50 evolutionary approach to, 327-31 legal contributions to, 326-7 Russian CC and, 339-44, 347-51 Fedotova v. the Russian Federation, 346 Modinos v. Cyprus, 328 Norris v. Ireland, 328 Novruk and Others v. Russia, 334 Oliari and Others v. Italy, 392 in Russia, 331-50, 391-2 federal laws against, 336-7 judicial activism and, 331-5 regional laws against, 335-6 social activism in support of, 331 Russian CC and, 350-1 anti-gay propaganda laws, 339-44 constitutional defense against, 339 - 44judges' responses, 347-51 Salgueiro de Silva Mouta case, 329 Schalk and Kopf v. Austria, 330 S.L. v. Austria, 328 Smith and Grady v. United Kingdom,

Western influences on, 155



410

Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender (LGBT) rights. (cont.) Vallianatos v. Greece, 329 Zorkin on, 347-8 Leuprecht, Peter, 257-8 Leviathan, 380 Levine, Felice J., 193-4 Lewis, Anthony, 87-8 LGBT rights. See Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender rights liberalism. See protective liberalism Loginov, Igor, 74 loyalty. See judicial loyalty Luchin, Viktor, 128 Lukyanov, Anatoliy, 219 Lukyanova, Yelena, 219 debate with Zorkin, 189, 220-1

Magnitsky, Sergei, 220 Magomadov, Mahmut, 281-2 Malfliet, Katlijn, 5 Mälksoo, Lauri, 257 Malsagova and Others v. Russia, 265 Mańko, Rafał, 300 Margolina, Sonja, 375 Marochkin, Sergey, 387 Martens, Fedor Fedorovich, 19 Marty, Dick, 283-4 Marxism-Leninism, 170-1 Maskhadov, Aslan, 274-6 Maskhadov and Others v. Russia, 274-6 Massias, Jean-Pierre, 257-8 material inducement, 21-2 Mavrin, Sergej, 112-13, 145, 210-11 McAuley, Mary, 383-4 McNamara, Michael, 289-90 Medov, Adam, 266-8 Medov v. Russia, 266-8 Medvedev, Dmitry, 112, 145 Mezhiyeva v. Russia, 273 Mikhailova, Valentina, 86-91 Mikhaylova v. Russia, 66, 86-91, 243-4 Mikheyev v. Russia, 211 Modinos v. Cyprus, 328 monism, international law and, 202

Montesquieu, Charles L., 167-8

Morshchakova, Tamara, 132-3

Moskalkova, Tatyana, 332 Muižnieks, Nils, 192

INDEX

Naryshkin, Sergei, 50 national identity, 177, 180 nativist approach, to human rights, 356 autocracy in, 372-3 foreign agents' law, 355, 357, 368 ROC role in, 379-82 Slavophile movement as influence on, 372-3 Solzhenitsyn and, 370-2

through traditional governance models, 369-78 victimhood arguments in, 373-4 NATO. See North Atlantic Treaty Organization

NGOs. See nongovernmental organizations

1995 Law. See Law on International **Treaties**

nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)

legal socialization and, 199-200 Russian court cases and, 70 SUTYAINIK, 70-1 Zorkin on, 179-80

Norris v. Ireland, 328

North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), expansion of, 357-8 North Caucasus region, human rights

violations of, 287-9 Aslakhanova v. Russia, 287 Petimat Ismailova and Others v.

Russia, 288 Sultygov and Others v. Russia, 288-9

Novikov case, 316-17

Novruk and Others v. Russia, 334

Oliari and Others v. Italy, 392 "On the Essence of Conscience of Law" (Ilyin), 376 Open Russia, 191

Orange Revolution, 363, 368-9 organ donations and transplants, under ECHR, 71-8



INDEX 411

PACE. See Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe Panasenko v. Russia, 308-9 parapolitics, 125-6 parental leave, in military, 240-1. See also Konstantin Markin v. Russia Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE), 40-1 as methodology source, 26 on Russian annexation of Crimea, 48 - 50Russian involvement in, 45 Yukos Oil Company v. Russia and, 216 Parmentier, Stephan, 5 Parrott, Lindsay, 200-1 Pasquier, Liliane Maury, 216 Personal Integrity Rights (PIR) scores, 197-8 persuasion, 21 Peter the Great (Tsar), xix Petimat Ismailova and Others v. Russia, 288 Petrova v. Latvia, 75-7 pilot judgments, 248-9 PIR. See Personal Integrity Rights scores Plato, 175, 180 Popper, Karl, 175 positivation, of international law, 158 - 9positivism. See first positivism; legal positivism postmodernism, 173, 180 The Power of Human Rights: International Norms and Domestic Change (Risse and Sikkink), 194-5 presumed consent, 77-8 prisoner voting rights, in UK, 35, 213-14 private property under Alexander II, 296 after Bolshevik revolution, 296 state's rights to property as superior to, 299-300 progress. See scientific and technological progress; social progress

prohibition on punishing an individual twice for same offence, 241-3 Promoting Democracy and Human Rights in Russia (Saari), 198-9 propaganda, 152-3 propagandist approach, to human rights, 356. See also anti-gay propaganda laws property rights, in Russia. See also private property under Civil Code of 1994, 297 under Code of Civil Procedure, 309 under Code of Commercial Procedure, 309 economic reform as influence on, 393-4 ECtHR cases, 302-23 breach of legal certainty in supervisory proceedings in, 308 - 9confiscatory measures, in criminal or administrative proceedings, 315 - 17for destruction of property during anti-terrorism operations, 309-12 economic control rights for unitary enterprises, 317-19 enforcement mechanisms and, 304 - 5failure to redeem state debt in, under Soviet bonds, 306-7 liability for state debts, 317-19 non-execution of court decisions, 302 - 6Panasenko v. Russia, 308-9 revocation of bona fide purchaser's title in, 312-15 historical development of, 295-301 hyperpositivism and, 300-1 under Land Code of 2001, 297 legal reforms of, 296-7 as legal transplant, 323 for material assets, 298-9 private property as subordinate to, 299-300 reforms under Alexander II, 296



412

property rights, in Russia. (cont.) Socialist legal tradition for, 295–301,

323-5

ultra-formalism and, 300-1

proportionality tests, 167-8

protective liberalism, 171

public order, in Russia, 229

Pure Theory of Law (Kelsen), 178 Pushkarskaya, Anna, 192-3, 210-11

Pushkov, Alexei, 52-3

Putin, Vladimir, 129, 132, 135, 182, 359,

365, 375-6. See also nativist

approach, to human rights

Law on the Constitutional Court

approved by, 190

ROC and, 380

Raimondi, Guido, 135, 147, 214, 217

red lines of sovereignty, 169

revocation of bona fide purchase, 312-15

Gladysheva v. Russia, 313

revocation of bona fide purchaser's

title, 312-15

RF Constitution. See Constitution of

the Russian Federation

RF Supreme Court. See Supreme Court

of Russian Federation

right to fair trial, 243-4

right to life, protection of, 265-72

Risse, Thomas, 20-1

on legal socialization, 194-5

ROC. See Russian Orthodox Church

Roman Zakharov v. Russia, 209

Ropp, Stephen C., 20-1

Rose Revolution, 363, 368-9

Rosenberg, Alfred, 174

Roter, Petra, 388

RSFSR Constitution. See Russian Soviet

Federative Socialist Republic

Constitution

RUDN. See Russian Peoples Friendship

University

rule of law

in Russia, 219

as state-centered, 229

social progress and, as integral feature of, xviii

INDEX

Russell-Johnston, Lord, 259

Russia. See also anti-gay propaganda

laws; Constitutional Court;

property rights; Russian legal

system

as administrative regime, 127, 129-32

judicial efficiency in, 129-30

judicial loyalty in, 130-1

judicial transparency in, 131-2

annexation of Crimea, 47-51

PACE response to, 48–50

sanctions for, 52-4

as clientelist nondemocratic regime, 127

judicial transparency in, 132

Russian CC and, 128-9

Code of Civil Procedure in, 309

Code of Commercial Procedure in, 309

CoE and, accession to, xix-xx, 3-5,

59-61, 164-70

entry process, 40-3

historical context for, 4-5

membership compared to other

countries, 43-7

opponents of, 146-7

political context for, 4-5

positive aspects of, 199-200

social reform context for, 4

Committee of Ministers and,

participation in, 45

Conception of Judicial Reform in,

133 - 4

as constitutional regime, 125-7, 132 - 7

judicial independence in, 133-4

suppression of, 148

democratization process in, 38

as state-centered, 229

domestic reforms in, 36-40

dual government regime in, 126-37

as dual state, 126-37

in Eastern Partnership, 44-5, 55

ECHR ratified by, 3

compliance of, 360-1

under RF Constitution, 360-1

economic reforms in, property rights

influenced by, 393-4



INDEX 413

ECtHR and, experience with, 6-24,	LGBT rights in, 331-50, 391-2
164–70, 202–12, 394–5	federal laws against, 336-7
compared to other countries, 11-14	judicial activism and, 331-5
compliance with judgments, 15-18,	regional laws against, 335-6
206-8	social activism in support of,
cultural context for, 18–19	331
historical context for, 18–19	NATO expansion and, 357-8
in human rights cases, 5–6	in PACE, 45
international human rights law	public order in, 229
and, 13–15	rule of law in, 219
Russian Constitutional Court's	as state-centered, 229
role in, 14-15	shock therapy policy in, 297, 302-3,
socialization effects of, 19-24	369
ECtHR judgments in, 94-6	spiral model of socialization in,
EU integration in Eastern Europe,	198–9
357–8	state sovereignty in
European norms and values in,	ECHR compliance and, 360-1
36-40	ECtHR judgments and, 362-8
Federal Compensation Act, 211	human rights compared to,
Federal Constitutional Law, 115	358–69
amendments to, 365	Zorkin on, 361–2
financial contributions to Strasbourg	Strasbourg Court influenced by,
Court, 224–7	225–7
human rights backlash in, 28	through filtering processes,
international human rights law in,	225-7
13–14	through financial contributions,
Western influences on, 23–4	225
judiciary in	judges, 225
efficiency of, 129–30	through secondment of lawyers
legal consciousness of, 153–4	and judges, 226–7
loyalty of, 130–1	sources of influence, 228–35
transparency of, 131–2	Strasbourg effect in, 24
Zorkin's criticism of, 136	Suppression of Terrorism Act, 275,
in jus publicum europaeum, 15	310
Law on Compensation, 206, 305	in UN Human Rights Council, 357
Law on Counteraction to Terrorism,	White Movement in, 375
311	Russian CC. See Constitutional Court
Law on Enterprises on Business	Russian civilization
Activity, 296–7	archaism as influence on, xix-xxi
Law on Land Reform, 296–7	bourgeois accumulation instinct and,
Law on Privatization of State and	xvii
Municipal Enterprises, 296–7	Huntington on role of authoritarian
Law on Property, 296–7	rule in, xvii–xviii
legal education in	Konchalovsky on role of culture in,
German influences on, 162–3	xvii
human rights and, 162	traditionalism and, xix
Western influences on, 155	Western influences on, xvii, xix
rrestern minuences on, 133	vv cocciii iiiiiuciiceo Oii, Avii, Aix



414 INDEX

Russian Federation. See also Russia legal positivism and, 169 foreign agents' law, 355, 357, 368 limits of concession in, 169 Law on Amendments to Legislative modernization of, 156, 170-1 Acts of the Russian Federation private property in regarding the Regulation of the under Alexander II, 296 Activities of Non-Profit after Bolshevik revolution, 296 Organizations Performing the state's rights to property as Functions of a Foreign Agent, superior to, 299-300 355, 357, 368 shared values in, 169-70 Law on International Treaties, 63 Socialist tradition for, 295-301, RF Constitution, 3-4 323 - 5ECHR and, 61-4 Soviet legal theory and, 162 international law as supreme to Strasbourg Court as influence on, national law under, 62, 202 123 Supreme Court of, 67-9, 166-7 Venice Commission and, 212–15 Russian language, Strasbourg Court Western legal scholarship as influenced by, 230-1 influence on, 159-60 Zorkin's response to, 170-3 Russian legal education. See legal education Russian Orthodox Church (ROC), 6 human rights doctrine of, 381-2 Russian legal system. See also property nativist ideology within, 379-82 rights authoritarianism in, 156-7 Putin and, 380 cultural capital and, 161 Russian Peoples Friendship University ECHR integration into, 202 (RUDN), 334-5 ECtHR and, 94-6 Russian Soviet Federative Socialist civil society as influence on, Republic (RSFSR) Constitution, 119 - 22incompatibility with, 212-15 Russophobia, 53, 55 legislative guidelines and recommendations, 102-3 Saari, Sinikukka, 198-9 political reactions to decisions, Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, 276, 112 - 15292 prescriptions to courts, 103-4 Sablina, Alina, 71-8, 81 Sablina, Elena, 75 recognition of unconstitutional Salgueiro de Silva Mouta case, 329 legal norms, 101 Russian CC and, integrating of Schalk and Kopf v. Austria, 330 judgments into, 97-106 Schennach, Stefan, 46-9 European law as influence on, 201 Schmitt, Carl, 366 exceptionalism of, 151-2, 154-64, scientific and technological progress, 395-9 first positivism in, 162-3, 167-70, secondment of lawyers and judges, 226 - 7foreign legal developments as seizure of Russian assets, in Belgium, influence on, 157-8 as heterogeneous, 152 Sejdić and Finci v. Bosnia and incompatibility with ECHR, 212–15 Herzegovina, 213-14 independent bar as part of, 201 serfdom, abolition of, 177 jury trial and, 201 Shamayev and 12 Others v. Russia, 204



INDEX 415

shock therapy policy, 297, 302-3, 369	Soviet legal theory, 162
Shor, Eran, 196	first positivism in, 162-3, 167-70, 185
Shtukaturov v. Russia, 144, 205	Vyshinski's dogmatization of, 162-3
Sikkink, Kathryn, 20-1	spiral model of human rights change,
on legal socialization, 194-5	20–1
S.L. v. Austria, 328	spiral model of socialization, 189,
Slavophile movement, 372-3	194–5
Smith, Adam, 201	challenges for, 196-7
Smith and Grady v. United Kingdom,	constructivist, 200-1
328	in Russia, 198-9
social activism, for LGBT rights, 331	spontaneous social orders, 178
social constructivism, 193-5	state debt
social progress, objective assessments	failure to redeem, 306-7
of, xviii	liability for, 317-19
Socialist legal tradition, 295-301,	state sovereignty
323-5	in Russia
socialization, as theoretical concept	ECHR compliance and, 360-1
ECtHR and, 385-6	ECtHR judgments and, 362-8
legal	human rights compared to,
academic development of, as	358–69
concept, 193–5	Zorkin on, 361-2
early applications of, 193-4	Schmitt on, 366
NGOs and, 199-200	Stepanov, Sergey, 94
Russia and, 193-201	Strasbourg Court. See also ECtHR
social constructivism and, 193-5	cases; European Court of
relevance of, 387-90	Human Rights
spiral model of, 189, 194-5	case law in, 235-44
challenges for, 196-7	for gender equality, 239-41
constructivist, 200-1	for parental leave in military,
in Russia, 198–9	240-1
socialization effects	for prison conditions, 235-6
as asymmetric process, 33-4	for prohibition of punishing an
conceptual development of, 197-8	individual twice for same
deep, 33	offence, 241–3
international context for, 19-24	for right to fair trial, 243-4
on international human rights law	for transparency as human rights
acculturation, 21-3	precondition, 236-9
ECtHR and, 19-24	Conflict Resolution Board, 233-4
material inducement, 21-2	constitutional law influenced by,
persuasion, 21	234–5
research on, 30-1	drafting of rules, 231
evaluation of, 32-3	ECHR and, 234-5
Solzhenitsyn, Aleksandr, 370-2	erga omnes effect of, 242-3
sovereign will, 186	European consensus on, 249
sovereignty. See state sovereignty	financial contributions to, 225
Soviet bonds, 306-7	as source of influence, 228-30
Harvest-90 commodity bonds,	international law as influence on,
306	234-5



416 INDEX

Strasbourg Court. (cont.)	territorial application of, expansion
judges in	of, 248
dialogue between, 233-5	Zolotuhkin case, 242-3
Russian, 225	Zorkin on, 223-4, 249
judicial leaders and, changing	Strasbourg effect, 4
attitudes of, 244–50	in Russia, 24
Kalashnikov case, 235-6	Sudre, Frédéric, 258
Katyn massacres case, 236-9	Sukhanov, Evgeniy, 295
Konstantin Markin v. Russia, 65,	Sultygov and Others v. Russia, 288-9
143-4, 206-7, 239-41, 377	Sundstrom, Lisa McIntosh, 199–200
margin of appreciation by member	Suppression of Terrorism Act (1998),
states, 248–9	Russia, 275, 310
Mikhaylova v. Russia, 66, 86-91,	Supreme Court of Russian Federation
243-4	(RF Supreme Court), 67–9
pilot judgments, 248-9	anti-gay propaganda laws and,
political leaders and, changing	339-44
attitudes of, 244–50	ECHR and, 166-7, 208-12
positive obligations of members, 248	ECtHR and, 68-9, 166-7, 208-12
prescriptions to courts on retrial,	Surkov, Vladimir, 363-4
103-4	sustainable development, social
registry of, 231-3	progress and, as integral feature
Russian CC influenced by, 14-15,	of, xviii
94–111, 223–4	SUTYAJNIK (NGO), 70-1
civil society as influence on,	Sweden, parapolitics in, 125-6
119–22	
in enforcement of judgments,	Tagayeva and Others v. Russia, 271
96–7	Tapp, June Louin, 193–4
integrating of judgments into legal	Tashukhadzhiyev v. Russia, 273-4,
system, 97–106	280
literal citations of cases and, 98-9	Timofeyev, Maxim, 215-16, 292
perception of provisions and,	Tiutchev, Fyodor, xvii, 182
99–100	Tolstoy, Leo, 12
reevaluation of, 117-19	Torshin, Alexander, 145
restriction and limitations of	torture of detainees, 261
constitutional rights, 104-6	Toumanov, Vladimir, 225
RF Constitution and, 106-8	Tovsultanova v. Russia, 280
Russian influence on, 9-10, 225-7	traditional governance models, 369-78
through filtering processes, 225-7	traditionalism, Russian civilization and,
through financial contributions,	xix
225, 228–30	transparency
judges, 225	judicial, 131–2
through secondment of lawyers	as precondition for human rights,
and judges, 226–7	236-9
sources of, 228-35	trials
Russian language as influence on,	by jury, 201
230-1	right to fair trial, 243-4
Russian legal system and, 123	Trochev, Alexei, 397-8



INDEX 417

Tsechoyev, Suleyman, 267–8 Tsechoyev v. Russia, 267–8 Turkey, "deep state" in, 125–6

UK. See United Kingdom Ukraine blackmail state in, 125-6 Orange Revolution in, 363, 368-9 ultra-formalism, 300-1 UN Human Rights Council, 357 unfair competition, Russian courts and, 155 unitary enterprises. See economic control rights United Kingdom (UK), ECtHR and dissatisfaction with, 13 prisoner voting rights cases, 35, 213 - 14United States (US) dual government regime in,

125-6

FARA, 159-60

Vaipan, Grigoriy, 215–16
Vajić, Nina, 281–3
Vallianatos v. Greece, 329
Venice Commission, 116, 120
Russian legal system and, 212–15
victimhood arguments, 373–4
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 67–8, 210
Vyshinski, Andrei, 162–3, 170
on state-centered positivism, 169

human rights law in, 13-14

use of force abuses, 268-72

Walters, Bob, 48–9
Western culture
international human rights law in
Russia influenced by, 23–4
Russian civilization influenced by,
xvii, xix
Russian legal education influenced
by, 155
Zorkin on, 151

Western legal scholarship, Russian legal system influenced by, 159–60 Westernizers. *See zapadniki* White Movement, 375 Wildhaber, Luzius, 130–1 will of the people, 162–3

Yukos Oil Company v. Russia, 139, 215–18, 320–3, 364–5 PACE response to, 216 Russian CC and, 217

zapadniki (Westernizers), 358-9

Zasulich, Vera, 201 Zolotuhkin case, 242-3 Zorkin, Valery, 17-18, 112, 128, 131, 135, 144, 192-3, 390 authoritarianism and, 156-7, 181, 192 - 3on collective rights, 157, 164 criticism of Russian judiciary, 136 debate with Lukyanova, 189, 220-1 on democratic interpretations of human rights, 179-80 on duties of lawyers, 179 on ECHR, 244-50 on ECtHR rulings, 244-50, 365 on foreign legal developments, 157-8 on freedom, 175 on globalization of legal systems, 173 on human rights law, 156 on individual human rights, 157 democratic interpretations of, 179 - 80foundational arguments against, obsolescence of, 185-6 liberalization of, 175-6 socialist conception of, 162 state endorsement of, 169 on judicial activism, 249 legal philosophy of, 173-86 holism of, 184-5 sovereign will in, 186 on LGBT rights, 347-8, 350-1 on NGOs, 179-80 philosophical influences on, 182-3



418

INDEX

Zorkin, Valery (cont.)
on postmodernism, 173, 180
on RF Constitution, 172
on Russian legal exceptionalism,
154–64
on Russian legal system, Western
influences on, 170–3
on Russian national identity, 177,
180

on Russian state sovereignty, 361–2 on Strasbourg Court, Russian involvement in, 223–4, 249 on unfair competition, 155 on Western culture, 151 Zvyagintsev, Andrey, 380 Zyuganov, Gennady, 374 on genocide, 374