

## Index

- Ackerman, Bruce, 119  
 acquittal, 130  
   Northern newspapers' coverage of  
     possibility of in 1866, 155  
   prosecution's fear of, 148, 237, 240, 292  
   white jurors' pressure to  
     acquit, 273–75  
*Advocate of Peace*, 116  
 African American jurors, 270–73  
*After Appomattox* (Downs), 178  
*Albany Law Journal*, 107  
*American Law Review*, 110  
 American nationhood (as created by Civil War), 2–5  
   effect of Davis case on, 155, 264  
 American Revolution. *See* Revolution  
 Amnesty Proclamation of 1865, 93–94  
 Amnesty Proclamation of 1868, 7, 292, 299–300, 308  
 amnesty, policy of, 262, 298  
*Amy Warwick* case, 227, 242, 245  
 anger toward Davis. *See also* public opinion  
   in 1865, 22–23  
   waning of over time, 153, 154, 309  
 Annesley, William, 81  
 appellate review of Davis case, 130, 167, 318  
 Appomattox, as final resolution of secession question, 3, 19, 63, 64, 86, 96, 100, 111, 178, 230, 301, 318, 326  
 Articles of Confederation (1781), 15–16  
 assassination of Lincoln, 20, 21, 26n.  
   16, 33, 34, 36, 72n. 24, 74, 75, 125, 138n. 2, 169, 176, 221, 256, 282  
   trial of conspirators, 20, 24, 34, 36, 46, 73, 75, 76, 122, 124, 138  
 Attorney General's Office, 47, 69, 122, 291  
 Bagley, Paul, 187  
 bail  
   bail hearings, 192  
   jumping bail, 285–87, 285n. 59  
   O'Connor's efforts to secure bail for Davis and, 73–74, 167–70, 187–89  
 Baker, Alpheus, 94  
 Baldwin, J., 26  
*Baltimore Gazette* (newspaper), 301  
 bar, New York, 43, 49, 304, 306, 307  
 Bates, Edward, 122, 209  
 Beach, S. Ferguson, 296–97  
 Beauregard, P.G.T., 95  
 belligerent status of rebellious groups under international law, 176, 206–8, 211–13, 219, 255, 264, 310, 312. *See also* Confederacy; international law; *Prize Cases* (1863)  
 Bello, Andres, 262  
 Bennett, James Gordon, 190n. 19, 285n. 58  
   *New York Herald* and, 153, 285n. 58  
 Bishop, Joel P., 146–47

- Black, Jeremiah, 27, 28, 29, 69, 75,  
 77–78, 99, 227, 242, 248, 282
- Blackstone, William, 90–91
- Blair, William, 216
- Blanc, Louis, 24
- Bledsoe, Albert, 102–3, 160–61
- bluff, O'Connor's strategy of, 63–64,  
 69–73, 81, 300–4
- Bluntschli, Johann Kaspar, 263–64
- Boston Daily Advertiser* (newspaper), 24,  
 243, 248, 308
- Botts, John Minor, 273
- Boutwell, George, 264, 278–80
- Brady, James, 29–30, 168
- Bristow, B.H., 124
- Brooks, Albert R., 272–73
- Brown, George William, 196–97
- Browning, Orville H., 292
- Brownson, Orestes, 114–15
- Burr, C. Chauncey, 101–2
- Burr's case*, 138–40, 142
- Coombs's interpretation of, 143–44
- Butler, Benjamin, 47–48, 292–93
- Bynkershoek, Cornelis von, 206
- Calvin's Case*, 174
- Campbell, John A., 67
- Campbell, Lewis D., 202
- Catholicism, 22, 49, 55, 58, 59,  
 306, 307
- Centz, P.C. *See* Sage, B.J.
- certification, for Supreme Court review,  
 7, 130, 299
- Chambers' Edinburgh Journal*, 88
- Chandler, Lucius, 38
- frustration with lack of definite trial  
     policy of, 152
- incompetence in preparing new  
     indictment in 1867, 232–38
- Judge Underwood's suspicion of  
     Confederate sympathies of, 185
- Charleston Courier* (newspaper), 309
- Charleston Mercury* (newspaper), 192
- Chase, Salmon P., 130, 163
- avoidance of Davis case by, 192–204
- Bradley Johnson's case and, 195–96
- Confederate belligerency in *US v.*  
     *Greathouse* (1863) and, 216–17
- George William Brown's criticism  
     of, 196–97
- invocation of Roger Taney by, 196–97
- newspaper coverage of evasiveness in  
     Davis case, 202
- radicalism of as advantage to Davis  
     defense, 180–81
- Shortridge v. Macon* and, 217–24
- unpredictable views of on Confederate  
     belligerency, 81
- unworkability of 1866 indictment due  
     to absence of, 167
- Welles's criticism of for lack  
     of involvement in Davis  
     prosecution, 194
- Chase, Samuel, 140
- Chase's Reports* (Johnson), 309–11
- Chicago Tribune* (newspaper), 82,  
 100, 155
- on Underwood, 187
- Christian Recorder* (newspaper), 192
- Cincinnati Commercial*  
 (newspaper), 203
- Civil War. *See also* trial by battle
- assumption of settling the question  
     of secession's constitutionality  
     after, 2–4
- functionalist vs. formalist views of law  
     post-Civil War, 252–53
- importance of name of, 254n. 34
- Lincoln's use of international law  
     during, 209–10
- links between Revolution and, 11, 17,  
     162, 221, 261, 317, 323
- non-resolution of secession's  
     constitutionality by, 5
- O'Connor's view of the erosion of legal  
     system by, 85, 98
- scale of death in, 10, 65, 90, 119, 325
- class prejudice and distinctions, 52, 56,  
 93, 175, 304–6
- Clay, Clement, 96, 176
- Davis's letters to, 66
- Clifford, John. *See also* Davis
- prosecution, by year
- appointment to Davis  
     prosecution of, 38
- request for release from Davis  
     prosecution by, 149–50
- slow progress in Davis prosecution  
     by, 127–28
- Stanbery's release of from Davis  
     prosecution, 150
- Coffey, T.J., 247

## Index

335

- Commentaries on the Laws of England* (Blackstone), 90
- Confederacy  
   dual status of, 212, 247, 252, 260
- Confederates  
   Amnesty Proclamation of 1865 and, 93–94  
   Chase's unpredictable views on Confederate belligerency and, 81  
   Confederate belligerency as exemption from treason prosecution, 80  
   Confederate belligerency in *Prize Cases* (1863) and, 79, 211–13  
   Confederate belligerency in the case of the *Savannah* (1861) and, 210–11  
   Confederate belligerency in *US v. Greathouse* (1863) and, 216–17  
   Evarts on belligerency and treason convictions and, 253  
   international vs. domestic law as applied to, 208–9  
   Lawrence on Confederate belligerency as precluding treason prosecutions and, 261–62  
   pro-Confederate sympathizers in New York and, 61  
   Stevens on Confederate belligerency as precluding treason prosecutions and, 176  
   Underwood's willingness to try for treason, 184–85  
   view of trial by battle by former, 86, 92–98, 100–1
- Confiscation Act (Treason Act) of 1862, 133, 183–84, 216, 267, 284
- Congress  
   desire to try Davis before Supreme Court due to secession question and, 129  
   discussions of Davis's case in, 6, 129–30, 132–36, 137, 169, 231, 278, 298  
   displeasure of trial delays in 1865 by, 129  
   statute of limitations and Crimes Act of 1790, 133–34  
   conquered provinces theory of Reconstruction, 9, 175  
   *Johnson v. McIntosh* and, 174–75  
   Stevens and, 105–6, 173–74, 176, 177
- Constitutional View of the Late War Between the States*, A (Stephens), 101
- constructive presence, 139, 142, 144, 145, 178  
   *Burr's case* and, 138–40  
   O'Connor's rejection of for use by defense, 145–46  
   Speed's rejection of, 138
- Cook, Fields, 272, 274
- Coombs, J.J., 143–44
- Cooper, William, 12n. 24, 72n. 24, 288n. 68
- Copperheads, 26, 31, 60, 61, 101, 165, 243, 249, 259
- Coski, John, 254n. 34
- Cox, Joseph, 272
- Crimes Act of 1790, 133–34
- Currie, David P., 325
- Curry, Jabez L. M., 102
- Curtis, George Ticknor, 113–14
- Dana, Richard Henry, 8. *See also* Davis prosecution, by year  
   at Harvard College and Harvard Law School, 227–29  
   attempt to hold trial in West Virginia by, 231–32  
   correspondence with Robert Grier, 246–47  
   disdain for Irish-Americans of, 304–6  
   family background of, 227  
   Grasp of War speech and secession's illegality, 229–30  
   inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5  
   joins Davis prosecution team of in 1867, 225  
   legal community's approval of *Prize Cases* pamphlet of, 246–48  
   legal expertise of, 225–27  
   letter stating objections to Davis trial by, 238–41  
   on *Prize Cases*' establishment of illegality of secession, 239–40  
   pamphlet of on Lawrence's view of the *Prize Cases*, 243–44  
   personal ambition of, 229  
   rewriting of Lawrence's Wheaton treatise on international law, 249–51  
   *Two Years Before the Mast* of, 228

- Davis and Lee, a Protest against the Attempt of the Yankee Radicals to Have Them and the Other Confederate Chiefs Murdered* (Sage, aka Centz), 159
- Davis prosecution (1865)
- appointment of Evarts and Clifford to Davis prosecution team, 38
  - Congress's displeasure of trial delays and, 129
  - Congress's determination to try and convict and, 129
  - Evarts and Clifford's slow progress in, 127–28
  - political riskiness of delays for Johnson and, 125
  - problem of possible appeal reaching Supreme Court, 130–31
- Davis prosecution (1866)
- Chief Justice Chase's absence, 167
  - Clifford's request for release from, 149–50
  - indictment of 1866 and, 164–65
  - Judge Underwood's desire to pack pro-Union jury in Virginia and, 186
  - Judge Underwood's willingness of to try Confederates for treason and, 184–85
  - newspaper coverage of Davis prosecution in Southern papers, 156–57
  - Northern newspaper coverage on delays by, 153–54
  - Northern newspaper coverage on possibility of acquittal in and, 155
  - poor quality of indictment and, 166
  - pro-Davis propaganda pieces and, 157–61
  - Speed's decision not to try case in Washington, D.C., 140–41
  - Speed's decision to try Davis in civil court rather than in military tribunal, 137–38
- Davis prosecution (1867)
- African American grand jurors and, 270–73
  - Chandler's incompetence in preparing new indictment and, 232–38
  - Dana as replacement for Clifford and, 225
  - Evarts and Dana's inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5
  - indictment of 1868 and, 266–67
  - Lee as witness before the grand jury, 269–70
  - prominent grand jury witnesses, 267–68
  - Stanbery's desire for minimal involvement in, 150–52
  - white grand jurors and, 273–75
- Davis prosecution (1868)
- African American jurors and, 270–73
  - anti-climactic end to, 308
  - Dana's letter stating objections to Davis trial, 238–41
  - desire to delay until end of impeachment trial and, 281–82
  - discussion of going public with objections to trying Davis, 292–93
  - effect of Evarts's role in Johnson impeachment trial on, 276–78
  - Evarts and Dana's inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5
  - Evarts's inattention to Davis case, 307–8
  - Johnson's amnesty proclamation freeing Davis from prosecution and, 300
  - Judiciary Committee's investigation of, 280–81
  - letter to President recommending abandonment of trial, 291–92
  - reaction to Davis defense motion on Fourteenth Amendment, 294–300
  - white jurors and, 273–75
- Davis trial location (venue), 6, 143, 178
- Bishop on, 146–47
  - Burr's case* and, 138–40
  - Dana's plan to hold trial in West Virginia, 231–32
  - Speed's decision not to try case in Washington, D.C., 140–41
  - worry over secession question in hands of Virginia jurors and, 146–49
- Davis, Garrett, 148
- Davis, Henry Winter, 247
- Davis, Jefferson

## Index

337

- arrest of, 1865, 20
- case of as precedent, 311
- desire for trial to vindicate
  - Confederate cause and validate secession, 65
- determination of to be martyr for secession of, 66–68
- gratitude toward O'Connor of, 68
- historians' assessment of military leadership of, 269
- imprisonment at Fort Monroe, 170
- Johnson's decision to prosecute for treason in 1865, 33–38
- letters to Clement Clay, 66
- mixed review of *The Prison Life* by, 158
- pandemonium upon release of, 189
- poor health at Fort Monroe, 73–74, 168
- public calls for compassion for, 23–24
- public calls for vengeance on, 22–23
- purported involvement in Lincoln assassination of, 169
- refusal to accept a pardon by, 65–66
- Stevens attempted alliance with in 1866, 172
- Davis, Varina, 29–30, 53, 64, 66, 67–68, 74, 76, 90, 124, 188, 275, 282, 287
- contacts lawyers on Davis's behalf, 27
- Davis's defense strategies (1865)
  - delaying of prosecution, 124–25
  - O'Connor's communication with Johnson on use of secession question in defense, 78–79
  - O'Connor's efforts to avoid military trial for Davis, 74–78
  - O'Connor's Johnson administration's cautiousness as, 69–73
  - O'Connor's efforts to secure bail for Davis and, 73–74
  - public discussion of Davis case as aid to, 81
  - strategy of negotiation and misdirection with Davis's prosecutors, 83
- Davis's defense strategies (1866)
  - O'Connor's rejection of use of constructive presence and, 145–46
  - O'Connor's request to move Davis from Fort Monroe 170
  - O'Connor's strategy of avoidance and delay and, 170
  - rejection of bail request by Judge Underwood, 167–70
  - swaying of public opinion by northern allies of Davis and, 161–64
- Davis's defense strategies (1867)
  - efforts to release on bail under Judge Underwood, 187–89
  - Evarts and Dana's inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5
- Davis's defense strategies (1868), 290
  - Chase's recommendation of use of Fourteenth amendment and, 293–96
  - Evarts and Dana's inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5
  - Johnson's amnesty proclamation eliminating threat of prosecution and, 300
  - O'Connor's trip to Washington to postpone prosecution, 287–89
  - O'Connor's secret plan for Davis to forfeit bail and not appear at trial, 285–87
- De Jure Belli ac Pacis (On the Law of War and Peace*, Grotius), 206
- death penalty, 133–34
- death, scale of in Civil War, 10, 65, 90, 119, 325
- deception, as trial strategy, 63–64, 300–4
- Declaration of Paris, 211 n. 20
- delay, 281–82, 303–5
- disloyalty
  - in the North, 61
  - in the South, 32
- doctrine, importance of, 252, 253
- Doolittle Bill, 131–32
- Doolittle, James, 131–32, 179–80
- Douglass, Frederick, 156
- Downs, Gregory, 178
- Dred Scott v. Sandford*, 15 n. 28, 18 n. 37, 44, 44 n. 14, 97 n. 31, 155
- dual status of Confederacy, 212, 247, 252, 260. *See also* Confederacy; mixed status of the Civil War
- Early, Jubal A., 101
- Eckert, Edward, 157
- Elements of International Law* (Wheaton), 88, 208, 227, 261
- competing versions of, 249–51

- England  
     historical use of trial by battle by, 87–88  
     treason and the English monarchs, 265
- ethics  
     judicial, 295n. 16  
     legal, 204, 286n. 62
- Evarts, William, 8. *See also* Davis  
     prosecution, by year  
     acceptance of retainer to prosecute  
         Davis by, 47–49  
     appointment to Davis  
         prosecution of, 38  
     as moderate Republican, 43  
     as new U.S. Attorney General in  
         1868, 290  
     at Harvard Law School, 42  
     at Yale, 42  
     inability to recognize O'Connor's  
         strategy of deception, 303–5  
     inattention to Davis case of, 307–8  
     *Lemmon v. New York* and, 44–45  
     letter to Johnson recommending  
         abandonment of Davis  
         prosecution, 291–92  
     on recognition of belligerency as  
         preventing treason prosecutions, 253  
     prominence of as lawyer, 39, 40  
     prominent political family of, 42  
     pro-Union and anti-slavery cases  
         tried by, 40  
     respect for O'Connor, 40, 306–7  
     role in Johnson impeachment  
         trial and its impact on Davis  
         prosecution, 276–78  
     *Savannah* (1861) case and, 45–46  
     slow progress in Davis prosecution  
         by, 127–28  
     Stanbery's desire for minimal  
         involvement in Davis prosecution  
         and, 150–52  
     work with O'Connor, 39–40
- Ex parte Bollman and Swartwout*, 140
- Ex parte Merryman*, 197
- Ex parte Milligan*, 78, 167
- Ex Parte Vallandigham*, 31
- Faust, Drew, 119
- fees, lawyers', 30, 51n. 31
- Fessenden, William Pitt, 156
- Field, Stephen, 216–17
- Fisher, Sidney George, 211
- forgetting, of Davis case, 325–26
- forgiveness and mercy, 22, 23–24, 153,  
     156, 162, 221, 257
- Forrest divorce case, 50
- Forrest, Edwin, 51
- Fort Monroe  
     Davis's treatment at, 21, 73–74, 168  
     Davis's imprisonment at, 170  
     Davis's release from, 280
- Fourteenth Amendment, 294–300
- ratification of, 62n. 73
- fragility of national experiment, 11, 64,  
     114, 301
- Fries's Case*, 140
- Fugitive Slave Act (1850), 145,  
     179, 202
- Garfield, James, 111–12
- Garibaldi, Giuseppe, 23
- Garrett, John W., 188
- General Orders No. 100 (Lieber), 254,  
     257, 258, 260, 263
- Georgia v. Stanton* (1867), 99
- Georgia Weekly Telegraph*  
     (newspaper), 192
- Glenn, William Wilkins, 301–2
- Grant, Ulysses S., 100
- Grasp of war theory, 229–30
- Greeley, Horace, 29, 62, 124, 288  
     as Republican supporter of  
         Davis, 162–63
- Greenleaf, Simon, 144–45
- Grier, Robert, 145  
     correspondence with Richard Henry  
         Dana, 246–47  
     dissent in *Texas v. White*,  
         103–6, 318  
     on trial by battle in *Prize Cases*  
         (1863), 103
- Grotius, Hugo, 206
- Gunther, Godfrey, 61
- Haldeman, Richard, 176
- Halleck, Henry, 126
- Halpine, Charles G., 157–58
- Harvard Law School, 42, 89, 113, 145,  
     227, 228
- Higginbotham, Evelyn Brooks, 273
- Hillyer, Giles M., 145–46
- Holmes, Oliver Wendell Jr., 114, 119
- Howard, Jacob, 129, 143

## Index

339

- Hurd, John Codman, 1–2,  
 117–18, 322–24  
 Hyman, Harold, 201
- impeachment and trial of Andrew  
 Johnson, 276–78, 281–84, 287–89.  
*See also* Johnson, Andrew  
 Boutwell on, 278–80  
 incompetence, prosectorial, 232–38,  
 303–5, 307–8. *See also* Davis  
 prosecution, by year  
 indictment of 1866, 164–65  
 unworkability of due to absence of  
 Chief Justice Chase, 167  
 indictment of 1868, 266–67  
 allowance for the death penalty under  
 Crimes Act of 1790, 133–34  
 Lee, Robert E. as grand jury witness,  
 269–70  
 O'Connor's worry over, 282–84  
 prominent witnesses'  
 testimony, 267–68  
 international law  
 as traditionally not reaching within  
 states, 205  
 belligerent status of rebellious groups  
 under, 206–8  
 cognizance of internal conflicts in the  
 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> centuries, 206  
 Lincoln's use of during Civil War, 209–10  
 vs. domestic law in the *Prize*  
*Cases*, 208–9  
 Irish Rebellion of 1798, 58  
 Irish-Americans  
 Dana's disdain for, 304–6  
 O'Connor's pro-Irish stance of as  
 pro-Southern sensibility, 56–60  
 ironclad oath, 6, 148, 240, 271  
*Is Davis a Traitor? or Was Secession a*  
*Constitutional Right Previous to the*  
*War of 1861?* (Bledsoe), 160–61  
*Ivanhoe* (Scott), 90
- Jenkins, Charles, 99  
 Johnson, Andrew. *See also* impeachment  
 and trial of Andrew Johnson  
 Amnesty Proclamation of 1865 for  
 former Confederates and, 93–94  
 Boutwell on impeachment of, 278–80  
 calls from public for vengeance on  
 Davis and, 22–23  
 decision to prosecute Davis for treason  
 in 1865, 33–38  
 Evarts role in impeachment trial  
 of, 276–78  
 political riskiness of delayed  
 prosecution for, 125  
 public calls for compassion for Davis  
 and, 23–24  
 waning political power of in 1867, 266  
 Johnson, Bradley, 195–96, 309–11  
 Johnson, Reverdy, 28  
 Joint Committee on Reconstruction, 106,  
 186, 264  
 Judicial Circuits Act, July 1866,  
 198, 199  
 Judiciary Act of 1789, 231  
 Judiciary Committee  
 investigation of Davis prosecution  
 by, 280–81  
 jumping bail, 285–87, 285n. 59  
 juries and jurors, 6  
 African American jurors in grand jury  
 of 1867 and 1868, 270–73  
 ironclad loyalty oath to U.S.  
 requirement for, 6, 148, 240, 271  
 Judge Underwood's desire to pack  
 pro-Union jury in Virginia and, 186  
 O'Connor's objection to  
 mixed-race, 275–76  
 uncertainty of jury trial as worry, 81  
 white jurors in grand jury of 1867 and  
 1868, 273–75  
 jurisdiction, 34, 46, 130, 142, 144, 164,  
 167, 199, 201, 232  
 appellate, 167  
 civil vs. military, 77  
*Texas v. White* and original, 313–16
- Kansas-Nebraska Act, 116  
*Keith v. Clark*, 322  
 Kramer, Larry, 119
- lack of attention to Davis case, in modern  
 era, 325–26  
 law and legal thought, in 19th century,  
*see also* international law; secession's  
 constitutionality; trial by battle  
 functionalism vs. formalism in post-  
 Civil War, 252–53  
*Law Magazine*, 25  
 law of nations. *See* international law

- law of war, 26, 33, 35, 36, 71, 74, 76, 80,  
 138, 147, 176, 205, 206, 207, 208,  
 210, 212, 219, 220, 221, 242, 244,  
 245, 254, 257, 258, 262, 263, 265
- Lawrence, William Beach, 134–36,  
 242–43, 261–62
- lawsuit against Dana for purported  
 plagiarism of Wheaton  
 treatise, 249–51
- reaction of to Dana's *Prize Cases*  
 pamphlet, 248–49
- lawyering, 8, 62n. 73. *See also* bluff,  
 O'Connor's strategy of; Davis's  
 defense strategies, by year; Davis  
 prosecution, by year; deception,  
 as trial strategy; incompetence,  
 prosectorial; misdirection, as  
 lawyering strategy
- Lea, Henry Charles, 107, 108–11
- Lee, Robert E., 119, 264  
 as witness in indictment of  
 1868, 269–70
- legal doctrine, 72n. 24, 251n. 25,  
 252, 253
- legal profession in the United States, 27,  
 47, 90, 107, 108, 110  
 in New York, 39, 40, 43, 49, 51,  
 60, 307
- legal realism, 12, 217
- Lemmon v. New York* (1860), 40  
 Evarts's argument in, 44–45  
 O'Connor and, 54–55
- levying war, 139–41, 214–16
- Lieber, Francis, 1–2, 123  
 criticism on delay of trial by, 125–26  
 views on treason and Confederate  
 belligerency, 254–61
- Lincoln, Abraham, 13, 17–18  
 assassination of, 20, 21, 26n. 16, 33,  
 34, 36, 72n. 24, 74, 75, 125, 138n.  
 2, 169, 176, 221, 256, 282
- Davis's purported involvement in  
 assassination of, 169
- First Inaugural Address, 17, 316
- trial of conspirators for assassination,  
 20, 24, 36, 46, 73, 75, 76, 122,  
 124, 138
- use of international law during Civil  
 War and, 209–10
- views on Davis's escape, 32
- views on perpetual Union, 17
- Longstreet, James, 97–98
- Lost Cause ideology, 7n. 15, 68, 68n. 14,  
 95, 101, 158, 300
- Lowry, Robert, 145–46
- Lyons, James, 32
- Mallory, Stephen R., 94
- Marbury v. Madison*, 130
- Married Women's Property Act, 52
- Marshall, John  
*Burr's case* and, 138–40  
 conquered territory in *Johnson v.*  
*McIntosh* and, 174–75
- McCulloch, Hugh, 264
- McPherson, James, 3
- McVeigh, William, 183–84
- medievalism, 89–90, 107–8. *See also*  
 trial by battle
- memory of the Davis case,  
 national, 325–26
- Middle Ages, 265n. 66
- Military Reconstruction, 9, 99, 179, 313,  
 314, 318, 319
- military tribunal  
 Bates' opposition to, 122  
 Bishop's recommendation for, 146–47  
 O'Connor's efforts to avoid, 74–78  
 Speed's opposition to conducting  
 Davis's trial by, 6, 121–22  
 Stanton's opposition to, 142  
 suggestions to Johnson for Davis's  
 prosecution, 26–27
- misdirection, as lawyering strategy, 83,  
 287n. 63, 302, 307
- mixed status of the Civil War,  
 209–10, 250
- Moncure, Richard, 107
- Morgan, Edwin D., 26
- Morton, Oliver, 125
- name, of Civil War, importance of,  
 254n. 34
- Napton, William B., 99
- Nashua, Elijah, 25
- Natchez Courier* (newspaper), 156, 202
- Nation, The* (newspaper)  
 accuses Johnson of purposely delaying  
 Davis prosecution, 154  
 on Underwood, 186
- nationalism, American, 2, 322–24
- Neff, Stephen, 252



## Index

341

- New Orleans Crescent* (newspaper), 157, 202
- New York
- disloyalty in, 26, 61
  - New York bar, 43, 49, 304, 306, 307
  - New York Daily News*, 165
  - New York Freeman's Journal and Catholic Register*, 22
  - New York Herald* (newspaper), 82, 129, 285n. 58
  - criticisms of Chase in, 203
  - criticisms of delays in Davis prosecution in, 153
  - New York Times*, 25
  - unflattering bio of O'Connor in, 63
  - New York World* (newspaper), 155, 203, 308
  - criticism of delay in Davis prosecution in, 154
  - newspaper coverage of Davis case. *See under* public opinion
  - Nichols, Roy, 12, 64n. 2
  - No Treason* (Spoonier), 116
  - Northrop, Lucius B., 95
- O'Connor, Thomas, 57, 57n. 53, 58, 58n. 57
- spelling of name, 57n. 53
- O'Connor, Charles, 8. *See also* Davis's defense strategies, by year
- appointment as leader of Davis defense team, 27
  - as self-taught lawyer, 49
  - B.J. Sage on constitutionality of secession and, 158–60
  - communication with Johnson on use of secession question in defense, 78–79
  - Davis's gratitude towards, 68
  - disaffection with war of, 84–85
  - efforts to avoid military trial for Davis, 74–78
  - efforts to secure bail for Davis, 73–74
  - establishment of Davis's defense team by, 29–32
  - Evarts and Dana's inability to recognize O'Connor's strategy of deception, 303–5
  - Evarts's respect for, 306–7
  - fear for Davis's life of, 73
  - Forrest divorce case and, 50
  - hidden motives in Davis defense, 63–64, 68–69, 300–4
  - impoverished upbringing of, 49
  - Johnson's amnesty proclamation eliminating threat of prosecution and, 300
  - jubilance upon Davis's release, 191
  - Lemmon v. New York* (1860) and, 54–55
  - objection to mixed-raced jury by, 275–76
  - on *Prize Cases*' invalidation of treason prosecution, 212–13
  - on Treason Clause, 214–16
  - on trial by battle as resolution of secession question, 84, 85
  - opinion of Civil War's erosion of legal system of, 85, 98
  - opposition to Married Women's Property Act, 52
  - personal characteristics of, 52–53
  - pro-Davis propaganda pieces commissioned by, 157–61
  - pro-Irish stance and pro-Southern sensibility of, 56–60
  - prominence of as lawyer, 39, 49
  - pro-slavery views of, 53–56
  - recruitment of James Brady by, 29–30
  - refusal of compensation for Davis defense by, 62
  - respect for Evarts, 40
  - secret plan for Davis to forfeit bail and not appear at trial of, 285–87
  - strategy to delay prosecution by, 124–25
  - trip to Washington to postpone prosecution, 287–89
  - unflattering bio of in *New York Times*, 63
  - use of cautiousness of Johnson administrations as defense strategy, 69–73
  - use of William Whiting's book in planning of defense strategy, 70
  - work with Evarts, 39–40
  - worry over indictment of 1868 of, 282–84
  - worry over Johnson's impeachment's effect on Davis, 282–84
  - oath, ironclad, 6, 148, 240, 271

- Old Guard, The*, 101  
 ordeal, as legal concept, 87  
 Ould, Robert, 32
- pardons  
   Davis's refusal to accept, 65–66  
   general idea of, 24, 93  
   of Robert E. Lee, 65  
 Parsons, W.A., 274–75  
 perpetual Union, idea of, 17, 24, 28, 118  
*Philadelphia Christian Recorder*, 117  
*Philadelphia Inquirer* (newspaper), 25, 82, 155  
 Phillips, Philip, 32  
 popular constitutionalism, 10, 100, 119  
 precedent, Davis's case as, 311  
*Prison Life of Jefferson Davis, The* (Halpine), 157–58, 293  
*Prize Cases* (1863), 41, 79, 80  
   Confederate belligerent status and, 211–13  
   Dana's involvement in, 225–27  
   Dana's pamphlet on Lawrence's mis-statements on pro-secession implications of, 243–44  
   Lawrence on, 242–43  
   Lawrence's reaction to Dana's pamphlet on, 248–49  
   legal community's approval of Dana's *Prize Cases* pamphlet, 246–48  
   O'Connor's opinion on invalidation of treason prosecutions due to, 212–13  
   Richard Henry Dana on, 239–40  
   trial by battle and, 103–6  
 prize, law of, 227, 244, 246  
 public opinion  
   importance of, for strategy in Davis's case, 157–64  
   newspaper coverage of Davis case as test case for secession's constitutionality, 24–25  
   newspaper coverage of Davis prosecution in Northern papers in 1866, 153–56  
   newspaper coverage of Davis prosecution in Southern papers in 1866, 156–57  
   Northern newspapers' confidence about securing Davis's conviction in 1865, 82  
   Northern newspapers' coverage of delays in the Davis prosecution, 153–54  
   Northern newspapers' coverage of possibility of acquittal in Davis prosecution, 155  
   Northern newspapers' coverage of the end of Davis case, 308–9  
   on Judge Underwood, 186  
   on *Texas v. White*, 318–21  
   pro-Davis propaganda pieces commissioned by O'Connor and, 157–61  
   public calls for compassion for Davis, 23–24  
   public calls for vengeance on Davis, 22–23  
   Southern newspapers' coverage of the end of Davis case, 309  
   swaying of by Davis's northern allies, 161–64  
 Pugh, George, 31
- racism, 13, 14, 54, 68n. 14, 86n. 6, 175, 230n. 12, 275  
 Radical Reconstruction, 9, 10, 177, 178, 184  
   secession question as furthering cause of, 172  
 Reagan, John H., 96–97  
 Rebellion of 1798 (Ireland), 58  
 Reconstruction, 2, 9, 197. *See also* conquered provinces theory of Reconstruction; Radical Reconstruction  
 Amnesty Proclamation of 1865 for former Confederates and, 93–94  
 federal control over southern states and, 173  
 Joint Committee on Reconstruction, 106, 186, 264  
 links with secession, 105–6  
 Military Reconstruction, 9, 99, 179, 313, 314, 318, 319  
 theoretical basis of, 9, 10, 178, 180, 229  
 Redfield, Issac, 112–13  
 Reed, William B., 30, 177  
 Reid, John Phillip, 251  
*Republic of Republics, The* (Sage), 159  
 Revolution, links between Civil War and, 11, 17, 162, 221, 261, 317, 323

## Index

343

- Richmond Dispatch* (newspaper),  
 166, 178  
 Riquelme, Antonio, 261  
 Root, J.M., 124  
 rule of law, 5–6, 10, 59, 62, 85, 86, 87,  
 92, 98, 99, 108, 120, 122–24, 125,  
 129, 135, 136, 141, 171, 301, 323  
 Sage, B.J., 32, 158–60  
*San Francisco Elevator* (newspaper), 60  
*Savannah* (1861), 40, 253  
 Confederate belligerency and, 210–11  
 Evarts's trying of, 45–46  
 Scott, Sir Walter, 90  
*Search for Order, The* (Wiebe), 4  
 secession's constitutionality. *See also*  
*Prize Cases* (1863); trial by battle  
 and Articles of Confederation  
 (1781), 15–16  
 B.J. Sage and, 158–60  
 belief in danger of letting juries  
 decide, 151  
 Civil War's lack of resolution of, 5  
 Congress's desire to facilitate appeal  
 of Davis case to Supreme Court  
 and, 129  
 Curtis on, 113–14  
 Dana's rewriting of Wheaton treatise  
 on international law and, 249–51  
 Davis case as test of, 5, 8, 24–25, 38,  
 81–83, 129  
 Doolittle Bill and, 131–32  
 Garfield's belief in continued  
 Confederate pro-secession ideology  
 and, 111–12  
 Holmes on, 114  
 instrumental use of in Davis case, 63–64,  
 68–69, 78–79, 158, 159, 300–4  
 links to slavery and racism, 86n. 6  
 O'Connor's instrumental use of  
 in Davis's defense, 63–64,  
 68–69, 300–4  
 Radical Reconstruction agenda  
 and, 172  
 Redfield on, 112–13  
 Richard Henry Dana's Grasp of War  
 speech and, 229–30  
*Texas v. White* (1869) and, 313–25  
 view of historians as being resolved by  
 the Civil War, 2–4  
 Second Confiscation Act, 216  
 Judge Underwood's self-dealing  
 via, 183–84  
 Seward, William, 71–72  
 prewar friendship with Davis, 72n. 24  
 recommendation of Evarts by, 47  
 Shea, George, 29, 61, 61n. 70, 69n. 18,  
 78–79, 81, 222, 294  
 memorial (petition) of Davis's  
 Northern supporters and, 161–62  
 Sherman, General William T., 100  
*Shorthridge v. Macon*, 217–24, 310  
 Sinclair, Catherine, and Forrest divorce  
 case, 50  
 slavery, relation to secession, 86n. 6  
*Lemmon* case and, 40, 45  
 Smith, Gerrit, 29, 161, 176,  
 219–22, 258–60  
 as Republican supporter of Davis,  
 162, 163  
 social pressure, on jurors to acquit  
 Davis, 273–75  
 South Carolina, 18  
*Southern Review*, 102–3  
 Speed, James. *See also* Davis prosecution,  
 by year  
 Bates's opposition to military tribunal  
 and, 122  
 belief in Davis's guilt in committing  
 treason and, 122  
 caution of in prosecuting Davis, 121,  
 122, 123, 125–27  
 choice of Evarts and Clifford  
 and, 47–49  
 decision to prosecute Davis in  
 a civil rather than military  
 trial, 137–38  
 desire to adhere to rule of law, 6, 120,  
 122–24, 141  
 Lieber's criticism of delay of trial  
 and, 125–26  
 official opinion on Davis case in  
 January 1866 by, 137  
 opposition to military tribunal of, 6,  
 121–22, 123  
 rejection of constructive presence  
 by, 138  
 resignation as attorney general, 149  
 speedy trial, right to under Sixth  
 Amendment, 161, 168  
 Spooner, Lysander, 115–16  
 Sprague, Peleg, 245

- Stanbery, Henry  
   desire for minimal involvement in  
     Davis prosecution, 150–52  
   replaces James Speed as attorney  
     general, 149
- Stanton, Edward, 142–43
- statute of limitations, 80n. 46, 135n. 39,  
   266, 267, 283n. 53  
   tolling of, 133–34, 267n. 3
- Stephens, Alexander H., 100–1
- Stevens, Thaddeus, 9  
   attempted alliance with Davis in  
     1866, 172  
   conquered provinces theory of  
     Reconstruction and, 105–6,  
     173–74, 176, 177  
   on Confederate belligerency as  
     precluding treason prosecutions, 176  
   on trial by battle, 105–6
- Story, Joseph, 17
- strategy, lawyering, 8, 62n. 73. *See also*  
   bluff, O'Connor's strategy of; Davis's  
   defense strategies, by year; Davis  
   prosecution, by year; deception,  
   as trial strategy; incompetence,  
   prosectorial; misdirection, as  
   lawyering strategy
- Strong, George Templeton, 2, 60
- Sumner, Charles, 89, 116
- Superstition and Force* (Lea), 107
- Supreme Court, appeals to, 26, 45, 48,  
   48n. 25, 130–31  
   in *Prize Cases*, 239, 243, 245, 249,  
   250, 253, 254  
   in *Texas v. White*, 7, 13, 104n. 52,  
   311, 313–14
- Surratt, John, 75, 76, 171n. 51, 282
- Surratt, Mary, 75, 76, 76n. 34,  
   171n. 51
- Taney, Roger, 130, 196–97
- Texas v. White* (1869), 8, 13, 313–25  
   jurisdiction and, 313–16  
   newspaper coverage of, 318–21  
   Robert Grier's dissent in, 103–6, 318  
   trial by battle and, 103–6
- Theory of Our National Existence*, *The*  
   (Hurd), 117–18, 322
- Tiffany, S.A., 277
- Tomlins, Christopher, 5
- Treason Act (Confiscation Act) of 1862,  
   133, 183–84, 216, 267, 284
- treason and treason convictions, 29
- Bluntschli on in aftermath of a  
   rebellion, 263–64
- Bradley Johnson's case and, 195–96
- Burr's case* and, 138–40
- Confederate belligerency in *US v.*  
   *Greathouse* (1863) and, 216–17
- Crimes Act of 1790, 133–34
- Evarts on belligerency and, 253
- Johnson's (Bradley) editing of *Chase's*  
   *Reports* and, 309–11
- Johnson's decision to prosecute Davis  
   for in 1865, 33–38
- lack of as proof of legality of  
   Confederate war effort, 265
- Lawrence on Confederate belligerency  
   as precluding, 261–62
- Lawrence's bill eliminating the  
   limitations period for federal  
   crimes, 134–36
- levying war requirement in,  
   139–41, 214–16
- Lieber on Confederate belligerency  
   and, 254–61
- Speed's desire for maintenance of rule  
   of law in prosecuting, 122–24
- statute of limitations and,  
   Stevens on Confederate belligerency as  
   precluding, 176
- Underwood's eagerness to try  
   Confederates for, 184–85
- trial by battle  
   American lawyers' unfamiliarity with  
     and criticism of, 90–91  
   Americans' ambivalence about  
     legitimacy of, 92  
   Americans' struggle with as providing  
     an answer to secession question,  
     86–87, 119–20  
   as analogous to wars between  
     nation-states, 88  
   Blackstone on, 90–91  
   Bledsoe on, 102–3  
   Brownson on, 114–15  
   Burr (Chauncey) on, 101–2  
   England's historical use of, 87–88  
   for Civil War combatants, 119  
   for Unionists, 86

## Index

345

- former Confederates' view of, 86,  
 92–98, 100–1  
 historical definition of, 87  
 Hurd on, 117–18  
 Lea's view of as obsolete, 107, 108–11  
 loss of legitimacy of, 118–19  
 medieval revival in Antebellum  
 America and, 89–90  
 Northerners' view of, 92  
 O'Connor's view of as providing an  
 as alternative resolution to the  
 secession question, 84, 85  
*Prize Cases* (1863) and, 103–6  
 Southern interest in writings of Scott  
 and, 90  
 Spooner's condemnation of, 115–16  
 Stephens (Alexander) on, 100–1  
 Stevens (Thaddeus) on, 105–6  
 Sumner on, 89  
*Texas v. White* (1869) and, 103–6  
 Unionist thinkers on, 100, 111  
 view of as as a terrible medieval  
 superstition, 107–8  
 West Virginia Supreme Court of  
 Appeals on, 107  
 Whitman on, 118  
 Trigg, Connally F., 145, 146  
*Two Years Before the Mast* (Dana), 228
- U.S. attorneys, 27, 29, 32, 38, 39, 40, 43,  
 47, 49, 51, 60, 90, 123, 243, 307  
 U.S. Constitution  
 requirement that a crime be tried in  
 state where the crime was committed  
 and, 231  
 right of secession in Articles of  
 Confederation and, 15–16  
*U.S. v. Burleigh*, 81  
*U.S. v. Greathouse* (1863), 80, 216–17  
*U.S. v. Hamway*, 145  
 Underwood, John C., 130  
 desire to pack pro-Union jury in  
 Virginia by, 186  
 eagerness to try Confederates for  
 treason, 184–85  
 grand jury in 1866 and, 165–66  
 public wariness towards, 186–87  
 radicalism of as potential advantage to  
 Davis defense, 180–81  
 rejection of O'Connor's bail request in  
 1866 by, 167–70  
 release of Davis on bail by in  
 1867, 187–89  
 self-dealing via Second Confiscation  
 Act of, 183–84  
 suspects Chandler of being a  
 Confederate sympathizer, 185  
 Union, idea of perpetual. *See* perpetual  
 Union, idea of
- Vanderbilt, Cornelius, 161  
 Varennes, John, 26–27  
 Vattel, Emerich de, 206, 208, 262  
 violence, 10, 62, 84, 86, 91, 92, 108, 114,  
 115, 117, 120  
 treason and, 32, 140, 141, 166
- Wade, Benjamin, 284  
 war and law, links between, 317, 322–24.  
*See also* international law; law of  
 war; secession's constitutionality;  
 trial by battle  
*Washington National Intelligencer*, 247  
 Washington, DC, as venue for Davis  
 trial, 140–41  
 Webster, Daniel, 17  
 Welles, Gideon, 34–35, 47, 194,  
 260–61, 276, 277  
 West Virginia Supreme Court, 107  
 Wheaton, Henry, 88, 208, 227,  
 249–51, 261  
 white supremacy, 13, 14, 230n. 12  
 Whiting, William, 70, 216  
 Whitman, James Q., 118  
 Wiebe, Robert, 4  
 Winder, John, 75–76  
 Wirz, Henry, 75–76  
 Witt, John Fabian, 252, 260  
 Wood, Fernando, 11  
 Woodman, Horatio, 121  
 Woodward, George Washington, 28  
 Wright, Quincy, 265