

CHRISTIANITY AND FAMILY LAW

The Western tradition has always cherished the family as an essential foundation of a just and orderly society, and thus accorded it special legal and religious protection. Christianity embraced this teaching from the start, and many of the basics of Western family law were shaped by Christian theologies of nature, sacrament, and covenant. This volume introduces readers to the enduring and evolving Christian teachings on betrothals and weddings; marriage and divorce; women's and children's rights; marital property and inheritance; and human sexuality and intimate relationships. The chapters are authoritatively written but accessible to college and graduate students and scholars, as well as clergy and laity. While alert to the hot-button issues of sexual liberty today, the contributing authors let the historical figures speak for themselves about what Christianity has contributed and continues to offer to the protection and guidance of our most intimate association.

John Witte, Jr. is Robert W. Woodruff Professor, McDonald Distinguished Professor, and director of the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University. He has published numerous articles and thirty books, including Law and Protestantism: The Legal Teachings of the Lutheran Reformation (Cambridge 2002), The Reformation of Rights (Cambridge 2007), Christianity and Law (Cambridge 2008), The Sins of the Fathers (Cambridge 2009), Christianity and Human Rights (Cambridge 2010), and The Western Case for Monogamy over Polygamy (Cambridge 2015).

Gary S. Hauk is university historian and senior adviser to the president of Emory University. He is the author of A Legacy of Heart and Mind: Emory since 1836 and editor of Where Courageous Inquiry Leads: The Emerging Life of Emory University, and has published numerous essays. He serves as senior editorial consultant to the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University.



LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Series Editor

John Witte, Jr., Emory University

Editorial Board

Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court / University of Milano Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge Norman Doe, Cardiff University Rafael Domingo, Emory University / University of Navarra Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame Robert P. George, Princeton University Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University Robin Griffith-Jones, the Temple, the Inns of Court Gary S. Hauk, Emory University R. H. Helmholz, University of Chicago Mark Hill OC, the Inns of Court / Cardiff University Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany / Universities of Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University

Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame
Jeremy Waldron, New York University/University of Oxford
Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic,
Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal,
and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep

John Anthony McGuckin, Columbia University

Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.



Books in the Series

Christianity and Natural Law

Norman Doe

Agape, Justice, and Law

Robert F. Cochran and Zachary R. Calo

Great Christian Jurists In English History

Mark Hill QC and R.H. Helmholz

Calvin's Political Theology and the Public Engagement of the Church

Matthew J. Tuininga

God and the Secular Legal System

Rafael Domingo

How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments

Philip L. Reynolds

Christianity and Freedom

edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke Vols. 1 & 2

The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law

Kathleen A. Brady

Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought

edited by Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini

The Western Case for Monogamy over Polygamy

John Witte, Jr.

God and the Illegal Alien

Robert W. Heimburger



Christianity and Family Law

AN INTRODUCTION

Edited by

JOHN WITTE, JR.

Emory University, Atlanta

GARY S. HAUK

Emory University, Atlanta





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108415347 DOI: 10.1017/9781108233255

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-41534-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-40119-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Eliza Ellison and Sara Haigh Hauk



Contents

Lis	st of Illustrations	page xii
Lis	st of Contributors	XV
Pre	eface	xix
	Introduction John Witte, Jr. and Gary S. Hauk	1
1	Moses, the Prophets, and the Rabbis <i>Elliot N. Dorff</i>	16
2	Jesus and St. Paul Gary S. Hauk	36
3	Emperor Constantine Judith Evans Grubbs	52
4	St. Augustine of Hippo David G. Hunter	69
5	St. John Chrysostom Vigen Guroian	85
6	Emperor Justinian Peter Sarris	100
7	Theodore Balsamon John Anthony McGuckin	116
8	Gratian Anders Winroth	134



x Contents

9	Peter Lombard Giulio Silano	146
10	Popes Alexander III and Innocent III Charles Donahue, Jr.	161
11	St. Thomas Aquinas Philip L. Reynolds	179
12	Martin Luther Steven Ozment and John Witte, Jr.	195
13	John Calvin Barbara Pitkin	211
14	King Henry VIII Henry Ansgar Kelly	220
15	Thomas Sanchez Rafael Domingo	245
16	John Selden Jason P. Rosenblatt	259
17	Mary Wollstonecraft Eileen Hunt Botting	275
18	Abraham Kuyper James D. Bratt	291
19	Emil Brunner Don S. Browning [†] and John Witte, Jr.	307
2 0	Popes Leo XIII and Pius XI Russell Hittinger	323
21	Pope Paul VI Stephen J. Pope	344
22	Pope John Paul II Robert P. George and Gerard V. Bradley	363
23	Paul Evdokimov Michael Plekon	381



		Contents	xi
2 4	Derrick Sherwin Bailey Mark D. Jordan		397
25	Jean Bethke Elshtain M. Christian Green		413
Bibli	ography		429
Index			454



Illustrations

1.1	Moses Smashing the Tablets of the Law, 1659 (oil on canvas), Rembrandt Harmensz. van Rijn (1606–69) / Gemaldegalerie, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Germany / Bridgeman Images	17
2.1	The Conversion of St. Paul (oil on canvas), Crozat, Ambroise (eighteenth century) / Musee des Augustins, Toulouse,	-/
	France / Bridgeman Images	37
3.1	Emperor Constantine I the Great (ca. 274–337) (mosaic),	
	Byzantine / San Marco, Venice, Italy / Bridgeman Images	53
4.1	Algeria: Saint Augustine of Hippo Regius (Annaba), painted	
	by Antonello da Messina (ca. 1430–79) / Pictures from	
	History / Bridgeman Images	70
5.1	St. John Chrysostom (fresco), Italian School	
	(twelfth century) / Chiesa della Panaghia, Rossano,	
	Calabria, Italy / Bridgeman Images	86
6.1	Emperor Justinian I (483–565) ca. 547 CE (mosaic)	
	(detail of 83451), Byzantine School (sixth century) / San	
	Vitale, Ravenna, Italy / Bridgeman Images	101
7.1	Theodore Balsamon, Nomocanon Photii Patriarchae	
	Constantinopolitani. Courtesy of the Pitts Theology	
	Library, Candler School of Theology, Emory University	117
8.1	Gratian, a table illustrating the prohibited degrees of	
	consanguinity (Salzburg?, ca. 1160). Bayerische	
	Staatsbibliothek München, C lm 13004, fol. 309r.	
	Reproduced with permission.	135
9.1	Portrait of Peter Lombard, Bishop of Paris: The glory of their	
	times; or The lives of ye primitive fathers, containing their	
	chiefest actions, workes, sentences, and deaths / Lupton,	
	Donald, d. 1676. Courtesy of the Pitts Theology Library,	
	Candler School of Theology, Emory University	147
	·	• '



List of Illustrations

xiii

10.1	Alexander III, European School (nineteenth century) / Private	
	Collection / © Look and Learn / Bridgeman Images	162
10.2	Portrait of Pope Innocent III (Gavignano or Anagni,	
	1160-Perugia, 1216), fresco, by an unknown artist, ca. 1219,	
	detail. Subiaco Monastery (Sacro Speco), Subiaco,	
	Italy / De Agostini Picture Library / G. Nimatallah /	
	Bridgeman Images	162
11.1	Thomas Aquinas (b/w photo) / © SZ Photo / Scherl /	
1111	Bridgeman Images	180
12.1	Double portrait of Martin Luther and Katherine von Bora,	100
12.1	1529 (oil on panel), Cranach, Lucas, the Elder (1472–1553) /	
	Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, Italy / Bridgeman Images	196
10.1	Portrait of John Calvin (1509–64) aged fifty-three, 1562	190
13.1	(engraving) (b/w photo), French School (sixteenth century) /	
	Bibliotheque Nationale, Paris, France / Bridgeman Images	212
		212
14.1	Portrait of Henry VIII (1491–1547) aged forty-nine, 1540 (oil on	
	panel), Hans Holbein the Younger (1497/8–1543) / Palazzo	
		230
15.1	Thomas Sanchez. Used by permission of the University	
_		246
16.1	Portrait of John Selden (1584–1654) from "Lodge's British	
	Portraits," 1823 (litho), English School (nineteenth	
	century) / Private Collection / Ken Welsh / Bridgeman	
	0	260
17.1	Portrait of Mary Wollstonecraft Godwin (1759–97), author	
	of A Vindication of the Rights of Woman, engraved	
	by W. T. Annis, pub. 1802 (engraving) (b/w photo), Opie,	
	John (1761–1807) (after) / Private Collection / Bridgeman	
	Images	276
18.1	Political speeches by Abraham Kuyper and others (1889).	
	Collection PJ / Alamy Stock Photo	292
19.1	Emil Brunner and Karl Barth, Courtesy of the Center	
,	for Barth Studies, Princeton Theological Seminary	
		308
20.1	Pope Leo XIII (litho), German School (nineteenth century) /	
	Private Collection / © Look and Learn / Elgar Collection /	
	Bridgeman Images	324
20.2	Pope Pius XI on the throne, 1927 (b/w photo) / © SZ Photo /) - T
20.2	Scherl / Bridgeman Images	324
21.1	Paul VI / Photo © Patrick Morin / Bridgeman Images	3 4 5
22.1	Pope John Paul II, Gdansk, 1987. Pope John Paul II's third) ()
1		364
	phsimase to rotatid / rotatil / blidgethall illiages	5 ⁰ 4



xiv	List of Illustrations	
23.1 24.1 25.1	Paul Evdokimov. Courtesy of Tomoko Faerber-Evdokimoff Derrick S. Bailey. Used by permission of family Jean Bethke Elshtain. Photo by Matthew Gilson / University	382 398
	of Chicago	414



Contributors

Eileen Hunt Botting (PhD, Yale) is Professor of Political Science at the University of Notre Dame.

Gerald V. Bradley (JD, Cornell) is Professor of Law at the University of Notre Dame.

James D. Bratt (PhD, Yale) is Professor of History, Emeritus, at Calvin College.

Don S. Browning[†] (PhD, Chicago) was the Alexander Campbell Professor of Ethics and the Social Sciences at the University of Chicago Divinity School and Robert W. Woodruff Senior Fellow at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University.

Rafael Domingo (PhD, Navarra) is Professor of Law and ICS Research Professor at the University of Navarra, and Francisco de Vitoria Senior Fellow at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University.

Charles Donahue, Jr. (LLB, Yale) is Paul A. Freund Professor of Law at Harvard University.

Elliot N. Dorff (Rabbi, Jewish Theological Seminary; PhD, Columbia) is Rector and Distinguished Service Professor of Philosophy at American Jewish University and Visiting Professor at UCLA School of Law.

Robert P. George (PhD, Oxford) is McCormick Chair in Jurisprudence and Founding Director of the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions at Princeton University.

M. Christian Green (JD, Emory; PhD, Chicago) is Senior Fellow at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University.



xvi

List of Contributors

Judith Evans Grubbs (PhD, Stanford) is Betty Gage Holland Professor of Roman History at Emory University.

Vigen Guroian (PhD, Drew) is Professor of Religious Studies in Orthodox Christianity at the University of Virginia.

Gary S. Hauk (PhD, Emory; MDiv, Methodist Theological School in Ohio) is university historian and senior adviser to the president of Emory University.

Russell Hittinger (PhD, St. Louis) is Warren Professor of Catholic Studies at the University of Tulsa.

David G. Hunter (PhD, Notre Dame) is Cottrill-Rolfes Chair of Catholic Studies at the University of Kentucky.

Mark D. Jordan (PhD, Texas-Austin) is Andrew W. Mellon Professor of Christian Thought and Professor of Studies of Women, Gender, and Sexuality at Harvard University.

Henry Ansgar Kelly (PhD, Harvard) is Distinguished Research Professor at the University of California, Los Angeles.

John Anthony McGuckin (PhD, Durham; DLitt, Sibiu) is Nielsen Professor of Ancient Church History at Union Theological Seminary, Professor of Byzantine Christian Studies at Columbia University, and Arch-Priest of the Romanian Orthodox Church.

Steven Ozment (PhD, Harvard) is McLean Professor of Ancient and Modern History at Harvard University.

Barbara Pitkin (PhD, Chicago) is Senior Lecturer in Religious Studies at Stanford University.

Michael Plekon (PhD, Rutgers) is Professor of Sociology and Religion and Culture at Baruch College of the City University of New York and Arch-Priest in the Orthodox Church in America.

Stephen J. Pope (PhD, Chicago) is Professor of Theology at Boston College.

Philip L. Reynolds (PhD, Toronto) is Charles Howard Candler Professor of Medieval Christianity, Aquinas Professor of Historical Theology, and Senior Fellow at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University.

Jason P. Rosenblatt (PhD, Brown) is Professor of English, Emeritus, at Georgetown University.



List of Contributors

xvii

Peter Sarris (DPhil, Oxford) is Reader in Late Roman, Early Medieval, and Byzantine History at the University of Cambridge.

Giulio Silano (PhD, Toronto) is Professor of History at the University of Toronto.

Anders Winroth (PhD, Columbia) is Forst Family Professor of History at Yale University.

John Witte, Jr. (JD, Harvard) is Robert W. Woodruff Professor, McDonald Distinguished Professor, and director of the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University.



Preface

This volume is one of several fresh introductions commissioned for the Cambridge Law and Christianity Series. Before this book series was established, Cambridge University Press published two similar anthologies, coedited by John Witte, Jr. and Frank S. Alexander: *Christianity and Law:* An Introduction (2008) and Christianity and Human Rights: An Introduction (2010). Soon, Cambridge will publish Norman Doe's Christianity and Natural Law: An Introduction, and the press has commissioned additional introductory volumes on "Christianity and Constitutional Law," "Christianity and Criminal Law," "Christianity and Private Law," and "Christianity and Economic Law." Others titles will soon follow.

Each of these introductions offers fresh scholarship into historical, doctrinal, and comparative perspectives on Christian sources and dimensions of familiar legal topics. Although the chapters are written by leading experts, they are intended for nonspecialists in colleges and in graduate and professional schools, as well as for clergy, interested laity, and scholars from other fields. The aim is to illuminate what Christianity has contributed and continues to offer to the world of law, particularly in the West.

The volume in hand analyzes Christian influences on Western family law. The main legal topics include the formation, maintenance, and dissolution of marriage; relations between husbands and wives, parents and children, and siblings and kinsmen within and beyond the household; and important dimensions of human sexuality and intimacy. This volume also touches more lightly on related legal topics of marital property and inheritance; the structure of the household and its role in public and private life; and household order, including women's rights, children's rights, and master–servant relations. Christian theology and the church's canon law had a decisive influence on these topics of Western family law for nearly two millennia.



xx Preface

From the fourth to the nineteenth centuries, church and state cooperated in the governance of the marital family, and an established Christian culture shaped sexual ethics. Today the modern secular state has assumed jurisdiction over most family law questions, and Western culture has disestablished Christianity and liberalized sex, marriage, and family norms. Nonetheless, many churches in and beyond the West continue to maintain internal laws and procedures to govern the family lives of their members, and Christian leaders continue to influence family law policies and advocate for their reform.

To tell this complex story in a single volume, we focus on twenty-eight titans who helped to shape the theory and law of sex, marriage, and family life in the West from biblical times until today. We have selected illustrative figures whose contributions to this tradition were both distinct and enduring. We have sought to balance Catholics, Protestants, and a few Orthodox figures who had influence in the West, and have placed leading popes, emperors, and kings alongside influential jurists, theologians, and philosophers. What emerges is a running set of portraits chronologically arranged – Moses, Jesus, St. Paul, Emperor Constantine, St. Augustine of Hippo, St. John Chrysostom, Emperor Justinian, Theodore Balsamon, Gratian, Peter Lombard, Pope Alexander III, Pope Innocent III, Thomas Aquinas, Martin Luther, John Calvin, King Henry VIII, Thomas Sanchez, John Selden, Mary Wollstonecraft, Abraham Kuyper, Emil Brunner, Pope Leo XIII, Pope Pius XI, Pope Paul VI, Pope John Paul II, Paul Evdokimov, D. S. Bailey, and Jean Bethke Elshtain. Scores, if not hundreds, of others deserve a place in this gallery of leading Christian thinkers on the family, but this set of portraits provides a cursory yet thorough introduction and illustration of what Christianity has offered to the theory and law of Western family life.

Each chapter follows a common structure to facilitate its use as a classroom text and research guide. Beginning with a short biographical introduction to its subject, each chapter explains why that person is important to the development of Western family law, concisely analyzes the person's main contributions, and ends with a list of recommended readings. The editorial introduction sets these twenty-eight figures in context, distills the key family law teachings of the Western tradition, and identifies their main points of convergence and contestation.

This volume eschews strong normative and confessional claims, seeking to edify, rather than enflame, popular debates today about sex, marriage, and family life. The contributing authors have let the historical figures speak for themselves about a wide range of Christian teachings on sex, marriage, and family life. This volume also avoids strong methodological or disciplinary



Preface xxi

biases. Instead, it incorporates law, theology, ethics, politics, history, women's studies, and LGBTQ studies to assess central topics of Christianity and family law.

We would be remiss if we did not express our deep appreciation to a number of people who have supported the production of this volume. We give special thanks to Mr. Cary Maguire, president of the Maguire Oil Company, who so kindly underwrote the costs of this volume and encouraged its preparation. It has been a joy to get to know Mr. Maguire in recent years, and for John Witte, Jr. to have the privilege of sitting in the Cary and Ann Maguire Chair in Ethics and American History at the Kluge Center in the Library of Congress to plan this and other volumes in the Cambridge Law and Christianity Series. We are indebted to John Berger, senior commissioning editor in law at Cambridge University Press, for masterminding the production and publication of the series. Amy Wheeler, in the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University, has earned our great gratitude for her skilled administrative support of all aspects of this volume. Finally, we express profound thanks to each of the authors of these chapters for distilling their immense learning into pithy and accessible essays that provide sharply etched portraits of a few of the great men and women who have shaped Western family law.

We two editors have enjoyed many years of friendship, both with each other and with our wonderful wives, Eliza Ellison and Sara Haigh Hauk, to whom we dedicate this volume.