

RUSSIA'S RESPONSE TO SANCTIONS

In the first in-depth analysis of the effects of sanctions on the Russian political economy, Richard Connolly details the Western sanctions targeting the energy, defense and financial sectors and the Russian response. He explores how Western sanctions have caused Russian officials to formulate rapid policy responses to enable the country to adapt to its new circumstances. The sanctions and the Russian response have caused the state's role in the Russian economy to grow stronger and led its policymakers to accelerate efforts to shift Russia's foreign economic relations away from the West and toward Asia. Connolly analyzes how the political economy in Russia and the nature of the country's integration with the global economy have been fundamentally reshaped. He demonstrates that a new system of political economy is emerging in Russia and how it is crucial to understanding Russia's future trajectory.

Richard Connolly is director of the Centre for Russian, European and Eurasian Studies (CREES) at the University of Birmingham. His research and teaching are principally concerned with the political economy of Russia.

Russia's Response to Sanctions

*How Western Economic Statecraft is Reshaping
Political Economy in Russia*

RICHARD CONNOLLY

University of Birmingham



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41502-6 — Russia's Response to Sanctions
Richard Connolly
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108415026
DOI: 10.1017/9781108227346

© Richard Connolly 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Connolly, Richard, 1979- author.

Title: Russia's response to sanctions : how Western economic statecraft is reshaping political economy in Russia / Richard Connolly, University of Birmingham.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018009856 | ISBN 9781108415026 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108400114 (pbk.)

Subjects: LCSH: Economic sanctions–Russia (Federation) | Russia (Federation)–Economic policy. | Russia (Federation)–Economic conditions. | Russia (Federation)–Foreign economic relations.

Classification: LCC HF1558.2 .C66 2018 | DDC 330.947–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018009856>

ISBN 978-1-108-41502-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41502-6 – Russia's Response to Sanctions
Richard Connolly
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Lucy, Freya and George

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
1 Sanctions and Political Economy	9
2 Russia's System of Political Economy	30
3 Western Sanctions and the Russian Response	56
4 Sanctions and the Energy Industry	78
5 Sanctions and the Defense Industry	117
6 Sanctions and the Financial System	153
Conclusion	191
<i>Bibliography</i>	201
<i>Index</i>	223

Figures

2.1	Natural resource export revenues, 2001–2015	<i>page</i> 33
2.2	Share of global manufacturing value-added, 2013	39
2.3	Annual changes in natural resource revenues and selected indicators of Russian economic performance, 2001–2015	40
2.4	Taxation revenues derived from oil and gas as a percentage of total federal tax revenues, 2006–2016	41
2.5	Life expectancy at birth, 1990–2015	48
2.6	Annual flows of IFDI into Russia and OFDI from Russia, 1994–2016	52
4.1	Oil and gas export revenues, 2000–2016	81
4.2	Import dependency in selected fields of oil and gas equipment, 2014	89
4.3	Volume and source of Russian imports: all categories of oil and gas extraction equipment, 2007–2016	91
4.4	Investment in the Russian oil and gas industries, 2010–2016	108
4.5	Crude oil production and exports, 2013–2017	109
5.1	Value of arms exports by Russia and selected countries, 2000–2015	126
5.2	Russian arms sales by region, 2000–2015	127
5.3	Volume and source of Russian imports: all categories of electronic equipment and components, 2001–2016	132
5.4	Annual state defense order (GOZ) and state-guaranteed credits (SGCs), 2005–2016	144
5.5	Value of Russia's arms exports, 2000–2016	146
6.1	The relative size of the Russian banking sector, 2013	159
6.2	Annual change in crude oil prices and net private financial capital flows, 1994–2016	164
6.3	External debt by public and private sector sectors, 1993–2016	165

6.4	Russia's international reserves, 1992–2017	165
6.5	Real effective exchange rate, 1995–2017	167
6.6	International investment position of Russia, 2000–2017	168
6.7	Ruble-dollar exchange rate and oil price (Brent, USD), 2010–2017	174
6.8	Quarterly gross private sector capital flows, 2000–2017	180
6.9	Change in risk premium in Russia, 2013–2017	183
6.10	Quarterly growth rates of fixed capital formation, 2005–2017	186
6.11	Quarterly flows of net and gross inward foreign direct investment, 2005–2017	187

Tables

4.1 Phases of foreign participation in the Russian energy industry	<i>page 87</i>
4.2 Import substitution targets for Russian oil extraction equipment industry	96
4.3 Status of selected joint ventures between Western IOCs and Russian oil companies, 2017	111
5.1 Procurement of foreign military equipment, 2009–2011	131
6.1 Private sector net capital inflows and outflows, 1994–2016	163

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank the large number of people who have helped me write this book – and to absolve them of responsibility for its shortcomings.

First, I would like to thank Mike Bradshaw, who first put the idea of studying the impact of sanctions on the Russian economy to me in the summer of 2014. Together, we applied for funding to support what would have been a detailed examination of how sanctions affected the oil industry. Our proposal was unsuccessful, but the idea to carry out an in-depth study of the impact of sanctions remained with me and provided the germ of the idea that eventually became this book.

I would also like to thank my colleagues at the Centre for Russian, European and Eurasian Studies (CREES), and in particular the extended CREES community that meets annually at the CREES conference in Windsor Great Park, for discussions that have helped form some of the ideas presented in this book. I am especially grateful to Derek Averre and Kasia Wolczuk, who in 2015 invited me to contribute to a special issue of *Europe-Asia Studies* that examined the conflict in Ukraine. The work undertaken in writing my contribution to this collection of essays helped develop my thinking on how sanctions were affecting Russia. I am also grateful to the University of Birmingham for granting me study leave which enabled me to make progress with drafting.

Soon after sanctions were put in place, I was appointed Associate Fellow on the Russia and Eurasia Programme at Chatham House. This afforded me the opportunity to share conversations with a great deal of scholars, policymakers, and other people with an interest in Russia. I am grateful to James Nixey, the head of the programme, and to L'ubica Pollakova, its manager, for involving me in the work that takes place on the program. Papers that I authored or coauthored (with Philip Hanson) on topics related to sanctions over the course of 2015 and 2016 were especially

helpful in sharpening ideas that are contained within this book. Thanks are also due to Andrew Monaghan, now at Oxford, who was a constant source of succor and light relief before, during, and after the book was written. As editor of the Russia Studies series for the NATO Defence College, he has also supported my work on Russia's attempts to build a more secure economy.

Since 2014, I have also been fortunate to make more than a dozen trips to Russia due to my position as Visiting Professor of Public Policy at the Russian Academy for the National Economy in Moscow. I would like to thank all those involved, including Robin Lewis and Vladimir Mau, for making this possible.

While researching this book, I was also privileged to be involved in a crossnational project coordinated by Tor Bukkwold of the Norwegian Defence Research Establishment (FFI), entitled "Russia's Defence Industry as a Driver of Economic Modernization." This enabled me to learn from a number of subject matter experts from across Europe, including: Tor, Cecilie Stenstad, and Una Hakvåg at FFI; Susan Oxenstierna and Tomas Malmlöf at the Swedish Defence Research Agency (FOI); Stuart Young from Cranfield University; and Ruslan Pukhov, Konstantin Makienko, and Maxim Shapovalenko from the Centre for the Analysis of Strategic Technologies (CAST) in Moscow. I am especially grateful to Maxim, who provided invaluable information as well as his time and an apple from his garden. Working alongside these people helped dramatically improve my understanding of the Russian defense industry, which in turn made the writing of Chapter 5 so much easier. For this, I am extremely grateful.

I have also benefited from conversations and correspondence with Sir Rodric Braithwaite, Rhod McKenzie, Carolina Vendil Pallin, Elizabeth Teague, Kyle Wilson, and Stephen Wegren.

Several people read one or more draft chapters. Their informed comments helped me avoid making more errors than would otherwise have been the case and enabled me to make a clearer and more informed argument. Nazrin Mehdiyeva gave insightful feedback on an earlier draft of the energy chapter, while Stephen Fortescue helped with comments on several chapters, as well as with interesting articles on Australian flora and fauna that, while having nothing at all to do with sanctions, provided a welcome diversion from writing.

Three people in particular deserve special thanks, both for their help in writing this book and for their intellectual support and friendship over the past decade: Julian Cooper, Philip Hanson, and Silvana Malle. I feel extremely privileged to have benefited from discussions with all three over

Acknowledgments

xv

many years, as well as from their comments on draft chapters of the book. They have served as a source of inspiration and invaluable support throughout my academic career. I hope that this book goes some way to meeting the high standards set by all three over their careers.

Naturally, all remaining errors – whether of fact or interpretation – remain mine alone.

Last, but by no means least, thanks – and apologies – are due to my wife, Lucy, and my two children, Freya and George, for putting up with a husband and father who was often absent during the final months of the book being written.