

## INTERPRETING DUNS SCOTUS

John Duns Scotus is commonly recognized as one of the most original thinkers of medieval philosophy – indeed, of Western philosophy *tout court*. His influence on subsequent philosophers and theologians is enormous and extends well beyond the limits of the Middle Ages. His thought, however, might be intimidating for the non-initiated because of the sheer number of topics he touched on and the difficulty of his philosophical style. The eleven essays collected here, especially written for this volume by some of the leading scholars in the field, take the reader through a variety of topics, including Duns Scotus's life and intellectual environment, his argument for the existence of God and his conceptions of modality, order, causality, matter and form, freedom, and human nature and its dignities. His views on the way human beings become aware of practical principles, on the extent and limits of their knowledge in this life, and on the concept of being and the notion of analogy are also analyzed. This volume provides a reliable entryway to the thought of Duns Scotus while giving a snapshot of some of the best research that is now being done on this difficult but intellectually rewarding thinker.

GIORGIO PINI is Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University in New York City. He is the author of *Categories and Logic in Duns Scotus* (2002), *Scoto e l'analogia* (2002), and the critical edition of a previously unedited work by Duns Scotus, *Notabilia super Metaphysicam* (2017). He has published numerous essays on later medieval metaphysics and theories of cognition.

INTERPRETING DUNS  
SCOTUS  
*Critical Essays*

EDITED BY  
GIORGIO PINI  
*Fordham University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-108-41138-7 — Interpreting Duns Scotus  
 Edited by Giorgio Pini  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108411387](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108411387)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108328975

© Giorgio Pini 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

NAMES: Pini, Giorgio, editor.

TITLE: Interpreting Duns Scotus : critical essays / edited by Giorgio Pini.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2021. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021024843 (print) | LCCN 2021024844 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781108420051 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108411387 (paperback) |

ISBN 9781108328975 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Duns Scotus, John, approximately 1266-1308. | Philosophy, Medieval. |

BISAC: PHILOSOPHY / History & Surveys / Medieval | PHILOSOPHY /

History & Surveys / Medieval | LCGFT: Essays.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B765.D74 I58 2021 (print) | LCC B765.D74 (ebook) | DDC 189/.4-DC23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024843>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024844>

ISBN 978-1-108-42005-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-41138-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page vii
<i>Notes on contributors</i>	viii
Introduction <i>Giorgio Pini</i>	I
1 John Duns Scotus's life in context <i>Stephen D. Dumont</i>	8
2 The modal framework of Duns Scotus's argument for the existence of a first cause <i>Richard Cross</i>	44
3 Duns Scotus on essential order in <i>De Primo Principio</i> and elsewhere <i>Thomas M. Ward</i>	59
4 Duns Scotus on how God causes the created will's volitions <i>Gloria Frost</i>	78
5 Duns Scotus on free will and human agency <i>Martin Pickavé</i>	102
6 Duns Scotus on the dignities of human nature <i>Marilyn McCord Adams</i>	122
7 Duns Scotus on matter and form <i>Cecilia Trifogli</i>	149
8 Duns Scotus, intuitionism, and the third sense of 'natural law' <i>Thomas Williams</i>	167

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
9	The bounds of sense: adequacy and abstraction in the later works of Duns Scotus <i>Wouter Goris</i>	184
10	Before univocity: Duns Scotus's rejection of analogy <i>Giorgio Pini</i>	204
11	Analogy after Duns Scotus: the role of the <i>analogia entis</i> in the Scotist metaphysics at Barcelona, 1320–1330 <i>Garrett R. Smith</i>	223
	<i>Bibliography</i>	246
	<i>Index</i>	264

## *Acknowledgments*

When this volume was still in the planning stages, Marilyn McCord Adams, who had agreed to contribute to it, passed away. Before being admitted to the hospital, with her characteristic generosity she sent me her chapter on Duns Scotus on the dignities of human nature. This might be the last essay she completed in her wonderfully productive life. It is an essay that perfectly reflects her penetrating intellect and her mastery of—and admiration for—Duns Scotus’s thought. It is a great honor to have it in this collection. While expressing my gratitude to her, for the lasting mark she left on philosophy, medieval scholarship, and the lives of those who were so fortunate as to cross paths with her, I also wish to extend my deepest thanks to her husband, Robert Merrihew Adams, who checked and authorized the small changes necessary to adjust Marilyn’s essay to the editorial norms of this series.

I carried out part of the work on this volume in 2018–2019, thanks to a Faculty Fellowship from Fordham University and a Solmsen Fellowship from the Institute for Research in the Humanities (IRH) at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. I wish to thank both institutions for their unflagging support of scholarship. I owe a special debt of gratitude to many people both at Fordham and IRH for many inspiring conversations as well as many laughs. Finally, I wish to thank my graduate assistants at Fordham University, Brenton Smith, Ciarán Coyle, and especially Emma Emrich for her tireless and skillful work on the index.

## *Notes on contributors*

MARILYN MCCORD ADAMS held numerous academic appointments over the course of her career, including Professor of Philosophy at UCLA, Horace Tracy Pitkin Professor of Historical Theology at Yale Divinity School, and Regius Professor of Divinity at the University of Oxford.

RICHARD CROSS is Rev. John A. O'Brien Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame.

STEPHEN D. DUMONT is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame.

GLORIA FROST is Professor of Philosophy at the University of St. Thomas in St. Paul, Minnesota.

WOUTER GORIS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Bonn.

MARTIN PICKAVÉ is Professor and Canada Research Chair of Medieval Philosophy at the University of Toronto.

GIORGIO PINI is Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University.

GARRETT R. SMITH is Research Fellow (Akademischer Rat) at the University of Bonn.

CECILIA TRIFOGLI, FBA, is Professor of Medieval Philosophy at the University of Oxford.

THOMAS M. WARD is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Baylor University.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Professor of Philosophy and Catholic Studies at the University of South Florida.