# CONTENTS

**Preface**  
Preface page xvii

**Acknowledgements**  
Acknowledgements xix

**Table of cases**  
Table of cases xx

**Table of statutes**  
Table of statutes lxxix

## Chapter 1 Introduction

1.

I Why have a book on remedies?  

II What is a remedy?  

A Monism and dualism  

B Sources of remedies in Australia  

C The unjust enrichment school of thought  

III The common law and equity divide in Australia  

A Fusion fallacy  

B Unjust enrichment scholars breaking down the common law and equitable divide  

C Australian reception of unjust enrichment scholarship  

D The position of the authors  

IV A functional approach to remedies  

A Parts 1 and 2: Compensation  

B Part 3: Remedies compelling performance and related remedies  

C Part 4: Remedies as vindication  

D Part 5: Account of profits and other gain-based relief for wrongs  

E Part 6: Restitution and giving back  

F Part 7: Proprietary remedies  

G Part 8: Enforcement of remedies  

H Conclusion

## Part 1 GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF COMPENSATION

23

## Chapter 2 Assessment of compensation

25

I Introduction  

II The compensatory principle and the identification of the wrong
III Losses and benefits 28
   A Non-pecuniary loss 28
   B Cost of repair and diminution in value 28
   C Betterment discount 30
   D Benefits flowing from mitigating actions of the plaintiff 33
   E Other benefits arising from the wrong 36
   F The impact of tax law 37

IV Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance 41
   A Overview of the current law 42
   B Consequential loss 44
   C Personal injury as initial harm 45
   D Pure economic loss as initial harm 49
   E Hypothetical conduct of the defendant 54

V Temporal considerations 57
   A The lump sum rule and the 'once and for all' rule 57
   B Date of assessment 60
   C Relevance of inflation 66
   D Determining the present equivalent of future pecuniary loss 66
   E Interest on compensation awards and compensation for the loss of the use of money 68

Chapter 3 Attribution of responsibility 73
   I Introduction 74
   II The legal concept of causation 74
   III Factual causation 78
      A Overview 78
      B The ‘but for’ test and its application 79
      C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 81
         1 Duplicative causation 82
         2 Pre-emptive causation 84
      D Evidential uncertainty 85
         1 Inference of factual causation 86
         2 Material contribution to the harm 86
         3 Material increase in risk 88
   IV Scope of liability 91
      A Subsequent event 91
         1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss 91
         2 Additional loss: intervening event 92
         3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event 100
         4 Basic loss: causally dependent subsequent event 103
      B Remoteness of damage 105
      C The purpose of the duty breached 105
Chapter 4 Multiple wrongdoers

I Introduction

II Common law rules

III Contribution statutes

IV Proportionate liability statutes

V Interplay of the three regimes

PART 2 COMPENSATION IN SPECIFIC CONTEXTS

Chapter 5 Compensation for breach of contract

I Introduction

II Assessment of compensation

A Protection of the plaintiff’s expectation interest

B Measure of expectation loss in particular contexts

1 Failure to deliver goods as promised

2 Failure to convey land as promised

3 Failure to build, maintain or repair property as promised

4 Failure to provide other services as promised

C The impact of Clark v Macourt

D Compensation of reliance loss

E Non-pecuniary loss

1 Restrictions at common law

2 Restrictions under statute

III Attribution of responsibility

A Remoteness of damage

1 The Hadley v Baxendale test

2 The significance of the defendant’s knowledge of the plaintiff’s circumstances

3 Assumption of responsibility as overriding criterion?

B Contributory negligence

Chapter 6 Compensation in tort

I Introduction

II Assessment of compensation

A General principle

B Specific contexts

1 Damage to reputation: defamation
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Damage to land or fixtures</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other wrongful interference with land</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Damage to goods</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Other wrongful interference with goods</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Defective premises or goods</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Damage to economic interests: reliance on a misrepresentation</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Attribution of responsibility</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Remoteness of damage</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The test of natural and probable consequences</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The test of reasonable foreseeability</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The test of reasonable contemplation</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The ‘eggshell skull’ rule</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Contributory negligence</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Common law</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Contributory negligence statutes</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Civil liability statutes</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The plaintiff’s conduct</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Factual causation and scope of the duty</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Apportionable loss</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Apportionment</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>Compensation for personal injury and death</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>The impact of legislation</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Statutory compensation schemes and ancillary regulation of common law damages</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Civil liability statutes</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Meaning of ‘personal injury’</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Loss suffered by an injured person</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Pecuniary loss resulting from needs created by the injury</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Medical expenses and cost of institutional care</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Domestic services provided to the injured person</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Increased cost of living at home</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cost of managing a lump sum award</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Pecuniary loss resulting from the impairment of capacities</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Loss of earning capacity</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Loss of employment-related benefits</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Loss of social security benefits</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Loss of capacity to do domestic work</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Non-pecuniary loss</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pain and suffering</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Loss of amenities</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Loss of expectation of life</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Statutory regulation</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Chapter 8 Compensation under the Australian Consumer Law

### I Introduction

II Assessment of compensation

A General principles

B Compensation for misleading or deceptive conduct
   1 Reliance loss as the general measure of compensation
   2 Compensation of expectation loss
   3 Compensation of reliance loss in excess of expectation loss

C Non-pecuniary loss

D Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance

### III Attribution of responsibility

A The common sense test of causation

B Factual causation

C Scope of liability
   1 Intervening cause
   2 Foreseeability of the loss
   3 The purpose of the provision contravened
   4 The plaintiff’s contribution to the loss

D Multiple wrongdoers

## Chapter 9 Equitable compensation for equitable wrongs

### I Introduction

II Assessment of equitable compensation

A Object of equitable compensation

B Recoverability of non-pecuniary loss

C Basic measure of equitable compensation

### III Attribution of responsibility

A Breach of trust
   1 Independent non-wrongful event
   2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss

B Breach of fiduciary duty
   1 Construction of the hypothetical world
   2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Contributory negligence</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Mitigation</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Breach of an equitable duty of care</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Scope of liability</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Contributory negligence</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PART 3 REMEDIES COMPELLING PERFORMANCE AND RELATED REMEDIES 289

### Chapter 10 Specific performance 291

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II The nature of specific performance</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III The relationship between specific performance and injunctions</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Inadequacy of damages and subject matter of contract</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Subject matter of contract</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Contracts involving land</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Contracts involving goods</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Contracts involving shares and stock</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Contracts to loan money</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Contracts for the benefit of third parties</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Contracts involving intellectual property</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Contracts for services</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Other requirements for specific performance</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Personal remedy</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Binding contract</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Consideration</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Uncertainty</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Illegality</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Im possibility and futility</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI Discretionary factors and bars to relief</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A General equitable bars to relief</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Hardship and the public interest</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Lack of clean hands</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Bars to relief relevant only to specific performance</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Mutuality</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Continuous supervision and personal services</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Readiness and willingness</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII Specific performance under the Australian Consumer Law</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII Specific restitution or specific delivery of property</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX Debt as a species of specific relief?</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 11 Injunctions

I Introduction

II The rights protected by injunctions and inadequacy of damages
   A Inadequacy of damages
   B The rights protected by injunctions
      1 Injury to property rights in land
      2 Injury to property rights in goods and funds of money
      3 Injury to intellectual property
      4 Injury to economic rights
      5 Injury to bodily integrity
      6 Injury to reputation
      7 Injury to privacy
      8 Injunctions restraining breaches of negative covenant in a contract
      9 Contracts for services

III Quia timet

IV Discretionary factors and bars to relief
   A General equitable bars to relief
      1 Hardship and the public interest
      2 Lack of clean hands
      3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice
   B Bars to injunctions that are equivalent to those in specific performance

V Injunctions under statutes
   A Intellectual property
   B The Australian Consumer Law
   C The Corporations Act 2001 (Cth)
   D Other statutory injunctions

Chapter 12 ‘Equitable damages’ or Lord Cairns’ Act damages

I Introduction

II History

III Advantages of Lord Cairns’ Act damages for a plaintiff

IV Jurisdiction to award Lord Cairns’ Act damages

V The need for a ‘wrongful act’ in some Australian jurisdictions
   A Australian legislation which mentions ‘wrongful act’
   B Australian legislation which does not mention ‘wrongful act’
   C Lord Cairns’ Act damages for statutory wrongdoing

VI Factors influencing the exercise of the jurisdiction
A General principles  
1 Where specific relief is no longer available or in addition to specific relief  
2 To provide a ‘middle ground’ solution between no relief and specific relief  
3 To provide relief for future losses  
4 To provide novel forms of relief  
B The Shelfer criteria  

VII The basis of assessment  
A Timing  
B Gain-based relief – ‘reasonable fee’ awards  
C Loss-based relief – compensatory awards of various kinds  
1 Where specific relief was impossible, or in addition to specific relief  
2 Future wrongdoing  
3 To provide novel forms of relief  

VIII Discretionary bars to relief  

IX Part 9.5 of the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth)  

X The future of Lord Cairns’ Act damages  

PART 4 REMEDIES AS VINDICATION  

Chapter 13 Self-help remedies  
I Introduction  
II Tort and self-help  
A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass  
B Self-defence of property  
C Self-defence of the person  
D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution  
E Abatement of nuisance  
III Contract and self-help  
A Rescission  
B Liquidated damages and penalties  
1 Is this a clause to which the penalties doctrine applies?  
2 On the facts, is this clause a penalty?  
3 Should we have a law against penalties at all?  
C Debt  
D Other stipulated contractual remedies  

Chapter 14 Exemplary damages and aggravated damages  
I Introduction  
II Exemplary damages
### Table of Contents

**A The nature and history of exemplary damages in Australia**

1. Need to make out the ‘host’ cause of action 392
2. Unavailable if criminal punishment already imposed 393
3. Calculation of exemplary damages 394

**B The causes of action for which exemplary damages can be awarded in Australia**

1. Exemplary damages available for tort 396
2. Exemplary damages available for breach of some statutes 398
3. Exemplary damages not available for breach of contract 399
4. Exemplary damages not available for equitable wrongdoing 402
5. Exemplary damages not available for breaches of Australian Consumer Law 404

**C Normative objections to exemplary damages generally** 405

**D Conclusion on exemplary damages generally** 406

**III Aggravated damages**

**A The distinction between exemplary damages and aggravated damages** 407

**B Availability of aggravated damages in Australian law**

1. Aggravated damages available for tort 409
2. Aggravated damages available for some statutory causes of action 411
3. Aggravated damages not available for contract 411
4. Aggravated damages not available for equitable wrongdoing 411
5. Aggravated damages available for breaches of the Australian Consumer Law 412

**IV ‘Vindicatory damages’** 413

**Chapter 15 Apologies and declaratory relief**

**I Introduction** 416

**II Apologies, declarations and nominal damages**

A Apologies 416

B Declarations, nominal damages and contemptuous damages 420

1. Declarations 420
2. Nominal damages 425
3. Contemptuous damages 426

III Other vindicatory remedies under the Australian Consumer Law 427

**PART 5 ACCOUNT OF PROFITS AND OTHER GAIN-BASED RELIEF FOR WRONGS** 429

**Chapter 16 Disgorgement of gains and ‘reasonable fee’ damages**

I Introduction 432
II The distinction between compensation, restitution and disgorgement
and the nature of gain-based remedies 433
A Compensation 433
B Restitution 433
C Disgorgement 434

III Disgorgement 435
A Equity and the account of profits 435
B Election 438
C Intellectual property and the account of profits 438
D Torts and ‘waiver of tort’ 441
E Breach of contract 443
F The Australian Consumer Law 447

IV ‘Reasonable fee’ damages 448
A Introduction and history 448
B Academic and judicial accounts 449
1 Compensatory analyses 449
2 Restitutionary analyses 451
3 Restitutionary and/or compensatory analyses 451
4 Vindicatory analyses 451
5 Property or exclusive entitlement analyses 452
6 Partial disgorgement analyses 452
7 Conclusion 452
C General patterns 453
D Equity 453
E Intellectual property 454
F Tort 455
1 Torts protecting proprietary rights in land 455
2 Torts protecting proprietary rights in goods 457
3 Other torts 458
G Contract 459

V Allowances, discretionary factors and bars to relief 460
A Allowances for skill and effort 461
1 Allowances for skill and effort for breach of fiduciary duty 461
2 Allowances for skill and effort for intellectual property breaches 463
3 Allowances for skill and effort and disgorgement in contract 464
B Discretionary factors and bars to relief 464
1 Hardship 464
2 Lack of clean hands 465
3 Delay and acquiescence 465

VI The future of gain-based relief in Australia 467
**PART 6  RESTITUTION AND GIVING BACK**

**Chapter 17  Personal remedies for unjust enrichment**

1. Introduction  
2. The elements of unjust enrichment  
3. Precise remedies for unjust enrichment  
   - A Money claims  
   - B Services claims  
   - C Goods claims  
4. Defences to a claim for restitution  
5. The relationship between contract and restitution for unjust enrichment

**Chapter 18  Rescission**

1. Introduction  
   - A Legal rescission  
   - B Equitable rescission  
   - C Rescission under the Australian Consumer Law  
2. The requirement of *restitutio in integrum*  
3. Election  
   - A How to make an election to rescind  
   - B The consequences of an election to rescind  
   - C The reasons behind the election requirement  
4. "Partial" rescission  
5. Bars to rescission  
   - A Impossibility of complete restoration  
   - B Affirmation  
   - C Delay  
   - D Intervening third party rights  
   - E Executed contracts and innocent misrepresentation

**PART 7  PROPRIETARY REMEDIES**

**Chapter 19  Proprietary remedies**

1. Introduction  
2. Proprietary remedies  
   - A Constructive and resulting trusts  
   - B Proprietary powers  
   - C Equitable liens  
3. Criteria for award of proprietary remedies  
   - A Proprietary remedies and unconscionability

Contents xv
PART 8  ENFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES  533

Chapter 20  Enforcement of remedies  535

I  Introduction  536

II  Interlocutory injunctions  536
   A  Legal, equitable or statutory right  537
   B  “Serious question to be tried” (or a ‘prima facie case’)  538
   C  The balance of convenience  540
      1  Likelihood of success  540
      2  Irreparable injury, hardship and inadequacy of damages to the plaintiff  541
      3  Hardship to the defendant and third parties  542
      4  Adequacy of undertaking as to damages for the defendant  543
      5  Delay on the part of the plaintiff  543
      6  Example of the balancing process  543
   D  Mandatory interlocutory injunctions  544
   E  Quia timet interlocutory injunctions  545
   F  Interlocutory injunctions which finally determine the matter  545
   G  Undertakings as to damages  546
   H  Interim injunctions under statute  546

III  Other pre-judgment remedies  547
   A  Arrest of the person  547
   B  Freezing orders (Mareva orders)  549
   C  Search orders (Anton Piller orders)  551

IV  Post-judgment enforcement  552
   A  Enforcement of money remedies  553
      1  Historical background  553
      2  Current Australian law  553
   B  Enforcement of specific remedies  557
      1  Enforcement against property  557
      2  Coercive enforcement: imprisonment, sequestration and fines  557

Index  561