

CONTENTS

Preface		page xvii
Acknowledgements		
Table of cases		XX
Table of statutes		lxxix
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
1	Why have a book on remedies?	2
II	What is a remedy? A Monism and dualism B Sources of remedies in Australia C The unjust enrichment school of thought	3 5 6 7
III	The common law and equity divide in Australia A Fusion fallacy B Unjust enrichment scholars breaking down the common law and equitable divide C Australian reception of unjust enrichment scholarship D The position of the authors	9 10 11 12 13
IV	A functional approach to remedies A Parts 1 and 2: Compensation B Part 3: Remedies compelling performance and related remedies C Part 4: Remedies as vindication D Part 5: Account of profits and other gain-based relief for wrongs E Part 6: Restitution and giving back F Part 7: Proprietary remedies G Part 8: Enforcement of remedies H Conclusion	14 16 18 19 20 21 22 22
PART 1 G	GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF COMPENSATION	23
Chapter 2	Assessment of compensation	25
l II	Introduction The compensatory principle and the identification of the wrong	26 26
	, ,,, ,, ,, ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	

V



III	Losses and benefits	28
	A Non-pecuniary loss	28
	B Cost of repair and diminution in value	28
	C Betterment discount	30
	D Benefits flowing from mitigating actions of the plaintiff	33
	E Other benefits arising from the wrong	36
	F The impact of tax law	37
IV	Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance	41
	A Overview of the current law	42
	B Consequential loss	44
	C Personal injury as initial harm	45
	D Pure economic loss as initial harm	49
	E Hypothetical conduct of the defendant	54
V	Temporal considerations	57
	A The lump sum rule and the 'once and for all' rule	57
	B Date of assessment	60
	C Relevance of inflation	66
	D Determining the present equivalent of future pecuniary loss	66
	E Interest on compensation awards and compensation for the loss	
	of the use of money	68
Observan O	A 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	70
Chapter 3	Attribution of responsibility	73
Chapter 3	Introduction	7 3
-		
1	Introduction	74
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation	74 74
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation	74 74 78
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview	74 74 78 78
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application	74 74 78 78 79
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)	74 74 78 78 79 81
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk Scope of liability	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk Scope of liability A Subsequent event 1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss 2 Additional loss: intervening event	74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk Scope of liability A Subsequent event 1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss 2 Additional loss: intervening event 3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 92
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk Scope of liability A Subsequent event 1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss 2 Additional loss: intervening event 3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event 4 Basic loss: causally dependent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 91 92 100 103
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation 2 Pre-emptive causation D Evidential uncertainty 1 Inference of factual causation 2 Material contribution to the harm 3 Material increase in risk Scope of liability A Subsequent event 1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss 2 Additional loss: intervening event 3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 92

vi Contents



	 D The plaintiff's contribution to the loss 1 Overview of the three relevant doctrines 2 Contributory negligence 3 Mitigation 	106 106 108 109
Chapter 4	Multiple wrongdoers	112
1	Introduction	113
II	Common law rules	114
Ш	Contribution statutes	117
IV	Proportionate liability statutes	121
V	Interplay of the three regimes	128
PART 2	COMPENSATION IN SPECIFIC CONTEXTS	131
Chapter 5	Compensation for breach of contract	133
1	Introduction	134
II	Assessment of compensation	134
	A Protection of the plaintiff's expectation interest	134
	B Measure of expectation loss in particular contexts	136
	1 Failure to deliver goods as promised	137
	2 Failure to convey land as promised	141
	3 Failure to build, maintain or repair property as promised	142
	4 Failure to provide other services as promised	149
	C The impact of Clark v Macourt	150
	D Compensation of reliance loss E Non-pecuniary loss	152 156
	Non-pecuniary loss Restrictions at common law	156
	2 Restrictions under statute	159
III	Attribution of responsibility	161
	A Remoteness of damage	161
	1 The Hadley v Baxendale test2 The significance of the defendant's knowledge of the	161
	plaintiff's circumstances	163
	3 Assumption of responsibility as overriding criterion?	164
	B Contributory negligence	167
Chapter 6	Compensation in tort	171
1	Introduction	172
II	Assessment of compensation	172
	A General principle	172
	B Specific contexts	172
	1 Damage to reputation: defamation	173

Contents vii



 Damage to land or fixtures Other wrongful interference with land Damage to goods Other wrongful interference with goods Defective premises or goods Damage to economic interests: reliance on a misrepresentation 	176 178 179 182 184 187
Attribution of responsibility A Remoteness of damage 1 The test of natural and probable consequences 2 The test of reasonable foreseeability 3 The test of reasonable contemplation 4 The 'eggshell skull' rule B Contributory negligence 1 Common law 2 Contributory negligence statutes 3 Civil liability statutes 4 The plaintiff's conduct 5 Factual causation and scope of the duty 6 Apportionable loss 7 Apportionment	188 189 190 195 197 199 199 200 201 203 204 204
Compensation for personal injury and death	208
	209
A Statutory compensation schemes and ancillary regulation of common law damages	209209211
	212
Loss suffered by an injured person A Pecuniary loss resulting from needs created by the injury 1 Medical expenses and cost of institutional care 2 Domestic services provided to the injured person 3 Increased cost of living at home 4 Cost of managing a lump sum award B Pecuniary loss resulting from the impairment of capacities 1 Loss of earning capacity 2 Loss of employment-related benefits 3 Loss of social security benefits 4 Loss of capacity to do domestic work C Non-pecuniary loss 1 Pain and suffering	214 215 215 218 219 220 225 225 225 227 227
	3 Other wrongful interference with land 4 Damage to goods 5 Other wrongful interference with goods 6 Defective premises or goods 7 Damage to economic interests: reliance on a misrepresentation Attribution of responsibility A Remoteness of damage 1 The test of natural and probable consequences 2 The test of reasonable foreseeability 3 The test of reasonable contemplation 4 The 'eggshell skull' rule B Contributory negligence 1 Common law 2 Contributory negligence statutes 3 Civil liability statutes 4 The plaintiff's conduct 5 Factual causation and scope of the duty 6 Apportionable loss 7 Apportionment Compensation for personal injury and death Introduction The impact of legislation A Statutory compensation schemes and ancillary regulation of common law damages B Civil liability statutes Meaning of 'personal injury' Loss suffered by an injured person A Pecuniary loss resulting from needs created by the injury 1 Medical expenses and cost of institutional care 2 Domestic services provided to the injured person 3 Increased cost of living at home 4 Cost of managing a lump sum award B Pecuniary loss resulting from the impairment of capacities 1 Loss of earning capacity 2 Loss of employment-related benefits 3 Loss of social security benefits 4 Loss of capacity to do domestic work C Non-pecuniary loss

viii Contents



	D Overlap between different heads of loss	230
V	Benefits arising from an injury	231
VI	Claims based on injury to another person	233
	A Loss of an employee's services	234
	B Loss of consortium	235
VII	Actions on death	237
	A Claim by the estate of the deceased	237
	B Claim by the dependants of the deceased	239
Chapter 8	Compensation under the Australian Consumer Law	247
1	Introduction	248
Ш	Assessment of compensation	250
	A General principles	250
	B Compensation for misleading or deceptive conduct	251
	1 Reliance loss as the general measure of compensation	251
	2 Compensation of expectation loss	252
	3 Compensation of reliance loss in excess of expectation loss	253
	C Non-pecuniary loss	254
	D Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance	256
III	Attribution of responsibility	256
	A The common sense test of causation	256
	B Factual causation	257
	C Scope of liability	258
	1 Intervening cause	258
	2 Foreseeability of the loss	259
	3 The purpose of the provision contravened	259
	4 The plaintiff's contribution to the loss	260
	D Multiple wrongdoers	262
Chapter 9	Equitable compensation for equitable wrongs	263
1	Introduction	264
II	Assessment of equitable compensation	266
	A Object of equitable compensation	266
	B Recoverability of non-pecuniary loss	267
	C Basic measure of equitable compensation	268
III	Attribution of responsibility	269
	A Breach of trust	270
	1 Independent non-wrongful event	270
	2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss	275
	B Breach of fiduciary duty	276
	1 Construction of the hypothetical world	276
	2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss	281

Contents ix



	3 Contributory negligence	283
	4 Mitigation	285
	C Breach of an equitable duty of care	286
	1 Scope of liability	286
	2 Contributory negligence	287
PART 3 R	EMEDIES COMPELLING PERFORMANCE	
Α	ND RELATED REMEDIES	289
Chapter 10	Specific performance	291
1	Introduction	292
II	The nature of specific performance	292
III	The relationship between specific performance and injunctions	294
IV	Inadequacy of damages and subject matter of contract	296
	A Inadequacy of damages	296
	B Subject matter of contract	299
	1 Contracts involving land	299
	2 Contracts involving goods	301
	3 Contracts involving shares and stock	302
	4 Contracts to loan money	303
	5 Contracts for the benefit of third parties	304
	6 Contracts involving intellectual property	305
	7 Contracts for services	305
٧	Other requirements for specific performance	306
	A Personal remedy	306
	B Binding contract	307
	1 Consideration	307
	2 Uncertainty	308
	3 Illegality	309
	4 Impossibility and futility	310
VI	Discretionary factors and bars to relief	312
	A General equitable bars to relief	312
	 Hardship and the public interest 	313
	2 Lack of clean hands	314
	3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice	315
	B Bars to relief relevant only to specific performance	316
	1 Mutuality	317
	2 Continuous supervision and personal services	318
	3 Readiness and willingness	321
VII	Specific performance under the Australian Consumer Law	321
VIII	Specific restitution or specific delivery of property	322
IX	Debt as a species of specific relief?	324

x Contents



Chapter 11	Injunctions	326	
1	Introduction		
II	The rights protected by injunctions and inadequacy of damages A Inadequacy of damages B The rights protected by injunctions 1 Injury to property rights in land 2 Injury to property rights in goods and funds of money 3 Injury to intellectual property 4 Injury to economic rights 5 Injury to bodily integrity 6 Injury to reputation 7 Injury to privacy 8 Injunctions restraining breaches of negative covenant in a contract 9 Contracts for services	329 330 331 331 332 333 335 336 336 337 338	
III	Quia timet injunctions	340	
IV	Discretionary factors and bars to relief A General equitable bars to relief 1 Hardship and the public interest 2 Lack of clean hands 3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice B Bars to injunctions that are equivalent to those in specific performance	341 341 342 343 343	
V	Injunctions under statutes A Intellectual property B The Australian Consumer Law C The Corporations Act 2001 (Cth) D Other statutory injunctions	344 344 344 346 346	
Chapter 12	'Equitable damages' or Lord Cairns' Act damages	347	
1	Introduction	348	
II	History	348	
III	Advantages of Lord Cairns' Act damages for a plaintiff	349	
IV	Jurisdiction to award Lord Cairns' Act damages	350	
V	The need for a 'wrongful act' in some Australian jurisdictions A Australian legislation which mentions 'wrongful act' B Australian legislation which does not mention 'wrongful act' C Lord Cairns' Act damages for statutory wrongdoing	352 352 353 354	
VI	Factors influencing the exercise of the jurisdiction	354	

Contents xi



	A General principles 1 Where specific relief is no longer available or in addition to specific relief	354 354
	 To provide a 'middle ground' solution between no relief and specific relief To provide relief for future losses To provide novel forms of relief 	355 358 358
	B The Shelfer criteria	359
VII	The basis of assessment A Timing B Gain-based relief – 'reasonable fee' awards C Loss-based relief – compensatory awards of various kinds 1 Where specific relief was impossible, or in addition to specific relief 2 Future wrongdoing 3 To provide novel forms of relief	360 360 362 362 362 363 363
VIII	Discretionary bars to relief	364
IX	Part 9.5 of the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth)	365
X	The future of Lord Cairns' Act damages	365
PART 4 R	EMEDIES AS VINDICATION	367
Chapter 13	Self-help remedies	369
Chapter 13	Self-help remedies Introduction	369 370
•		
1	Introduction Tort and self-help A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass B Self-defence of property C Self-defence of the person D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution	370 371 371 373 374 375
I	Introduction Tort and self-help A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass B Self-defence of property C Self-defence of the person D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution E Abatement of nuisance Contract and self-help A Rescission B Liquidated damages and penalties 1 Is this a clause to which the penalties doctrine applies? 2 On the facts, is this clause a penalty? 3 Should we have a law against penalties at all? C Debt	370 371 371 373 374 375 377 379 380 381 383 384 385
	Introduction Tort and self-help A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass B Self-defence of property C Self-defence of the person D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution E Abatement of nuisance Contract and self-help A Rescission B Liquidated damages and penalties 1 Is this a clause to which the penalties doctrine applies? 2 On the facts, is this clause a penalty? 3 Should we have a law against penalties at all? C Debt D Other stipulated contractual remedies	370 371 371 373 374 375 377 379 380 381 383 384 385 386

xii Contents



	А	The nature and history of exemplary damages in Australia	389
		1 Need to make out the 'host' cause of action	392
		2 Unavailable if criminal punishment already imposed	393
		3 Calculation of exemplary damages	394
	В	The causes of action for which exemplary damages	
		can be awarded in Australia	395
		1 Exemplary damages available for tort	396
		2 Exemplary damages available for breach of some statutes	398
		3 Exemplary damages not available for breach of contract	399
		4 Exemplary damages not available for equitable wrongdoing	402
		5 Exemplary damages not available for breaches of	
		Australian Consumer Law	404
	С	Normative objections to exemplary damages generally	405
	D	Conclusion on exemplary damages	406
III	Aggr	avated damages	407
	Α	The distinction between exemplary damages and aggravated	
		damages	407
	В	Availability of aggravated damages in Australian law	409
		1 Aggravated damages available for tort	409
		2 Aggravated damages available for some statutory	
		causes of action	411
		3 Aggravated damages not available for contract	411
		4 Aggravated damages not available for equitable	
		wrongdoing	411
		5 Aggravated damages available for breaches of the	
		Australian Consumer Law	412
IV	'Vind	icatory damages'	413
Chapter 1	5 Apol	logies and declaratory relief	415
1	Intro	duction	416
II	Apolo	ogies, declarations and nominal damages	416
	Α	Apologies	416
	В	Declarations, nominal damages and contemptuous damages	420
		1 Declarations	420
		2 Nominal damages	425
		3 Contemptuous damages	426
III	Othe	r vindicatory remedies under the Australian Consumer Law	427
PART 5	ACCO	UNT OF PROFITS AND OTHER	
(GAIN-	BASED RELIEF FOR WRONGS	429
Chapter 1	6 Disg	orgement of gains and 'reasonable fee' damages	431
I	Intro	duction	432

Contents xiii



Ш	rne	distinction between compensation, restitution and disgorgement	
	and '	the nature of gain-based remedies	433
	Α	Compensation	433
	В	Restitution	433
	С	Disgorgement	434
Ш	Disg	orgement	435
	Α	Equity and the account of profits	435
	В	Election	438
	С	Intellectual property and the account of profits	438
	D	Torts and 'waiver of tort'	441
	Е	Breach of contract	443
	F	The Australian Consumer Law	447
IV	'Rea	sonable fee' damages	448
	Α	Introduction and history	448
	В	Academic and judicial accounts	449
		1 Compensatory analyses	449
		2 Restitutionary analyses	451
		3 Restitutionary and/or compensatory analyses	451
		4 Vindicatory analyses	451
		5 Property or exclusive entitlement analyses	452
		6 Partial disgorgement analyses	452
		7 Conclusion	452
	С	General patterns	453
	D	Equity	453
	Ε	Intellectual property	454
	F	Tort	455
		1 Torts protecting proprietary rights in land	455
		2 Torts protecting proprietary rights in goods	457
		3 Other torts	458
	G	Contract	459
٧	Allov	vances, discretionary factors and bars to relief	460
	Α	Allowances for skill and effort	461
		1 Allowances for skill and effort for breach of	
		fiduciary duty	461
		2 Allowances for skill and effort for intellectual property	
		breaches	463
		3 Allowances for skill and effort and disgorgement	
		in contract	464
	В	Discretionary factors and bars to relief	464
		1 Hardship	464
		2 Lack of clean hands	465
		3 Delay and acquiescence	465
VI	The t	future of gain-based relief in Australia	467

xiv Contents



PART 6 RI	ESTITUTION AND GIVING BACK	469
Chapter 17	Personal remedies for unjust enrichment	471
1	Introduction	472
II	The elements of unjust enrichment	475
Ш	Precise remedies for unjust enrichment	477
	A Money claims	477
	B Services claims C Goods claims	477 479
IV	Defences to a claim for restitution	479
V	The relationship between contract and restitution for	473
•	unjust enrichment	480
Chapter 18	Rescission	485
1	Introduction	486
	A Legal rescission	488
	B Equitable rescission	489
	C Rescission under the Australian Consumer Law	490
II 	The requirement of restitutio in integrum	491
III	Election A How to make an election to rescind	494 495
	B The consequences of an election to rescind	496
	C The reasons behind the election requirement	499
IV 'Partial' rescission		499
V	Bars to rescission	501
	A Impossibility of complete restoration	502
	B Affirmation C Delay	503 503
	D Intervening third party rights	504
	E Executed contracts and innocent misrepresentation	506
PART 7 PF	ROPRIETARY REMEDIES	509
Chapter 19	Proprietary remedies	511
I	Introduction	512
II	Proprietary remedies	513
	A Constructive and resulting trusts	513
	B Proprietary powers C Equitable liens	516 517
III	Criteria for award of proprietary remedies A Proprietary remedies and unconscionability	518 520
	Sp. 12. 12. 12. 12. 12. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13. 13	320

ΧV

Contents



B Proprietary remedies and perfection	521
C Proprietary remedies and unjust enrichment	522
D Proprietary remedies and wrongdoing	527
Discretionary factors and bars to relief	531
The need for more defined criteria	531
NFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES	533
Enforcement of remedies	535
Introduction	536
Interlocutory injunctions	536
, ,	537
	538
C The balance of convenience	540
1 Likelihood of success	540
2 Irreparable injury, hardship and inadequacy of damages	
to the plaintiff	541
3 Hardship to the defendant and third parties	542
4 Adequacy of undertaking as to damages for the defendant	543
5 Delay on the part of the plaintiff	543
6 Example of the balancing process	543
D Mandatory interlocutory injunctions	544
E Quia timet interlocutory injunctions	545
F Interlocutory injunctions which finally determine the matter	545
G Undertakings as to damages	546
H Interim injunctions under statute	546
Other pre-judgment remedies	547
A Arrest of the person	547
B Freezing orders (Mareva orders)	549
C Search orders (Anton Piller orders)	551
Post-judgment enforcement	552
A Enforcement of money remedies	553
1 Historical background	553
2 Current Australian law	553
B Enforcement of specific remedies	557
1 Enforcement against property	557
2 Coercive enforcement: imprisonment, sequestration	
and fines	557
	C Proprietary remedies and unjust enrichment D Proprietary remedies and wrongdoing Discretionary factors and bars to relief The need for more defined criteria NFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES Enforcement of remedies Introduction Interlocutory injunctions A Legal, equitable or statutory right B 'Serious question to be tried' (or a 'prima facie case') C The balance of convenience 1 Likelihood of success 2 Irreparable injury, hardship and inadequacy of damages to the plaintiff 3 Hardship to the defendant and third parties 4 Adequacy of undertaking as to damages for the defendant 5 Delay on the part of the plaintiff 6 Example of the balancing process D Mandatory interlocutory injunctions E Quia timet interlocutory injunctions F Interlocutory injunctions which finally determine the matter G Undertakings as to damages H Interim injunctions under statute Other pre-judgment remedies A Arrest of the person B Freezing orders (Mareva orders) C Search orders (Anton Piller orders) Post-judgment enforcement A Enforcement of money remedies 1 Historical background 2 Current Australian law B Enforcement of specific remedies 1 Enforcement against property 2 Coercive enforcement: imprisonment, sequestration

xvi Contents

Index

561