

# REMEDIES IN AUSTRALIAN PRIVATE LAW

#### Second edition

*Remedies in Australian Private Law* offers readers a clear and detailed introduction to remedies and their functions under Australian law. Clearly structured, with a strong black-letter law focus, the text provides a complete treatment of remedies in common law, equity and statute, and develops a framework for understanding the principles of private law remedies and their practical application.

The second edition has been significantly revised and offers up-to-date coverage of case law and legislation, including the Australian Consumer Law. It builds on the detailed treatment of remedies and their broad functions across a range of private law categories, including torts, contract, equity, trusts and property law. It also offers expanded coverage of vindicatory damages, debt, specific restitution and coercive remedies. Theoretical perspectives on issues such as equitable obligations, the fusion of common law and equity, the nature of reasonable fee awards and the concept of unjust enrichment are also discussed.

With its systematic and accessible approach, *Remedies in Australian Private Law* enables students and practitioners to develop a coherent understanding of remedial law and to analyse legal problems and identify appropriate remedial solutions.

**Katy Barnett** is Associate Professor in the Melbourne Law School at the University of Melbourne.

**Sirko Harder** is Reader in Law in the Sussex Law School at the University of Sussex.



# REMEDIES IN AUSTRALIAN PRIVATE LAW

Second edition

Katy Barnett Sirko Harder







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108404754

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2014, 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014

Second edition 2018 (version 5, April 2022)

Cover designed by Fiona Byrne

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library A catalogue record for this book is available from the National Library of Australia

ISBN 978-1-108-40475-4 Paperback

Reproduction and communication for educational purposes

The Australian *Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10% of the pages of this work, whichever is the greater, to be reproduced and/or communicated by any educational institution for its educational purposes provided that the educational institution (or the body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

For details of the CAL licence for educational institutions contact:

Copyright Agency Limited Level 12, 66 Goulburn Street Sydney NSW 2000 Telephone: (02) 9394 7600

Telephone: (02) 9394 7600 Facsimile: (02) 9394 7601

E-mail: memberservices@copyright.com.au

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Preface

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-40475-4 — Remedies in Australian Private Law Katy Barnett , Sirko Harder Frontmatter **More Information** 

# CONTENTS

Preface		page xvii
Acknowledgeme	nts	xix
Table of cases		XX
Table of statutes		lxxix
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
1	Why have a book on remedies?	2
II	What is a remedy?  A Monism and dualism  B Sources of remedies in Australia  C The unjust enrichment school of thought	3 5 6 7
III	The common law and equity divide in Australia  A Fusion fallacy  B Unjust enrichment scholars breaking down the common law and equitable divide  C Australian reception of unjust enrichment scholarship  D The position of the authors	9 10 11 12 13
IV	<ul> <li>A functional approach to remedies</li> <li>A Parts 1 and 2: Compensation</li> <li>B Part 3: Remedies compelling performance and related remedies</li> <li>C Part 4: Remedies as vindication</li> <li>D Part 5: Account of profits and other gain-based relief for wrongs</li> <li>E Part 6: Restitution and giving back</li> <li>F Part 7: Proprietary remedies</li> <li>G Part 8: Enforcement of remedies</li> <li>H Conclusion</li> </ul>	14 16 18 19 20 21 22 22
	SENERAL PRINCIPLES OF COMPENSATION	23
Chapter 2	Assessment of compensation	25
1	Introduction	26
II	The compensatory principle and the identification of the wrong	26



III	Losses and benefits	28
	A Non-pecuniary loss	28
	B Cost of repair and diminution in value	28
	C Betterment discount	30
	D Benefits flowing from mitigating actions of the plaintiff	33
	E Other benefits arising from the wrong	36
	F The impact of tax law	37
IV	Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance	41
	A Overview of the current law	42
	B Consequential loss	44
	C Personal injury as initial harm	45
	D Pure economic loss as initial harm	49
	E Hypothetical conduct of the defendant	54
V	Temporal considerations	57
	A The lump sum rule and the 'once and for all' rule	57
	B Date of assessment	60
	C Relevance of inflation	66
	D Determining the present equivalent of future pecuniary loss	66
	E Interest on compensation awards and compensation for the loss	
	of the use of money	68
Observan O	A 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	70
Chapter 3	Attribution of responsibility	73
Chapter 3	Introduction	7 <b>3</b>
-		
1	Introduction	74
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation	74 74
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation	74 74 78
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview	74 74 78 78
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application	74 74 78 78 79
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)	74 74 78 78 79 81
I II	Introduction The legal concept of causation Factual causation A Overview B The 'but for' test and its application C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes) 1 Duplicative causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk  Scope of liability	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk  Scope of liability  A Subsequent event  1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss  2 Additional loss: intervening event	74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk  Scope of liability  A Subsequent event  1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss  2 Additional loss: intervening event  3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 92
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk  Scope of liability  A Subsequent event  1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss  2 Additional loss: intervening event  3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event  4 Basic loss: causally dependent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 91 92 100 103
I II	Introduction  The legal concept of causation  Factual causation  A Overview  B The 'but for' test and its application  C Causal overdetermination (multiple sufficient causes)  1 Duplicative causation  2 Pre-emptive causation  D Evidential uncertainty  1 Inference of factual causation  2 Material contribution to the harm  3 Material increase in risk  Scope of liability  A Subsequent event  1 Distinction between basic loss and additional loss  2 Additional loss: intervening event  3 Basic loss: causally independent subsequent event	74 74 78 78 79 81 82 84 85 86 86 88 91 91 91 92

vi Contents



	<ul> <li>D The plaintiff's contribution to the loss</li> <li>1 Overview of the three relevant doctrines</li> <li>2 Contributory negligence</li> </ul>	106 106 108
	3 Mitigation	109
Chapter 4	Multiple wrongdoers	112
1	Introduction	113
II	Common law rules	114
Ш	Contribution statutes	117
IV	Proportionate liability statutes	121
V	Interplay of the three regimes	128
PART 2	COMPENSATION IN SPECIFIC CONTEXTS	131
Chapter 5	Compensation for breach of contract	133
1	Introduction	134
II	Assessment of compensation	134
	A Protection of the plaintiff's expectation interest	134
	B Measure of expectation loss in particular contexts	136
	1 Failure to deliver goods as promised	137
	2 Failure to convey land as promised	141 142
	<ul><li>Failure to build, maintain or repair property as promised</li><li>Failure to provide other services as promised</li></ul>	142
	C The impact of Clark v Macourt	150
	D Compensation of reliance loss	152
	E Non-pecuniary loss	156
	1 Restrictions at common law	156
	2 Restrictions under statute	159
III	Attribution of responsibility	161
	A Remoteness of damage	161
	1 The Hadley v Baxendale test	161
	2 The significance of the defendant's knowledge of the	
	plaintiff's circumstances	163
	3 Assumption of responsibility as overriding criterion?	164
	B Contributory negligence	167
Chapter 6	Compensation in tort	171
1	Introduction	172
II	Assessment of compensation	172
	A General principle	172
	B Specific contexts	172
	1 Damage to reputation: defamation	173

vii

Contents



<ul> <li>Damage to land or fixtures</li> <li>Other wrongful interference with land</li> <li>Damage to goods</li> <li>Other wrongful interference with goods</li> <li>Defective premises or goods</li> <li>Damage to economic interests: reliance on a misrepresentation</li> </ul>	176 178 179 182 184 187
Attribution of responsibility  A Remoteness of damage  1 The test of natural and probable consequences  2 The test of reasonable foreseeability  3 The test of reasonable contemplation  4 The 'eggshell skull' rule  B Contributory negligence  1 Common law  2 Contributory negligence statutes  3 Civil liability statutes  4 The plaintiff's conduct  5 Factual causation and scope of the duty  6 Apportionment	188 189 190 195 197 199 199 200 201 203 204 204
Compensation for personal injury and death	208
	209
A Statutory compensation schemes and ancillary regulation of common law damages	<ul><li>209</li><li>209</li><li>211</li></ul>
	212
Loss suffered by an injured person  A Pecuniary loss resulting from needs created by the injury  1 Medical expenses and cost of institutional care  2 Domestic services provided to the injured person  3 Increased cost of living at home  4 Cost of managing a lump sum award  B Pecuniary loss resulting from the impairment of capacities  1 Loss of earning capacity  2 Loss of employment-related benefits  3 Loss of social security benefits  4 Loss of capacity to do domestic work  C Non-pecuniary loss  1 Pain and suffering  2 Loss of amenities  3 Loss of expectation of life	214 215 215 218 219 220 225 225 225 227 227 227 228
	3 Other wrongful interference with land 4 Damage to goods 5 Other wrongful interference with goods 6 Defective premises or goods 7 Damage to economic interests: reliance on a misrepresentation  Attribution of responsibility A Remoteness of damage 1 The test of natural and probable consequences 2 The test of reasonable foreseeability 3 The test of reasonable contemplation 4 The 'eggshell skull' rule  B Contributory negligence 1 Common law 2 Contributory negligence statutes 3 Civil liability statutes 4 The plaintiff's conduct 5 Factual causation and scope of the duty 6 Apportionable loss 7 Apportionment  Compensation for personal injury and death  Introduction  The impact of legislation A Statutory compensation schemes and ancillary regulation of common law damages B Civil liability statutes  Meaning of 'personal injury'  Loss suffered by an injured person A Pecuniary loss resulting from needs created by the injury 1 Medical expenses and cost of institutional care 2 Domestic services provided to the injured person 3 Increased cost of living at home 4 Cost of managing a lump sum award B Pecuniary loss resulting from the impairment of capacities 1 Loss of earning capacity 2 Loss of expolicy to do domestic work C Non-pecuniary loss 1 Pain and suffering 2 Loss of amenities

viii Contents



	D Overlap between different heads of loss	230
V	Benefits arising from an injury	231
VI	Claims based on injury to another person	233
	A Loss of an employee's services	234
	B Loss of consortium	235
VII	Actions on death	237
	A Claim by the estate of the deceased	237
	B Claim by the dependants of the deceased	239
Chapter 8	Compensation under the Australian Consumer Law	247
1	Introduction	248
Ш	Assessment of compensation	250
	A General principles	250
	B Compensation for misleading or deceptive conduct	251
	1 Reliance loss as the general measure of compensation	251
	2 Compensation of expectation loss	252
	3 Compensation of reliance loss in excess of expectation loss	253
	C Non-pecuniary loss	254
	D Certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance	256
III	Attribution of responsibility	256
	A The common sense test of causation	256
	B Factual causation	257
	C Scope of liability	258
	1 Intervening cause	258
	2 Foreseeability of the loss	259
	3 The purpose of the provision contravened	259
	4 The plaintiff's contribution to the loss	260
	D Multiple wrongdoers	262
Chapter 9	Equitable compensation for equitable wrongs	263
1	Introduction	264
II	Assessment of equitable compensation	266
	A Object of equitable compensation	266
	B Recoverability of non-pecuniary loss	267
	C Basic measure of equitable compensation	268
III	Attribution of responsibility	269
	A Breach of trust	270
	1 Independent non-wrongful event	270
	2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss	275
	B Breach of fiduciary duty	276
	1 Construction of the hypothetical world	276
	2 Intervening acts and remoteness of loss	281

Contents ix



	Contributory negligence     Mitigation     Breach of an equitable duty of care	283 285 286
	<ol> <li>Scope of liability</li> <li>Contributory negligence</li> </ol>	286 287
	2 Contributory negligence	201
	REMEDIES COMPELLING PERFORMANCE	
A	AND RELATED REMEDIES	289
Chapter 10	Specific performance	291
1	Introduction	292
II	The nature of specific performance	292
III	The relationship between specific performance and injunctions	294
IV	Inadequacy of damages and subject matter of contract	296
	A Inadequacy of damages	296
	B Subject matter of contract	299
	1 Contracts involving land	299
	<ul><li>2 Contracts involving goods</li><li>3 Contracts involving shares and stock</li></ul>	301 302
	4 Contracts to loan money	303
	5 Contracts for the benefit of third parties	304
	6 Contracts involving intellectual property	305
	7 Contracts for services	305
V	Other requirements for specific performance	306
	A Personal remedy	306
	B Binding contract	307
	1 Consideration	307
	2 Uncertainty	308
	3 Illegality	309
	4 Impossibility and futility	310
VI	Discretionary factors and bars to relief	312
	A General equitable bars to relief     1 Hardship and the public interest	312 313
	2 Lack of clean hands	314
	3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice	315
	B Bars to relief relevant only to specific performance	316
	1 Mutuality	317
	2 Continuous supervision and personal services	318
	3 Readiness and willingness	321
VII	Specific performance under the Australian Consumer Law	321
VIII	Specific restitution or specific delivery of property	322
IX	Debt as a species of specific relief?	324

x Contents



Chapter 11	injunctions	
1	Introduction	327
II	The rights protected by injunctions and inadequacy of damages  A Inadequacy of damages  B The rights protected by injunctions  1 Injury to property rights in land  2 Injury to property rights in goods and funds of money  3 Injury to intellectual property  4 Injury to economic rights  5 Injury to bodily integrity  6 Injury to reputation  7 Injury to privacy  8 Injunctions restraining breaches of negative covenant in a contract  9 Contracts for services	329 330 331 331 332 333 335 336 336
III	Quia timet injunctions	340
IV	Discretionary factors and bars to relief  A General equitable bars to relief  1 Hardship and the public interest  2 Lack of clean hands  3 Laches: delay with acquiescence and delay with prejudice  B Bars to injunctions that are equivalent to those in specific performance	341 341 342 343 343
V	Injunctions under statutes A Intellectual property B The Australian Consumer Law C The Corporations Act 2001 (Cth) D Other statutory injunctions	344 344 344 346 346
Chapter 12	'Equitable damages' or Lord Cairns' Act damages	347
I	Introduction	348
II	History	348
III	Advantages of Lord Cairns' Act damages for a plaintiff	349
IV	Jurisdiction to award Lord Cairns' Act damages	350
V	The need for a 'wrongful act' in some Australian jurisdictions  A Australian legislation which mentions 'wrongful act'  B Australian legislation which does not mention 'wrongful act'  C Lord Cairns' Act damages for statutory wrongdoing	352 352 353 354
VI	Factors influencing the exercise of the jurisdiction	354

Contents xi



	A General principles     1 Where specific relief is no longer available or in addition to specific relief	354 354
	<ul> <li>To provide a 'middle ground' solution between no relief and specific relief</li> <li>To provide relief for future losses</li> <li>To provide novel forms of relief</li> </ul>	355 358 358
	B The Shelfer criteria	359
VII	The basis of assessment  A Timing  B Gain-based relief – 'reasonable fee' awards  C Loss-based relief – compensatory awards of various kinds  1 Where specific relief was impossible, or in addition to specific relief  2 Future wrongdoing  3 To provide novel forms of relief	360 360 362 362 362 363 363
VIII	Discretionary bars to relief	364
IX	Part 9.5 of the Corporations Act 2001 (Cth)	365
X	The future of Lord Cairns' Act damages	365
PART 4 R	EMEDIES AS VINDICATION	367
Chapter 13	Self-help remedies	369
Chapter 13	Self-help remedies Introduction	<b>369</b> 370
•		
1	Introduction  Tort and self-help  A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass  B Self-defence of property  C Self-defence of the person  D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution	370 371 371 373 374 375
I	Introduction  Tort and self-help  A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass  B Self-defence of property  C Self-defence of the person  D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution  E Abatement of nuisance  Contract and self-help  A Rescission  B Liquidated damages and penalties  1 Is this a clause to which the penalties doctrine applies?  2 On the facts, is this clause a penalty?  3 Should we have a law against penalties at all?  C Debt	370 371 371 373 374 375 377 379 380 381 383 384 385
	Introduction  Tort and self-help  A Eviction of trespassers and protection of land and goods from trespass  B Self-defence of property  C Self-defence of the person  D Recaption, replevin and specific restitution  E Abatement of nuisance  Contract and self-help  A Rescission  B Liquidated damages and penalties  1 Is this a clause to which the penalties doctrine applies?  2 On the facts, is this clause a penalty?  3 Should we have a law against penalties at all?  C Debt  D Other stipulated contractual remedies	370 371 371 373 374 375 377 379 380 381 383 384 385 386

xii Contents



	А	The nature and history of exemplary damages in Australia	389
		1 Need to make out the 'host' cause of action	392
		2 Unavailable if criminal punishment already imposed	393
		3 Calculation of exemplary damages	394
	В	The causes of action for which exemplary damages	
		can be awarded in Australia	395
		1 Exemplary damages available for tort	396
		2 Exemplary damages available for breach of some statutes	398
		3 Exemplary damages not available for breach of contract	399
		4 Exemplary damages not available for equitable wrongdoing	402
		5 Exemplary damages not available for breaches of	
		Australian Consumer Law	404
	С	Normative objections to exemplary damages generally	405
	D	Conclusion on exemplary damages	406
III	Aggr	avated damages	407
	Α	The distinction between exemplary damages and aggravated	
		damages	407
	В	Availability of aggravated damages in Australian law	409
		1 Aggravated damages available for tort	409
		2 Aggravated damages available for some statutory	
		causes of action	411
		3 Aggravated damages not available for contract	411
		4 Aggravated damages not available for equitable	
		wrongdoing	411
		5 Aggravated damages available for breaches of the	
		Australian Consumer Law	412
IV	'Vind	icatory damages'	413
Chapter 1	5 Apol	logies and declaratory relief	415
1	Intro	duction	416
II	Apolo	ogies, declarations and nominal damages	416
	Α	Apologies	416
	В	Declarations, nominal damages and contemptuous damages	420
		1 Declarations	420
		2 Nominal damages	425
		3 Contemptuous damages	426
III	Othe	r vindicatory remedies under the Australian Consumer Law	427
PART 5	ACCO	UNT OF PROFITS AND OTHER	
(	GAIN-	BASED RELIEF FOR WRONGS	429
Chapter 1	6 Disg	orgement of gains and 'reasonable fee' damages	431
I	Intro	duction	432

Contents

xiii



II	The o	distinction between compensation, restitution and disgorgemen	t
	and t	the nature of gain-based remedies	433
	Α	Compensation	433
	В	Restitution	433
	С	Disgorgement	434
Ш	Disg	orgement	435
	Α	Equity and the account of profits	435
	В	Election	438
	С	Intellectual property and the account of profits	438
	D	Torts and 'waiver of tort'	441
	Е	Breach of contract	443
	F	The Australian Consumer Law	447
IV	'Rea	sonable fee' damages	448
	Α	Introduction and history	448
	В	Academic and judicial accounts	449
		1 Compensatory analyses	449
		2 Restitutionary analyses	451
		3 Restitutionary and/or compensatory analyses	451
		4 Vindicatory analyses	451
		5 Property or exclusive entitlement analyses	452
		6 Partial disgorgement analyses	452
		7 Conclusion	452
	С	General patterns	453
	D	Equity	453
	Е	Intellectual property	454
	F	Tort	455
		1 Torts protecting proprietary rights in land	455
		2 Torts protecting proprietary rights in goods	457
		3 Other torts	458
	G	Contract	459
V	Allow	vances, discretionary factors and bars to relief	460
	Α	Allowances for skill and effort	461
		1 Allowances for skill and effort for breach of	
		fiduciary duty	461
		2 Allowances for skill and effort for intellectual property	
		breaches	463
		3 Allowances for skill and effort and disgorgement	
		in contract	464
	В	Discretionary factors and bars to relief	464
		1 Hardship	464
		2 Lack of clean hands	465
		3 Delay and acquiescence	465
VI	The 1	future of gain-based relief in Australia	467

xiv Contents



PART 6 RI	ESTITUTION AND GIVING BACK	469
Chapter 17	Personal remedies for unjust enrichment	471
1	Introduction	472
II	The elements of unjust enrichment	475
III	Precise remedies for unjust enrichment	477
	A Money claims	477
	B Services claims	477
157	C Goods claims	479
IV	Defences to a claim for restitution	479
V	The relationship between contract and restitution for unjust enrichment	480
Chapter 18	Rescission	485
1	Introduction	486
	A Legal rescission	488
	B Equitable rescission	489
	C Rescission under the Australian Consumer Law	490
II	The requirement of restitutio in integrum	491
III	Election	494
	A How to make an election to rescind	495
	B The consequences of an election to rescind C The reasons behind the election requirement	496 499
IV	'Partial' rescission	499
V	Bars to rescission  A Impossibility of complete restoration	501 502
	B Affirmation	502
	C Delay	503
	D Intervening third party rights	504
	E Executed contracts and innocent misrepresentation	506
PART 7 PI	ROPRIETARY REMEDIES	509
Chapter 19	Proprietary remedies	511
1	Introduction	512
II	Proprietary remedies	513
	A Constructive and resulting trusts	513
	B Proprietary powers	516
	C Equitable liens	517
III	Criteria for award of proprietary remedies  A Proprietary remedies and unconscionability	518 520

ΧV

Contents



B Proprietary remedies and perfection	521
C Proprietary remedies and unjust enrichment	522
D Proprietary remedies and wrongdoing	527
Discretionary factors and bars to relief	531
The need for more defined criteria	531
NFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES	533
Enforcement of remedies	535
Introduction	536
Interlocutory injunctions	536
, ,	537
	538
C The balance of convenience	540
1 Likelihood of success	540
2 Irreparable injury, hardship and inadequacy of damages	
to the plaintiff	541
3 Hardship to the defendant and third parties	542
4 Adequacy of undertaking as to damages for the defendant	543
5 Delay on the part of the plaintiff	543
6 Example of the balancing process	543
D Mandatory interlocutory injunctions	544
E Quia timet interlocutory injunctions	545
F Interlocutory injunctions which finally determine the matter	545
G Undertakings as to damages	546
H Interim injunctions under statute	546
Other pre-judgment remedies	547
A Arrest of the person	547
B Freezing orders (Mareva orders)	549
C Search orders (Anton Piller orders)	551
Post-judgment enforcement	552
A Enforcement of money remedies	553
1 Historical background	553
2 Current Australian law	553
B Enforcement of specific remedies	557
1 Enforcement against property	557
2 Coercive enforcement: imprisonment, sequestration	
and fines	557
	C Proprietary remedies and unjust enrichment D Proprietary remedies and wrongdoing  Discretionary factors and bars to relief  The need for more defined criteria  NFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES  Enforcement of remedies  Introduction  Interlocutory injunctions  A Legal, equitable or statutory right B 'Serious question to be tried' (or a 'prima facie case')  C The balance of convenience  1 Likelihood of success 2 Irreparable injury, hardship and inadequacy of damages to the plaintiff 3 Hardship to the defendant and third parties 4 Adequacy of undertaking as to damages for the defendant 5 Delay on the part of the plaintiff 6 Example of the balancing process  D Mandatory interlocutory injunctions  E Quia timet interlocutory injunctions  F Interlocutory injunctions which finally determine the matter  G Undertakings as to damages  H Interim injunctions under statute  Other pre-judgment remedies A Arrest of the person B Freezing orders (Mareva orders) C Search orders (Anton Piller orders)  Post-judgment enforcement A Enforcement of money remedies 1 Historical background 2 Current Australian law  B Enforcement of specific remedies  1 Enforcement against property 2 Coercive enforcement: imprisonment, sequestration

xvi Contents

Index

561



## **PREFACE**

The second edition of this text seeks to build on the strengths of the first edition in presenting a detailed, scholarly map of remedies in Australian private law, which is intended to be helpful to judges, professionals, scholars and students.

Since the last edition, there have been several Australian cases which have required consideration. They include *Badenach v Calvert* [2016] HCA 18, (2016) 257 CLR 440 (on the availability of damages for loss of a chance in negligence), *Westpac Banking Corporation v Jamieson* [2015] QCA 50, [2016] 1 Qd R 495 (on alternative investments and calculation of damages for misrepresentation), *Stone v Chappell* [2017] SASCFC 72, (2017) 128 SASR 165 (on damages for rectification costs in excess of diminution in value), *Gray v Richards* [2014] HCA 40, (2014) 253 CLR 660 (on damages for fund management costs in personal injury cases), *Paciocco v Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd* [2016] HCA 28, (2016) 258 CLR 525 (on penalty clauses in contracts), *Cheng v Farjudi* [2016] NSWCA 316, (2016) 93 NSWLR 95 (on the availability of exemplary damages) and *Australian Financial Services and Leasing Pty Ltd v Hills Industries Ltd* [2014] HCA 14, (2014) 253 CLR 560, (on unjust enrichment law and its relationship with equity).

We also consider several new overseas cases, mainly from the United Kingdom, in particular AIB Group (UK) plc v Mark Redler & Co Solicitors [2014] UKSC 58, [2015] AC 1503 (on equitable compensation for breach of trust), Lawrence v Fen Tigers Ltd [2014] AC 822, [2014] UKSC 13 (on nuisance, injunctions and Lord Cairns' Act damages), Cavendish Square Holding BVv Makdessi [2015] UKSC 67, [2016] AC 1172 (on penalty clauses in contracts), One Step (Support) Ltd v Morris-Garner [2016] EWCA Civ 180, [2017] QB 1 (on gain-based relief in contract) and FHR European Ventures LLP v Mankarious [2014] UKSC 45, [2015] AC 250 (on proprietary remedies for bribes taken in breach of fiduciary duty).

In addition to incorporating new material, we have made changes to some of the existing material. In Chapter 2, we have extended the discussion of *British Westinghouse Electric and Manufacturing Co Ltd v Underground Electric Railways Company of London Ltd* [1912] AC 673 and the avoided loss rule, and we have reorganised the discussion of certainty of loss and recovery for the loss of a chance in order to make the various categories of case clearer. In Chapter 5, we have added a more detailed discussion of *Clark v Macourt* [2013] HCA 56, (2013) 253 CLR 1. In Chapter 14, we have added a section on vindicatory damages. The sections on debt and specific restitution are now integrated into the discussion of specific relief in Chapter 11. We have also reorganised some of the material in Chapters 3 and 12.

As in the first edition, the primary responsibility for Chapters 2 to 9 lay with Sirko and the primary responsibility for the other chapters lay with Katy, but the text is very much a joint work. We have considered material available to us before 1 December 2017.

xvii



Katy would like to thank her family (Scott, Eloise, Josh and Hamish) for supporting her through the book revision process. She would also like to thank her JD and Masters students at Melbourne Law School for making her constantly think about how to present the law of remedies more clearly. Special thanks to Stephanie McHugh for providing research assistance to Katy.

Sirko would like to thank his family (Huan, Oliver and Alina) for their constant support. He would also like to thank Professor Harold Luntz for insightful conversations about various issues relating to damages for personal injury or death.

We both would like to thank the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments. We would also like to thank Tanya Bastrakova, Lucy Russell, Shelley Barons and the other staff at Cambridge University Press for their professionalism and patience during the revision process.

Katy Barnett Sirko Harder January 2018

xviii Preface



### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The authors and Cambridge University Press would like to thank the following for permission to reproduce material in this book.

**Text extracts on pages 12–13** from *Roxborough v Rothmans of Pall Mall Australia Ltd* [2001] HCA 68, (2001) 208 CLR 516; **136** and **154** from *Commonwealth v Amann Aviation Pty Ltd* (1991) 174 CLR 64; **514**, **519** and **526** from *Muschinski v Dodds* (1985) 160 CLR 583, reproduced with permission of Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia Limited, legal.thomsonreuters.com.au. **Text extracts on page 555** from *Choice Investments Ltd v Jeromnimon Midland Bank Ltd, Garnishee* [1981] QB 149 reproduced with permission of the Incorporated Council of Law Reporting (ICLR) for England and Wales.

Every effort has been made to trace and acknowledge copyright. The publisher apologises for any accidental infringement and welcomes information that would redress this situation.



# TABLE OF CASES

2144 Broke Road Pty Ltd v ACN 062 859 358 Pty Ltd [2010] NSWSC 489, 149

A v Bottrill [2003] 1 AC 449, 393, 397 A v New South Wales (2007) 230 CLR 500, 396, 409 A H McDonald & Co Pty Ltd v Wells (1931) 45 CLR 506, 305, 492, 499 A Schroeder Music Publishing Co Ltd v Macaulay [1974] 3 All ER 616, 305 AB v South West Water Services Ltd [1992] QB 507, 392, 410 AB Corporation v CD Co [2002] 1 Lloyd's Rep 805, 446 Abbey Forwarding Ltd v Hone (No 3) [2015] Ch 309, 550 Abbott v Kasza (1976) 71 DLR (3d) 581, 94 Aberdeen Development Co v Makiel, Ramsay & Taylor [1977] SLT 177, 424 Abigroup Contractors Pty Ltd v Sydney Catchment Authority (No 3) (2006) 67 NSWLR 341, 253 ABN AMRO Bank NV v Bathurst Regional Council (2014) 224 FCR 1, 60, 279 ACES System Development Pte Ltd v Yenty Lily [2013] 4 SLR 1317, 451 Ackerley v Palmer [1910] VLR 339, 334 Ackland v Commonwealth (2007) Aust Torts Reports 81–916, 107–8 Adams v Kennedy (2000) 49 NSWLR 78, 396 Addax Ltd v Arcadia Petroleum Ltd [2000] 1 Lloyd's Rep 493, 141 Addenbrooke Pty Ltd v Duncan (No 2) (2017) 348 ALR 1, 257 Adderley v Dixon (1824) 57 ER 239, 299, 302 Addis v Gramophone Co Ltd [1909] AC 488, 156, 158, 399-400, 411 Adeels Palace Pty Ltd v Moubarak (2009) 239 CLR 420, 79-80, 96 Adelaide Stevedoring Co Ltd v Forst (1940) 64 CLR 538, 86 ADI v Aerospace Systems Management Pty Ltd [2003] NSWSC 758, 544 Administrative and Clerical Officers Association v Commonwealth (1979) 26 ALR 497, 295, 538 Aequitas Ltd v Sparad No 100 Ltd (2001) 19 ACLC 1006, 505 Aerospatiale Societe Nationale Industrielle v Aerospatiale Helicopters Pty Ltd (1986) 11 FCR 38, AFA Airconditioning Pty Ltd v Mendrecki (2008) 101 SASR 381, 222 Agricultural Land Management Ltd v Jackson (No 2) (2014) 48 WAR 1, 17, 269, 274-5 AI McLean Pty Ltd v Hayson [2008] NSWSC 927, 80 AIB Group (UK) plc v Mark Redler & Co Solicitors [2015] AC 1503, 60, 101–2, 270, 272–3, 275 Ailakis v Olivero (2014) 100 ACSR 524, 138 Ainsworth v Criminal Justice Commission (1992) 175 CLR 564, 422-3 Air Express Ltd v Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd (1979) 146 CLR 249, 537, 546

ХX

Air Manymak v Jeffs [2006] NTCA 12, 223

Airloom Holdings Pty Ltd v Thales Australia Ltd [2011] NSWSC 1513, 136

Akron Securities Ltd v Iliffe (1997) 41 NSWLR 353, 7, 490 Alacina Pty Ltd v Townsville Port Authority [2009] QSC 126, 349



> Alameddine v Glenworth Valley Horse Riding Pty Ltd (2015) 324 ALR 355, 248, 250 Alati v Kruger (1955) 94 CLR 216, 379, 487, 489, 492, 494, 496, 501-2 Albion Insurance Co Ltd v Government Insurance Office (NSW) (1969) 121 CLR 342, 116 Alcan Gove Pty Ltd v Zabic (2015) 257 CLR 1, 91 Alcoa Portland Aluminium Pty Ltd v Victoria WorkCover Authority (2007) 18 VR 146, 218 Aldersea v Public Transport Corporation (2001) 3 VR 499, 188, 209, 409 Alexander v Cambridge Credit Corporation Ltd (1987) 9 NSWLR 310, 75-6, 93-4, 162 Alexander v Perpetual Trustees WA Ltd (2004) 216 CLR 109, 265, 335 Alfred McAlpine Construction Ltd v Panatown Ltd [2001] 1 AC 518, 148 Allan v Fletcher (2001) 79 SASR 559, 203-4 Allan v Loadsman [1975] 2 NSWLR 789, 222 Allan v Snyder [1977] 2 NSWLR 685, 522 Allcard v Skinner (1887) 36 Ch D 145, 489, 504, 523, 525, 531 Allen v Chadwick (2014) 120 SASR 350, 219, 230 Allen v Chadwick (2015) 256 CLR 148, 202-3, 218 Allen v Jambo Holdings Ltd [1980] 1 WLR 1251, 549 Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Girone [2011] QCA 245, 225 Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v GSF Australia Pty Ltd (2005) 221 CLR 568, 75, 259 Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Kerr (2012) 83 NSWLR 302, 221, 223 Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Waterbrook at Yowie Bay Pty Ltd [2009] NSWCA 224, 95, 97 Allianz Australia Ltd v Sim (2012) 10 DDCR 325, 87, 91 Allied Irish Banks plc v Byrne [1995] 2 FLR 325, 499 Allison v Hewitt (1974) 3 DCR (NSW) 193, 158 Alucraft Pty Ltd (in liq) v Grocon Ltd (No 2) [1996] 2 VR 386, 148 Amaca Pty Ltd v Banton (2007) 5 DDCR 314, 396 Amaca Pty Ltd v Booth (2011) 246 CLR 36, 82, 86-7, 89, 91 Amaca Pty Ltd v Ellis (2010) 240 CLR 111, 88, 91 Amaca Pty Ltd v King (2011) 35 VR 280, 86 Amaca Pty Ltd v New South Wales (2003) 199 ALR 596, 120 Amaltal Corporation Ltd v Maruha Corporation [2007] 3 NZLR 192, 279, 283 Amcor Ltd v Barnes [2012] VSC 434, 315 Amec Developments Ltd v Jury's Hotel Management (UK) Ltd [2001] 1 EGLR 81, 446, 467 American Baseball and Athletic Association v Harper, 54 Central Law Journal 449 (1902), 339  $American\ Broadcasting\ Company\ v\ Wolf,\ 438\ NYS\ (2d)\ 482\ (1981),\ \textbf{339}$ American Cynamid Co v Ethicon [1975] AC 396, 537-9, 541 Amertek Inc v Canadian Commercial Corporation (2003) 229 DLR (4th) 419, 10, 443 Amertek Inc v Canadian Commercial Corporation (2005) 256 DLR (4th) 287, 443 AMEV-UDC Finance Ltd v Austin (1986) 162 CLR 170, 383, 386 Amoco Australia Pty Ltd v Rocca Bros Motor Engineering Co Pty Ltd (1975) 133 CLR 331, 338 AMP Bank Ltd v Brown [2017] NSWSC 313, 117 AMP General Insurance Ltd v Roads and Traffic Authority of NSW (2001) Aust Torts Reports 81-619, 193, 195, 240 Ampol Petroleum Ltd v Mutton (1952) 53 SR (NSW) 1, 337 Anchor Brewhouse Developments Pty Ltd v Berkley House (Dockland Developments) Pty Ltd [1987] 2 EGLR 173, **331** Ancient Order of Foresters in Victoria Friendly Society Ltd v Lifeplan Australia Friendly Society

> > Table of cases xxi

Ltd [2017] HCATrans 210, 266

Andar Transport Pty Ltd v Brambles Ltd (2004) 217 CLR 424, 121



```
Anderson v Hotel Capital Trading Pty Ltd [2003] NSWSC 1195, 97
Andjelic v Marsland (1996) 186 CLR 20, 60, 70
Andrew Shelton & Co Pty Ltd v Alpha Healthcare Ltd (2002) 5 VR 577, 478
Andrews v Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd (2011) 211 FCR 53, 381
Andrews v Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd (2012) 247 CLR 205, 380-3
Andrews v John Fairfax & Sons Ltd [1980] 2 NSWLR 225, 173-4, 408
Angel v Jay [1911] 1 KB 666, 506
Anglia Television Ltd v Reed [1972] 1 QB 60, 153, 155
\label{lem:angle_loss} \textit{Anglo Cyprian Trade Agencies v Paphos Wine Industries Ltd} \ [1951] \ 1 \ All \ ER \ 873, \ \textbf{425}
Anglo-Newfoundland Development Co Ltd v Pacific Steam Navigation Co Ltd [1924] AC 406,
    199
Anthanasopoulos v Moseley (2001) 52 NSWLR 262, 181
Anthony v Haney (1832) 131 ER 372, 375-6
Anton Piller KG v Manufacturing Processes Ltd [1976] Ch 55, 551-2
Anyco Pty Ltd v Kleeman (2008) Aust Torts Reports 81-933, 46, 84
ANZ Executors and Trustees Ltd v Humes Ltd [1990] VR 615, 303, 313, 315
Aquaculture Corporation v New Zealand Green Mussel Co Ltd [1990] 3 NZLR 299, 402
Aquagenics Pty Ltd v Break O'Day Council (2010) 20 Tas R 239, 122, 128
Archer v Brown [1985] QB 401, 409
Archer v Williams [2003] EMLR 869, 267
Archibald v Powlett [2017] VSCA 259, 160, 214
Ardlethan Options Ltd v Easdown (1915) 20 CLR 285, 109
Argy v Blunts & Lane Cove Real Estate Pty Ltd (1990) 26 FCR 112, 258, 260
Aristoc Industries Pty Ltd v RA Wenham (Builders) Pty Ltd [1965] NSWR 581, 301, 314, 323, 332,
    338, 512
Aristocrat Technologies Australia Pty Ltd v DAP Services (Kempsey) Pty Ltd (2007) 157 FCR 564,
    398, 411
Armour v Fewster [2004] SADC 1, 138
Armoury v Delamirie (1722) 93 ER 664, 456
Armstrong v Sheppard & Short Ltd [1959] 2 QB 384, 315, 425
Armstrong Strategic Management and Marketing Pty Ltd v Expense Reduction Analysts Group
    Pty Ltd [2013] NSWSC 457, 311
Arnott v Choy (2010) 56 MVR 390, 109-10
Arthur Robinson (Grafton) Pty Ltd v Carter (1968) 122 CLR 649, 220
AS v Murray [2013] NSWSC 733, 396
ASA Constructions Pty Ltd v Iwanov [1975] 1 NSWLR 512, 352
Ashby v White (1703) 92 ER 126, 19
Ashburst v Mason (1875) LR 20 Eq 225, 116
Ashrafi Persian Trading Co Pty Ltd v Ashrafinia (2001) Aust Torts Reports 81-636, 95
Associated Grocers Co-operative Ltd v Hubbard Properties Pty Ltd (No 2) (1986) 45 SASR, 142
Associated Midland Corporation Ltd v Bank of New South Wales [1983] 1 NSWLR 533, 182
Associated Newspapers Group plc v Insert Media Ltd (1989) IPR 345, 341
Associated Newspapers Ltd v Bancks (1951) 83 CLR 322, 386
Association of Quality Child Care Centres of NSW Inc v Manefield (2012) Aust Torts Reports
    82-103, 176
Astley v Austrust Ltd (1999) 197 CLR 1, 107, 167-8, 202, 284
Athens-MacDonald Travel Service Pty Ltd v Kazis [1970] SASR 264, 158
Atherton v T M Building Consultants Pty Ltd [2014] NSWCATCD 255, 145
```

xxii Table of cases



> Atkinson v Hastings Deering (Qld) Pty Ltd (1985) 8 FCR 481, 140 Atlas Steels (Australia) Pty Ltd v Atlas Steels Ltd (1948) 49 SR (NSW) 157, 305, 338 Attorney-General v Albany Hotel Co [1892] 2 Ch 696, 546 Attorney-General v Aspinall (1837) 40 ER 773, 334 Attorney-General v Blake [1998] Ch 439, 445 Attorney-General v Blake [2001] 1 AC 268, 3, 10, 362, 443-7, 449, 451, 453-4, 459-60 Attorney-General v Great Eastern Railway Company (1872) 25 LT 867, 545 Attorney-General v Hallett (1847) 153 ER 1316, 541 Attorney-General v Observer Ltd [1990] 1 AC 109, 435, 439 Attorney-General v Sheffield Gas Consumers Co (1853) 43 ER 119, 329 Attorney-General for England and Wales v The Queen [2002] 2 NZLR 91, 443 Attorney-General for Hong Kong v Reid [1994] 1 AC 324, 513, 529, 531 Attorney-General (NSW) v Perpetual Trustee Co Ltd (1955) 92 CLR 113, 234 Attorney-General of Trinidad and Tobago v Ramanoop [2006] 1 AC 328, 413 Auspac Trade International Pty Ltd v Victorian Dairy Industry Authority (Supreme Court of Victoria, Southwell, Nathan and O'Bryan JJ, 22 February 1994), 140 Australasian Meat Industry Employee's Union v Mudginberri Station Pty Ltd (1986) 161 CLR Australasian Performing Rights Association v Grebo Trading Co Pty Ltd (1978) 23 ACTR 30, Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd v Westpac Banking Corporation (1988) 164 CLR 662, 473 Australia and New Zealand Banking Group Ltd v Widin (1990) 26 FCR 21, 307 Australian Breeders Co-operative Society Ltd v Jones (1997) 150 ALR 488, 118 Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Comalco Ltd (1986) 12 FCR 510, 111, 173-4 Australian Broadcasting Corporation v Lenah Game Meats Pty Ltd (2001) 208 CLR 199, 3, 329, 336, 537-8 Australian Broadcasting Corporation v McBride (2001) 53 NSWLR 430, 174 Australian Broadcasting Corporation v O'Neill (2006) 227 CLR 57, 334, 336, 537, 539–41 Australian Coarse Grain Pool Pty Ltd v Barley Marketing Board of Queensland (1982) 46 ALR Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v AirAsia Berhad Co [2012] FCA 1413, 422 Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v Dataline.Net.Au Pty Ltd (in liq) (2007) 161 FCR 513, 345 Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v Dermalogica Pty Ltd (2006) 149 FCR 135, 345 Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v Midland Brick Co Pty Ltd (2004) 207 ALR 329, 422 Australian Competition and Consumer Commission v Top Snack Foods Pty Ltd (1999) ATPR 41-708, 412 Australian Consolidated Press Ltd v Morgan (1965) 112 CLR 483, 558 Australian Consolidated Press Ltd v Uren (1967) 117 CLR 221, 391-2 Australian Financial Services and Leasing Pty Ltd v Hills Industries Ltd (2014) 253 CLR 560, Australian Hardwoods Pty Ltd v Commissioner for Railways [1961] 1 WLR 425, 293 Australian and International Pilots Association v Qantas Airways Ltd [2011] FCA 1487,

Australian National Airlines Commission v Commonwealth (1986) 17 FCR 445, 544

Table of cases xxiii



Australian Paper Ltd v Communications, Electrical, Electronic, Energy, Information, Postal, Plumbing and Allied Services Union (1998) 81 IR 15, 545

Australian Safeway Stores Pty Ltd v Zaluzna (1987) 162 CLR 479, 374

Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Australian Property Custodian Holdings Ltd (2014) 322 ALR 45, **275** 

Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Drake (No 2) (2016) 340 ALR 75, 287 Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Mauer-Swisse Securities Ltd (2002) 42 ACSR 605, 547

Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Parkes (2001) 38 ACSR 355, **547** Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Pegasus Leveraged Options Group Pty Ltd

(2002) 41 ACSR 561, **547**Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Rich (2009) 236 FLR 1, **286** 

Australian Securities and Investments Commission v Triton Underwriting Insurance Agency (2008) 48 ACSR 249, 547

Australian Telecommunications Commission v Parsons (1985) 59 ALR 535, 241-2

Australian Winch and Haulage Co Pty Ltd v Collins [2013] NSWCA 327, 42, 55

Autodesk Inc v Yee (1996) 68 FCR 391, 398

Automotive, Food, Metals, Engineering, Printing and Kindred Industries Union v McCain Foods (Australia) Pty Ltd [2012] FCA 1126, 306

Avram v Gusakoski (2006) 31 WAR 400, 201

AW v New South Wales [2005] NSWSC 543, 396

Awad v Twin Creeks Properties Pty Ltd [2012] NSWCA 200, 490-1

Axiak v Ingram (2012) 82 NSWLR 36, 205

Aynsley v Glover (1874) LR 18 Eq 544, 351, 355

Aynsley v Glover [1875] LR 10 Ch App 283, 355

B v Reineker [2015] NSWSC 949, 67

B J McAdam Pty Ltd v Jax Tyres Pty Ltd (No 3) [2012] FCA 1438, 162

Babanaft International Co SA v Bassatne [1990] Ch 13, 551

Bacchus Marsh Concentrated Milk Co Ltd (in liq) v Joseph Nathan & Co Ltd (1919) 26 CLR 410, 338

Backwell v AAA [1997] 1 VR 182, 396, 409-10

Badenach v Calvert (2016) 257 CLR 440, 41, 43, 53-4

Badman v Drake [2008] NSWSC 1366, 489, 501, 523, 525, 531

Baghdadi v Quality P & M Smallgoods Pty Ltd [2008] NSWSC 406, 215

Baguley v Lifestyle Homes Mackay Pty Ltd [2015] QCA 75, 62

Bahr v Nicolay (No 2) (1988) 164 CLR 604, 305, 321

Baig v Baig [1970] VR 833, **303** 

Bailey v Namol Pty Ltd (1994) 53 FCR 102, 398-9, 411

Bailey v Nominal Defendant [2004] QCA 344, 97

Bailey v Truth and Sportsman Ltd (1938) 60 CLR 700, 426

Baily v Taylor (1829) 39 ER 28, **439** 

Bain v Fothergill (1874) LR 7 HL 158, 141

Baird v BCE Holdings Pty Ltd (1996) 40 NSWLR 374, 507

Baird v Roberts [1977] 2 NSWLR 389, 222

Baird Textile Holdings Ltd v Marks & Spencer plc [2001] CLC 999, 1017, 135

Bak v Glenleigh Homes Pty Ltd [2006] NSWCA 10, 107

Baker v Bolton (1808) 170 ER 1033, **239** 

xxiv Table of cases



Baker v Mackenzie (2015) 72 MVR 421, 217

Baker v Willoughby [1970] AC 467, 85, 101-3

Balanced Securities Ltd v Bianco (No 2) (2010) 27 VR 599, 72, 178, 455

Balls v Strutts (1841) 66 ER 984, 334

Balnaves v Smith [2012] OSC 192, 224

Baltic Shipping Co v Dillon (1993) 176 CLR 344, 156-9, 161, 163, 209, 227, 411, 473

Bamford v Albert Shire Council (1996) 93 LGERA 335, 185

Bamford v Albert Shire Council [1998] 2 Qd R 125, 63, 141, 185

Banco de Portugal v Waterlow and Sons Ltd [1932] AC 452, 111

Bank of America Canada v Mutual Trust Co [2002] 2 SCR 601, 10, 443

Bank of Credit and Commerce International SA v Ali (No 2) [2002] 3 All ER 750, 75

Bank Mellat v Kazmi [1989] QB 541, 558

Bank of New Zealand v New Zealand Guardian Trust Co Ltd [1999] 1 NZLR 664, 287

Bank of Nova Scotia v Hellenic Mutual War Risks Association (Bermuda) Ltd (The Good Luck) [1990] 1 QB 818, **168** 

Bankstown Foundry Pty Ltd v Braistina (1986) 160 CLR 301, 205

Bannister & Hunter Pty Ltd v Transition Resort Holdings Pty Ltd (No 2) [2013] NSWSC 1943, 148

Barbagallo v J & F Catelan Pty Ltd [1986] 1 Qd R 245, 178-9, 349, 352, 358, 363

Barclay v Penberthy (2012) 246 CLR 258, 234-5, 239

Barclays Bank plc v Fairclough Building Ltd [1995] QB 214, 168

Barclays Bank plc v O'Brien [1994] 1 AC 180, 502, 504-5

Bargen v State Government Insurance Office (Queensland) (1982) 154 CLR 318, 119

Barlow v Neville Jeffress Advertising Pty Ltd (1994) 4 Tas R 391, 341

Barnard v Towill (1998) 72 SASR 27, 204

Barnes v Addy (1874) LR 9 Ch App 244, 515

Barnes v Forty Two International Pty Ltd (2014) 316 ALR 408, 41, 257

Barnett v Chelsea and Kensington Hospital Management Committee [1969] 1 QB 428, 74

Barrett v Lets Go Adventures Pty Ltd (2016) 23 DCLR (NSW) 329, 78, 212

Bartlett v Arbuckle [2004] WASC 169, 157

Bartlett v Bartlett (1845) 67 ER 800, **335** 

Bartley v Myers (2002) 83 SASR 183, 259

Barton v Armstrong [1976] AC 104, **489** 

Batchelor v Burke (1981) 148 CLR 448, 70

Bateman v Face Accountants Pty Ltd (2010) 81 ATR 102, 253

Bateman v Nominal Defendant (2012) 15 DCLR (NSW) 239, 201

Bathurst City Council v PWC Properties Pty Ltd (1998) 195 CLR 566, 519, 528

Bathurst Regional Council v Local Government Financial Services Pty Ltd (No 5) [2012] FCA 1200, 124, 128

Baud v Brook (1973) 40 DLR (3d) 418, 323

Baume v Commonwealth (1906) 4 CLR 97, 425

Baumgartner v Baumgartner (1987) 164 CLR 137, 513, 521-2, 526

Baxall Securities Ltd v Sheard Walshaw Partnership [2002] BLR 100, 184

Baxter v Four Oaks Properties Ltd [1965] Ch 816, 353, 358, 363

Bayer AG v Winter [1986] 1 WLR 497, **549** 

Baynard v Woolley (1855) 52 ER 729, 334

Bayne v Stephens (1908) 8 CLR 1, 68

Beach Petroleum NL v Kennedy (1999) 48 NSWLR 1, 265, 269, 274, 277, 279

Table of cases xxv



Beard v Richmond (1987) Aust Torts Reports 80-129, 97

BearingPoint Australia Pty Ltd v Robert Hillard [2008] VSC 115, 340

Beasley v Marshall (1985) 40 SASR 544, 215

Bechara v Campbell-Williams [2011] NSWCA 177, 256

Beck v Farrelly (1975) 13 SASR 17, 232

Becker v City of Marion Corporation [1977] AC 271, 421

Becker Group Ltd v Motion Picture Company of Australia Ltd [2004] FCA 630, 138

Beecham Group Ltd v Bristol Laboratories Pty Ltd (1968) 118 CLR 618, 537-41, 545

Beechwood Homes (NSW) Pty Ltd v Camenzuli [2010] NSWSC 521, 333-4

Behnke v Bede Shipping Co Ltd [1927] 1 KB 649, 301–2

Belan v Casey (2003) 57 NSWLR 670, 116

Belgrave Nominees Pty Ltd v Barlin-Scott Airconditioning (Australia) Pty Ltd [1984] VR 947, 330

Bellgrove v Eldridge (1954) 90 CLR 613, 144, 147-8

Bellingen Shire Council v Colavon Pty Ltd (2012) 188 LGERA 169, 195

Bendal Pty Ltd v Mirvac Project Pty Ltd (1991) 23 NSWLR 464, 331, 356-7, 456

 $Bendigo\ and\ Country\ Districts\ Trustees\ and\ Executors\ Co\ Ltd\ v\ Sandburst\ and\ Northern$ 

District Trustees, Executors and Agency Co Ltd (1909) 9 CLR 474, 341

Bendix Mintex Pty Ltd v Barnes (1997) 42 NSWLR 307, 90

Beneficial Finance Corporation v Alzden Pty Ltd (NSWSC Equity Division, 10 May 1993), 376

Benjamin v Currie [1958] VR 259, 241

Bennett v Estate of Talacko (dec'd) [2017] VSCA 163, 41

Bennett v Goodwin (2005) 62 ATR 515, 40, 182

Bennett v Minister of Community Welfare (1992) 176 CLR 408, 90, 95, 282

Beoco Ltd v Alfa Laval Co Ltd [1995] QB 137, 103

Berger v Boyles [1971] VR 321, **425** 

Bergman v Haertsch [2000] NSWSC 528, 410

Bernhard v Ellis [2016] WADC 10, 260

Bernstein of Leigh (Baron) v Skyviews & General Ltd [1978] QB 478, 331

Berryman v Hames Sharley (WA) Pty Ltd (2008) 38 WAR 1, 49

Berryman v London Borough of Hounslow (1998) 30 HLR 567, 168

Best v Samuel Fox & Co Ltd [1952] AC 716, 235

Beswick v Beswick [1968] AC 58, 296, 303-4, 541

Beswicke v Alner [1926] VLR 72, 331

Bethlehem Engineering Export Co v Christie, 105 F (2d) 933 (1939), 339

Betts v Neilson (1868) LR 3 Ch App 429, 358

BHP Coal Pty Ltd v O & K Orenstein & Koppel AG [2008] QSC 141, 181

BHPB Freight Pty Ltd v Cosco Oceania Chartering Pty Ltd (No 2) [2008] FCA 1656, 121

BHPB Freight Pty Ltd v Cosco Oceania Chartering Pty Ltd (No 3) [2009] FCA 1087, 260

BI (Contracting) Pty Ltd v Strikwerda (2005) 3 DDCR 149, 244

Bialkower v Acobs Pty Ltd (1998) 83 FCR 1, 117

Big River Timbers Pty Ltd v Stewart (1999) 9 BPR 16,605, 518

BigTinCan Pty Ltd v Ramsay [2013] NSWSC 1248, 44

Bilambil-Terranora Pty Ltd v Tweed Shire Council [1980] 1 NSWLR 465, 40, 182, 448, 457

Bilbie v Lumley (1802) 102 ER 448, 477

Bilyak v Pesor [2012] NSWSC 193, 264

Birch v Taubmans Ltd (1956) 57 SR (NSW) 93, 236

Bird v Holbrook (1828) 130 ER 911, 373-4

xxvi Table of cases