

PROCUREMENT BY INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

How do international organizations procure goods, services and works to carry out their institutional mission? How does this procurement activity affect individuals? Does the procurement relationship between international organizations and private subjects lead to an even distribution of rights and duties? Are international organizations accountable to private subjects and states when allocating their resources through procurement? This book explores the complex phenomenon of procurement by international organizations from the point of view of the relationship between international organizations and private subjects. It provides, for the first time, a systematization and conceptualization of the emerging rules and practices of procurement by international organizations. It also identifies the international political dynamics and interplay of interests underlying these rules and practices. In doing so, it shows how these dynamics shape the exercise of international public authority over private subjects, and the scope of private subjects' rights vis-à-vis international organizations.

Elisabetta Morlino is an assistant professor of administrative law at the University of Suor Orsola Benincasa of Naples. She holds a PhD in global administrative law from the Istituto Italiano di Scienze Umane (now part of the Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa) and an LLM in International Legal Studies from the New York University (NYU) School of Law. She has been Hugo Grotius Scholar at NYU and visiting scholar at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg. She has served as legal consultant for IFAD's Procurement Division in Rome and as an intern at the UN Office of Legal Affairs in New York. She is a member of ICON-S, the PCLG-Network, UACES and IRPA. She has previously published in the fields of global and European administrative law, international organizations and environmental protection.

PROCUREMENT BY
INTERNATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS

A Global Administrative Law Perspective

ELISABETTA MORLINO



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-40201-9 — Procurement by International Organizations
Elisabetta Morlino
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108402019

DOI: 10.1017/9781108235112

© Elisabetta Morlino 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Morlino, Elisabetta, author.

Title: Procurement by international organizations: a global administrative law perspective / Elisabetta Morlino, University of Naples.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018015877 | ISBN 9781108415750 (alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: International organizations. | International agencies – Law and legislation. |

International agencies – Rules and practice. | Administrative law. | Public contracts.

Classification: LCC KZ4850 .M67 2018 | DDC 352.5/3211–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018015877>

ISBN 978-1-108-41575-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-40201-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>List of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>List of Instruments</i>	xvi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxxviii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Setting the Questions	1
1.2 Research Design	7
1.3 Theoretical Framework	8
1.4 Structure of the Book	13
2 Procurement and International Organizations: A Conceptual Map	16
2.1 A Problem of Definition	16
2.2 Types of Organizations and Implications for Procurement	35
3 The Institutional Roots of Change: From Private Negotiations to Public Tenders	47
3.1 Introduction	47
3.2 The Institutionalization Phase: Contracts	47
3.3 The Emergence of Procurement Procedure and Its Problems (the 1960s and 1970s)	51
3.4 A System in Transition (the 1980s)	62

3.5	Administrative Reforms and Procurement Regulation (the 1990s)	70
3.6	Codification, Proceduralization and Publicization: Scope and Limits	95
4	The Regulatory Architecture: Principles and Practices	96
4.1	Introduction	96
4.2	The Law Applicable to Procurement	97
4.3	The Phases of the Procurement Procedure	109
4.4	Principles in Practice: Competition Through Indicators and Ladders of Transparency	121
4.5	Integrity: Rules of Conduct and Practices	194
4.6	Conclusions	202
5	Procurement Contracts and Limits to the Contractual Freedom of Private Parties and States	204
5.1	Introduction	204
5.2	Contracts and Limits to the Contractual Freedom of Private Parties in Direct Procurement	205
5.3	Contracts in Indirect Procurement and Limits to the Contractual Freedom of States	252
5.4	Conclusions	258
6	Contracts and Applicable Law: Blurring the Lines between Public and Private Law	261
6.1	Introduction	261
6.2	Theories and Practices in the History of International Organizations	262
6.3	The Current Approaches	270
6.4	Conclusions	286
7	Accountability in Procurement	288
7.1	Introduction	288

CONTENTS	vii
7.2 Operational Definitions and Components of International Organizations' Accountability	290
7.3 External Controls	295
7.4 Internal Controls on Direct Procurement	304
7.5 Inter-Institutional Controls On Indirect Procurement	319
7.6 Private Subjects' Rights vis-à-vis International Organizations	322
7.7 Conclusions	371
8 How the Interplay of Interests Shapes Procurement	376
8.1 Introduction	376
8.2 National Roots of Procurement Regulation and the Anomalous Legal Transplant	377
8.3 Interests and Principles: Dynamics in National Public Procurement	383
8.4 Interests and Principles: Dynamics in International Organizations' Procurement	389
9 Conclusions: Global Administrative Law for Procurement of International Organizations: Development and Limits	410
9.1 The Questions	410
9.2 Between Past and Future: Multipolarity as the Source of Global Administrative Law for Procurement	411
9.3 Proceduralization and New Rights: The Functionalization of Conflicting Interests and Its Limits	414
9.4 Contracts for Organizations: Privileges and Public-Private Regulatory Hybridization	418
9.5 Implications for the Legitimacy of International Organizations	423
<i>Bibliography</i>	429
<i>Index</i>	457

FIGURES

2.1 The triangle of proximity and institutional influence in international organizations' (IOs') procurement	<i>page</i> 35
2.2 Organizations of the UN system with highest procurement volumes (in millions of US dollars)	42
4.1 The European legal framework for public procurement	103
4.2 Organizations and reason giving	193

TABLES

2.1 Procurement by international organizations (IOs): A taxonomy	<i>page</i> 32
4.1 Competition by indicators	159
4.2 Ladders of transparency	163
4.3 Patterns of reason giving	192

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing a book is like a solo crossing of the Atlantic: long and, for the most part, solitary. Yet, you safely get to the destination with the help of those who provide you with navigation coordinates, who advise you of storms and droughts, who light beacons along your way and who give you fuel to speed you on. Many people have made such contributions to this adventure of mine.

Sabino Cassese, who was the first to give me travel maps, has my warmest gratitude for having always been an inexhaustible source of support and ideas.

Heartfelt thanks to Luisa Torchia, for showing me that Captain Courageous is really a woman and for spurring me on in my voyage, constantly expressing her trust, tenacious even when the destination seemed distant.

Very special thanks to Aldo Sandulli. I would never have had the serenity I needed to complete this work if he had not constantly counselled me along the way, as well as created the ideal conditions for study and research.

This book owes a lot to Stephan Schill and Joseph H.H. Weiler. I am deeply grateful to them for their support, advice and suggestions, which helped me to improve the manuscript.

For their detailed comments and observations on a preliminary version of this work, my thanks also go to Stefano Battini, Roberto Caranta, Lorenzo Casini, Giacinto Della Cananea, Claudio Franchini, Bernardo Giorgio Mattarella, Giulio Napolitano, Bernardo Sordi and Giulio Vesperini.

My research benefited from the generous sponsorship and hospitality of various universities and research centres in Europe and the United States. I am grateful to the Università Suor Orsola Benincasa in Naples, and in particular to Rector Lucio D'Alessandro, for believing in and sponsoring my research project; the New York University School of Law, and especially Richard B. Stewart and Catherine Kessedjian for

agreeing to supervise my first attempts to frame the issue; the Max Planck Institute of International and Comparative Law of Heidelberg with special thanks to Anne Peters and Armin Von Bogdandy.

An analysis and understanding of the empirical aspects that were the basis for the book was made possible thanks to my work with organizations, first as an intern at the United Nations Office of Legal Affairs and then as a consultant for IFAD, and thanks to the many accounts from permanent employees of international organizations, collected over a period of about seven years. In particular, I wish to thank Sandro Luzzietti and Matthias Meyerhans for giving me the opportunity to experience the daily practice of an organization. Special thanks also to Enrico Labriola, who has been not only a steady contact with whom I could share opinions and reflections on the activity of organizations; to Nikiforos P. Diamandouros, who allowed me to deepen the empirical aspects of the research within European institutions; and to Paul Buades for his helpfulness and for the frankness with which we were able to discuss sensitive issues. And thanks to all officials of the organizations I included in the research, for granting me interviews and giving me their time and best explanations: in particular, Maria Vicien-Milburn, Jay Pozenel, Enzo de Laurentiis, Hunt Lacascia, Luigi Ferrara, George Jadoun, Maria Teresa Pisani, Sergio Benetti, Michael Dethlefsen, Gian Domenico Spota, Gian Luigi Albano, João Sant'Anna, Gian Luigi Faura, Durante Rapacciuolo, Pierpaolo Settembri and Panagiotis Stamatopoulos. Many others have requested and been promised anonymity and therefore cannot be named here, but I am indebted to them for their patience and interest.

Cambridge University Press was superb. Thanks to Kim Hughes, Finola O' Sullivan, Gemma Smith, Abigail Neale and Samantha Town for their interest in the work and their patience in bringing it to life.

Warm thanks to Sylvia Gilbertson for her meticulous work and her care and speed in assisting me in revising the text.

Finally, this journey was made possible above all thanks to the daily, loving support of various people who were able to calm the storms and securely set the course during the years this work took shape.

I am deeply grateful to Giulia Bertezolo for her sincere and affectionate participation, and for teaching me that optimism is the first step towards the solution of any problem.

This book, as with every other enterprise I came across in my life, was made possible by the precious support of my sister Irene. To her goes my

daily unspoken thanks for being an oasis of love, understanding and sharing.

To my parents, I dedicate this book with infinite love and inextinguishable gratitude for making this – and everything else – possible, since the beginning.

LIST OF CASES

International Court of Justice

- ‘Certain Expenses of the United Nations. Advisory Opinion 20 July 1962’, 20 July 1962
 [1962] *ICJ Recueil des arrêts, avis consultatifs et ordonnances* 151
 ‘Reparation for Injuries Suffered in the Service of the United Nations. Advisory
 Opinion’ [1949] *ICJ Recueil des arrêts, avis consultatifs et ordonnances* 178

Court of Justice of the European Union

- Case C-113/07 P, *SELEX Sistemi Integrati SpA v. Commission and European
 Organisation for the Safety of Air Navigation (Eurocontrol)*, 26 March 2009, not
 published in the ECR
 Case C-182/91, *Forafrique Burkinabe SA v. Commission of European Communities*
 [1993] ECR I-2184
 Case C-267/82, *Développement SA e Clemessy v. Commission* [1986] ECR I-1907
 Case C-310/91, *Hugo Schmid v. Belgian State, represented by the Minister van Sociale
 Voorzorg* [1993] ECR I-3011
 Case C-364/92, *SAT Fluggesellschaft mbH v. European Organisation for the Safety of Air
 Navigation (Eurocontrol)* [1994] ECR I-43
 Case C-370/89, *SGEEM e Etroy v. BEI* [1992] ERC I-6211
 Case C-411/98, *Angelo Ferlini v. Centre Hospitalier de Luxembourg* [2000] ECR I-8081
 Case T-121/08, *PC-Ware Information Technologies v. Commission* [2010] ECR II-1541
 Case T-155/04, *SELEX Sistemi Integrati SpA v. Commission*, 12 December 2006, not
 published in the ECR
 Case T-160/03, *AFCon Management Consultants v. Commission of the European
 Communities* [2005] ECR II-981
 Case T-199/14, *Vanbreda Risk & Benefits v. Commission*, 29 October 2015, not pub-
 lished in the ECR
 Case T-211/07, *AWWW v. Eurofound*, 1 July 2008, not published in the ECR
 Case T-216/09, *Astrim e Elyo Italia v. Commission*, 25 October 2012, not published in
 the ECR
 Case T-299/11, *European Dynamics v. OHIM*, 7 October 2015, not published in
 the ECR

- Case T-50/05, *Evropaïki Dynamiki v. Commission* [2010] ECR II-313
 Case T-554/08, *Evropaïki Dynamiki v. Commission* [2012] 24 April 2012, not published in the ECR
 Case T-556/11, *European Dynamics Luxembourg and Others v. EUIPO*, 7 October 2015, not published in the ECR
 Case T-70/05, *Evropaïki Dynamiki v. EMSA* [2010] ECR II-313
 Joint cases 46/93–48/93, *Brasserie du Pêcheur v. Federal Republic of Germany* [1996] ECR I-1029
 Joint cases 389/87 and 390/87, *GBC Echternach and A. Moritz v. Minister van Onderwijs en Wetenschappen* [1989] ECR 723
 Joint cases 6/90 – 9/90, *Francovich, Bonifaci et al. v. Italian Republic* [1991] ECR I-5375

European Court of Human Rights

- Ashingdane v. United Kingdom*, Application No. 8225/78, 28 May 1985 [1985] 7 EHRR 528
Ary Spaans v. The Netherlands, Application No. 12516/86, 12 December 1988 [1988] 58 Decisions and Reports 119 [1988] 107 ILR 1
Immobiliare Saffi v. Italy, Application No. 22774/93, 28 July 1999 [1999] ECHR 65
Waite and Kennedy, Application No. 26083/94, 18 February 1999 [1999] ECHR 13

European Ombudsman

- Decision of the European Ombudsman on Complaint 52/1995/JL/B against the European Commission*, 27 July 1995
Decision of the European Ombudsman on Complaint 1859/2005/BB and 1858/2005/BB against the European Monitoring Centre for Racism and Xenophobia, 16 July 2007
Decision of the European Ombudsman Closing His Inquiry into Complaint 2400/2006/JF against the European Commission, 13 January 2009
Decision of the European Ombudsman Closing His Inquiry into Complaint 3000/2009/JF against the European Commission, 26 July 2012

General Claims Commission (Mexico–United States)

- H.G. Venable (U.S.A.) v. United Mexican States*, 8 July 1927 [1927] 4 Reports of International Arbitral Awards 219

National Courts

- Corte di Cassazione, 8 February 1991, n. 1303, *Quartiere Generale Forze Alleate Sud Europa v. Bonifacio e Soc. Fratelli di Benedetto* [1991] *I Foro italiano* 752
- Cour d'Appel de Bruxelles, *Mme L. v. Secrétariat général du Groupe des Etats d'Afrique des Caraïbes et du Pacifique*, 4 March 2003 [2003] *Journal des tribunaux* 684
- Cour d'Appel de Paris, *Banque africaine de développement v. Degboe*, 7 October 2003 [2004] *Revue critique de droit international privé* 409
- Cour de Cassation, Chambre sociale, *Banque africaine de développement v. Degboe*, 25 January 2005 [2005] *Journal du droit international* 1142