

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

PARLIAMENTARY HISTORY OF THE FRENCH REVOLUTION¹

[1837]

It appears to be, if not stated in words, yet tacitly felt and understood everywhere, that the event of these modern ages is the French Revolution. A huge explosion, bursting through all formulas and customs; confounding into wreck and chaos the ordered arrangements of earthly life; blotting-out, one may say, the very firmament and skyey loadstars,—though only for a season. Once in the fifteen-hundred years such a thing was ordained to come. To those who stood present in the actual midst of that smoke and thunder, the effect might well be too violent: blinding and deafening, into confused exasperation, almost into madness. These onlookers have played their part, were it with the printing-press or with the battle-cannon, and are departed; their work, such as it was, remaining behind them;—where the French Revolution also remains. And now, for us who have receded to the distance of some half-century, the explosion becomes a thing visible, surveyable: we see its flame and sulphur-smoke blend

¹ LONDON AND WESTMINSTER REVIEW, No. 9.—*Histoire Parlementaire de la Révolution Française; ou Journal des Assemblées Nationales depuis 1789 jusqu'en 1815: contenant la Narration des Evénemens, les Débats, etc. etc.* (Parliamentary History of the French Revolution; or Journal of the National Assemblies from 1789 to 1815: containing a Narrative of the Occurrences; Debates of the Assemblies; Discussions in the chief Popular Societies, especially in that of the Jacobins; Records of the Commune of Paris; Sessions of the Revolutionary Tribunal; Reports of the leading Political Trials; Detail of the Annual Budgets; Picture of the Moral Movement, extracted from the Newspapers, Pamphlets, etc. of each Period: preceded by an Introduction on the History of France till the Convocation of the States-General). By P. J. B. Buchez and P. C. Roux. Tomes 1^{er}-23^{me} et seq. Paris, 1833-36.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

with the clear air (far *under* the stars); and hear its uproar as part of the sick noise of life,—loud, indeed, yet embosomed too, as all noise is, in the infinite of silence. It is an event which can be looked on; which may still be execrated, still be celebrated and psalmodied; but which it were better now to begin understanding. Really there are innumerable reasons why we ought to know this same French Revolution as it was: of which reasons (apart altogether from that of ‘Philosophy teaching by Experience, and so forth), is there not the best summary in this one reason, that we so *wish* to know it? Considering the qualities of the matter, one may perhaps reasonably feel that since the time of the Crusades, or earlier, there is no chapter of history so well worth studying.

Stated or not, we say, this persuasion is tacitly admitted, and acted upon. In these days everywhere you find it one of the most pressing duties for the writing guild, to produce history on history of the French Revolution. In France it would almost seem as if the young author felt that he must make this his proof-shot, and evidence of craftsmanship: accordingly they do fire-off *Histoires, Précis of Histoires, Annales, Fastes* (to say nothing of Historical Novels, *Gil Blases, Dantons, Barnaves, Grangeneuve*), in rapid succession, with or without effect. At all events it is curious to look upon; curious to contrast the picturing of the same fact by the men of this generation and position with the picturing of it by the men of the last. From Barruel and Fantin Desodoards to Thiers and Mignet there is a distance! Each individual takes up the Phenomenon according to his own point of vision, to the structure of his optic organs;—gives, consciously, some poor crotchety picture of several things; unconsciously some picture of himself at least. And the Phenomenon, for its part, subsists there, all the while, unaltered; waiting to be pictured as often as you like, its entire meaning not to be compressed into any picture drawn by man,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

HISTORY OF THE FRENCH REVOLUTION 3

Thiers's *History*, in ten volumes foolscap-octavo, contains, if we remember rightly, one reference; and that to a book, not to the page or chapter of a book. It has, for these last seven or eight years, a wide or even high reputation; which latter it is as far as possible from meriting. A superficial air of order, of clearness, calm candour, is spread over the work; but inwardly, it is waste, inorganic; no human head that honestly tries can conceive the French Revolution *so*. A critic of our acquaintance undertook, by way of bet, to find four errors per hour in Thiers: he won amply on the first trial or two.¹ And yet readers (we must add), taking all this along with them, may peruse Thiers with comfort in certain circumstances, nay, even with profit; for he is a brisk man of his sort; and does tell you much, if you knew nothing.

Mignet's, again, is a much more honestly-written book; yet also an eminently unsatisfactory one. His two volumes contain far more meditation and investigation in them than Thiers's ten: their degree of preferability, therefore, is very high; for it may be said: Call a book diffuse, and you call it in all senses bad; the writer could not find the right word to say, and so said many more or less wrong ones: did not hit the nail on the head, only smote and bungled about it and about it. Mignet's book has a compactness, a rigour, as of riveted rods of iron: this also is an image of what symmetry it has;—symmetry, if not of a living earth-born Tree, yet of a firm well-manufactured Gridiron. Without life, without colour or verdure: that is to say, Mignet is heartily and altogether a *prosaist*; you are too happy that he is not a *quack* as well! It is very mortifying, also, to study his philosophical reflections; how he jingles and rumbles a

¹ Thiers says, 'Notables consented with eagerness' (vol. i. p. 10), whereas they properly did not consent at all; 'Parlement recalled on the 10th of September' (for the 15th); and then 'Séance Royale took place on the 20th of the same month' (19th of quite a different month, not the same, nor next to the same); 'D'Espréménil a young Councillor' (of forty and odd); 'Duport a young man' (turned of sixty), etc. etc.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

4

MISCELLANIES

quantity of mere abstractions and dead logical formulas, and calls it Thinking;—rumbles and rumbles, till he judges there may be enough; then begins again narrating. As thus:

‘The Constitution of 1791 was made on such principles as had resulted from the ideas and the situation of France. It was the work of the middle class, which chanced to be the strongest then: for, as is well known, whatever force has the lead will fashion the institutions according to its own aims. Now this force, when it belongs to one, is despotism; when to several, it is privilege; when to all, it is right: which latter state is the ultimatum of society, as it was its beginning. France had finally arrived thither, after passing through feudalism, which is the aristocratic institution; and then through absolutism, which is the monarchic one.

‘The work of the Constituent Assembly perished, not so much by its own defects as by the assaults of factions. Standing between the aristocracy and the multitude, it was attacked by the former, and stormed and won by the latter. The multitude would never have become supreme, had not civil war and the coalition of foreign states rendered its intervention and help indispensable. To defend the country the multitude required to have the governing of it: thereupon (*alors*) it made its revolution, as the middle class had made its. The multitude too had its *Fourteenth of July*, which was the *Tenth of August*; its Constituent, which was the Convention; its Government, which was the Committee of *Salut Public*; but, as we shall see,’ etc.¹

Or thus; for there is the like at the end of every chapter:

‘But royalty had virtually fallen, on the Tenth of August; that day was the insurrection of the multitude against the middle class and constitutional throne, as the Fourteenth of July had been the insurrection of the middle classes against the privileged classes and an absolute throne. The Tenth of August witnessed the commencement of the dictatorial and arbitrary epoch of the Revolution. Circumstances becoming more and more difficult, there arose a vast war, which required increased energy; and this energy, unregulated, inasmuch as it was popular, rendered the sway of the lower class an unquiet, oppressive and cruel sway.’ ‘It was not any way possible that the *Bourgeoisie* (middle class), which had been strong enough to strike-down the old government and the privileged classes, but which had taken to repose after this

¹ Chap. iv. vol. i. p. 271.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

HISTORY OF THE FRENCH REVOLUTION 5

victory, could repulse the Emigration and united Europe. There was needed for that a new shock, a new faith; there was needed for that a new Class, numerous, ardent, not yet fatigued, and which loved its Tenth of August, as the Burgherhood loved its Fourteenth of,' etc. etc.¹

So uncommonly *lively* are these Abstractions (at bottom only occurrences, similitudes, days of the month, and suchlike), which rumble here in the historical head! Abstractions really of the most lively, insurrectionary character; nay, which produce offspring, and indeed are oftenest parricidally devoured thereby:—such is the jingling and rumbling which calls itself Thinking. Nearly so, though with greater effect, might algebraical *x*'s go rumbling in some Pascal's or Babbage's mill. Just so, indeed, do the Kalmuck people pray: quantities of written prayers are put in some rotary pipkin or calabash (hung on a tree, or going like the small barrel-churn of agricultural districts); this the devotee has only to whirl and churn; so long as he whirls, it is prayer; when he ceases whirling, the prayer is done. Alas, this is a sore error, very generally, among French thinkers of the present time. One ought to add, that Mignet takes his place at the head of that brotherhood of his; that his little book, though abounding too in errors of detail, better deserves what place it has than any other of recent date.

The older Desodoardses, Barruels, Lacrozettes, and suchlike, exist, but will hardly profit much. Toulangeon, a man of talent and integrity, is very vague; often incorrect for an eye-witness; his military details used to be reckoned valuable; but, we suppose, Jomini has eclipsed them now. The Abbé Montgaillard has shrewdness, decision, insight; abounds in anecdotes, strange facts and reports of facts: his book being written in the form of Annals, is convenient for consulting. For the rest, he is acrid, exaggerated, occasionally altogether perverse; and, with his hastes and his hatreds, falls into the strangest hallucination;—as, for example, when he coolly records that 'Madame de Staël, Necker's daughter, was seen

¹ Chap. v. vol. i. p. 37^r.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

6

MISCELLANIES

(*on vit*) distributing brandy to the *Gardes Françaises* in their barracks'; that 'D'Orléans Egalité had a pair of *man-skin* breeches,'—leather breeches, of human skin, such as they did prepare in the tannery of Meudon, but *too late* for D'Orléans! The history by *Deux Amis de la Liberté*, if the reader secure the original edition, is perhaps worth all the others; and offers (at least till 1792, after which it becomes convulsive, semi-fatuous here and there, in the remaining dozen volumes) the best, correctest, most picturesque narrative yet published. It is very correct, very picturesque; wants only *foreshortening*, shadow and compression; a work of decided merit; the authors of it, what is singular, appear not to be known.

Finally, our English histories do likewise abound: copious if not in facts, yet in reflections on facts. They will prove to the most incredulous that this French Revolution was, as Chamfort said, no 'rose-water Revolution'; that the universal insurrectionary abrogation of law and custom was managed in a most unlawful, uncustomary manner. He who wishes to know how a solid *Custos rotulorum*, speculating over his port after dinner, interprets the phenomena of contemporary Universal History, may look in these books: he who does not wish that, need not look.

On the whole, after all these writings and printings, the weight of which would sink an Indiaman, there are, perhaps, only some three publications hitherto that can be considered as forwarding essentially a right knowledge of this matter. The *first* of these is the *Analyse du Moniteur*, complete expository Index, and Syllabus of the Moniteur Newspaper from 1789 to 1799; a work carrying its significance in its title;—provided it be faithfully executed; which it is well known to be. Along with this we may mention the series of Portraits, a hundred in number, published with the original edition of it: many of them understood to be accurate likenesses. The natural face of a man is often worth more than several biographies of him, as biographies are written. These hundred Portraits have been copied into a book called *Scènes*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

HISTORY OF THE FRENCH REVOLUTION 7

de la Révolution, which contains other pictures, of small value, and some not useless writing by Chamfort; and are often to be found in libraries. A republication of Vernet's Caricatures¹ would be a most acceptable service, but has not been thought of hitherto. The *second* work to be counted here is the *Choix des Rapports, Opinions et Discours*, in some twenty volumes, with an excellent index: parliamentary speeches, reports, etc. are furnished in abundance; complete illustration of all that this Senatorial province (rather a wearisome one) can illustrate. *Thirdly*, we have to name the Collection of *Memoirs*, completed several years ago, in above a hundred volumes. Booksellers Baudouin, Editors Berville and Barrière, have done their utmost; adding notes, explanations, rectifications, with portraits also if you like: *Louvet, Riouffe* and the two volumes of *Memoirs on the Prisons* are the most attractive pieces. This Baudouin Collection, therefore, joins itself to that of Petitot, as a natural sequel.

And now a *fourth* work, which follows in the train of these, and deserves to be reckoned along with them, is this *Histoire Parlementaire* of Messieurs Buchez and Roux. The Authors are men of ability and repute; Buchez, if we mistake not, is Dr. Buchez, and practises medicine with acceptance; Roux is known as an essayist and journalist: they once listened a little to Saint-Simon, but it was before Saint-Simonism called itself 'a religion,' and vanished in Bedlam. We have understood there is a certain bibliomaniac military gentleman in Paris, who in the course of years has amassed the most astonishing collection of revolutionary ware: books, pamphlets, newspapers, even sheets and handbills, ephemeral printings and paintings, such as the day brought them forth, lie there without end.² Into this warehouse, as indeed into all manner

¹ See Mercier's *Nouveau Paris*, vol. iv. p. 254.

² It is generally known that a similar collection, perhaps still larger and more curious, lies buried in the British Museum here,—inaccessible for want of a proper catalogue. Some eighteen months ago, the respectable sub-librarian seemed to be working at such a thing: by respectful application to him, you could gain access to his room, and have the satisfaction of mounting on ladders,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

8

MISCELLANIES

of other repositories, Messrs. Buchez and Roux have happily found access: the *Histoire Parlementaire* is the fruit of their labours there. A Number, two forming a Volume, is published every fortnight: we have the first Twenty-two Volumes before us, which bring-down the narrative to January 1793; there must be several other Volumes out, which we have not yet seen.

Conceive a judicious compilation with such resources. Parliamentary Debates, in summary, or (where the occasion warrants it) given at large; this is by no means the most interesting part of the matter: we have excerpts, notices, hints of all imaginable sorts; of Newspapers, of Pamphlets, of Sectionary and Municipal Records, of the Jacobins' Club, of Placard-journals, nay, of Placards and Caricatures. No livelier emblem of the time, in its actual movement and tumult, could be presented. The Editors connect these fragments by expositions such as are needful; so that a reader coming unprepared to the work can still know what he is about. Their expositions, as we can testify, are handsomely done: but altogether apart from these, the excerpts themselves are the valuable thing. The scissors, in such a case, are independent of the pen. One of the most interesting English biographies we have is that long thin Folio on Oliver Cromwell, published some five-and-twenty years ago, where the editor has merely clipt-out from the contemporary newspapers whatsoever article, paragraph, or sentence he found to contain the name of Old Noll, and printed them in the order of their dates. It is surprising that the like has not been attempted in other cases. Had seven of the eight Translators of Faust, and seventy-times-seven of the four-hundred-four-score-and-ten Imaginative Authors, but thrown-down the writing-instrument, and turned to the old newspaper files judiciously with the cutting one!

and reading the outside titles of his books, which was a great help. Otherwise you could not in many weeks ascertain so much as the table of contents of this repository; and after days of weary waiting, dusty rummaging, and sickness of hope deferred, gave-up the enterprise as a 'game not worth the candle.'

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

HISTORY OF THE FRENCH REVOLUTION 9

We can testify, after not a little examination, that the Editors of the *Histoire Parlementaire* are men of fidelity, of diligence; that their accuracy in regard to facts, dates and so forth, is far beyond the average. Of course they have their own opinions, prepossessions even; but these are honest prepossessions, which they do not hide; which one can estimate the force of, allow for the result of. Wilful falsification, did the possibility of it lie in their character, is otherwise out of the question. But, indeed, our Editors are men of earnestness, of strict principle; of a faith, were it only in the republican Tricolor. Their democratic faith, truly, is palpable, thorough-going; as it has a right to be, in these days, since it likes. The thing you have to praise, however, is that it is a quiet faith, never an hysterical one; never expresses itself otherwise than with a becoming calmness, especially with a becoming brevity. The hoarse deep croak of Marat, the brilliant sharp-cutting gaiety of Desmoulins, the dull bluster of Prudhomme, the cackling garrulity of Brissot, all is welcomed with a cold gravity and brevity; all is illustrative, if not of one thing, then of another. Nor are the royalist Royous, Suleaus, Peltiers forgotten: *Acts of the Apostles*, *King's Friend*, nor *Crowing of the Cock*: these, indeed, are more sparingly administered; but at the right time, as is promised, we shall have more. In a word, it may be said of this *Histoire Parlementaire*, that the wide promise held-out in its title-page is really in some respectable measure fulfilled. With a fit Index to wind it up (which Index ought to be not good only but excellent, so much depends on it here), this Work bids fair to be one of the most important yet published on the History of the Revolution. No library, that professes to have a collection in this sort, can dispense with it.

A *Histoire Parlementaire* is precisely the house, or say rather, the unbuilt city, of which the single brick *can* form a specimen. In so rich a variety, the only difficulty is where to choose. We have scenes of tragedy, of comedy, of farce, of farce-tragedy oftenest of all; there is eloquence, gravity;

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-02252-1 - The Works of Thomas Carlyle, Volume 29

Edited by Henry Duff Traill

Excerpt

[More information](#)

10

MISCELLANIES

there is bluster, bombast and absurdity: scenes tender, scenes barbarous, spirit-stirring, and then flatly wearisome: a thing waste, incoherent, wild to look upon; but great with the greatness of reality; for the thing exhibited is no vision, but a fact. Let us, as the first excerpt, give this tragedy of old Foulon, which all the world has heard of, perhaps not very accurately. Foulon's life-drama, with its hasty cruel sayings and mean doings, with its thousandfold intrigues, and 'the people eating grass if they like,' ends in this miserable manner. It is the Editors themselves who speak; compiling from various sources:

'Towards five in the morning (Paris, 22d July 1789), M. Foulon was brought in; he had been arrested at Vitry, near Fontainebleau, by the peasants of the place. Doubtless this man thought himself very guilty towards the people' (say, very hateful); 'for he had spread abroad a report of his death; and had even buried one of his servants, who happened to die then, under his own name. He had afterwards hidden himself in an estate of M. de Sartines'; where he was detected and seized.

'M. Foulon was taken to the Hotel-de-Ville, where they made him wait. Towards nine o'clock, the assembled Committee had decided that he should be sent to the Abbaye prison. M. de Lafayette was sent for, that he might execute this order; he was abroad over the Districts: he could not be found. During this time a crowd collected in the square; and required to see Foulon. It was noon: M. Bailly came down; the people listened to him; but still persisted. In the end they penetrated into the great hall of the Hôtel-de-Ville; would see Foulon, "whom," say they, "you are wanting to smuggle-off from justice." Foulon was presented to them. Then began this remarkable dialogue. M. de la Poize, an Elector: "Messieurs, every guilty person should be judged." "Yes, judged directly, and then hanged."—M. Osselin: "To judge, one must have judges; let us send M. Foulon to the tribunals." "No, no," replied the people; "judge him just now."—"Since you will not have the common judges," said M. Osselin, "it is indispensable to appoint others." "Well, judge him yourselves."—"We have no right either to judge or to create judges; do you name them." "Well," cried the people, "M. le Curé of Saint-Etienne then, and M. le Curé of Saint-André."—Osselin: "Two judges are not enough; there needs seven." Thereupon the people named Messrs. Quatremere, Varangue, etc. "Here are seven judges indeed," said Osselin; "but we still want a clerk." "Be you clerk."—"A king's Attorney." "Let it be M.