THE CAMBRIDGE EDITION OF EARLY CHRISTIAN WRITINGS VOLUME 3 CHRIST: Through the Nestorian Controversy

The Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings provides the definitive anthology of early Christian texts, from ca. 100 CE to ca. 650 CE. Its volumes reflect the cultural, intellectual, and linguistic diversity of early Christianity, and are organized thematically on the topics of God, Practice, Christ, Community, Reading, and Creation. The series expands the pool of source material to include not only Greek and Latin writings, but also Syriac and Coptic texts. Additionally, the series rejects a theologically normative view by juxtaposing texts that were important in antiquity but later deemed "heretical" with orthodox texts. The translations are accompanied by introductions, notes, suggestions for further reading, and scriptural indices. The third volume focuses on early Christian reflection on Christ as God incarnate from the first century to ca. 450 CE. It will be an invaluable resource for students and academic researchers in early Christian studies, history of Christianity, theology and religious studies, and late antique Roman history.

MARK DELCOGLIANO is Associate Professor of Theology at the University of St. Thomas, Minnesota. He is the author of *Basil of Caesarea's Anti-Eunomian Theory of Names* (2010), and has published numerous journal articles as well as translations of Basil of Caesarea, Athanasius of Alexandria, Didymus the Blind, Gregory of Nyssa, and Gregory the Great.

THE CAMBRIDGE EDITION OF EARLY CHRISTIAN WRITINGS

SERIES EDITORS

Andrew Radde-Gallwitz, University of Notre Dame Mark DelCogliano, University of St. Thomas Ellen Muehlberger, University of Michigan Bradley K. Storin, Louisiana State University

The Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings offers new translations of a wide range of materials from ca. 100 CE to ca. 650 CE, including many writings that have not previously been accessible in English. The volumes will focus on selected themes and will include translations of works originally written in Greek, Latin, Syriac, and Coptic, together with introductions, notes, bibliographies, and scriptural indices to aid the reader. Taken together they should greatly expand the range of texts available to scholars, students, and all who are interested in this period of Christian thought.

THE CAMBRIDGE EDITION OF EARLY CHRISTIAN WRITINGS

VOLUME 3

CHRIST: Through the Nestorian Controversy

EDITED BY

Mark DelCogliano University of St. Thomas, Minnesota





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107693326

D01: 10.1017/9781107449640

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

> First published 2022 First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-06213-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-69332-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Notes on Contributors	page x
Acknowledgments	xiii
Note on the Texts and Translations	xv
Abbreviations	xvii
Series Introduction	xviii
Introduction	xx

PART I: THE BEGINNINGS OF CHRISTOLOGY

Ι.	Ascension of Isaiab 6–11 (Ethiopic Version)	3
2.	The Gospel of Peter	16
3.	The Epistle of the Apostles	2 I
4.	The First Letter of Clement (Selections)	44
5.	Ignatius of Antioch, Letters (Selections)	53
6.	<i>Epistle to Diognetus</i> 1 and 7–12	63
7.	Justin Martyr, <i>First Apology</i> 23, 30–32, 46, 63 and	
	Second Apology 10, 13	69
8.	Tatian, Address to the Greeks 4–7	79
9.	Odes of Solomon 7, 19, 41, and 42	84
10.	Treatise on Resurrection	92
11.	A Ptolemaic Theology as Recounted by Irenaeus of Lyons	
	in Against Heresies 1.8.5	99
12.	Irenaeus of Lyons, Against Heresies (Selections)	103

PART II: DEVELOPING CHRISTOLOGICAL TRADITIONS

137
144
173
187
197
2 I 2

CONTENTS

19.	Hilary of Poitiers, On the Trinity 9.1–14	222
20.	Ephrem the Syrian, <i>Hymns on Faith</i> 4, 10, 24, 31, 36,	
	51, 54, 77, 78, and 79	235

PART III: TRADITIONS OF PRO-NICENE CHRISTOLOGY

21.	Tome to the Antiochenes 7	273
22.	Athanasius of Alexandria, Christological Letters to Epictetus,	
	Adelphius, and Maximus	276
23.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, Recapitulation	301
24.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, Selected Letters	308
25.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, On the Faith and the Incarnation	322
26.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, On the Body's Union with the	5
	Divinity in Christ	327
27.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, Fragments of Other Writings	333
28.	Apollinarius of Laodicea, Fragmentary Writings against	
	Diodore and Flavian	339
29.	Basil of Caesarea, <i>Letters</i> 261 and 262	348
30.	Basil of Caesarea, Homily on the Holy Birth of Christ	354
31.	Diodore of Tarsus, Selected Fragments	366
32.	Gregory of Nazianzus, Letter 101 to Cledonius	388
33.	Gregory of Nazianzus, <i>Poems</i> 1.1.10–11	399
34.	Gregory of Nyssa, Oration on the Savior's Nativity	403
35.		
	against the Apollinarians and Eunomians (Fragments)	420
36.	Augustine of Hippo, On Eighty-Three Different	
	Questions. Number 80: Against the Apollinarians	489
37.	Augustine of Hippo, Letter 137	494
38.	The Leporius Dossier	510
	Leporius, Statement of Amendment	512
	Augustine, Letter 219	523
	John Cassian, On the Incarnation of the Lord against	
	Nestorius, Book 1	525
39.	Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Exposition of the Orthodox Faith	535

PART IV: CONTROVERSY OVER NESTORIUS

40.	Eusebius of Dorylaeum, Protest	559
41.	Cyril of Alexandria, Second Letter to Nestorius	564

VIII

Contents

42.	Nestorius of Constantinople, Second Letter to Cyril	570
43.	Proclus of Constantinople, Homily on the Holy Virgin	
	Theotokos	577
44.	Nestorius of Constantinople, Three Letters to Celestine	
	of Rome	585
45·	John Cassian, On the Incarnation of the Lord against	
	<i>Nestorius</i> 3.1–16 and 5.1–4	593
46.	Cyril of Alexandria, Third Letter to Nestorius	623
47·	Nestorius of Constantinople, Letter to John of Antioch	637
48.	Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Refutation of the Twelve Anathemas	
	of Cyril of Alexandria	641
49·	Acts of the Council of Ephesus (June–October 431):	
	Selected Proceedings	658
50.	Cyril of Alexandria, Letter of Reunion to John of Antioch	718
51.	Ibas of Edessa, Letter to Mari the Persian	726
52.	Cyril of Alexandria, First Letter to Succensus	731
53.	Cyril of Alexandria, Second Letter to Succensus	74 ⁰
54.	Theodoret of Cyrrhus, Eranistes: Epilogue	747
Sugg	gestions for Further Reading	759
Scrip	ptural Index	762

Notes on Contributors

Anthony Briggman is Associate Professor of Early Christianity at Candler School of Theology, Emory University. He translated the selections from Irenaeus of Lyons's *Against Heresies*. Professor Briggman would like to acknowledge that his translation of Irenaeus is the result of a joint translation project shared with his graduate students Sarah Bogue, Brian Gronewoller, Brendan Harris, Micah Miller, and Devin White.

Dexter Brown is a doctoral student in the Departments of Classics and Religious Studies at Yale University. He translated the selection from the *Ascension of Isaiab* with Aaron Michael Butts.

Aaron Michael Butts is Associate Professor in the Department of Semitic and Egyptian Languages and Literatures at the Catholic University of America. He translated the selections from the *Odes of Solomon*. He also translated the selection from the *Ascension of Isaiab* with Dexter Brown.

Matthew R. Crawford is Associate Professor and Director of the Research Program in Biblical and Early Christian Studies in the Institute for Religion and Critical Inquiry at the Australian Catholic University. He translated Cyril of Alexandria's Second and Third Letters to Nestorius, his Letter of Reunion to John of Antioch, and his First and Second Letters to Succensus; and Nestorius's Second Letter to Cyril of Alexandria, his Letter to John of Antioch, and his First Letter to Celestine of Rome. He also translated the selections from John Cassian's On the Incarnation of the Lord against Nestorius with Thomas L. Humphries.

Mark DelCogliano is Associate Professor of Theology at the University of St. Thomas. He translated the *Gospel of Peter*; the selections of the *The First Letter of Clement*, of Ignatius of Antioch's *Letters*, and of the *Epistle to Diognetus*; the Greek and Latin *Fragments* of Paul of Samosata; the

Notes on Contributors

selections of the *Tome to the Antiochenes* and of Hilary of Poitiers's *On the Trinity*; Athanasius of Alexandria's *Christological Letters to Epictetus, Adelphi-us, and Maximus*; Apollinarius of Laodicea's *Recapitulation*, his *Letter to the Bishops in Diocaesarea*, his *Synodical Tome*, his *Fragments of Letters to Dionysius, Serapion, Terentius, and Julian*, his *Fragments of Other Writings*, and his *Fragmentary Writings against Diodore and Flavian*; Basil of Caesarea's *Letters 261 and 262* and his *Homily on the Holy Birth of Christ*; the Greek and Latin fragments of Theodore of Mopsuestia's *On the Incarnation of the Lord against the Apollinarians and Eunomians*; Leporius's *Statement of Amendment*; the first book of John Cassian's *On the Incarnation of the Lord against Nestorius*; Nestorius's *Second and Third Letters to Celestine of Rome*; and the selections from *Acts of the Council of Ephesus*.

Emanuel Fiano is Assistant Professor of Syriac Studies at Fordham University. He translated the Syriac *Fragments* of Paul of Samosata.

Thomas L. Humphries is Associate Professor of Philosophy, Theology, and Religion at Saint Leo University. He translated the selections from John Cassian's *On the Incarnation of the Lord against Nestorius* with Matthew R. Crawford.

Ellen Muehlberger is Professor of History at the University of Michigan. She translated Aphrahat's *Demonstration* 17: *On the Son*; the *Selected Fragments* of Diodore of Tarsus; and the Syriac fragments of Theodore of Mopsuestia's *On the Incarnation of the Lord against the Apollinarians and Eunomians*.

Michael Papazian is Professor of Religion and Philosophy at Berry College. He translated the Armenian *Fragments* of Paul of Samosata.

Andrew Radde-Gallwitz is Associate Professor of Liberal Studies at the University of Notre Dame. He translated the selections from Justin Martyr's *First* and *Second Apologies*; Gregory of Nyssa's *Oration on the Savior's Nativity*; Augustine of Hippo's *On Eighty-Three Different Questions. Number 80: Against the Apollinarians* and his *Letters* 137 and 219; and Proclus of Constantinople's *Homily on the Holy Virgin Theotokos.* Professor Radde-Gallwitz would like to thank Margaret M. Mitchell for her helpful feedback on his translation of Gregory of Nyssa.

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

Paul S. Russell is Lecturer in Theology at St. Joseph of Arimathea Anglican Theological College. He translated the selections of Ephrem the Syrian's *Hymns on Faith*.

Jared Secord is an Academic Strategist at the University of Calgary. He translated the selections from Tertullian's *Apology*, from his *On the Flesh of Christ*, and from his *Against Praxeas*.

Melissa Harl Sellew is Professor Emerita of Classical and Near Eastern Studies at the University of Minnesota. She translated the *Treatise on Resurrection*.

Bradley K. Storin is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at Louisiana State University. He translated the selections from Tatian's *Address to the Greeks* and from Origen's *On First Principles*; Apollinarius of Laodicea's *Letter to Jovian*, his *First Letter to Dionysius*, his *On the Faith and the Incarnation*, and his *On the Body's Union with the Divinity in Christ*; Gregory of Nazianzus's *Letter* 101 *to Cledonius* and the selections from his *Poems*; and Ibas of Edessa's *Letter to Mari the Persian*.

Vasilije Vranic is a priest in the Serbian Orthodox Church in Washington, DC and a Visiting Fellow in the Center for the Study of Early Christianity at the Catholic University of America. He translated Eusebius of Doryl-aeum's *Protest*, and Theodoret of Cyrrhus's *Exposition of the Orthodox Faith*, his *Refutation of the Twelve Anathemas of Cyril of Alexandria*, and the epilogue to his *Eranistes*.

Francis Watson is Professor in the Department of Theology and Religion at Durham University. He translated the *Epistle of the Apostles*.

Acknowledgments

Planning for what became volumes 3 and 4 in the Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings (CEECW) series began in 2012 when Andrew Radde-Gallwitz asked Ellen Muehlberger, Bradley K. Storin, and me to join him in editing a new series of thematic anthologies of early Christian texts. A scholar cannot have hoped for more knowledgeable, hard-working, and generous collaborators. Each of us brings a truly complementary set of skills, expertise, and perspectives to this project, making each volume of the series far greater than the sum of its parts. So first of all I thank my three collaborators, Andy, Ellen, and Brad, for their tireless efforts in the countless hours spent bringing this volume to completion, with painstaking attention to detail, with patience when progress was slow, with support for me when times were tough, and always, always, with plenty of good humor: thank you, my dear friends.

No less do I thank all those who contributed translations to this volume: Anthony Briggman, Dexter Brown, Aaron Michael Butts, Matthew R. Crawford, Emanuel Fiano, Thomas L. Humphries, Michael Papazian, Paul S. Russell, Jared Secord, Melissa Harl Sellew, Vasilije Vranic, and Francis Watson. Thank you for collaborating with us as your translations went through the multi-stage checking and editing process, which I realize could seem overly scrupulous at times. It was a thrill for me to be able to work closely with you on both the nuts-and-bolts and the finer points of your introductions and translations. To those who joined the project early on, thank you for your patience with me in the years it took to get your work into print. To those who joined the project at the eleventh hour, thank you for squeezing this project into your busy schedule on such short notice and yet producing such top-notch work.

Along the way several others have also made this volume possible through their sharing of advice, expertise, and time, by giving feedback, checking translations, helping crack difficult passages, providing unpublished work, and so forth: Pauline Allen, Lewis Ayres, John Behr, Matthew R. Crawford, Philip Michael Forness, Margaret M. Mitchell, Alex Pierce, Richard Price,

XIII

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Corey Stephan, Francis Watson, Robin Darling Young, and Kevin Zilverberg. Your assistance has been an immense help to me: thank you.

A special thanks to Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press for encouragement and advice with this large and complex project that took longer to complete than any of us anticipated, as well as to Hal Churchman, her assistant, Lisa Carter, our content manager, and Mary Starkey, our copy-editor. This volume has benefited immensely from their efforts and attention to detail.

And finally to Amy, Iris, and Richard: I simply cannot find the words to say how grateful I am to you, my three true loves.

Note on the Texts and Translations

Our translations have been produced in consultation with published editions and, in some cases, with manuscripts. Bibliographical information for the editions used can be found in the introduction to each translated text. The numeration of each work follows that of the editions from which we have translated. Numbers in the text with no surrounding brackets indicate chapter or paragraph divisions. In the case of texts with subdivisions or multiple numbering systems, the major chapter division is indicated in bold, followed by the subdivision in regular type with a full stop. Where bracketed numbers in bold appear, these indicate page numbers in a printed edition or folio numbers in a manuscript codex.

When a text quotes earlier material, references are provided in the notes with the following format: first, the series and number within the series or the abbreviation used for the critical edition, followed by a colon; then, the page number of the edition and, after a comma, the line numbers (if any); and finally the editor's name. For example, if Basil of Caesarea's *Against Eunomius* 1.12 were to be quoted, the reference would be: Basil of Caesar-ea, *Against Eunomius* 1.12, 32–35 (SChr 299: 214 Sesboüé). In some cases, as in this example, the line numbering in the critical edition is tied to the subdivisions of the work itself, not to the pages of the edition.

Psalms are cited according to the Septuagint numbering and versification, with the numbering of the Masoretic text in parenthesis. Note that in many English translations of the Psalms, the versification differs from the Septuagint and Masoretic text because the psalm heading is not included in the verse numbering.

All dates in the volume are CE unless otherwise noted.

The following conventions are used in the translations:

	Editorial supplement within a text by the translator to improve
	the sense
<>	Lacuna within a text
<aaa></aaa>	Conjectural emendation by the text's editor to fill a lacuna

*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-107-69332-6 — The Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings Volume 3: Christ: Through the Nestorian Controversy Edited by Mark DelCogliano Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

NOTE ON THE TEXTS AND TRANSLATIONS

- ** Transition from one document or major section to another
- * * * Intentional omission of material from the translation

Abbreviations

ACO	Acta Conciliorum Oecumenicorum
Apollinaris	Hans Lietzmann (ed. and trans.), Apollinaris von Laodicea und
	seine Schule: Texte und Untersuchungen (Tübingen: Mohr Sie-
	beck, 1904).
CACSS	Corpus apologetarum Christianorum saeculi secundi
CCSG	Corpus Christianorum, Series Graeca
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina
CEECW	Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings
CPG	Clavis Patrum Graecorum
CSCO	Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
Ep.	Epistula, Epistle
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller
GCS n.F.	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller, Neue Folge
GNO	Gregorii Nysseni Opera
LXX	Septuagint
Nestoriana	Friedrich Loofs (ed.), Nestoriana: Die Fragmente des Nestorius
	(Halle: Max Niemeyer, 1905).
PG	Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Graeca
PL	Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina
PO	Patrologia Orientalis
SChr	Sources chrétiennes

Series Introduction

The literary legacy of the early Christians is vast and spans multiple linguistic traditions. Early Christians used the written word in many ways: they sent letters, staged dialogues, reported revelations, gave advice, defended themselves, accused others, preached homilies, wrote histories, sang hymns, hammered out creeds, interpreted texts, and legislated penances - just to list the most common examples. They did these things in Greek, Latin, Syriac, and Coptic; while countless Christians would have used other languages, such as Armenian, these four are the medium of the vast majority of our surviving texts. For each text that has survived, there is a unique story. Some became part of educational curricula for Christians in medieval Byzantium, Basra, and Bologna; some were recited or sung liturgically; some were read in private devotions; some lay at the core of later theological debates such as the European Reformations in the sixteenth century or the Ressourcement movement in twentieth-century Catholicism; some suffered a literary death, being buried in the sands of Egypt only to be discovered again, quite by accident, in the past century. The question of how these works have been received over the centuries is undoubtedly important, but their later interpreters and interpretations ought not to overshadow their original significance and context.

The Cambridge Edition of Early Christian Writings offers a representative sample of this diverse literature in seven thematic volumes: God, Practice, Christ: Through the Nestorian Controversy, Christ: Chalcedon and Beyond, Creation, Community, and Reading. While no series of this kind can be comprehensive, these themes allow the reader to understand early Christianity in its full intellectual, practical, ritual, and communal diversity. The theme and the selection of texts are thoroughly discussed in each volume's respective introduction, but certain principles have guided the construction of all seven volumes. Our goal has been neither to narrate the establishment of orthodox or normative Christianity as this has been traditionally understood nor to champion its replacement by another form of Christianity. Instead, we have opted to let each text speak with its own historical

XVIII

Series Introduction

voice and authority, while aiming to expand the number and range of early Christian texts available to English speakers. Because of this, many of these texts are translated into English here for the first time, while all others have been translated anew. We have combined magisterial works with neglected ones in order to show the diversity and interconnectedness of Christianity in its formative period. We are neither reproducing a canon of classics nor creating a new one. We make no claims that the included works are aesthetically or intellectually superior to other texts we have excluded. Some well-known classics have been omitted for simply that reason: they are readily accessible and widely read. Others are too lengthy and do not bear excerpting well. In some cases, we have judged that attention to a single work by an author has led to an unfortunate neglect of other works of equal or greater value by the same author. In such cases, we are taking the opportunity to cast our spotlight on the latter. In sum, by no means have we felt constrained by previous lists of "must-reads" in our own selections.

We have sought to produce translations that are literal – faithful to the original language's meaning and, when possible, syntax. If a meaningful term appears in the original language, we have aimed to capture it in the translation. At the same time, we have aimed to produce intelligible and attractive English prose. At times the two goals have conflicted and prudential judgments have been made; as part of a team of translators, we are fortunate that we have not had to make such decisions alone. Every translation that appears in our volumes has gone through a rigorous multi-stage editorial process to ensure accuracy as well as readability. We hope that this painstaking collaborative process ensures the reliability and consistency of our translations. As a team, we have come to see the value – and indeed the necessity – of such collaborative work for the academic study of early Christianity's rich library of texts.

Andrew Radde-Gallwitz Mark DelCogliano Ellen Muehlberger Bradley K. Storin