### CONSTITUTIONALISM IN ASIA IN THE EARLY TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

Examining developments in the first decade of the twenty-first century, this authoritative collection of essays studies the evolving practice of constitutional law and constitutional ism in Asia. It provides a comprehensive overview of the diverse constitutional issues and developments in sixteen East, Southeast and South Asian countries. It also discusses the types of constitutionalism that exist and the general trends in constitutional developments whilst offering comparative, historical and analytical perspectives on Asian constitutionalism. Written by leading scholars in the field, this book will be of great interest to students and scholars alike.

Albert H.Y. Chen is Chan Professor in Constitutional Law at the University of Hong Kong.

### COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors:

Tom Ginsburg University of Chicago

Zachary Elkins University of Texas at Austin

Ran Hirschl University of Toronto

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

### Volumes in the series

Comparative Constitutional Design Edited by Tom Ginsburg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century Edited by Albert Chen

# Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century

Edited by

ALBERT H.Y. CHEN University of Hong Kong



### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107687745

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014 First paperback edition 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Constitutionalism in Asia in the early twenty-first century / edited by Albert Chen. pages cm - (Comparative constitutional law and policy)
ISBN 978-1-107-04341-1 (Hardback)
1. Constitutional law-Asia. I. Chen, Hongyi, 1957- author editor of compilation.
KNC524.C67 2014
342.5-dc23 2013047256

ISBN 978-1-107-04341-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-68774-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

List	of figures	<i>page</i> vii
List	of tables	viii
Con	tributors	ix
Pref	ace	xiii
1	The achievement of constitutionalism in Asia: moving beyond 'constitutions without constitutionalism' Albert H.Y. Chen	1
2	<b>East Asian constitutionalism in comparative perspective</b> Tom Ginsburg	32
3	Major constitutional developments in Japan in the first decade of the twenty-first century Shojiro Sakaguchi	52
4	Upgrading constitutionalism: the ups and downs of constitutional developments in South Korea since 2000 Jongcheol Kim	76
5	<b>Constitutional change in North Korea</b> Dae-Kyu Yoon	101
6	<b>Chinese constitutional dynamics: a decennial review</b> Wang Zhenmin and Tu Kai	118
7	A decade of changing constitutionalism in Taiwan: transitional and transnational perspectives Jiunn-rong Yeh and Wen-Chen Chang	141

V

vi	Contents	
8	<b>Hong Kong's constitutional journe</b> y, 1997–2011 Johannes Chan	169
9	Constitutional developments in Vietnam in the first decade of the twenty-first century Bui Ngoc Son	194
10	Constitutionalism in Burma, Cambodia and Thailand: developments in the first decade of the twenty-first century Kevin Y.L. Tan	219
11	Constitutional developments in Malaysia in the first decade of the twenty-first century: a nation at the crossroads H.P. Lee	244
12	'We are feeling our way forward, step by step': the continuing Singapore experiment in the construction of communitarian constitutionalism in the twenty-first century's first decade Thio Li-ann	270
13	Philippine constitutional law: majoritarian courts and elite politics Raul C. Pangalangan	295
14	Promoting democracy and finding the right direction: a review of major constitutional developments in Indonesia Nadirsyah Hosen	322
15	The Indian constitution in the twenty-first century: the continuing quest for empowerment, good governance and sustainability Surya Deva	343
16	The old order is dying, the new order is not yet born: politics of constitution demolishing and constitution building in Nepal Yash Ghai	367
17	The impact of internationalisation on national constitutions Cheryl Saunders	391
Inde	2X	416

# Figures

2.1	Scope and detail, by region, over time	page 44
2.2a	Government power indices, by region, over time	46
2.2b	Details of executive power, by region, over time	47
2.3a	Rights, by region, over time: overall number of rights	49
2.3b	Criminal procedure rights, by region, over time	49
2.3C	Economic rights, by region, over time	50
2.3d	Property rights, by region, over time	50

# Tables

2.1	Regional differences	page 42
2.2	Relative rank of East Asia among eight regions	43
6.1	Composition of the Legislative Council of the HKSAR	132
7.1	Adoption of international human rights treaties in Taiwan	153

# Contributors

**Bui Ngoc Son**, Lecturer in Law at the Vietnam National University–Hanoi, has published extensively on constitutional law, ancient Chinese political philosophy and the relationship between Confucianism and constitutionalism. He is a PhD graduate of the Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong.

**Johannes Chan**, Professor and Dean of the Faculty of Law at the University of Hong Kong and a Senior Counsel, is a leading scholar of constitutional law, administrative law and human rights in Hong Kong.

**Wen-Chen Chang**, Professor at the College of Law of National Taiwan University, is a leading scholar of constitutional law in Taiwan. In recent years she has published major works of scholarship on comparative constitutional law.

Albert H.Y. Chen, Chan Professor in Constitutional Law, Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong, specialises in Hong Kong constitutional law, the study of Chinese law from a comparative-law perspective, and legal and political theory.

**Surya Deva** is an Associate Professor at the School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong. His primary research interests lie in corporate social responsibility, Indo-Chinese constitutional law, and international human rights. His most recent book is the co-edited *Human Rights Obligations of Business: Beyond the Corporate Responsibility to Respect?* (Cambridge University Press, 2013).

Yash Ghai, Emeritus Professor of Public Law and formerly the Sir Y.K. Pao Professor of Public Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong, is a world-renowned scholar of comparative constitutional law in Africa, Asia and the Pacific. He has given advice frequently on constitution-making and constitutional issues in many developing countries.

**Tom Ginsburg**, Leo Spitz Professor of International Law and Ludwig and Hilde Wolf Research Scholar at the University of Chicago Law School, is a leading authority on international and comparative law, Asian law, and the study of law from the perspectives of political science and economics. He is Co-director CAMBRIDGE

х

#### Contributors

of the Comparative Constitutions Project and a Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation. He was elected to membership of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2013.

Nadirsyah Hosen, Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law, University of Wollongong in Australia, specialises in Indonesian constitutional law, Islamic law, and law and religion.

**Jongcheol Kim** is a Professor of Law at the Yonsei University School of Law in Korea. He has published in Korean and English on constitutional law, administrative law and socio-legal theories.

**H.P. Lee**, Sir John Latham Chair of Law at Monash University, Australia, is a leading authority on Malaysian and Australian constitutional law.

**Raul C. Pangalangan** is the George Malcolm Professor of Law and a former Law Dean at the University of the Philippines, where he teaches constitutional law and public international law. He has taught at Harvard Law School as Visiting Professor, and has lectured at the Hague Academy of International Law. He held the Asian Public Intellectual Fellowship in 2012–13. He is currently the Publisher of the *Philippine Daily Inquirer*, the nation's most influential newspaper.

Shojiro Sakaguchi, Professor of Constitutional Law and Director of the Law School at Hitotsubashi University in Tokyo, is a leading scholar of Japanese constitutional law who writes in both Japanese and English.

**Cheryl Saunders** is a Laureate Professor at Melbourne Law School and founding Director of its Centre for Comparative Constitutional Studies. She is a leading authority on Australian constitutional law and comparative constitutional law, including Asian constitutional law. She is President Emeritus of the International Association of Constitutional Law and a member of the advisory board of International IDEA.

Kevin Y.L. Tan is a leading scholar of constitutional law, legal history and the legal system of Singapore, as well as of comparative law in Southeast Asia. He is currently Adjunct Professor at both the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore, and the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University.

Thio Li-ann, Provost's chair and Professor of Law at the National University of Singapore, is a leading authority on constitutional and administrative law, human rights and international law, with a focus on Asian practice. She was formerly a Nominated Member of the Singapore Parliament (Eleventh Session).

#### Contributors

**Tu Kai** is an Assistant Professor at the Law School at Tsinghua University, Beijing. He teaches comparative constitutional law and legal theory, and is interested in the study of federal and devolved governments.

**Wang Zhenmin**, Professor and Dean of the Law School at Tsinghua University, is a leading scholar of Chinese constitutional law who writes extensively in both Chinese and English. He is a Vice-President of the Chinese Society of Constitutional Law and a member of the American Law Institute.

**Jiunn-rong Yeh**, University Chair Professor at the College of Law of National Taiwan University, is a leading scholar of constitutional law, administrative law and environmental law in Taiwan. In recent years he has published major works of scholarship on comparative constitutional law, administrative law and environmental law in East Asia and beyond.

**Dae-Kyu Yoon** is Professor of Law and Vice-President of Kyungnam University at Seoul Campus. He is a leading authority on law and society in South Korea and on North Korean law, writing in both Korean and English on these subjects. He has served as Director of the Institute for Far Eastern Studies at Kyungnam University, and is a former President of the Korean Law and Society Association.

xi

### Preface

This book is a study of constitutional developments and the practice of constitutional law and constitutionalism in sixteen selected Asian countries or jurisdictions in the first decade of the twenty-first century. The objective is to create systematic narratives to document such developments, and to provide comparative, historical and analytical perspectives on various elements of converging or diverging practices and trends of constitutionalism in the jurisdictions concerned. It is hoped that this book will be of interest to scholars and students of comparative constitutional law, comparative politics, and Asian studies, particularly human rights, democracy, legal systems, the rule of law, constitutional adjudication and governance in Asia.

The existing English-language literature on comparative constitutional law, like the literature on comparative law generally, focuses mainly on Europe and North America, and also to some extent South Africa and Japan, but devotes relatively little attention to Asian countries.<sup>1</sup> There do exist some valuable works on constitutional law and constitutionalism in Asia, such as Lawrence Beer (ed.), *Constitutional Systems in Late Twentieth Century Asia* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1992), and Cheryl Saunders and Graham Hassall (eds.), *Asia-Pacific Constitutional Yearbooks* (Centre for Comparative Constitutional Studies, University of Melbourne, 1995–9). These works are, however, no longer up to date. More recently, some works have appeared on constitutional courts in Asia.<sup>2</sup> These works focus mainly on constitutional law and constitutional developments. As far as Southeast Asia is concerned, a relevant work is Clauspeter

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See, e.g., Norman Dorsen et al., *Comparative Constitutionalism: Cases and Materials*, 2nd edn (St Paul, MN: West, 2010); Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet, *Comparative Constitutional Law*, 2nd edn (New York: Foundation Press, 2006).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tom Ginsburg, Judicial Review in New Democracies: Constitutional Courts in Asian Cases (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Andrew Harding and Penelope Nicholson (eds.), New Courts in Asia (London: Routledge, 2010); Björn Dressel (ed.), The Judicialization of Politics in Asia (London: Routledge, 2012).

xiv

#### Preface

Hill and Jörg Menzel (eds.), *Constitutionalism in Southeast Asia* (Singapore: Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung, 2008). The coverage of that book, however, is limited to Southeast Asian countries.

It is hoped that this present book can contribute to filling a gap in the existing literature, because (1) it is more comprehensive in coverage than existing works, both in terms of the countries or jurisdictions covered and in terms of the constitutional issues and developments covered; (2) it is more up to date than existing works; and (3) it attempts to contribute comparative and theoretical reflections on contemporary constitutional phenomena in Asia.

In this book, apart from Chapters 1, 2 and 17, which are on theoretical, comparative and transnational perspectives, all other chapters are 'country chapters' devoted to describing and analysing constitutional developments in the particular country or jurisdiction concerned. It is hoped that these 'country chapters' as a whole will enable readers to acquire an overall view of constitutional developments in East and Southeast Asia, India and Nepal in the first decade of the twenty-first century. The 'country chapters' are designed not to be too specialised or detailed, but to provide a comprehensive and systematic review of major constitutional developments in the countries or jurisdictions concerned in the first decade of the twenty-first century. Authors of these chapters were invited to cover, as far as practicable, some or all of the following aspects of constitutional development: (1) discussions or proposals regarding, or actual enactment of, in the first decade of the twenty-first century, a new constitution or constitutional amendment, (2) major constitutional-law cases decided by the courts in this period, and the trend, if any, emerging from the cases, (3) major legislative developments in the domain of constitutional law in this period, and (4) major political developments in this period that can inform our understanding of constitutional developments in the country or jurisdiction concerned, such as changes of government, or major political, social or economic events.

Contributors to this book were all invited to attend the Fourth Asian Constitutional Law Forum (4th ACLF) held at the Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong (HKU), on 16–17 December 2011, and to present their draft chapters as papers for this conference. The manuscripts were then revised, taking into account comments received at the conference, and updated to take into account developments in 2012, and, in some cases, also particularly significant developments in early 2013. The publication of this book would not have been possible without the successful organisation of the 4th ACLF at HKU. I am therefore much indebted to all those who contributed to the 4th ACLF, particularly Professors Jiunn-rong Yeh and Wen-Chen Chang of the College of Law of National Taiwan University, who, as organisers of the 3rd ACLF in Taipei in 2009, passed to me the 'torch' for organising the 4th ACLF; Dean Johannes Chan of our Faculty of Law, HKU, who secured the financial resources for the 4th ACLF; Professor Simon Young, Director of the Centre for Comparative and Public Law (CCPL) at the Faculty

#### Preface

of Law, HKU, who decided that the CCPL would host the 4th ACLF; and, last but not least, Ms Sharron Fast and Ms Flora Leung – our able and dedicated staff at the CCPL – who provided excellent administrative support in planning, organising and managing the conference. I am also grateful to Mr M. Howard-Johnson – JD student and my research assistant in 2012 – for his invaluable editorial assistance in the preparation of the manuscript for this book. May I also take this opportunity to record my deepest gratitude to the contributors to this volume for their willingness to participate in, and their hard work and steadfast support for, both the conference and this book project, and to Ms Finola O'Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for her keen interest in, and kind support for, the present project.

Albert H.Y. Chen

XV