

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

SIENESE PAINTING
AFTER
THE BLACK DEATH
ARTISTIC PLURALISM, POLITICS, AND THE NEW
ART MARKET



This book provides a new perspective on Sieneſe painting after the Black Death, asking how ſocial, religious, and cultural change effect visual imagery and ſtyle. Judith Steinhoff demonstrates that Siena’s artistic culture of the mid- and late fourteenth century was intentionally pluralistic, and not conservative as is often claimed. She ſhows that Sieneſe art both before and after the Black Death was the material expression of an artistically ſophisticated population that conſciously and carefully integrated tradition and change. Promoting both iconographic and ſtylistic pluralism, Sieneſe patrons furthered their own goals as well as addressed the culture’s changing needs. Steinhoff preſents both detailed case ſtudies and a broader view of trends in artistic practice and patronage. She offers a new approach to interpreting artistic ſtyle in the Trecento, arguing that artists and patrons alike understood the potential of ſtyle as a vehicle that conveys ſpecific meanings.

Judith B. Steinhoff is Associate Professor of Art History at the University of Houston. She has published articles in *Renaissance Studies*, *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, *the Art Bulletin*, and *Renaissance Siena: Art in Context*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B . Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

SIENESE PAINTING
AFTER
THE BLACK DEATH
ARTISTIC PLURALISM, POLITICS,
AND THE NEW ART MARKET



JUDITH B. STEINHOFF

University of Houston



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Siene painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.orgInformation on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107686694

© Judith Steinhoff 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

First paperback edition 2014

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Steinhoff, Judith B. (Judith Belle), 1953–

Siene painting after the Black Death : artistic pluralism, politics, and the new art market / Judith B. Steinhoff.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-84664-1 (hardback)

1. Painting, Italian – Italy – Siena – 14th century. I. Title.

ND621.S6874 2005

759.5'58'09023 – dc22 2005006442

ISBN 978-0-521-84664-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-68669-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Publication of this book has been aided by The Publications Committee,
Department of Art and Archaeology, Princeton University.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Dedicated to

Elizabeth H. Beatson,

friend and colleague,

and

John Plummer,

inspiring teacher and mentor.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B . Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS



<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
PART I: TRECENTO ART HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY	
ONE: INTRODUCTION	3
TWO: MEISS AND METHOD: HISTORIOGRAPHY OF SCHOLARSHIP ON MID-TRECENTO SIENESE PAINTING	9
PART II: PATRONS AND ARTISTS: WORKING RELATIONSHIPS IN TRANSITION	
THREE: PATRONS AND ARTISTS	29
FOUR: ECONOMIC, SOCIAL, AND POLITICAL CONDITIONS AND THE ART MARKET AFTER 1348	64
FIVE: ARTISTS' WORKING RELATIONSHIPS IN THE EARLY TRECENTO	72
SIX: ARTISTS' WORKING RELATIONSHIPS AFTER THE BLACK DEATH: A SIENESE <i>COMPAGNIA</i> , CIRCA 1348–1363	78
PART III: TRANSMISSION AND TRANSFORMATION OF CIVIC–RELIGIOUS IMAGERY	
INTRODUCTION TO PART III	115

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

C O N T E N T S

SEVEN: THE CRAFTING AND CONSOLIDATION OF SIENESE CIVIC–RELIGIOUS IMAGERY: CIVIC–RELIGIOUS RITUALS AND IMAGERY IN THE EARLY FOURTEENTH CENTURY	119
EIGHT: SIENESE CIVIC–RELIGIOUS IMAGERY AT THE MID-TRECENTO	150
PART IV: ARTISTIC STYLE: TRADITION AND TRANSITION	
NINE: STYLISTIC PLURALISM IN THE 1330S AND 1340S	175
TEN: THE POLITICS OF STYLE IN THE 1350S AND 1360S: THE CASE OF SANTA MARIA DELLA SCALA	190
ELEVEN: STYLE AS ICONOGRAPHY: GENERAL REFLECTIONS	210
PART V: CONCLUSION	
<i>Notes</i>	223
<i>Works Cited</i>	243
<i>Index</i>	255

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS



FIGURES

1	Andrea di Cione (Orcagna), <i>The Strozzi Altarpiece</i> .	page 11
2	Siena, Palazzo Pubblico.	32
3	Anonymous, <i>Siena, Memoriale delle Offese</i> .	33
4	Aerial view of Siena Cathedral and Palazzo Pubblico.	34
5	Ambrogio Lorenzetti, “Effects of Good Government” (detail, <i>Allegory of Good Government</i>).	35
6	Sano di Pietro, <i>San Bernardino Preaching in Piazza San Francesco</i> .	39
7	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>San Gimignano Polyptych</i> .	40
8	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Peter Martyr</i> (detail of San Gimignano polyptych).	41
9	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> (detail of San Gimignano polyptych).	43
10	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Tabernacle with Madonna and Child Enthroned with Saints and Angels</i> .	44
11	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, interior of <i>Tabernacle wings</i> .	45
12	<i>Tabernacle of the Virgin</i> . France, late 13th–early 14th century, ivory.	46
13	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	47
14	Ambrogio Lorenzetti, <i>Maestà</i> .	48
15	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> (Lucca polyptych).	49
16	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Mary Magdalen</i> .	50
17	Andrea di Bartolo, <i>St. Mary Magdalen</i> .	51
18	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Palazzo Pubblico Triptych</i> .	57
19	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Sestano Altarpiece</i> .	59
20	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>San Pietro a Ovile Madonna and Child</i> .	61
21	Anonymous, <i>Thamyris Painting the Virgin and Child</i> . Giovanni Boccaccio, “Le livre des cleres et nobles femmes.”	73
22	Niccolò di ser Sozzo and Luca di Tommè, <i>Madonna and Child Enthroned with Saints</i> .	79

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

23	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, halo design (detail: <i>St. Catherine</i>).	84
24	Palazzo Venezia Master, <i>St. Corona</i> (detail of halo).	84
25	Palazzo Venezia Master, <i>St. Corona</i> (detail of fabric).	85
26	Niccolò di ser Sozzo, <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	86
27	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	86
28	Niccolò di ser Sozzo, <i>Madonna and Child</i> (detail of Child's head).	87
29	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, Child's face (detail from <i>San Gimignano polyptych</i>).	87
30	Niccolò di ser Sozzo (attributed), <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	88
31	Bartolommeo Bulgarini (with assistant), <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	89
32	Luca di Tommè, <i>Madonna and Child Enthroned</i> .	91
33	Luca di Tommè, <i>Madonna and Child Enthroned</i> .	92
34	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> .	93
35	Luca di Tommè, <i>St. Bartholomew</i> (from Mystic Marriage of St. Catherine altarpiece).	95
36	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Bartholomew</i> (detail from Pisa polyptych).	95
37	Luca di Tommè, <i>Madonna and Child</i> (detail: fabric design).	96
38	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Ovile Madonna</i> (detail: fabric design).	97
39	Jacopo di Mino del Pellicciaio, <i>Coronation of the Virgin</i> .	98
40	Pellicciaio, <i>Coronation</i> (detail of pastiglia).	99
41	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Ovile Madonna</i> (detail of pastiglia).	99
42	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Peter</i> (detail from San Gimignano polyptych).	100
43	Naddo Ceccarelli, <i>St. Blasius</i> (from predella of Ospedale altarpiece). Princeton, Princeton University Art Museum no. 62.57	101
44	"Master of the Rebel Angels" (Giovanni da Milano?), <i>Fall of the Rebel Angels</i> .	103
45	"Master of the Rebel Angels" (Giovanni da Milano?), <i>St. Martin Dividing His Cloak with a Beggar</i> .	103
46	Bartolo di Fredi, <i>Griffi-Cacciati Altarpiece</i> .	109
47	Bartolo di Fredi, <i>Adoration of the Shepherds, St. Augustine, and St. Anthony Abbot</i> .	110
48	Simone Martini, <i>The City Seal</i> (detail of <i>Maestà</i>).	120
49	Anonymous, Gabella cover of 1483: <i>Presentation of the Keys of the City to the Virgin</i> .	121
50	Anonymous, <i>Madonna degli Occhi Grossi</i> (or <i>Madonna of the Vow</i>).	122
51	Guido da Siena (and workshop), <i>Madonna delle Grazie</i> (<i>Madonna of Thanks</i>) or <i>Madonna del Voto</i> .	123
52	Duccio di Buoninsegna, <i>Maestà</i> .	125

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

53	Siena, Palazzo Pubblico, <i>Sala del Consiglio</i> or <i>Sala del Mappamundo</i> .	127
54	Simone Martini, <i>Maestà</i> . Siena, Palazzo Pubblico, <i>Sala del Consiglio</i> .	127
55	Duccio di Buoninsegna, <i>Stained-glass Oculus</i> .	131
56	Lippo Memmi (attributed), <i>Assumption of the Virgin</i> .	132
57	Niccolò di ser Sozzo, “Assumption of the Virgin,” frontispiece, <i>Caleffo dell’Assunta</i> .	133
58	Siena, Hospital of Santa Maria della Scala.	137
59	Siena, Piazza del Duomo with Ospedale di Santa Maria della Scala.	139
60	Duccio di Buoninsegna, <i>Maestà</i> (detail of patron saints).	141
61	Lippo Memmi, <i>Maestà</i> . San Gimignano, Palazzo Comunale.	143
62	Bartolomeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Ansanus</i> (Palazzo Pubblico triptych).	144
63	Niccolò di ser Sozzo, <i>St. Ansanus</i> (detail of frontispiece, <i>Caleffo dell’Assunta</i>).	145
64	Plan indicating the locations of the patron saint altars. Siena, Cathedral.	147
65	Lippo Memmi, <i>Madonna della Misericordia</i> .	151
66	Francesco di Giorgio and assistants, Biccherna Cover of 1467: <i>The Virgin Protecting Siena in Time of Earthquakes</i> .	153
67	Master of the Palazzo Venezia Madonna, <i>St. Corona</i> .	155
68	Pietro Lorenzetti, <i>Birth of the Virgin</i> (St. Savinus altarpiece).	156
69	Ambrogio Lorenzetti, <i>Purification of the Virgin</i> (St. Crescentius altarpiece).	157
70	Duccio di Buoninsegna, <i>Nativity</i> (from the <i>Maestà</i>).	158
71	Ambrogio Lorenzetti (workshop), <i>Adoration of the Child</i> .	159
72	<i>Embroidery, Nativity/Adoration of the Shepherds</i> .	161
73	Bulgarini, <i>Inscription on Virgin’s Halo</i> (detail of Fogg <i>Adoration of the Shepherds</i>).	163
74	<i>Libro dei Censi</i> (1400), detail of city.	167
75	Sano di Pietro, <i>San Bernardino with a Model of Siena</i> .	170
76	Pietro Lorenzetti, <i>Arezzo Altarpiece</i> .	182
77	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Lucca polyptych</i> .	183
78	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Catherine of Alexandria</i> .	184
79	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Catherine of Alexandria</i> (x-radiograph).	185
80	Niccolò di Segna, <i>Saints Benedict, Michael, Bartholomew, Nicholas</i> .	186
81	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child</i> (from Palazzo Pubblico triptych).	187

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

82	Palazzo Venezia Master, <i>The Mystic Marriage of St. Catherine</i> (from the Ospedale).	192
83	Naddo Ceccarelli, polyptych (from Ospedale).	193
84	Ceccarelli, predella (from Ospedale polyptych).	194
85	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>St. Luke Altarpiece</i> .	195
86	Bartolommeo Bulgarini, <i>Madonna and Child Enthroned with Angels</i> .	197
87	Pietro Lorenzetti, <i>Carmelite Altarpiece</i> .	199
88	Niccolò di ser Sozzo and Luca di Tommè, <i>Madonna and Child Enthroned</i> .	207
89	St. Francis Master, <i>The Miracle of the Spring</i> (Assisi, San Francesco, upper church).	212
90	The Limbourg Brothers, <i>October</i> (calendar page from <i>Très Riches Heures</i>).	213

COLOR PLATES

Color plates follow page 112

- I View of Siena, Palazzo Pubblico campanile.
- II Siena Cathedral.
- III Bartolommeo Bulgarini, *Assumption of the Virgin*. Siena, Pinacoteca no. 61.
- IV Bartolommeo Bulgarini, *The Adoration of the Shepherds*. Cambridge, Fogg Art Museum inv. no. 1917.89.
- V Reconstruction of the St. Victor Altarpiece (line drawing).
- VI Reconstruction of the St. Victor Altarpiece (photo montage).
- VII Simone Martini, *The Annunciation* (St. Ansanus altarpiece). Florence, Uffizi inv. nos. 451, 452, 453.
- VIII Master of the Palazzo Venezia Madonna, *St. Victor*. Copenhagen, Statens Museum for Kunst.
- IX Bartolommeo Bulgarini, halo and fabric designs (detail: *Madonna and Child*, from the San Gimignano polyptych). Florence, private collection.
- X Duccio, *Assumption of the Virgin* (detail of oculus, Siena Cathedral).
- XI Anonymous, *Frontispiece, Libro dei Censi*.
- XII *St. Crescentius* (detail, *Libro dei Censi* frontispiece).
- XIII *Evangelary* (cover). Siena, Complesso museale di Santa Maria della Scala. Gilded silver and cloisonné. Venetian and Byzantine, 10th–14th century.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS



The ideas and research for this book developed over a period of more than twenty years. During that long gestation, my thinking about the subjects I address here benefited enormously from many conversations reaching back to my years as a graduate student and right up until the summer of 2004. I can thank directly only some of those who took the time to engage in those discussions, but I am grateful to all.

The late Elizabeth Beatson was not only a valued colleague but also a long-time friend and source of intellectual stimulation. I remember with particular fondness the conversations we had in the spring of 1997 when I was at Princeton as a visiting scholar. Elizabeth's willingness to grapple with the literature and interpretations of the Black Death and post-plague art since the time when she had worked so closely with Millard Meiss proved substantively challenging, but it was also inspiring. John Plummer, despite his disclaimers of any expertise in Siene trecento painting, opened my mind to ways of seeing and thinking about art that have remained a great inspiration in my work. He introduced to me the concept of "the style of the iconography and the iconography of the style." I thank him for his wisdom and for many wonderful conversations.

As an art historian, I have long felt the challenge of approaching historical material, not as a mere backdrop for understanding art, but with (at least as nearly as possible!) as complex and nuanced an understanding as scholars trained in that field. I am therefore especially grateful for the dialog I have had with Sam Cohn over the years. His work on Siena and the Black Death has been a key source of both intellectual stimulation and support for my own. In addition, he has been extremely generous in reading and critiquing the social and economic aspects of my work and making valuable suggestions of additional literature to consider.

I have also been extremely fortunate to have the opportunity to carry on numerous discussions with Norman Muller and Erling Skaug about techniques used in trecento panel paintings and their implications for a possible "compagnia" of painters in Siena. Gaudenz Freuler gave me valuable feedback on my speculations about the relationship between Bulgarini and Bartolo di Fredi, and ultimately

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-68669-4 - Sieneſe Painting after the Black Death: Artistic Pluralism, Politics, and the New Art Market

Judith B. Steinhoff

Frontmatter

[More information](#)A C K N O W L E D G M E N T S

supported my analysis of inter-workshop relationships even in the absence of hard evidence. Conversations and correspondence with Henk van Os broadened my thinking not only about workshop organization and artists' interactions in trecento Siena but, very importantly, on the devotional contexts and many other aspects of Sieneſe painting as well.

My first conception of this book was very different from the form it eventually took. Several people read and made insightful comments about prospectuses and pieces or even the whole of earlier versions. I particularly want to thank Cristelle Baskins, Joanna Cannon, Cathleen Hoeniger, and Debra Pincus for their critiques and forthright comments. They helped greatly to sharpen my thinking about how to shape the final manuscript, as did the readers for Cambridge University Press and one other anonymous reader. My dear friend, Lynn Randolph, a painter herself, provided a valuable sounding board that, I hope, helped me to make the text more accessible to a number of audiences. I thank her for listening, asking questions, and for looking at Sieneſe art with me.

I am also grateful to the students in my classes at the University of Houston who enabled and helped me to explore the role of patronage in the making of art, and to the scholars who made insightful comments on the material from this book that I presented at Kalamazoo and other conferences.

Above all, I am deeply appreciative for the support, sound critiques, and keen editorial skills of my husband, Donald R. Morrison.