Foundations of Healthcare Ethics Theory to practice

In order to provide the highest level of care to their patients and clients, health professionals need a sound knowledge and understanding of healthcare ethics. *Foundations of Healthcare Ethics: Theory to practice* focuses on the philosophical concepts that underpin contemporary ethical discourse for health professionals, and arms both students and professionals with the knowledge to tackle situations of moral uncertainty in clinical practice.

The text has been specially written to provide an in-depth study of the theoretical foundations of healthcare ethics. It covers a range of normative ethical theories, from virtue ethics to utilitarianism, while also investigating their application to contemporary issues in healthcare and society. The book provides opportunities for self-directed learning, and also presents questions and case studies to facilitate engagement and discussion.

Foundations of Healthcare Ethics: Theory to practice provides both students and professionals with an understanding of the philosophy governing healthcare ethics in order to help them provide a better level of care to all patients and clients.

Jānis (John) T. Ozoliņš is Professor of Philosophy at the Australian Catholic University and permanent Honorary Fellow, University of Latvia.

Joanne Grainger is a lecturer and healthcare ethicist in the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Paramedicine at the Australian Catholic University.



Foundations of Healthcare Ethics Theory to practice

Edited by Jānis T. Ozoliņš & Joanne Grainger





477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107639645

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Cover designed by Sardine Design Typeset by Integra Software Services Pvt. Ltd Printed in Singapore by C.O.S. Printers Pte Ltd

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloguing-in-Publication entry is available from the catalogue of the National Library of Australia at www.nla.gov.au

ISBN 978-1-107-63964-5 Paperback

Reproduction and communication for educational purposes

The Australian *Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10% of the pages of this work, whichever is the greater, to be reproduced and/or communicated by any educational institution for its educational purposes provided that the educational institution (or the body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

For details of the CAL licence for educational institutions contact:

Copyright Agency Limited Level 15, 233 Castlereagh Street Sydney NSW 2000 Telephone: (02) 9394 7600 Facsimile: (02) 9394 7601 E-mail: info@copyright.com.au

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Please be aware that this publication may contain several variations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander terms and spellings; no disrespect is intended. Please note that the terms 'Indigenous Australians' and 'Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples' may be used interchangeably in this publication.

Every effort has been made in preparing this book to provide accurate and up-to-date information that is in accord with accepted standards and practice at the time of publication. Although case histories are drawn from actual cases, every effort has been made to disguise the identities of the individuals involved. Nevertheless, the authors, editors and publishers can make no warranties that the information contained herein is totally free from error, not least because clinical standards are constantly changing through research and regulation. The authors, editors and publishers therefore disclaim all liability for direct or consequential damages resulting from the use of material contained in this book. Readers are strongly advised to pay careful attention to information provided by the manufacturer of any drugs or equipment that they plan to use.

> In memory of Jacob Jānis Ozoliņš (1981–2013) and for my family. Jānis (John) Ozoliņš

For my parents Jill and Len Grainger, whose love and extraordinary work ethic have both inspired and enabled me to choose the career path of fostering a culture of life in healthcare.

Joanne Grainger

Foreword

'My Hippocratic oath tells me to cut a gangrenous appendix out of the human body. The Jews are the gangrenous appendix of mankind. That's why I cut them out.' So explained one of the doctors working in a Nazi death camp during World War II. He thought the procedures he carried out at Auschwitz were justifiable on *medical* grounds. Killing Jews, Gypsies, Catholics, the mentally and physically disabled, homosexuals and other vulnerable people by various methods – including starvation, lethal injection or poisoning with carbon monoxide – furthered Hitler's aim of cleansing the gene pool and ensuring the Aryan race's dominion over all other races (Cook, 2014, citing Lifton, 2000: 232).

Unfortunately, the Allied Powers do not escape culpability for the misuse of science and medicine. In recent years, reports have emerged of unethical medical experiments conducted by the Americans in Guatemala after World War II. Dr John Cutler, who eventually rose to be US Assistant Surgeon-General, led this project and was associated with a parallel one in Tuskegee, Alabama. To study the course of sexually transmitted diseases and the effect of penicillin, the US Public Health Service deliberately infected soldiers, prostitutes, prisoners and mental patients with syphilis without their knowledge or consent. The 1997 film Miss Evers' Boys brought the Alabama part of that story to public attention, and led to an apology by President Bill Clinton. But it was not until 2011 that a Commission of Inquiry reported the full horror of the Guatemalan phase of the study: instead of the few dozen victims previously acknowledged, there were in fact at least two thousand healthy men deliberately infected, many of whom in turn infected their wives and children. Instead of being treated with penicillin, they were all given placebos so the researchers could observe the course of the disease as it took its terrible toll on their bodies and minds, and eventually killed them (Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues, 2011).

Such research is obviously monstrous. But what shocked many people was that it was still going on in 1970s America. The international legal instruments to guarantee human rights and the World Medical Association's declarations to ensure a high standard of medical ethics that came after the terrible Nazi experiments of the 1930s and 1940s were supposed to prevent such things from ever occurring again. No doctor would ever again intentionally torture or viii foreword

kill, and no government or profession would ever again sponsor such practices. For sensitive students, health professionals, lawyers and ethicists – such as those who may read this textbook – this must raise deep questions. Why would some people fail to abide by the most basic principles of morality, known not only to the world's great religions, but also to sound medicine and nursing, the common law and good secular philosophy?

Unfortunately, atrocities in the name of medicine or research cannot be confined to the garbage bin of history. Richard Dawkins, prominent scientist and evangelist for atheism, claimed recently that not only are parents free to abort children with Down syndrome: they actually have a moral obligation to do so. This comment followed in the wake of revelations that some surrogate mothers were refusing to abort children they were carrying on behalf of other couples, who had been found to have Down Syndrome and whose commissioning parents had directed be terminated (Flynn, 2014). Julian Savulescu, an Australian bioethicist at Oxford University, admitted that eugenics is practised all the time in contemporary healthcare, especially through 'search and destroy' pre-natal screening and genetic tests; however, because it is a matter of 'free choice', it is at least rhetorically different from the Nazi eugenics program (cited in Cook, 2014). That said, Dawkins, Savulescu and others believe there is not just a right but a duty to abort the handicapped and a duty to improve the genetic pool where we can. How soon this duty will be sufficiently politically palatable to be made law or medical policy is uncertain, but bioethics will on their view be no barrier to such social trends.

Clearly declarations of moral principle for healthcare practice are important: they offer a basis for professional unity, identity, regulation and education; they allow health professionals to tell themselves and those who entrust themselves to their care that 'this is what we stand for; this is what we will do and not do and why'. They are therefore crucial to the health professional– patient relationship. But such ethics statements are never enough: eternal vigilance is required to ensure they are truly observed, and we need medical practitioners of good character who will actually apply them wisely and consistently. In the struggle for the soul of our culture, the battlegrounds are increasingly hospitals and aged care facilities, parliaments and courts, bureaucracies and academies. If our highest values are to survive and be enacted, healthcare will require students and professionals of intelligence and courage. If healthcare is to be worthy of the reverence and rewards received in our community, if people are to continue to trust health professionals, the practitioners must be principled and virtuous.

FOREWORD **ix**

We must understand, for instance, what healthcare is for and how its internal goals might reasonably be pursued. The therapeutic and research imperatives to get results 'no matter what'; the technological imperative to pursue the technically possible even if morally troubling; the demands of patients, administrators and financiers; the practitioners' feelings of impotence and fantasies of omnipotence: all can militate against ethics in practice. Doctors and nurses are by no means alone in this. Ethics committees and legal and moral advisers to health institutions can feel pressured to be 'part of the team', getting results no matter what the cost to justice and ethics. Even philosophers and theologians – who should be the experts at raising questions as much as providing answers – can all too easily become window-dressers for the ideologies of the age or the convenience of those they are advising.

Yet ordinary people still look to their professionals to provide not just a high level of technical care but highly ethical care. Here's one reason why. When the best pagan doctors sought to follow Hippocrates or the best Christian doctors the Good Samaritan, when Jews and Muslims brought the wisdom of Maimonides and Avicenna to the West and through the West to the world, when more recent practitioners re-consecrated themselves to the Geneva Declaration, all swore an oath – not an employment contract or protocol, but an oath: a prayer and promise to God, or the gods, or whatever people hold most precious. That is a humble act, acknowledging that both goodness and health ultimately come from a source greater than ourselves; that on joining and practising in my profession I am engaging in more than a job, in something more like a God-given 'vocation'. Solemnly to consecrate my life to the service of humanity; to say I will put the life and health of my patients first and always respect their dignity and privacy; to resolve to save and heal and care, never kill or harm or abandon; to promise to honour my teachers and build up my profession: to commit to such things requires all that is best in the human spirit and God's help also.

* * *

Amy Gutmann, President of the University of Pennsylvania and Chair of the Guatemala Commission, said that the experiments the US government carried out 'should shock the conscience not in spite of their medical context, but precisely because of it'. We rightly expect more of our professionals. We expect our health professionals to be protectors of life and health and dignity.

Although there have been many failures, and although contemporary bioethics is in many ways in disarray, all is not lost. In your hands is a textbook that

X FOREWORD

aims to provide our future practitioners with the intellectual resources to be more than mere witchdoctors and hired guns. This work, authored by a number of respected ethicists, theologians and philosophers, provides professionals, students and the general reader with an accessible entrée to the ethics of healthcare, informed by a Catholic intellectual perspective and mostly in accord with that church's bioethical teaching. It is not straitened by a utilitarian ethic that precludes the possibility of absolutes or by deontological ethics that preclude the possibility of questions. It is, rather, open to questions about what healthcare is and what it is for, what a health professional is and what they are for, what a good professional practice is and what sorts of practices might be morally 'shady'. It accepts that central to medical practice are the goals of saving, healing and caring, and principles against killing, harming or abandoning. Though avoiding over-simplifications, it insists that sound practice requires respect for the dignity or inviolability of the human being from conception until natural death.

Rather than diving straight into the ethical conundrums that are the stuff of TV hospital shows or media headlines, this book valuably begins by grounding our reflection in the range of ethical approaches, from 'principlism' to Kantian ethics, empathy and care, virtue ethics and natural law. Exploration of the latter two theories in particular is helpful in providing students with ways of thinking about ethics that build on classical thought and modern declarations, that make sense of what health professionals actually do and aspire to, yet that receive far too little exposure in our culture today. In this regard, Aristotle, Aquinas and the great tradition on the human person, happiness and practical reason get a thorough workout in this volume, and the authors are unafraid to refer appropriately to God and spirituality. This is because healthcare has become not only a battleground for the soul of our culture, as suggested above, but also a place where sensitive and ethical practitioners today must ask for themselves the big questions about what it is to be a good person and live a good life. Put baldly, good nurses and doctors are not merely excellent technicians but also good. And so they need the sort of intellectual equipment and moral formation this book proposes.

Building on such philosophical and theological foundations, this book then readies the reader to confront a number of topical ethical issues, such as conceptualising human dignity, conscience and the health professional; the beginning of life; autonomy and consent; the interaction between law and autonomy at the end of life; organ donation and brain death; and issues of justice, health resource-allocation and palliative care for the dying. Thus CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-63964-5 - Foundations of Healthcare Ethics: Theory to Practice Edited by Jānis T. Ozoliņš & Joanne Grainger Frontmatter More information

FOREWORD Xi

practitioners and students are provided with a way through the maze of real-life challenges that they are likely to confront.

Foundations of Healthcare Ethics: Theory to practice is an important addition to the library of any student or practitioner who wishes to approach healthcare in ways that are reasonable and compassionate, that accord with the long wisdom of the profession itself and the wider philosophical-theological tradition, and that allow both practitioners and those for whom they care to live 'the good life' to its natural end.

Most Rev. Anthony Fisher OP, Archbishop of Sydney

References

Cook, M. (2014). Lest we forget. Mercatornet, 4 September. Retrieved 20 September 2014 from http://www.mercatornet.com/articles/view/lest we forget1>.

Flynn, J. (2014). When babies become commodities: The new eugenics. *Zenit*, 7 September. Retrieved 20 September 2014 from http://www.zenit.org/en/ articles/when-babies-becomecommodities>.

Lifton, R. J. (2000). The Nazi doctors: Medical killing and the psychology of genocide. New York: Basic Books.

Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues (2011). 'Ethically impossible' STD research in Guatemala from 1946 to 1948. Washington, DC: Presidential Commission.

Contents

Foreword by Anthony Fisher List of contributors		page vii xvii
1	Why study healthcare ethics?	1
	Patrick McArdle and Joanne Grainger	
	Why ethics?	
	Ethics in the context of the twenty-first century	
	Studying 'professional ethics'	
	Bioethics or the ethics of healthcare? Why study healthcare ethics?	
2	Ethical theories	14
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	Introduction: What is ethics?	
	Meta-ethics and normative ethics	
	Normative ethics and ethical theories	27
	Conclusion	30
3	Ethical principlism	33
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	What is a principle?	34
	Common morality	
	The four principles	
	Conclusion	48
4	Personhood and human dignity	51
	David G. Kirchhoffer	
	The rise of the concept of human dignity in healthcare ethic: Controversies regarding the meaning and relevance	s 51
	of human dignity	55
	Rethinking human dignity: The multi-dimensionality of	
	the human individual	61
5	Empathy and care	70
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	Empathy, care and ethics	
	What is empathy?	73

XIV CONTENTS

	Edith Stein Healthcare and empathy	
6	Healthcare and virtue	85
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	Character and virtue	
	Approaches to virtue ethics	
	Aristotle and the good for human beings	
	Aquinas and the infused virtues	
7	Rationality in utilitarian thought	102
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	Classical utilitarianism	103
	The key elements of utilitarianism	106
	Act utilitarianism	108
	Rule utilitarianism	110
	Preference utilitarianism	113
	Peter Singer's principle of the equal consideration	
	of interests	115
	Problems for utilitarianism	116
8	Natural law and the sanctity of human life	120
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	The idea of a law	120
	Practical reasoning and objective human fulfilment	123
	Contemporary natural law theory	
	Modes of responsibility and the virtues	129
	Absolute moral norms	
	Moral absolutes and the double effect	131
	Conclusion	135
9	Obligations, duties and rights	138
	Jānis (John) Ozoliņš	
	Kant's deontological approach to ethics	
	Hypothetical and categorical imperatives	140
	The good will	
	Duty and the categorical imperative	
	The first formulation of the categorical imperative	
	The second formulation of the categorical imperative	
	The third formulation of the categorical imperative	
		150

10 A historical analysis of feminism and an application to contemporary healthcare ethics 155 Joanne Grainger A historical review of the origins of contemporary feminism 156 The three 'waves' of contemporary feminism 157 Difficulties in defining 'feminism' 162 'Relational autonomy' as a contemporary expression 11 Conscience and the healthcare professional 174 Brigid McKenna The case for freedom of conscience for healthcare Healthcare professionals or healthcare providers? 184 12 Is there a right to life and a right to die? 193 Frank Brennan The legal and moral dimensions of rights talk 193 Rights in United Nations instruments 198 Non-constitutional protection of rights in domestic law 205 13 When does human life begin? A theological, philosophical and scientific analysis 213 Norman Ford and Joanne Grainger 14 Autonomy and consent 228 Jānis (John) Ozoliņš

CONTENTS XV

XVI CONTENTS

	Competence of the participant	237
	Risk	237
	Limits of consent	239
	Consent for those below the age of 18	240
	Different ways of establishing consent	242
15	The 'dead donor rule' and organ donation	246
	Brigid McKenna	
	Donation after death and the 'dead donor rule'	247
	'Testing' problems: Have patients who meet the 'Harvard	
	criteria' lost all brain function?	248
	Conceptual problems: Are patients who have lost all brain	
	function in fact dead?	249
	What is 'death' and does it matter?	251
	Conclusion	259
16	Just care at the end of life	263
	Bernadette Tobin	
	Four approaches to justice in the distribution of healthcare	
	resources.	263
	Who counts as 'the other'?	270
	What justice requires at the end of life	272
	Conclusion	275

Index

List of contributors

Frank Brennan SJ, AO is Professor of Law at the Australian Catholic University and Adjunct Professor at the Australian National University College of Law and National Centre for Indigenous Studies. He was the founding director of Uniya, the Australian Jesuit Social Justice Centre. He is a board member of St Vincent's Health Australia. His book, *Acting on Conscience* (2007), looks at the place of religion in Australian politics and law. The National Trust classified him as a Living National Treasure at the same time as Paul Keating labelled him 'the meddling priest'. In 2009, he chaired the Australian National Human Rights Consultation Committee.

Norman Ford, sdb is a Senior Fellow of Catholic Theological College, and a member of both the Department of Philosophy and the Department of Moral Theology and Canon Law. He lectures in bioethics, and ethical theory and practical issues. He has published extensively in bioethics. Among his recent publications are: *Stem Cells, Science, Medicine, Law and Ethics* (co-authored with Michael Herbert, 2003), *The Prenatal Person: Ethics from Conception to Birth* (2002), *Christian Conscience* (2009) and *Ethical Dilemmas in Assisted Reproductive Technologies* (2011); along with many articles in journals and collections.

Joanne Grainger is a registered nurse, healthcare ethicist and post-graduate course coordinator for the School of Nursing, Midwifery and Paramedicine at the Australian Catholic University (ACU). Currently completing a Doctor of Education at Melbourne University, Joanne also lectures in the area of sports ethics for the Masters of High Performance Sport course at ACU. In 2010, Joanne was awarded the prestigious Edmund Pellegrino Fellowship in Bioethics from Georgetown University in Washington DC, the first registered nurse and Australian to receive this award. Also in 2010, Joanne received the Mary Philippa Brazill Foundation national grant for the development of online healthcare ethics education units specifically for post-graduate nurses and midwives across Australia. In 2012, Joanne was conferred the Australian Catholic University Excellence in Teaching award for her leadership in healthcare ethics education at the university and in the public sphere. She has interests in the scholarship areas of military ethics (in particular the role of nurses in the WWII Nazi euthanasia programs), simulation education pedagogy, and research ethics, and is passionate about the academic work and life of Pope John Paul II.

David G. Kirchhoffer is a Lecturer in Theological Ethics in the School of Theology at the Australian Catholic University's McAuley campus in Banyo, Brisbane. He is a South African

XVIII LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

who holds degrees in psychology and advanced biology, and theology. He completed his doctorate in theological ethics at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium, and worked as a post-doctoral researcher at the Centre for Biomedical Ethics and Law at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven. He is the author of *Human Dignity in Contemporary Ethics* (2013) and co-editor of *Being Human: Towards a Theological Anthropology for the 21st Century* (2013).

Patrick McArdle is Associate Professor in Theology and Campus Dean of the Canberra Campus of the Australian Catholic University. He is also Director of the Institute for Catholic Identity and Mission. His primary research is related to Christian anthropology, applying his findings in this field to practical theology and Christian ethics, especially in the field of healthcare. His recent publications, including *Relational Health Care: A Practical Theology of Personhood* (2008), centre on healthcare and Christian anthropology, models of formation for those engaged in ministries and other Church-based activities, and the educational impact of relational personhood.

Brigid McKenna is the Director of the Office of Life, Marriage and Family in the Archdiocese of Hobart, Tasmania. She is a medical practitioner and healthcare ethicist and educator. She has degrees from the University of Tasmania (MBBS) and the John Paul II Institute for Marriage and Family (MBioeth). After several years of medical practice, she became the Director of the Life Office, an agency of the Catholic Archdiocese of Sydney involved in bioethical research, education and public policy. She has also taught at the University of Notre Dame Australia, the Australian Catholic University and the University of Tasmania.

Jānis (John) T. Ozoliņš FHERDSA, FPESA, MACE, Foreign Member of the Latvian Academy of Sciences, is Professor of Philosophy at the Australian Catholic University, permanent Honorary Fellow, Institute of Philosophy and Sociology, University of Latvia, and Inaugural Crawford Miller Visiting Fellow at St. Cross College, Oxford. He is a Fellow of the Higher Education Research and Development Society of Australasia, and a Fellow and former President of the Philosophy of Education Society of Australasia. He is also Reviews Editor of *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, Editor of *Res Disputandae* (formerly *Ethics Education*) and an editorial consultant on a number of international refereed journals. He is Secretary-General of the World Union of Catholic Philosophy (COMIUCAP), Regional Coordinator for Oceania of the Centre for Research in Values and Philosophy and a member of the International Association of Catholic Bioethicists. He has interests in the metaphysics of Aquinas, philosophy of education, social philosophy, research ethics and applied ethics, and has published widely in these areas.

Bernadette Tobin is director of the Plunkett Centre for Ethics, a joint centre of the Australian Catholic University and St Vincent's & Mater Health Sydney. She is Conjoint Associate Professor in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of New South Wales and Conjoint Associate Professor in the Faculty of Health Sciences at the University of Sydney. She is Honorary Ethicist at the Children's Hospital at Westmead, Sydney.