

# Index

accident prevention, 193, 242, 243, 248, 250 Baty, Thomas, 228, 230 Ackner, Lord, 190 Bazley v Curry, 2, 19, 76, 92, 161, 174, administrative law, 50-3 194, 249 agency, 131, 132, 176 McLachlin J, 162-6, 189, 191, 194, 238, and motor vehicles, 110-16 241-2, 246, 247 conceptual difficulties of, Blackburn, Lord, 116-17 Blackstone, Sir William, 57 114, 141, 253 Blieck case, 20, 30, 133-40, 186, 223 common law, in, 12, 13, 47, 102, 144 borrowed servant problem, 56, definition, 109 scope of the agent's authority, 110 83-93, 142 Brüggemeier, G., 10, 103 Atiyah, P.S., 4, 42, 98, 159, 228 compensation, 253 control test, 59 Callinan J, 115, 173, 174 dual liability of employers, Canada, 42, 72, 92-3, 132, 260 81, 89-90, 93 671122 Ontario Ltd v Sagaz Industries Canada inclusion of all workers in vicarious Inc., 69, 71, 72, 79 liability, 140 Bazley v Curry, 2, 19, 76, 92, 161, 162-6, 174, 189, 193-4, 241-2, 246, 247 independent contractors, 125 insurance, 237 McLachlin J, 162-6, 189, 191, 194, 238, risk, 194 241-2, 246 Australia, 71, 123 control test, 162 agency, 102, 129-31 course of employment test, 155, 191 course of employment test, 172-4, 191 enterprise risk, 169 extension of liability, 247 Hollis v Vabu, 74-5, 76, 249 control, 75, 127-9, 143 Jacobi v Griffiths, 161, 163 policy concerns, 249, 251 legislation for vicarious liability, 105 Insurance Contracts Act 1984, 33 motor vehicle legislation, 115 Ipp Report, 117 right to an indemnity, 35 legislation for vicarious liability, 105 risk, 194, 251 motor vehicle legislation, 115 Cane, P., 89, 112, 179, 237 New South Wales v Lepore; Samin v Chabas, François, 233 Queensland; Rich v Queensland, 161, children, capacities of, 212 249, 251, 262 civil law systems, 2, 229; see also French Civil parental responsibility, 200-1 Code, German Civil Code policy factors, 249, 251 and common law systems, 5 prohibited conduct, 155 right to an indemnity, 34 employer/employee relationship, 65, 78 authority extension of vicarious liability outside ostensible, 176, 178, 179, 181 the employment context, 106-8, 263 parental, 220 independent contractors, 125



### 274 INDEX

civil law systems (cont.) contract law, 43-54, 44-6, 97 intermediate category of employee, 131 and doctors, 63 principles of fault, 2 liability in, 5, 67 professionals, 156 contract of employment, 23, 55-79, 82, 101, terminology used in, 26 128, 142 Clyde, Lord, 189 and temporary workers, 96 contract for services, 23, 58, 71 common employment, doctrine of, 119 common law systems definition, 79 control, 55, 87, 99, 128, 140, 244, 252 Cooke J, 70–1 administrative law, 50-1 agency, 108-16, 144 civil law systems and, 5 corporations, 7, 47, 252 close connection test, 262 course of employment test, 150-88, 251, 253 company law and, 47 appraisal of the situation, 188-95 concurrent liability, 44 authority of the employee, 178, 179 connection between the tort and the case law, 192 parties' relationship, 145 close connection test, 162-3, 165-6, contract of employment, 56 167, 169, 172-4, 178, 180-1, course of employment test, 157-81, 193 188-95, 262-3 close connection test, 189 common law system, in the, 160-2 deliberate wrongdoing, 160-2 connection between the risk and the development of vicarious liability in, wrong that results, 162-6 12 - 13composite test, 70-3, 75, 131, 133, 193 employer/employee relationship, 65, 79, 143 strong connection test, 164 equality before the law, 44 European law in, 258 exemplary damages, 17, 22, 39-43 factors in, 191, 195 extension of vicarious liability outside Salmond test: see separate entry significance of policy in, 150-3 the employment context, 26, 108-26, 116-26 courts, discretion given to, 2, 73, 76, 106, functional limit on liability, 148 107, 195 legislation for vicarious liability, 103-5 craftsmen liability, 24 master's responsibility for actions of criminal law, 53-4, 160, 202 servants, 232 culpa in eligendo/in vigilando, 231-4 motor vehicle legislation, 141 parental liability, 196, 223-6 damages, exemplary, 17, 22, 39-43 parental responsibility in, 197-203, 254 de Greuille, Bertrand, 25, 59, 229 duty of care owed to children, 199 Denning Lord, 14, 69, 113, 118, 155 fault-based liability, 206-10 Cassidy v Ministry of Health, 61, 62, 69, framework for in tort law, 203-17 118, 122 models of, 205-13, 223 Denham v Midland Employers' Mutual preventing children from causing Assurance Ltd, 98 injury to another, 198, 200-3 dependent contractors, 127, 143, 144, 253 proof of fault, 202 deterrence, 42, 43, 76, 163, 172, protection of children, 197, 198-200 241-3, 245-7 standards expected, 201, 206 Hollis v Vabu, 129, 251 standards of care, 226 doctors, 13; see also professionals vicarious or strict liability, 210-13 contract law and, 63 professionals and, 62-3 control and negligence, 61-5 responsibility in, 1 Draft Common Frame of Reference rigidity of, 122 (Europe), 255, 256, 257 strict liability, 6, 223-6 Book VI, Article 3:201, 258-63 system of precedent, 166 course of employment test, 262 tort law and social change, 226 terminology used in, 260, 264 company law, 46-50 compensation, 209, 230, 234-7, 246, 251, employees, 140; see also independent 252, 253 contractors, temporary workers and the course of employment test, accountability of, 39, 243 146, 153 intermediate category of, 131



INDEX 275

employer/employee relationship, 7, 23, 31, English Law Commission, 40 enterprise risk, 163, 164, 165, 169, 238, 55-79, 120, 230, 253 agency relationships, 56, 82, 94, 143, 253 247, 249 borrowed servant problem, 83-93, 142 Eörsi, G., 21 dual liability, 89-93 Europe, 5 triangular relationship, 83 differences in legal systems, 265 changes in, 60, 65, 76, 77, 93, 142 Draft Common Frame of Reference, 255, composite test, 70-3, 75, 131, 133 256, 257 considering the totality of the Book VI, Article 3:201, 258-63 relationship, 70-3, 78, 97 course of employment test, 262 application of the test, 73-7 terminology used in, 260, 264 bicycle couriers, 74-5, 79 European Group on Tort Law, 260 distinguishing factors, 75-7 harmonised law of vicarious liability, owner-drivers, 73-4, 79 255-65 contracting-out of core tasks, 99, 126, 143 control test, 261 course of employment test, 258, 262-3 control, 55, 87, 99, 128, 244, 252 control test, 57-9, 75, 78, 244 fault-based principles, 258 alternative approaches to, 66-73, independent contractors, 261 69-73, 78 interpretation of liability, 258 composite test, 70-3, 75, 131, 133 relationship giving rise to liability, doubts about, 60-5 scope of an employer's liability, 262-3 interpretation of, 66-8 limitations of, 74 terminological questions, 259 response to doubts about, 65 parental liability, 196 dual liability of employers, 98 presumption of fault, 254 employer as bearer of risk, 37 Principles of European Tort Law employer as guarantor, 37 Article 6:102, 258-63 entrepreneur test, 70-3 terminology used in, 264 flexible interpretation of, 128, 131, 141, Research Group on EC Private Law, 256 143, 144 Study Group on a European Civil independent contractors, 23, 58, 62, 72, Code, 256 European Centre of Tort and Insurance 126, 140 Law, 208-9 organisation (integration) test, 69-70, 69-73, 141 European Commission, 255, 256 the parent/child relationship and, 196, 211 European Group on Tort Law, 260 partners in a firm, 56, 104 European Parliament, 255 power to organise, direct and control the exemplary damages, 17, 22, 39-43 activities of another, 133-40 professionals and, 60, 61-5, 78, 85, 118 Fabre-Magnan, M., 139 reasonable care towards employees, 119 fairness, 243, 252; see also justice right to an indemnity, 38, 241, 247 Fedke, J., 209 shared control, 91 Feliu, J.S., 211 special cases, 81 Flannigan, R., 126, 250 temporary workers 56, 81, 93-8, 143, 253 Fleming, J.G., 122, 150, 238, 244 alternative approaches to, 97-8 France casual workers, 95 administrative courts, 134 finding liability, 95-6 Assemblée plénière decisions, 181-8, 216-17 triangular relationship, 94 Bertrand case, 215-16, 219, 221, 223 triangular relationship, 150, 234 Blieck case, 20, 30, 133-40, 186, 223 vertical integration of, 82, 93 case law on dans les fonctions auxquelles ils England and Wales les ont employés test, 181-8, 188-9 motor vehicle legislation, 115-16 Code of Criminal Procedure, 53 parental liability, fault-based, 206-10 command and control, 232 parental responsibility in, 210-13, company law, 44, 47, 48-9 218-19, 224 contract law, 44, 63, 64 parenting orders, 203, 204, 219 Costedoat case, 36-8, 241, 246, 247 risk, 251 course of employment test, 181-8



# 276 INDEX

France (cont.)	liability
criminal law, 53-4, 156	for the acts of others, conditions
division between civil and criminal	for, 185
chambers, 182, 183	of physicians, 67
dual liability of employers, 91	no-fault liability, 186
faute de service, 36, 52	presumed liability, 23-4
faute personnelle, 36, 38	strict liability, 6, 23, 25
faute séparable ou détachable, 49	parental liability, 24, 29, 135, 219-20,
Fullenworth decision, 214, 240	222-3, 240
insurance, 33, 35, 103, 220, 250	and domicile of the children, 217
loi Badinter, 183	faute de surveillance or d'éducation,
parental liability, 135	213, 214
objective standard of care for, 212	limitations of the system, 223–4
strict liability, 213–17	presumption of liability, 214
vicarious or strict liability, 210–13	strict liability, 218
public sector employees, 24, 36, 44, 52	policy considerations, 152
right to an indemnity, 34, 35–8	reform of, 29-30, 37-8, 78, 138-40, 217,
right to give instructions, 58-9, 63, 102	241, 246
risk, 246, 251	requirement for a wrongful act, 29
temporary workers, 97	right to give instructions, 66
fraud, test for, 175–81	risk, 194, 239, 251
French Civil Code, 2, 8-9, 23, 103, 267-9	serious misconduct, 36
§ 1384 (5), 25–6, 27–8, 52, 103, 107, 145,	standard of care, 264
213, 232, 238	subordination and authority, 68, 137
extension of, 138-40, 247	
foundations of, 147	Galand-Carval, S., 196, 221
functions of the commetant and préposé,	Gaudu, F., 88, 91
35, 180	German Civil Code, 2, 269–72
interpretation of, 45, 53-4, 108,	§§ 276–278, 63
138-40	§ 278, 45
limitations of, 139, 141, 180	§ 823(1), 11, 12, 28, 46, 49, 232, 264
parental authority, 216	§ 831, 9–10, 11, 26, 103, 148, 231, 232
abus de fonctions, 181, 182, 185-8, 246	fault, 28-9
administrative courts, 44, 52–3	reform of, 46
Assemblée plénière decisions, 184	§ 832, 206-7
borrowed servant problem, and the, 86	§ 839 (liability for officials), 51–2
breadth of vicarious liability in, 3	§ 1626(1), 207
categories of liability, 9	§ 1631(1), 207
commettant and préposé, 25, 57, 139	in Ausführung der Verrichtung, 150-88
connection between the risk and the	borrowed servant problem, 88
wrong that results, 262	contract law and company law, 43, 45, 47
contrat de travail, 107	contract of employment, 57
contrat d'entreprise, 107 control test, subordination and	control test, right to give instructions, 261
authority, 261 doctrine of apparence, 180	course of employment test, substantive connection, 153
employer as guarantor, 236	doctrine of decentralised exoneration, 11
extension of vicarious liability outside	fault-based principles, 4, 5, 19,
the employment context, 106, 139	146, 259
fairness and social justice, 234	Geschäftsherr and Verrichtungsgehilfe, 26,
fault, 8, 9, 264	64-5, 261
force majeure, 215, 216, 221	parental liability
les fonctions auxquelles ils les ont employés,	emphasis on the facts of the case, 208
150-8, 181-8, 188-95, 262	fault-based, 206–10
connection between the employer and	reverse burden of proof, 206-7
the employee's duties, 186	policy considerations, 152–3
limiting the scope of liability, 183–4	presumption of fault, 29, 103, 231



INDEX 277

public sector employees, 51-2	parental liability and, 212, 220
reform of, 11, 46, 232	responsibility and, 39, 136, 230
requirement for a wrongful act, 29	right of indemnity, and the, 31, 38
right to give instructions, 66-7	risk and, 247
tort law, 45	social, 234, 252
Germany	
company law, 47, 49-50	Kahn-Freund, O., 60
contract law, 43, 45	Keith, Lord, 177-8
criminal courts, 156	,
employer/employee relationship, tests	La Forest J, 35
for, 97	Larouche, P., 67
fault-based principles, 103	Laski, Harold, 238
Imperial Law of Liability, 232	Latin maxims, 14, 19, 228, 232, 233
presumption of fault, 244	Lawson, F.H., 7
right to give instructions, 59, 63	Legeais, R., 67
Gummow J, 114-15	Lever, J., 66
dullillow j, 114-15	liability, 21–54, 138
Haldane LC, Viscount, 47-8	authority, 58
Hallet LJ, 85	-
•	company law in, 43–54
Hesselink, M.W., 263	concurrent, 44 conditions for, 58
Heuston, R.F.V., 157	
Hobhouse, Lord, 166, 175–81	contract law in, 43–54, 67
Hollis v Vabu, 74–8, 143, 249–56	control test for, 57-9
control, 75, 127–9, 143	craftsman liability, 24
policy concerns, 249–51	delictual liability, 57, 223
Holt CJ, 12–13	direction, 58
hospitals, liability of, 62, 118-21, 236	dual liability, 81, 89–93, 98
	fault-based principles, 22, 59, 198,
Ibbetson, D.J., 12, 229	230, 244
identification, theory of, 228, 231-4	joint and several, 49, 89–93
indemnity, right to, 30–9	primary, 16–18, 41, 43, 132, 253
limiting the application of, 32	public law in, 50-3
independent contractors, 58, 62, 74, 79,	rationale for imposition of, 16
81, 93	strict liability, 22, 230
case law on, 107	Lister v Hesley Hall Ltd, 3, 160-2, 169, 189-90
in European law, 261	193, 242, 263
justifications for vicarious liability, 125	Lord Hobhouse, 175, 233, 250
non-independent, 127, 143, 144, 253	Lord Millett, 158, 159-60, 166-72, 248
industrial revolution, 7, 55	Lord Steyn, 132, 166-72, 191
insurance, 20, 188, 235, 237, 239,	scope of vicarious liability, 19–20
242, 252	loss distribution, 107, 113, 172,
employer insurance, 236	193, 234-7
in England, 152	and risk, 36, 220, 239, 252
in France, 33, 221, 250	Lunney, M., 89, 112, 132, 179, 191
motor insurance, 112, 115, 141	Luntz, H., 91
Ipp JA, 174	
Ipp Report, 117	MacGuigan JA, 60
Irish Law Reform Commission, 224	MacKenna J, 73-4
	Magnus, U., 209
Johnston, David, 147	Markesinis, B.S., 11, 45, 208
Jourdain, P., 219, 238, 247	Martin-Casals, M., 211
Bertrand case, 219	Mason J, 120
control test, 68, 88	master's responsibility for actions
risk, 107, 137, 238, 247	of servants, 12, 22, 109
justice, 8, 153, 163, 166-72, 247-50, 252	master's tort theory, 13-15, 232
corrective, 1, 16–17, 31, 233, 239	Mazeaud, H.L., 233
distributive 16-17 212 239	McCarthy I 132



## 278 INDEX

McHugh J	in tort law
Hollis v Vabu, 76, 128, 131-2, 133, 143	choice of model, 217-23
Northern Sandblasting Pty Ltd v Harris, 140	fault-based, 206-10
McKee v Dumas, 84	framework for, 203-17
McKendrick, E., 120, 126, 141	models of, 205-13
McLachlin J, 162-6, 189, 191, 194,	vicarious or strict liability, 210-13
245, 252	parenting orders, 203, 204, 219
Bazley v Curry, 238, 241-2	Phegan J, 94-5
Jacobi v Griffiths, 163	Phillips MR, Lord, 119
Millett, Lord, 158	police officers, liability for actions of,
Morton, Lord, 15	42, 103, 170-1
motor vehicle legislation, 115–16, 252	Pollock, F., 12, 229
Mouly, J., 141	Pothier, R.J., 147, 231
Moury, j., 111	primary liability and vicarious liability,
negligence, 9, 179-80, 216, 232, 254, 264	16–18, 41, 43, 132, 175, 193
New South Wales v Lepore, 2, 19, 120, 124, 161,	Principles of European Tort Law, 255
	Article 6:102, 258–63
172-4, 249, 250, 251, 262	
New Zealand, 102, 129–31	terminology used in, 264
Accident Compensation Scheme, 252	professionals, 78, 118, 252
Newark, F.H., 14	autonomy and discretion of, 61, 78, 85
Neyers, J.W., 92	public bodies, claims against, 53
Nicholls, Lord, 2	public law, 50–3
Dubai Aluminium Co Ltd v Salaam, 3, 167,	public safety, 121
171-2, 194, 248	public sector employees, 24, 36, 44, 52
non-delegable duties, 13, 17, 102, 116–26, 141, 144, 253	punishment, 40; see also justice
and hospitals, 62, 118-21	qui facit per alium facit per se, 14, 228, 232
categories of, 118	
collateral negligence, 122–6	Rebut, D., 237
limitations on, 122-6	reform on vicarious liability law, 4, 224
other duties, 121-2	in England and Wales, 32, 33
policy considerations, 121	in France, 29-30, 37-8, 78, 138-40, 217,
schools of, 124, 173	241, 246
	in Germany, 11, 46, 232
Oliphant, K., 191, 219, 224	Reid, Lord, 14, 198
organisational fault, 46	representative agents, 127-33, 140
	res ipsa loquitur, 234
parent/child relationship	Research Group on EC Private Law, 256
and the employer/employee relationship,	respondeat superior, 228, 233
196, 211	responsibility, 1, 15, 243, 249
standard of care, 217	and tort law, 1
parental autonomy, 205, 218, 219, 222, 225	apportionment of, 92, 131
parental liability, 24, 135, 196–225, 240, 254	individual, 136, 224, 230
and schools, 204	of parents, 204
and tort law, 218	Ribot, J., 211
for the torts of the child or the acts of the	risk, 29, 34-6, 121, 237-41, 242-3,
child, 210	245-7, 249-50
in common law systems, 206-10, 223-6	and justice, 239, 243, 247
objective standard of care for, 208	and uncertainty, 243
parent-child-victim triangular	enterprise risk, 9, 37, 163, 164, 165, 169,
relationship, 225	238, 247, 249
parental responsibility	social risk, 223
at common law, 197–203, 208, 210–13,	Roman law, 6–7, 147, 149
218-19, 224	paterfamilias' liability, 7, 147
liability to parties injured by the child,	Sache II 122
200-3	Sachs LJ, 123 Salmond test, 157, 159, 160, 161, 162, 169, 181
liability to the child, 198	Janiioliu (Est, 157, 153, 100, 101, 104, 109, 181



INDEX 279

in Australia, 172, 174 fraud and, 175-81 risk-based reasoning, 36, 39, 173, significance of policy in, 150-3 188, 238, 250 tests for, 162-81 Scott, Lord, 40 courts' considerations of, 2 servant's tort theory, 13, 15 criteria for, 227 sexual abuse, 124, 161, 164, 173, 242 definition, 1-9 exemplary damages and, 17 Slynn, Lord, 51 Smith, Y.B., 235 extension of, 2, 3, 26, 101, 140-3, Spain, 210-13, 244 146, 240 Stevens, G.M., 77 case law, 106-26 Stevens, Robert, 233, 247 in civil law systems, 106-8 Steyn, Lord, 168, 194 in common law systems, 108-26 Lister v Hesley Hall Ltd, 166-72, 191 rational for, 229 strict liability, 22, 230 representative agents, 127-40 Study Group on a European Civil Code, 256 statute by, 103-6 harmonised law of, 255-65 temporary workers, 56, 81, 93-8, 143, 253 consensus on, 263 alternative approaches to, 97-8 policy considerations, 264 practicality and principle, 263-5 casual workers, 95 finding liability, 95-6 social, political, economic and cultural triangular relationship, 94 factors, 264 historical overview, 6-13 Terré, F., 185 tort law Latin maxims and, 14, 19, 228, 232, 233 legal basis for, 13-18 and changing social and economic needs, 254 master's tort theory, 13-15, 232 and responsibility, 1 parental liability, 218 Principles of European Tort Law, 255 policy and principle, 227 policy considerations, 81, 93, 97, 102, 129, role of in society, 239 vagueness of, 264 150-3, 264 Trindade, F., 89, 112, 132, 179 balancing, 243-52, 253, 265 case law examples, 151-3 Unberath, H., 11, 45 deterrence, 76, 172 uncertainty about the law, 18, 20, 79, 171, fairness and justice, 247-50 loss distribution, 172 243, 247 and risk, 243 primary policy factors, 248 and the close connection test, 171, 263 prohibited conduct, 153 in common law, 4, 13, 89 public safety and risk, 121 United States risk: allocation of consequences, doctrine of the 'family car', 113 economic reality test, 70-3, 74 secondary policy factors, 248 employer/employee relationship, primary liability and, 16-18, 41, 43, 132, economic reality test, 74 193, 233-4, 253 parental liability, 225 rationale for imposition of, 36, 98, 107, Restatement of Agency, 58, 70, 71, 98, 108, 126, 194 157, 192 changing perceptions of, 252 deterrence, 43 right to an indemnity, 35 relationship giving rise to, 26, 101-44 van Gerven, W., 66, 68 case law, 106-26 vicarious liability, 22, 26, 101, 230, 247-51 statute, 103-6 agency and motor vehicles, 110-16 requirement for a wrongful act, 27-30 right to an indemnity, 30-9 civil law systems in, 229 common factors in, 22 role in post-industrialised States, 5, 247 Salmond test, 157-81 common law in, 12-13 course of employment test, 12, 23, 150-88 in common law systems, 159 common law systems in, 157-81 weakness of, 161 deliberate wrongdoing, 160-2 wrongful act authorised by the economic reasoning, 166 employer, 158



#### 280 INDEX

vicarious liability (cont.) wrongful and unauthorised mode of doing an authorised act, 158-62 scope of, 1, 15, 20, 145-95, 251 limiting the scope, 147-9 role of policy in, 162 servant's tort theory, 13 specific legislation for, 101, 103-6 terminology, 22-7 theoretical coherence of, 13, 19, 113 theoretical justifications, 228 deterrence, 241-3 fault, 231-4 risk, 237-41 victim compensation and loss distribution, 234-7 triangular relationship, 150, 192 uncertainty about: see separate entry victims, 177 and parental liability, 202 protection of, 99, 107, 193, 205, 242

in French law, 37, 38, 180, 182, 219, 221 in German law, 45 reliance by, 177, 178, 179-80, 181 Vines, P., 124, 174 Viney, G., 45, 107, 186, 219 relationship of subordination and authority, 68, 88, 137 risk, 219, 238, 247 Voer, Johannes, 147 Wagner, Gerhard, 11, 46, 207 Waller, P.L., 224 Weekes, R., 169 Weinrib, Ernest, 233 Whittaker, S.J., 265 Williams, Glanville, 13, 16, 32, 126, 140, 229, 234 Wright, Lord, 72 Zimmermann, R., 11, 147

Zweigert and Kötz, 10