

State, Faith, and Nation in Ottoman and Post-Ottoman Lands

Current standard narratives of Ottoman, Balkan, and Middle East history overemphasize the role of nationalism in the transformation of the region. Challenging these accounts, this book argues that religious affiliation was in fact the most influential shaper of communal identity in the Ottoman era, that religion molded the relationship between state and society, and that it continues to do so today in lands once occupied by the Ottomans. The book examines the major transformations of the past 250 years to illustrate this argument, traversing the nineteenth century, the early decades of post-Ottoman independence, and the recent past. In this way, the book affords unusual insights not only into the historical patterns of political development but also into the forces shaping contemporary crises, from the dissolution of Yugoslavia to the rise of political Islam.

Frederick F. Anscombe is a senior lecturer in contemporary history at Birkbeck, University of London. His publications include *The Ottoman Gulf: The Creation of Kuwait, Saudi Arabia, and Qatar* (1997); *The Ottoman Balkans, 1750–1830* (ed., 2006); and articles in *Past & Present*, *Journal of Modern History*, and *International History Review*.

State, Faith, and Nation in Ottoman and Post-Ottoman Lands

FREDERICK F. ANSCOMBE

University of London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-61523-6 — State, Faith, and Nation in Ottoman and Post-Ottoman Lands
 Frederick F. Anscombe
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107615236

© Frederick F. Anscombe 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Anscombe, Frederick F.

State, faith, and nation in Ottoman and post-Ottoman lands / Frederick F. Anscombe.
 pages cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04216-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-61523-6 (paperback)

1. Islam and state – Turkey – History. 2. Islam and state – Balkan Peninsula –
 History. 3. Islam and state – Middle East – History. 4. Nationalism – Turkey –
 Religious aspects – History. 5. Nationalism – Balkan Peninsula – Religious
 aspects – History. 6. Nationalism – Middle East – Religious aspects –
 History. 7. Turkey – History – Ottoman Empire, 1288–1918. 1. Title.

BPI73.6.A575 2014

322'.10956-dc23 2013038166

ISBN 978-1-107-04216-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-61523-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

*For Márta, Lotti, Klára, and Frida
with love and thanks*

Contents

<i>List of Maps and Images</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Transliteration and Abbreviations</i>	xiii
Introduction	1
<i>Eastern Questions</i>	4
<i>The Replacement Narrative</i>	11
<i>Balık Baştan Kokar</i>	14
PART I THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE	19
1 State, Faith, Nation, and the Ottoman Empire	21
2 The Premodern Islamic State and Military Modernization	33
<i>The Eighteenth-Century Ottoman State: Politics, Money, and the Military</i>	34
<i>The Military Crisis of the Late Eighteenth Century</i>	43
<i>Selim III and the New Order</i>	46
<i>The Deed of Agreement</i>	57
3 The Breaking of the Premodern Islamic State	61
<i>Mahmud II and the Military</i>	62
<i>Faith and Nation: The Greek Revolt and Ottoman Reform</i>	66
<i>Reform, Religion, and Rebellion: Ottoman Europe</i>	76
<i>Reform, Religion, and Rebellion: Ottoman Asia</i>	83
<i>The Gülhane Reform Decree</i>	87
4 The Reconstructed Muslim State	90
<i>Westernization or Modernization?</i>	91
<i>Measures to Create Order</i>	96

<i>Law and Islam</i>	98
<i>Ottoman and Foreign Christians</i>	107
<i>Abdülhamid II and Islamism</i>	113
<i>Macedonia and the Young Turks</i>	117
5 End of Empire	121
<i>Positivism and Military Rule</i>	122
<i>The CUP and Imperial Disintegration</i>	129
<i>The First World War and Imperial Collapse</i>	133
PART II FROM OTTOMAN TO POST-OTTOMAN STATES	141
6 The Post-Ottoman Balkans	149
<i>Greece</i>	154
<i>Serbia</i>	163
<i>Bulgaria</i>	170
<i>Albania</i>	176
7 Post-Ottoman Turkey	181
8 The Post-Ottoman Arab Lands	197
<i>The European Imperial Period</i>	198
<i>Arab Nationalism and Islam</i>	206
PART III CONTEMPORARY POST-OTTOMAN STATES	219
9 The Contemporary Balkans	224
<i>Yugoslavia</i>	228
<i>Bosnia</i>	234
<i>Macedonia</i>	237
<i>Greece</i>	239
<i>Bulgaria</i>	245
<i>Albania</i>	250
10 Contemporary Turkey	254
<i>The Restoration of Religion in Politics</i>	256
<i>Politics, the Military, and Islam after 1980</i>	262
<i>The Politics of “Islamic Revival” since 2002</i>	267
11 Contemporary Arab Countries	270
<i>Politics, Arab Nationalism, and Military Autocracy</i>	271
<i>The Endurance of Islam in Society and Politics</i>	280
<i>Conclusion</i>	289
Conclusion: State, Faith, and Nation	292
<i>Bibliography</i>	297
<i>Index</i>	315

Maps and Images

MAPS

1	Lands within the Ottoman Empire	<i>page xv</i>
2	Lands Claimed for the Greek Nation (Early Twentieth Century)	xvi
3	Lands Claimed for the Serbian Nation (Early Twentieth Century)	xvii
4	Lands Claimed for the Bulgarian Nation (Early Twentieth Century)	xviii
5	Geographic Syria under British and French Mandates	xix

IMAGES

1	King Ferdinand I of Bulgaria, preceded by scripture and Orthodox clergy, enters Mustafa Pasha (now Svilengrad, Bulgaria) following seizure of the town in the First Balkan War (1912).	146
2	Dormition of the Theotokos Orthodox Cathedral, Avram Iancu Square, Cluj, Romania.	221

Acknowledgments

Various people and institutions have helped me on this and earlier, related projects. For funding the archival research that marked the starting point of the book, I thank the National Endowment for the Humanities, Washington, DC. Birkbeck, University of London, provided additional support, including travel funds for a conference in Montreal that clarified points in my views on the Selim III–Mahmud II era. For assistance enabling me to participate in two other conferences that proved similarly helpful, I thank Tolga Esmer of Central European University and Hakan Yavuz and Peter Sluglett of the University of Utah. Tolga and Joshua Landis kindly provided copies of their dissertations. For their help I am indebted also to the staffs of the Başbakanlık Archive in Istanbul, the National Archive in Kew, and Birkbeck Library.

I particularly wish to thank colleagues whose comments on some of my earlier work and whose perspectives on eighteenth- and nineteenth-century history have benefited me to an extent that they have probably never realized: Engin Akarlı, Virginia Aksan, Tolga Esmer, Benjamin Fortna, Colin Heywood, Michael Hickok, Mark Mazower, William Ochsenswald, Ayşe Ozil, Lucy Riall, Julian Swann, and Feroze Yasamee. Ayşe also provided helpful comments on much of the book manuscript, for which I am very grateful. Part of Chapter 3 first appeared in “Islam and the Age of Ottoman Reform,” *Past & Present* 208 (Aug. 2010), 159–89, and parts of Chapters 2 and 3 first appeared in “The Balkan Revolutionary Age,” *Journal of Modern History* 84 (2012), 572–606, and I thank the editors of both journals for permitting further use of the material. I wish that I could thank by name the anonymous reviewers of

the articles and those commissioned by Cambridge to critique the book manuscript; I am very grateful for their suggestions for improvement.

Toward the end of my years in graduate school, I once marveled at the stack of correspondence in the hands of one of the scholars whose classes I had most enjoyed taking, the late Charles Issawi; with his usual good humor he complained that they were all letters demanding that he do something, and that he wished there were one saying simply that he was wonderful. I am still sorry that I never sent him such a note. This book presents my interpretation of Ottoman and post-Ottoman history, and I want to acknowledge with deepest thanks the debt I owe to those scholars who taught me (and thereby prepared me to think constructively) about the Ottoman empire and its effects upon successor countries: Carl Brown, Şükrü Hanioglu, Halil İnalçık, Norman Itzkowitz, Cemal Kafadar, Heath Lowry, ‘Abd al-Karim Rafiq – and yes, Charles Issawi. The experience of teaching, in turn, has had an enormous impact upon both my research interests and the views expressed in the book; I cannot acknowledge by name all of the students who have made teaching rewarding over the years, but I thank them for their interest, insights, and skepticism. By thanking scholars, students, and funders, I make no suggestion that any of them shares the views I present in the book; they have helped me, but all faults or errors are mine alone.

I wish to thank those at Cambridge University Press who have supported this project through the stages to publication: Marigold Acland, William Hammell, Sarika Narula, and Alison Daltroy. Their care has made the process enjoyable. I also thank Abidha Sulaiman and her team at Newgen Knowledge Works for their help with production of the book.

That Cambridge has published the book delights my mother, who is sure that my father would have been happy to see me somehow linked to the university at which he studied. To give such satisfaction is a slight token of thanks for all that they did to get me to this point. They, and the rest of my family in the United States, have my love and gratitude for all that they have done for me over the decades.

And the first shall be last: A gyönyörűségem Márta, Lotti és Klára jól bírták a hangulatomat és a távolléteket, amíg írtam ezt a könyvet. Remélem, hogy a könyv megéri ezt az árat. To them I dedicate it.

Transliteration and Abbreviations

Transliteration of non-Latin-script terms follows Library of Congress conventions, subject to modest amendments, including use of English spellings that are widely recognized (“shaikh” rather than “shaykh”/“şeyh”). Diacriticals have been omitted from Arabic terms. Terms common to Arabic and Ottoman are problematic: for consistency they are given in Arabic form (“shari‘a” rather than “şeriat,” “milla” rather than “millet”).

Abbreviations

BOA	Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi, Istanbul
<i>BriJMES</i>	<i>British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies</i>
BSOAS	<i>Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies</i>
Cev.Dah	Cevdet Dahiliye
CHT ₃	<i>Cambridge History of Turkey, volume 3: The Later Ottoman Empire, 1603–1839</i> , ed. Suraiya Faroqhi (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006)
CHT ₄	<i>Cambridge History of Turkey, volume 4: Turkey in the Modern World</i> , ed. Reşat Kasaba (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
EEQ	<i>East European Quarterly</i>
FO	Foreign Office
HH	Hatt-i Hümayun
IHR	<i>International History Review</i>
IJMES	<i>International Journal of Middle East Studies</i>
ILS	<i>Islamic Law and Society</i>

<i>JMGS</i>	<i>Journal of Modern Greek Studies</i>
<i>JMH</i>	<i>Journal of Modern History</i>
<i>MES</i>	<i>Middle Eastern Studies</i>
<i>NA</i>	National Archives, London
<i>P&P</i>	<i>Past & Present</i>
<i>SH</i>	<i>Scripta Hierolosymitana</i>

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-61523-6 — State, Faith, and Nation in Ottoman and Post-Ottoman Lands
 Frederick F. Anscombe
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



MAP I. Lands within the Ottoman Empire



MAP 2. Lands Claimed for the Greek Nation (Early Twentieth Century)



MAP 3. Lands Claimed for the Serbian Nation (Early Twentieth Century)



MAP 4. Lands Claimed for the Bulgarian Nation (Early Twentieth Century)



MAP 5. Geographic Syria under British and French Mandates