

#### ETHICS IN AN AGE OF SURVEILLANCE

People increasingly live online, sharing publicly what might have once seemed private, but at the same time are enraged by extremes of government surveillance and the corresponding invasion of our private lives. In this enlightening work, Adam Henschke re-examines privacy and property in the age of surveillance in order to understand not only the importance of these social conventions, but also their moral relevance. By analysing identity and information and presenting a case for a relation between the two, he explains the moral importance of virtual identities and offers an ethically robust solution to design surveillance technologies. This book should be read by anyone interested in surveillance technology, new information technology more generally and social concepts like privacy and property.

ADAM HENSCHKE is an applied ethicist, working on areas that cross over between ethics, technology and security. He is a lecturer at the National Security College (NSC) in the Australian National University, Canberra, Australia and a research fellow with Delft University of Technology in The Hague, The Netherlands. His research concerns ethical and philosophical analyses of information technology and its uses, military ethics and relations between ethics and national security. He has published on surveillance, emerging military technologies and intelligence and cyberspace. He is the secretary of the Asia-Pacific Chapter of the International Society of Military Ethics (APAC-ISME).



# Ethics in an Age of Surveillance

### PERSONAL INFORMATION AND VIRTUAL IDENTITIES

### ADAM HENSCHKE

Australian National University





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryagani, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107130012
DOI: 10.1017/9781316417249

© Adam Henschke 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Henschke, Adam, 1976– author.

TITLE: Ethics in an age of surveillance: personal information and virtual identities / Adam Henschke.

DESCRIPTION: 1 Edition. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017009170 | ISBN 9781107130012 (Hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Intelligence service–Moral and ethical aspects. | Electronic surveillance–Moral and ethical aspects. | Confidential communications–Moral and ethical aspects. | Personal information management–Psychological aspects. | Online identities. |

Privacy, Right of. | BISAC: LAW / General.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JF1525.I6 H455 2017 | DDC 170–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017009170

ISBN 978-1-107-13001-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To my parents and siblings, real and theoretical: Pam, Jurgen and Chris. CAPPE's staff and students. Without you all I would not be myself.



## Contents

Acknowledgements		page xi
	PART I SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGIES AND ETHICAL VACUUMS	1
1	On the Project and Its Motivation	3
	1.1 The Project: Ushering in the Age of Surveillance	3
	1.2 The Motivation: From Intimate to Innocuous Information	6
	1.3 Virtual Identity in an Ethical Vacuum?	12
	1.4 Personal Information and the Failure of Simple Ethical Theories	15
	1.5 On My Methodology and Terminology	20
	1.6 Structure	<del>2</del> 4
2	On Privacy	28
	2.1 Privacy's Limits in an Age of Surveillance	28
	2.2 Surveillance and Privacy in Public: The Case of Kate and Karl	29
	2.3 Privacy's Recent History	34
	2.4 Privacy Questions	44
	2.5 Pluralism in Privacy	47
	2.6 Surveillance Technologies and Privacy's Return	52
	2.7 Kate and Karl Revisited: Pluralism in Privacy	54
3	On Property	56
	3.1 Property's Failure in an Age of Surveillance	56
	3.2 Owning the Products of Surveillance: The Case of CCTV	57
	3.3 Property's Recent History	59
	3.4 Intellectual Property: Owning the Intangible	74
	3.5 Surveillance Products, Personal Information and Property	78
	3.6 CCTV Revisited: Relating Information to People	84



viii

### Table of Contents

	PART II IDENTITY AND INFORMATION	87
4	On Identity	89
	4.1 Identity in a World of Information: An Age of Surveillance	89
	4.2 What Are We Doing with Our Lives? The Case of Sally Online	90
	4.3 From Information to Identification	91
	4.4 Experience: What We Know Tells Us What We Will Know	97
	4.5 What Is Identity?	100
	4.6 A Taxonomy of Identity Elements	106
	4.7 Sally Revisited: Virtual Identity	122
5	On Information	126
	5.1 Information Everywhere	126
	5.2 Information as Morally Reactive: The Case of the Aggression Gene	127
	5.3 Data: The Pieces of the Puzzle	129
	5.4 Syntax: The Rules of the Game	130
	5.5 Semantics: What Is the Meaning of This?	131
	5.6 Knowledge: Fitting Information to Truth	134
	5.7 Information and Communication	140
	5.8 New Information	144
	5.9 The Aggression Gene Revisited: Multirealisability	149
6	On Identity and Information	152
	<ul><li>6.1 Identity and Information: Stepping Into the Circle of Surveillance</li><li>6.2 What Causes What? The Case of Watching Watchers/CCTV</li></ul>	152
	Operators	153
	6.3 The Role of Cognition: Information Forms Identity	157
	6.4 Identity Forms Information	163
	6.5 Dyadic Relations and Mutual Causation	170
	6.6 Explicating the Elements of the Identity/Information Dyad	173
	6.7 The Identity/Information Dyad: How One Shapes the Other	176
	6.8 Dyadic Relations, Personal Information and Surveillance	179
	6.9 CCTV Operators Revisited: Explanatory Priority	180
	PART III ETHICAL IMPORTANCE OF INFORMATION	183
7	On Importance	185
	7.1 Surveillance Technologies and Moral Importance: Personalising	
	Information	185
	7.2 Personal Information in Pieces: The Benign and Powerful Role of	
	Metadata	186
	7.3 Setting Limits on Identity	188



	Table of Contents	ix
	7.4 What is Personal Information?	192
	7.5 Personal Information and Virtual Identity	196
	7.6 Metadata Revisited: The Moral Importance of Virtual Identities	197
8	On Individuals	199
	<ul><li>8.1 Individuals as Willing Informational Agents</li><li>8.2 Personal Information for All: The Case of Wearable Health</li></ul>	199
	Technologies	201
	8.3 Privacy Claims	202
	<ul><li>8.4 Ownership Claims</li><li>8.5 Basic Recognition Claims</li></ul>	205 208
	8.6 Wearable Health Technologies Revisited: Tracking the Steps	215
9	On Institutions	217
	9.1 Information and Institutions	217
	9.2 They Are Watching Us: The Case of Edward Snowden	218
	9.3 A Taxonomy of Harms	222
	9.4 Informational Access	236
	9.5 Where to Now?	242
	9.6 Snowden Revisited: Harms, Benefits and Distribution	<del>2</del> 45
10	In Conclusion	252
	10.1 Surveillance Is Good	252
	10.2 Justifying the Use of Personal Information: What's the Point?	253
	10.3 From Potential Challenges to Disaggregation	257
	10.4 Practical Responses: Value-Sensitive Design and Virtual Identities	261
	10.5 Reflections on Ethics in the Age of Surveillance	264
Арţ	Appendix 1 Glossary of Terms	
,	References	
Ind	Index	



### Acknowledgements

The list of acknowledgements for a first book is difficult; it feels like everyone from a primary school teacher, to someone who I had a drunken conversation with at 3am, to PhD supervisors, to current colleagues deserves some kind of recognition. But to write down everyone who helped form this book in some way or another would be both tedious and confusing. So, in an effort to be specific, a large number of people won't be listed but deserve acknowledgement; my apologies to you.

First, I thank the staff and colleagues at the National Security College at the Australian National University (ANU). Their willingness to give me fairly free rein, intellectual motivation and economic support while I converted my PhD dissertation into something more book-like is greatly appreciated. Within the ANU, the University House Early Career Fellowship programme funded research and travel opportunities.

I also thank the Brocher Foundation and the Hastings Center, who both hosted me as a research fellow at different points in the book's progress. The time spent at both institutions was absolutely essential in giving me the focus to develop some of the key concepts and in giving me the space to develop the larger structure of the book. This research was supported by U.S. National Science Foundation grant #1318126. Any opinions, findings and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the persons or organisations above.

Though it is a number of years between the book as it is and the PhD that it was, the lion's share of the research and conceptual development was done for my PhD at Charles Sturt University's Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (CAPPE). I sincerely see CAPPE's staff as my theoretical parents, having raised me from an immature academic and CAPPE's fellow students as my theoretical siblings who grew up with me. While John Weckert, as my primary supervisor, played the biggest role in this, the academic environment of CAPPE is something that was quite special and hopefully wove itself into my DNA.



xii

#### Acknowledgements

Early arguments, concepts and ideas for the book appeared in 'Making Sense of Animal Disenhancement', NanoEthics, 6:1, 2012, 'Did You Just Say What I Thought You Said? Talking about Genes, Identity and Information', Identity and the Information Society, 3:3, 2010 and 'Computer Ethics and Applied Contexts' (with John Weckert) in Floridi, L., (ed.) A Philosophical Introduction to Computer Ethics, Cambridge University Press, 2009, as well as many conference papers and public seminars.

I gratefully acknowledge Matt Gallaway at Cambridge University Press for showing an interest in the project early on and maintaining his interest in the time that followed. It's absolutely certain that without his willingness to take a risk on a first-time author that the book would not exist. I also recognise the work of the other people at Cambridge University Press; Meera Smith, Rebecca Jackaman and the rest of the production team who shepherded my words into an actual book. I also thank Ana Stiparu, whose help in the final stages of production saved me from intellectual collapse.

Finally, I wish to thank my real family and a stellar set of friends. When I first said that I was going to study ethics, though many were confused, my family and friends never wavered in their faith that I could make something of this: despite the fact that my typically deranged ranting gave little idea of what I was actually doing or why. My parents, Pam and Jurgen and my brother, Chris, not only encouraged me in keeping on working but also took an interest in what I was doing. Thanks also go to my various housemates and friends in Canberra, who put up with me for the duration and my friends in Melbourne and elsewhere, who motivated me by asking questions about my work and challenging me when the answers made no sense.

Looking back, this book had its inception while I was studying in Sweden in late 2006. In the ten years that followed, I have been so very lucky to have been exposed to so many great and wonderful people inside and outside of academia who helped in so many different ways to bring this book into being. Without this global village of colleagues, friends and family, what was a tiny idea conceived at the beginnings of a Linköping winter would not have emerged. And while I am hardly able to offer anything objective about the quality of what follows, my heartfelt appreciation goes out to everyone who helped bring this tiny idea, that identity and information may have some relation, into the world.