ETHICS IN AN AGE OF SURVEILLANCE

People increasingly live online, sharing publicly what might have once seemed private, but at the same time are enraged by extremes of government surveillance and the corresponding invasion of our private lives. In this enlightening work, Adam Henschke re-examines privacy and property in the age of surveillance in order to understand not only the importance of these social conventions, but also their moral relevance. By analysing identity and information and presenting a case for a relation between the two, he explains the moral importance of virtual identities and offers an ethically robust solution to design surveillance technologies. This book should be read by anyone interested in surveillance technology, new information technology more generally and social concepts like privacy and property.

ADAM HENSCHKE is an applied ethicist, working on areas that cross over between ethics, technology and security. He is a lecturer at the National Security College (NSC) in the Australian National University, Canberra, Australia and a research fellow with Delft University of Technology in The Hague, The Netherlands. His research concerns ethical and philosophical analyses of information technology and its uses, military ethics and relations between ethics and national security. He has published on surveillance, emerging military technologies and intelligence and cyberspace. He is the secretary of the Asia-Pacific Chapter of the International Society of Military Ethics (APAC-ISME).
Ethics in an Age of Surveillance

PERSONAL INFORMATION AND VIRTUAL IDENTITIES

ADAM HENSCHKE
Australian National University
To my parents and siblings, real and theoretical: Pam, Jurgen and Chris. CAPPE’s staff and students. Without you all I would not be myself.
## Contents

**Acknowledgements**  

**PART I SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGIES AND ETHICAL VACUUMS**  

1 On the Project and Its Motivation  
1.1 The Project: Ushering in the Age of Surveillance  
1.2 The Motivation: From Intimate to Innocuous Information  
1.3 Virtual Identity in an Ethical Vacuum?  
1.4 Personal Information and the Failure of Simple Ethical Theories  
1.5 On My Methodology and Terminology  
1.6 Structure  

2 On Privacy  
2.1 Privacy’s Limits in an Age of Surveillance  
2.2 Surveillance and Privacy in Public: The Case of Kate and Karl  
2.3 Privacy’s Recent History  
2.4 Privacy Questions  
2.5 Pluralism in Privacy  
2.6 Surveillance Technologies and Privacy’s Return  
2.7 Kate and Karl Revisited: Pluralism in Privacy  

3 On Property  
3.1 Property’s Failure in an Age of Surveillance  
3.2 Owning the Products of Surveillance: The Case of CCTV  
3.3 Property’s Recent History  
3.4 Intellectual Property: Owning the Intangible  
3.5 Surveillance Products, Personal Information and Property  
3.6 CCTV Revisited: Relating Information to People
## Table of Contents

**PART II  IDENTITY AND INFORMATION**

4  On Identity

4.1 Identity in a World of Information: An Age of Surveillance 89
4.2 What Are We Doing with Our Lives? The Case of Sally Online 90
4.3 From Information to Identification 91
4.4 Experience: What We Know Tells Us What We Will Know 97
4.5 What Is Identity? 100
4.6 A Taxonomy of Identity Elements 106
4.7 Sally Revisited: Virtual Identity 122

5  On Information

5.1 Information Everywhere 126
5.2 Information as Morally Reactive: The Case of the Aggression Gene 127
5.3 Data: The Pieces of the Puzzle 129
5.4 Syntax: The Rules of the Game 130
5.5 Semantics: What Is the Meaning of This? 131
5.6 Knowledge: Fitting Information to Truth 134
5.7 Information and Communication 140
5.8 New Information 144
5.9 The Aggression Gene Revisited: Multirealisability 149

6  On Identity and Information

6.1 Identity and Information: Stepping Into the Circle of Surveillance 152
6.2 What Causes What? The Case of Watching Watchers/CCTV Operators 153
6.3 The Role of Cognition: Information Forms Identity 157
6.4 Identity Forms Information 163
6.5 Dyadic Relations and Mutual Causation 170
6.6 Explicating the Elements of the Identity/Information Dyad 173
6.7 The Identity/Information Dyad: How One Shapes the Other 176
6.8 Dyadic Relations, Personal Information and Surveillance 179
6.9 CCTV Operators Revisited: Explanatory Priority 180

**PART III  ETHICAL IMPORTANCE OF INFORMATION**

7  On Importance

7.1 Surveillance Technologies and Moral Importance: Personalising Information 185
7.2 Personal Information in Pieces: The Benign and Powerful Role of Metadata 186
7.3 Setting Limits on Identity 188
## Table of Contents

7.4 What is Personal Information? 192  
7.5 Personal Information and Virtual Identity 196  
7.6 Metadata Revisited: The Moral Importance of Virtual Identities 197  

8 On Individuals 199  
8.1 Individuals as Willing Informational Agents 199  
8.2 Personal Information for All: The Case of Wearable Health Technologies 201  
8.3 Privacy Claims 202  
8.4 Ownership Claims 205  
8.5 Basic Recognition Claims 208  
8.6 Wearable Health Technologies Revisited: Tracking the Steps 215  

9 On Institutions 217  
9.1 Information and Institutions 217  
9.2 They Are Watching Us: The Case of Edward Snowden 218  
9.3 A Taxonomy of Harms 222  
9.4 Informational Access 236  
9.5 Where to Now? 242  
9.6 Snowden Revisited: Harms, Benefits and Distribution 245  

10 In Conclusion 252  
10.1 Surveillance Is Good 252  
10.2 Justifying the Use of Personal Information: What’s the Point? 253  
10.3 From Potential Challenges to Disaggregation 257  
10.4 Practical Responses: Value-Sensitive Design and Virtual Identities 261  
10.5 Reflections on Ethics in the Age of Surveillance 264  

Appendix 1 Glossary of Terms 267  
References 271  
Index 295
Acknowledgements

The list of acknowledgements for a first book is difficult; it feels like everyone from a primary school teacher, to someone who I had a drunken conversation with at 3am, to PhD supervisors, to current colleagues deserves some kind of recognition. But to write down everyone who helped form this book in some way or another would be both tedious and confusing. So, in an effort to be specific, a large number of people won’t be listed but deserve acknowledgement; my apologies to you.

First, I thank the staff and colleagues at the National Security College at the Australian National University (ANU). Their willingness to give me fairly free rein, intellectual motivation and economic support while I converted my PhD dissertation into something more book-like is greatly appreciated. Within the ANU, the University House Early Career Fellowship programme funded research and travel opportunities.

I also thank the Brocher Foundation and the Hastings Center, who both hosted me as a research fellow at different points in the book’s progress. The time spent at both institutions was absolutely essential in giving me the focus to develop some of the key concepts and in giving me the space to develop the larger structure of the book. This research was supported by U.S. National Science Foundation grant #1318126. Any opinions, findings and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the persons or organisations above.

Though it is a number of years between the book as it is and the PhD that it was, the lion’s share of the research and conceptual development was done for my PhD at Charles Sturt University’s Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (CAPPE). I sincerely see CAPPE’s staff as my theoretical parents, having raised me from an immature academic and CAPPE’s fellow students as my theoretical siblings who grew up with me. While John Weckert, as my primary supervisor, played the biggest role in this, the academic environment of CAPPE is something that was quite special and hopefully wove itself into my DNA.

I gratefully acknowledge Matt Gallaway at Cambridge University Press for showing an interest in the project early on and maintaining his interest in the time that followed. It’s absolutely certain that without his willingness to take a risk on a first-time author that the book would not exist. I also recognise the work of the other people at Cambridge University Press; Meera Smith, Rebecca Jackaman and the rest of the production team who shepherded my words into an actual book. I also thank Ana Stiparu, whose help in the final stages of production saved me from intellectual collapse.

Finally, I wish to thank my real family and a stellar set of friends. When I first said that I was going to study ethics, though many were confused, my family and friends never wavered in their faith that I could make something of this: despite the fact that my typically deranged ranting gave little idea of what I was actually doing or why. My parents, Pam and Jurgen and my brother, Chris, not only encouraged me in keeping on working but also took an interest in what I was doing. Thanks also go to my various housemates and friends in Canberra, who put up with me for the duration and my friends in Melbourne and elsewhere, who motivated me by asking questions about my work and challenging me when the answers made no sense.

Looking back, this book had its inception while I was studying in Sweden in late 2006. In the ten years that followed, I have been so very lucky to have been exposed to so many great and wonderful people inside and outside of academia who helped in so many different ways to bring this book into being. Without this global village of colleagues, friends and family, what was a tiny idea conceived at the beginnings of a Linköping winter would not have emerged. And while I am hardly able to offer anything objective about the quality of what follows, my heartfelt appreciation goes out to everyone who helped bring this tiny idea, that identity and information may have some relation, into the world.