#### **Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together**

Rational thinking as exemplified in mathematical cognition is immensely important in the modern world. This book documents how a group of three eighth-grade girls developed specific group practices typical of such thinking in an online educational experience. A longitudinal case study tracks the team during eight hour-long sessions, following the students' meaning-making processes through their mutual chat responses preserved in computer logs coordinated with their geometric actions. The examination of data focuses on key areas of the team's development: its effective team collaboration, its productive mathematical discourse, its enacted use of dynamic-geometry tools, and its ability to identify and construct dynamic-geometry dependencies. This detailed study of group cognition serves as a paradigmatic example of computer-supported collaborative learning, incorporating a unique model of human-computer interaction analysis applied to the use of innovative educational technology. A valuable resource for researchers, instructors, and students alike, it offers concrete suggestions for improving educational practice.

Gerry Stahl is Professor Emeritus at Drexel University's College of Computing and Informatics. He is the founding editor of the *International Journal of Computer-Supported Collaborative Learning*, and his publications include *Group Cognition: Computer Support for Building Collaborative Knowledge*, *Translating Euclid: Designing a Human-Centered Mathematics*, and *Studying Virtual Math Teams*.

#### LEARNING IN DOING: SOCIAL, COGNITIVE, AND COMPUTATIONAL PERSPECTIVES

#### SERIES EDITOR EMERITUS

John Seely Brown, Xerox Palo Alto Research Center

#### GENERAL EDITORS

Roy Pea, Professor of Education and the Learning Sciences and Director, Stanford Center for Innovations in Learning, Stanford University Christian Heath, The Management Centre, King's College, London Lucy A. Suchman, Centre for Science Studies and Department of Sociology, Lancaster University, UK

#### BOOKS IN THE SERIES

The Construction Zone: Working for Cognitive Change in School Denis Newman, Peg Griffin, and Michael Cole

Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation Jean Lave and Etienne Wenger

Street Mathematics and School Mathematics Terezinha Nunes, David William Carraher, and Analucia Dias Schliemann

Understanding Practice: Perspectives on Activity and Context Seth Chaiklin and Jean Lave, Editors

Distributed Cognitions: Psychological and Educational Considerations Gavriel Salomon, Editor

*The Computer as Medium* Peter Bøgh Anderson, Berit Holmqvist, and Jens F. Jensen, Editors

Sociocultural Studies of Mind James V. Wertsch, Pablo del Rio, and Amelia Alvarez, Editors

Sociocultural Psychology: Theory and Practice of Doing and Knowing Laura Martin, Katherine Nelson, and Ethel Tobach, Editors

Mind and Social Practice: Selected Writings of Sylvia Scribner Ethel Tobach et al., Editors

(continued after index)

# Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together

The Development of Mathematical Group Cognition

GERRY STAHL Drexel University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107566873

© Gerry Stahl 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016 First paperback edition 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Stahl, Gerry. Constructing dynamic triangles together : the development of mathematical group cognition / Gerry Stahl, Drexel University. pages cm. - (Learning in doing) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-12791-3 (hardback) 1. Geometry - Study and teaching (Middle school) 2. Middle school education. 3. Middle school students. 4. Mathematical ability. I. Title. QA461.S73 2016 516.0071'2-dc23 2015024940 ISBN 978-1-107-12791-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-56687-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

### Contents

List of Figures	page x
List of Logs	xii
Series Foreword	XV
Preface	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
Introduction to the Analysis	1
Research Context	1
Presentation Structure	4
Researching Mathematical Cognition	11
The Historical Development of Mathematical Cognition	12
The Methodology of Group-Cognitive Development	16
Analyzing Development of Group Cognition	22
Focus on Group Practices	22
Sequential-Interaction Analysis	31
The Display of Collaborative Development	38
Session 1: The Team Develops Collaboration Practices	44
Tab Welcome	46
Tab Hints Help	69
Tab Objects	72
Tab Dragging	77
Summary of Learning in Session 1	81
Session 2: The Team Develops Dragging Practices	88
Tab Equilateral	88
Tab Relationships	99

vii

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-56687-3 — Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together
Gerry Stahl
Frontmatter
More Information

viii	Contents
Tab Where's Waldo	103
Tab Exploring	104
Summary of Learning in Session 2	105
Session 3: The Team Develops Construction Practices	109
Visual Drawings and Theoretical Constructions	109
Tab Bisector	111
Tab Perpendicular	123
Summary of Learning in Session 3	124
Session 4: The Team Develops Tool Usage Practices	129
Tab Right-Triangle	129
Tab Triangles	134
Tab Hierarchy	138
Summary of Learning in Session 4	139
Session 5: The Team Identifies Dependencies	142
The Inscribed Triangles Tab	142
Summary of Learning in Session 5	152
Session 6: The Team Constructs Dependencies	154
The Inscribed Triangles Tab, Continued	154
The Inscribed Squares Tab	157
Summary of Learning in Session 6	166
Session 7: The Team Uses Transformation Tools	171
The Transformations Tab	171
Summary of Learning in Session 7	182
Session 8: The Team Develops Mathematical Discourse	
and Action Practices	184
The Quadrilateral Tab	185
Poly1: Efficient Analysis	186
Poly2: Group Memory	188
Poly3: A Confused Attempt	202
Poly4: Vertices Swinging around Circles	204
Poly5: It's Restricted Dude	205
Poly6: A Rectangle?	206
Poly7: A Final Attempt	208
Summary of Learning in Session 8	209
What Did We Learn about What the Team Learned?	215

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-56687-3 — Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together
Gerry Stahl
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents	ix
Contributions to a Theory of Mathematical Group Cognition	217
How Mathematical Group Cognition Developed	218
Collaboration and the Development of Group Agency	220
The Group Discourse of Mathematical Dependency	225
Dynamic-Geometry Tools Mediating Group Cognitive	
Development	232
Dragging as Embodied Group Cognition	235
Constructing as Situated Group Cognition	237
Designing as Group Conceptualizing of Dependency	238
Constructing Mathematical Group Cognition	241
The Dialectic of Mathematical Cognition	241
Implications for Designing	243
Advances and Future Prospects	246
References	251
Author Index	261
General Index	263

### Figures

1	A circle, a line segment, and an equilateral triangle are	
	dragged.	page 26
2	Dynamic isosceles triangle.	27
3	The Cereal Team works on Topic 5.	34
4	The Welcome Tab of Session 1 for WinterFest 2013.	46
5	The team constructs a polygon.	66
6	The Hints Help Tab.	70
7	The Objects Tab.	72
8	The Dragging Tab.	78
9	The Equilateral Tab.	89
10	An attempt to construct an equilateral triangle.	91
11	Intersecting the circles at point C.	94
12	The Relationships Tab.	102
13	The Where's Waldo Tab.	103
14	The Exploring Tab.	105
15	The Bisector Tab.	112
16	Constructing the midpoint.	114
17	Adjusting the midpoint.	121
18	The Perpendicular Tab.	123
19	A perpendicular to HJ.	124
20	The Right-Triangle Tab.	130
21	Some custom right triangles.	133
22	The Triangles Tab.	135
23	The grid.	138
24	The Hierarchy Tab.	139
25	The Triangles, Squares and Hexagons Tabs.	143
26	The construction after Fruitloops finished.	148
27	The construction after Cheerios finished.	150

X

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-56687-3 — Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together
Gerry Stahl
Frontmatter
More Information

xi
150
159
163
164
172
177
178
179
186
191
191
199
207

### Logs

1	The team meets in the first session.	page 47
2	The team decides to take turns.	50
3	The team expresses confusion.	58
4	The team constructs a shape.	62
5	The team connects objects.	63
6	The team describes its shape.	66
7	The team cannot see each other's work.	70
8	The team explores simple figures.	73
9	The team decides to move on.	77
10	Discussion of crossed lines.	79
11	Discussion of dependent points.	80
12	The team tries to construct an equilateral triangle.	90
13	Constructing the circles.	92
14	Connecting the points.	94
15	Dragging the points.	96
16	Dragging the triangle.	98
17	Identifying constraints.	100
18	Identifying kinds of triangles.	104
19	Exploring triangles.	105
20	Reconstruct the example figure.	112
21	Draw a perpendicular-looking line.	115
22	Use the example figure as a guide.	116
23	Use circles without dependencies.	118
24	Construct dependencies.	120
25	Discuss why the figure is perpendicular.	122
26	Defining the team's custom perpendicular tool.	124
27	Constructing a right triangle.	130

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-56687-3 — Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together
Gerry Stahl
Frontmatter
More Information

Log	S	xiii
28	Using the team's perpendicular tool.	133
29	Constructing different triangles.	135
30	Measuring an equilateral triangle.	137
31	The only posting in the tab.	140
32	The team explores the triangles.	143
33	The team discusses dependencies.	145
34	The team constructs the first triangle.	145
35	The team experiments.	146
36	The team views other tabs.	147
37	The team makes a key observation.	148
38	The team explains its construction.	155
39	The team explains the dependencies.	156
40	The team explores the square.	157
41	The team constructs its first square.	158
42	The team makes another key observation.	162
43	The team tests its construction.	163
44	The team summarizes dependencies.	165
45	The team drags triangle ABC.	172
46	The team drags vector DE.	173
47	The team questions transformations.	174
48	The team finds the transformation tools.	175
49	The team reflects a triangle.	177
50	The team constructs more transformed objects.	179
51	The teacher visits the chat room.	180
52	The team helps each other.	181
53	The team analyzes Poly1.	187
54	The team explores constraints in Poly2.	189
55	The team discusses the possible construction of Poly2.	194
56	The team becomes confused about Poly2.	198
57	The team is unsure of how Poly2 was constructed.	201
58	Confusion about Poly3.	203
59	Constraints in Poly4.	205
60	A restricted point in Poly5.	206
61	Parallel lines and right angles in Poly6.	207
62	A constricted point in Poly7.	208
63	References in the chat about Poly2.	228

### Series Foreword

This series for Cambridge University Press is widely known as an international forum for studies of situated learning and cognition. Innovative contributions are being made by anthropology; by cognitive, developmental, and cultural psychology; by computer science; by education; and by social theory. These contributions are providing the basis for new ways of understanding the social, historical, and contextual nature of learning, thinking, and practice that emerge from human activity. The empirical settings of these research inquiries range from the classroom to the workplace, to the high-technology office, and to learning in the streets and in other communities of practice. The situated nature of learning and remembering through activity is a central fact. It may appear obvious that human minds develop in social situations and extend their sphere of activity and communicative competencies. But cognitive theories of knowledge representation and learning alone have not provided sufficient insight into these relationships. This series was born of the conviction that new exciting interdisciplinary syntheses are under way as scholars and practitioners from diverse fields seek to develop theory and empirical investigations adequate for characterizing the complex relations of social and mental life, and for understanding successful learning wherever it occurs. The series invites contributions that advance our understanding of these seminal issues.

> Roy Pea Christian Heath Lucy Suchman

#### Preface

Rational thinking as exemplified in mathematical cognition is of undeniable importance in the modern world. This book documents how a group of three eighth-grade girls developed specific practices typical of such thinking through involvement in an online educational experience. The presentation begins by discussing the methodological approach adopted in analyzing the development of mathematical group cognition. An extended case study then tracks the team of students step by step through its eight-hour-long progression. Concluding sections draw the consequences for the theory of group cognition and for educational practice.

The book investigates the display of mathematical reasoning by the students discussing dependencies within a sequence of dynamic-geometry figures. By examining the network of their mutual chat responses preserved in computer logs coordinated with their geometric actions exhibited in a replayer, it is possible to follow in detail the meaning-making processes of the students and to observe how the team develops its mathematical group cognition by adopting a variety of group practices. The longitudinal data set provides a rich opportunity to observe cognitive development through the interplay of processes and practices identifiable at the individual, small-group, and community units of analysis.

The examination of data focuses on these areas of the team's development:

- 1. Its effective team collaboration,
- 2. Its productive mathematical discourse,
- 3. Its enacted use of dynamic-geometry tools, and
- 4. Its ability to identify and construct dynamic-geometry dependencies by:
  - a. Dynamic dragging of geometric objects,
  - b. Dynamic construction of geometric figures, and
  - c. Dynamic *design* of dependencies in geometric relationships.

xvii

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-107-56687-3 — Constructing Dynamic Triangles Together Gerry Stahl Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

xviii

Preface

The analysis reveals how the three students contribute differently, but also appropriate each other's contributions. This successively advances the group's ability to collaborate effectively with group agency, to articulate mathematical ideas productively by applying increasingly meaningful mathematical terminology, and to engage in dynamic-geometry challenges using mastered software functionality. The shared digital workspace supports group exploration and testing of geometric conjectures, while sequenced curricular topics guide student discoveries. These affordances help the students advance to new levels of individual and group mathematical cognition through the situated adoption of many specific group practices for productive collaboration, mathematical discourse, and dynamic-geometry problem solving.

The result is a detailed case study of the Virtual Math Teams Project as a paradigmatic example of computer-supported collaborative learning, incorporating a unique model of human-computer interaction analysis applied to the use of innovative educational technology.

### Acknowledgments

The data analyzed here is from WinterFest 2013, an effort of the Virtual Math Teams (VMT) Project, a long-term collaboration among researchers at Drexel University, the Math Forum, and Rutgers University at Newark. WinterFest 2013 involved teachers in New Jersey who were participating in a professional development course at Rutgers, and their students.

The analysis of the data was discussed at many weekly research meetings of the VMT project team. Regular participants in the VMT discussions were: Stephen Weimar, Annie Fetter, Tony Mantoan, Michael Khoo, Sean Goggins, Diler Öner, Murat Çakir, Arthur Powell, Muteb Alqahtani, and Loretta Dicker. They each contributed in multiple ways to the generation and analysis of the data. In particular, the analysis of Session 3 herein borrows from the parallel analysis in Öner & Stahl (2015b) and the analysis of Session 8 incorporates content and figures from Çakir & Stahl (2015). Excerpts of this data were also discussed at an all-day workshop at ICLS 2014 (Stahl, 2014d), which is documented at www.gerrystahl.net/vmt/ icls2014, including the full dataset for the Cereal Team.

The VMT Project was generously funded by a sequence of grants from the U.S. National Science Foundation covering from 2003 to 2016.