Transformations of Musical Modernism

Profound transformations in the composition, performance and reception of modernist music have taken place in recent decades. This collection brings fresh perspectives to bear upon key questions surrounding the forms that musical modernism takes today, how modern music is performed and heard and its relationship to earlier music. In sixteen chapters, leading figures in the field and emerging scholars examine modernist music from the inside, in terms of changing practices of composition, musical materials and overarching aesthetic principles, and from the outside, in terms of the changing contextual frameworks in which musical modernism has taken place and been understood. Shaped by a ‘rehearing’ of modernist music, the picture that emerges redraws the map of musical modernism as a whole and presents a full-scale re-evaluation of what the modernist movement has been all about.

ERLING E. GULDBRANDSEN is a professor at the Department of Musicology, University of Oslo, where he leads the research group, ‘20/21 – Musical Trajectories Today’. He has carried out research at IRCAM (Paris) and at the Paul Sacher Foundation (Basel) and received the King’s Gold Medal for his work on Boulez. His 2006 article on Mahler and Boulez was awarded the Norwegian prize ‘Scientific Article of the Year’. He has published widely on Wagner and musical drama, musical modernism, music history, analysis, performance practice and aesthetic experience.

JULIAN JOHNSON is Regius Professor of Music at Royal Holloway, University of London. He has written five books, including Webern and the Transformation of Nature (Cambridge, 1999) and Mahler’s Voices (2009). His most recent, Out of Time: Music and the Making of Modernity (2015), considers music’s constitutive relation to modernity from the sixteenth century to the present. In 2005 he was awarded the Dent Medal of the RMA for ‘outstanding contributions to musicology’ and, in 2013, became the first holder of the Diamond Jubilee Regius Chair of Music.
Music Since 1900

GENERAL EDITOR Arnold Whittall

This series – formerly Music in the Twentieth Century – offers a wide perspective on music and musical life since the end of the nineteenth century. Books included range from historical and biographical studies concentrating particularly on the context and circumstances in which composers were writing, to analytical and critical studies concerned with the nature of musical language and questions of compositional process. The importance given to context will also be reflected in studies dealing with, for example, the patronage, publishing and promotion of new music, and in accounts of the musical life of particular countries.

Titles in the series

Jonathan Cross
The Stravinsky Legacy

Michael Nyman
Experimental Music: Cage and Beyond

Jennifer Doctor
The BBC and Ultra-Modern Music, 1922–1936

Robert Adlington
The Music of Harrison Birtwistle

Keith Potter
Four Musical Minimalists: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass

Carlo Caballero
Fauré and French Musical Aesthetics

Peter Burt
The Music of Toru Takemitsu

David Clarke
The Music and Thought of Michael Tippett: Modern Times and Metaphysics

M. J. Grant
Serial Music, Serial Aesthetics: Compositional Theory in Post-War Europe

Philip Rupprecht
Britten’s Musical Language
Thomas Schuttenhelm
The Orchestral Music of Michael Tippett: Creative Development and the Compositional Process

Marilyn Nonken
The Spectral Piano: From Liszt, Scriabin, and Debussy to the Digital Age

Jack Boss
Schoenberg’s Twelve-Tone Music: Symmetry and the Musical Idea

Deborah Mawer
French Music and Jazz in Conversation: From Debussy to Brubeck

Philip Rupprecht
British Musical Modernism: The Manchester Group and their Contemporaries

Amy Lynn Wlodarski
Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation

Carola Nielinger-Vakil
Luigi Nono: A Composer in Context

Erling E. Guldbrandsen and Julian Johnson
Transformations of Musical Modernism
Transformations of Musical Modernism

Edited by

Erling E. Guldbrandsen and Julian Johnson
University of Oslo
Royal Holloway, University of London
Contents

List of music examples  page ix
Notes on contributors  xii
Acknowledgements  xvi

Introduction  1
Erling E. Gulbrandsen and Julian Johnson

Part I Rethinking modernism  19
1 The lure of the Sublime: revisiting the modernist project  21
   Susan McClary
2 Return of the repressed: particularity in early and late modernism  36
   Julian Johnson
3 Expressionism revisited: modernism beyond the twentieth century  53
   Arnold Whittall
4 Erik Bergman, cosmopolitanism and the transformation of musical geography  74
   Björn Heile
5 Sharing a stage: the growing proximity between modernism and popular music  97
   David Metzer

Part II Rewriting modernism  117
6 Ritual and Eros in James Dillon’s Come live with me  119
   Michael Cherlin
7 Montage in modernity: scattered fragments, dynamic fragments  145
   Jean-Paul Olive
8 Transformations of appearance: suddenness and the modernist fragment  155
   Marion Hestholm
9 Rethinking Boulez: schemes, logics and paradigms of musical modernity  172
   Edward Campbell
Contents

10 Remembrance and prognosis in the music of György Ligeti 190
   Peter Edwards

11 Valentin Silvestrov and the symphonic monument in ruins 201
   Samuel Wilson

Part III Replaying modernism 221

12 Playing with transformations: Boulez’s Improvisation III sur Mallarmé 223
   Erling E. Guldbrandsen

13 Performance as critique 245
   Arnulf Christian Mattes

14 ‘Unwrapping’ the voice: Cathy Berberian and John Cage’s Aria 264
   Francesca Placanica

15 Radically idiomatic instrumental practice in works by Brian
   Ferneyhough 279
   Anders Førisdal

16 The ethics of performance practice in complex music after 1945 299
   Tanja Orning

Bibliography 319
Index of names 336
Index of subjects 347
Music examples

3.6 Simon Holt, *Black Lanterns*, ending. © Copyright 1984 Chester Music Limited. All rights reserved. International copyright secured. Used by permission of Chester Music Limited. 68
3.7 Simon Holt, *Boots of Lead*, bars 1–16: offstage clarinet in A only. © Copyright 2002 Chester Music Limited. All rights reserved. International copyright secured. Used by permission of Chester Music Limited. 69
4.1 Serial structure of Erik Bergman’s *Aubade* for Orchestra, Op. 48 85
4.2 Erik Bergman, *Colori ed Improvisazioni* Op. 72, bars 50ff. Reproduced by permission of Boosey & Hawkes Music Publishers Ltd 88
List of music examples


8.1 Beethoven, *Pastoral Symphony*, 2nd movement (Szene am Bach), clarinet motive (bars 69–70). 164

11.1 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, figs. 10–12 (upbeat to bar 73–88), reduction. 204

11.2 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5: first harp, bar 300. © 2001 by M. P. Belaieff, Frankfurt. 212

11.3 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, figs. 90–92 (upbeat to bar 758–777), reduction. 213

11.4 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, bar 772 to end, reduction. 213

11.5 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, returning melody, first violins, from bar 727 (fig. 87). © 2001 by M. P. Belaieff, Frankfurt. 216

11.6 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, first clarinet’s solo line, bars 611–615. © 2001 by M. P. Belaieff, Frankfurt. 216

11.7 Valentin Silvestrov, Symphony No. 5, bars 479–483, beginning of the piano’s solo material. © 2001 by M. P. Belaieff, Frankfurt. 217

12.1a ‘Improvisation III’, harps, page 1, first version’. 229

12.1b ‘Improvisation III’, harps, page 1, revised version’. 229

12.2 ‘Basic figures’. 232

12.3 ‘Permutations and multiplications’. 232

12.4 ‘Superposition and displacement’. 233

12.5 ‘Reduction of polyphony’. 233

12.6 ‘Alpha series’. 234

12.7 ‘Beta series’. 234
List of music examples

12.8 ‘Gamma series’. 234

15.1 Brian Ferneyhough, Unity Capsule, opening. Copyright © 1975 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 284

15.2 Brian Ferneyhough, Unity Capsule, page 5, end of middle stave and opening of bottom stave. Copyright © 1975 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 285

15.3 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 1, bars 1–6. Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 289

15.4 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 2, bars 1–4 (example 15.4a) and 31–32 (example 15.4b). Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 292

15.5 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 2, bar 7. Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 293

15.6 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 4, bars 6–8. Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 295

15.7 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 4, bars 26–27. Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 295

15.8 Kurze Schatten II, mvt. 4, bars 34–35. Copyright © 1989 by Hinrichsen Ed. Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 296

16.1 Klaus K. Hübler, Opus breve, page 1. © 1988 by Breitkopf & Härtel, Wiesbaden. Reproduced by permission. 301

16.2 Time and Motion Study II by Brian Ferneyhough. Copyright © (1978) Used by permission of C. F. Peters Corporation. All rights reserved. 312
Notes on contributors

Edward Campbell is Senior Lecturer in Music at the University of Aberdeen and a member of the university’s Centre for Modern Thought. He specializes in contemporary European art music and aesthetics including historical, analytical and aesthetic approaches to European modernism, the music and writings of Pierre Boulez, contemporary European opera and the interrelation of musical thought and critical theory. He is the author of the books Boulez, Music and Philosophy (Cambridge, 2010) and Music after Deleuze (2013), and co-editor of Pierre Boulez Studies, to be published by Cambridge in 2016.

Michael Cherlin is the author of Schoenberg’s Musical Imagination (Cambridge, 2007) and Some Varieties of Musical Irony (Cambridge, forthcoming), and the editor of Music Theory Spectrum (2013–15). He is Professor of Music Theory at the University of Minnesota.

Peter Edwards is a postdoctoral fellow and lectures in musicology at the University of Oslo. His current project ‘Style and Modernity’, funded by the Research Council of Norway, studies the implications of modernist aesthetics on theories of style across a range of musical genres and traditions. He is also a guitarist and composer and has received commissions from leading ensembles and performers.

Anders Førisdal is a Norwegian guitarist and musicologist. As a soloist and artistic director of the group asamisimasa, he has collaborated with many of the major composers of our time, including Brian Ferneyhough, Helmut Lachenmann and Mathias Spahlinger, and given numerous world premieres. He wrote his master’s thesis on Aldo Clementi, and his first solo CD, a double disc devoted to the experimental guitar music of Bjørn Fongaard, was released in February 2015. At the time of writing, Førisdal has recently finished a doctoral thesis on radically idiomatic instrumental practice in the works of Ferneyhough, Richard Barrett and Klaus K. Hübler.

Erling E. Guldbrandsen is Professor at the Department of Musicology, University of Oslo, where he leads the research group ‘20/21 – Musical Trajectories Today’. He followed the doctoral programme ‘Musique et musicologie du XXème siècle’ at IRCAM (Paris) and studied Pierre Boulez’s music
at IRCAM and at the Paul Sacher Foundation (Basel), resulting in his dissertation on Boulez which was awarded His Majesty the King’s Gold Medal in 1996. A 2006 article on Mahler and Boulez was awarded the Norwegian prize ‘Scientific Article of the Year’. Guldbrandsen has published widely on contemporary music, Boulez, Mahler, Bruckner, Wagner, J. S. Bach, Norwegian music and opera, often combining music analysis, performance studies, literary criticism, music history and aesthetics.

**Björn Heile** is Reader in Music Since 1900 and Head of Music at the University of Glasgow. He is the author of *The Music of Mauricio Kagel* (2006), the editor of *The Modernist Legacy: Essays on New Music* (2009), co-editor (with Martin Iddon) of *Mauricio Kagel bei den Darmstädter Ferienkursen für Neue Musik: Eine Dokumentation* (2009) and co-editor (with Peter Elsdon and Jenny Doctor) of *Watching Jazz: Encountering Jazz Performance on Screen* (forthcoming). He is currently preparing a large collaborative research project on the performance practice of Mauricio Kagel’s experimental music and co-editing (with Charles Wilson) *The Ashgate Research Companion to Modernism in Music*.

**Marion Hestholm** earned her doctoral degree in June 2011. Her dissertation ‘Fragments, Flights, and Forms: Montage as a Constructive Principle of Twentieth-Century Music’ investigates the mechanisms of montage as it takes shape in music by Ives, Berio and Kagel. She is particularly interested in the reciprocity between twentieth-century music and philosophy, and of how that century’s musical innovation actualizes concepts such as organicism, narrativity and poetic logic. Hestholm is also a trained pianist from the Norwegian Music Academy. At present, she works as a radio host and reporter in the Norwegian Broadcasting Corporation.

**Julian Johnson** is Regius Professor of Music at Royal Holloway, University of London. His writing on music history has focused particularly on musical modernism but he has published widely on music from Beethoven through to contemporary music, and in relation to philosophy, literature, visual art and landscape. He has written five books, including *Webern and the Transformation of Nature* (Cambridge, 1999) and *Mahler’s Voices* (2009). His most recent, *Out of Time: Music and the Making of Modernity* (2015), considers music’s constitutive relation to modernity from the sixteenth century to the present.

**Arnulf Christian Mattes** is Associate Professor at the University of Bergen Centre for Grieg Research. He studied the cello at the Staatliche Musikhochschule Trossingen and gained a PhD at the University of Oslo with a dissertation on Schoenberg’s late chamber works. In 2009 he...
xiv Notes on contributors

received a three-year research grant from the Norwegian Research Council for the postdoctoral project ‘Musical Expression in Transforming Cultures: A Comparative Study of Rudolf Kolisch’s Performance Practice’. Mattes has previously published articles on Schoenberg and Kolisch in the Journal of the Arnold Schoenberg Center and Twentieth-Century Music.

Susan McClary is Professor of Music at Case Western Reserve University and Distinguished Professor Emerita, UCLA. She focuses her research on the cultural criticism of music. Her books include Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, and Sexuality; Georges Bizet: Carmen; Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form; Modal Subjectivities: Renaissance Self-Fashioning in the Italian Madrigal; Reading Music, Desire and Pleasure in 17th-Century Music; and Structures of Feeling in 17th-Century Expressive Culture. Her work has been translated into at least twenty languages. McClary received a MacArthur Foundation ‘Genius’ Fellowship in 1995.

David Metzer is Professor of Music at the University of British Columbia. He is the author of Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music and Musical Modernism at the Turn of the Twenty-First Century. His articles have appeared in Modernism/modernity, Journal of Musicology and Popular Music, among other journals. He is currently working on a history of the ballad in American popular music from the 1950s to the present day.

Jean-Paul Olive is a professor in the Department of Music at Paris 8 University, where he teaches musical analysis and aesthetics. After being director of the department ‘Arts, Philosophy and Aesthetics’, he directed the Doctoral School’s programme in ‘Aesthetics, Science and Technology of the Arts’. He also founded the ‘Arts 8’ series and is co-director of the musicology journal Filigrane. His major publications include a book on the work of Alban Berg (Alban Berg: Le tissage et le sens, 1997), an essay about montage in music (Musique et montage: Essai sur le matériau musical au début du XXème siècle, 1999) and a book on the musical texts of the philosopher Theodor W. Adorno (Un son désenchanté, 2008). He also directed numerous edited collections including: Expression et geste musical, 2013 (with Suzanne Kogler); Réfléchir les forms: Autour d’une analyse dialectique de la musique, 2013; and Gestes, fragments, timbres: la musique de György Kurtág, 2009.

Tanja Orning is a cellist and musicologist active in the fields of contemporary and experimental music. She performs with groups such as asamisima, BOA trio and DR.OX, as well as in her solo-project Cellotronics. She studied in Oslo, London, and at Indiana University with Janos Starker as a Fulbright Research Fellow. Since earning her PhD at the Norwegian
Notes on contributors

Academy of Music in contemporary performance practice (2014), Orning has worked as an associate professor at the Department of Musicology, University of Oslo, and teaches contemporary music at the Academy of Music, besides being an active performer.

Francesca Placanica is the co-editor of Cathy Berberian: Pioneer of Contemporary Vocality (2014) and has worked extensively on primary sources from Cathy Berberian’s private archives while completing her master’s thesis ‘Cathy Berberian: Performance as Composition’ at Southern Methodist University, Dallas, Texas, in 2007. She holds a PhD in Music from the University of Southampton (2013) and has lectured in Performance and Musicology at Maynooth University in 2014. An active professional singer, she is now an associate researcher at Orpheus Institute (Ghent), where she is leading her artistic research project on twentieth-century monodrama and vocality.


Samuel Wilson is Lecturer in Contextual Studies at London Contemporary Dance School and Tutor in Music Philosophy and Aesthetics at Guildhall School of Music and Drama. His research focuses principally on subjectivity and music in the context of recent modernity. He completed his PhD in 2013 at Royal Holloway, University of London (supervised by Julian Johnson), and has since published in Contemporary Music Review and International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music. He is a member of the central organizing committee for the annual London Conference in Critical Thought (londoncritical.org).
Acknowledgements

This collection of essays originates from an international symposium held in Paris in October 2011, organized by Erling Guldbrandsen and the Musical Modernism Research Group based at Oslo University. It brought together a number of established figures in the field with emerging scholars in order to examine the transformation of musical modernism that has taken place in recent decades. It became clear during the three-day meeting that not only did the papers present a particularly rich set of perspectives on this central question but together they formed a powerful and coherent analysis which was considerably more than the sum of its parts. To help realize this as a full-length book publication, Julian Johnson was invited to act as the co-editor. The resulting volume includes the work of many of those who participated in that meeting as well as contributions by other invited scholars. In bringing this wonderfully rich set of approaches to publication, the editors are necessarily grateful to a number of key people.

The seminar series promoted by the Musical Modernism Research Group of the Department of Musicology at Oslo University was invaluable in creating the context for both the Paris meeting in 2011 and the subsequent development of ideas. The group continues to flourish, under the leadership of Erling Guldbrandsen, under its new name ‘20/21 – Musical Trajectories Today’. The Paris meeting was generously supported by the Centre Franco-Norvégien in Paris, directed by Bjarne Rogan. The editors are very grateful to Victoria Cooper, Senior Commissioning Editor at Cambridge University Press, for her enduring support and encouragement; to Arnold Whittall, who welcomed the volume into the ‘Music in the Twentieth Century’ series, of which he is the editor; to Fleur Jones at Cambridge University Press, who piloted the book manuscript through to publication; and to Sam Wilson, for his invaluable administrative help. Finally, our thanks go to the other fourteen authors whose work has created this volume. The process of sharing ideas from which this book emerges, always conducted in a spirit of enthusiastic openness and generosity, has been a great pleasure for us both.