Implicatures

An accessible and thorough introduction to implicatures, a key topic in all frameworks of pragmatics. Starting with a definition of the various types of implicatures in Gricean, neo-Gricean and post-Gricean pragmatics, the book covers many important questions for current pragmatic theories, namely: the distinction between explicit and implicit forms of pragmatic enrichment, the criteria for drawing a line between semantic and pragmatic meaning, the relations between the structure of language (syntax) and its use (pragmatics), the social and cognitive factors underlying the use of implicatures by native speakers, and the factors influencing their acquisition for children and second language learners. Written in non-technical language, Implicatures will appeal to students and teachers in linguistics, applied linguistics, psychology and sociology who are interested in how language is used for communication, and how children and learners develop pragmatic skills.

Sandrine Zufferey is full professor of French linguistics at the University of Bern, Switzerland.

Jacques Moeschler is full professor of French linguistics at the Department of Linguistics, University of Geneva, Switzerland.

Anne Reboul is a senior researcher at the Institute for Cognitive Sciences-Marc Jeannerod, Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), Lyon.
'Key Topics in Semantics and Pragmatics' focuses on the main topics of study in semantics and pragmatics today. It consists of accessible yet challenging accounts of the most important issues, concepts and phenomena to consider when examining meaning in language. Some topics have been the subject of semantic and pragmatic study for many years, and are re-examined in this series in light of new developments in the field; others are issues of growing importance that have not so far been given a sustained treatment. Written by leading experts and designed to bridge the gap between textbooks and primary literature, the books in this series can either be used on courses and seminars, or as one-stop, succinct guides to a particular topic for individual students and researchers. Each book includes useful suggestions for further reading, discussion questions, and a helpful glossary.

Already published in the series:

- *Meaning and Humour* by Andrew Goatly
- *Metaphor* by L. David Ritchie
- *Imperatives* by Mark Jary and Mikhail Kissine
- *Modification* by Marcin Morzycki
- *Semantics for Counting and Measuring* by Susan Rothstein
- *Irony* by Joana Garmendia

Forthcoming titles:

- *Distributivity* by George Tsoulas and Eytan Zweig
- *Semantics and Pragmatics in Sign Languages* by Kathryn Davidson Zaremba
- *Frame Semantics* by Hans C. Boas
- *Game-Theoretic Pragmatics* by Anton Benz
- *Propositional Logic* by Allen Hazen and Jeffrey Pelletier
- *Compositionality* by Maria Bittner
- *The Semantics of Case* by Olga Kagan
- *Proper Names and Direct Reference* by Gregory Bochner
- *Attitude Reports* by Thomas Grano
- *Indirect Speech Acts* by Nicolas Ruytenbeek
Implicatures

SANDRINE ZUFFEREY
University of Bern

JACQUES MOESCHLER
University of Geneva

ANNE REBOUL
Institute for Cognitive Sciences-Marc Jeannerod, CNRS UMR 5304
Contents

List of Figures  page ix
List of Tables  x
Preface  xi
Part I  Theoretical Foundations  1

1   Ordinary Language Philosophy and the Birth of Pragmatics  3
   1.1  Introduction  3
   1.2  Paul Grice’s Contribution to Pragmatics  5
       1.2.1  Meaning  5
       1.2.2  Implicature  7
   1.3  Properties of Implicatures  11
   1.4  Problems with the Gricean Approach  16
   1.5  Summary  19

2   Linguistic Theory and Pragmatics  22
   2.1  Introduction  22
   2.2  Pragmatics and the Chomskyan Revolution in Linguistics  24
       2.2.1  Pragmatics as Performance  24
       2.2.2  Reference and Illocutionary Force as Theoretical Issues  28
       2.2.3  I-Language, E-Language and Pragmatics  31
   2.3  The Cognitive Linguistic Trend, Its Origin and Domains  33
       2.3.1  The Cognitive Linguistics Paradigm  34
       2.3.2  The Conceptual Semantics Paradigm  38
   2.4  Two Models of Communication  41
   2.5  Summary  43

3   Relevance Theory and the Broadening of Pragmatics to Explicit Meaning  45
   3.1  Introduction  45
   3.2  The Cognitive Principle of Relevance  47
CONTENTS

vi

3.3 The Communicative Principle of Relevance 51
3.4 The Pragmatics of Explicit Communication 56
3.5 Relevance Theory and Implicit Communication 59
3.6 Ad Hoc Concepts and Lexical Pragmatics 62
3.7 Summary 65

Part II Types of Implicature 67

4 Particularized Conversational Implicatures: Why There Are Conversational Implicatures 69
  4.1 Introduction 69
  4.2 Metaphors as Implicit Communication 70
  4.3 Neither the Gricean nor the Relevance-Theoretic Accounts Can Explain the Existence of Conversational Implicatures 73
  4.4 Recovering Strongly Communicated Implicatures despite the Principle of Cooperation 77
  4.5 The Possibility of Denial 79
  4.6 Speaker’s Commitment and Hearer’s Epistemic Vigilance 84
  4.7 Summary 86

5 Conventional Implicature and Presupposition: Formal Semantics and Pragmatics 88
  5.1 Introduction 88
  5.2 The Gricean Notion of Conventional Implicature 89
  5.3 Semantic Presupposition 95
  5.3.1 A Brief History of Semantic Presupposition 95
  5.3.2 The Issue with the Semantic Account of Presuppositions 97
  5.4 A Pragmatic Account of Presupposition 100
  5.5 Presuppositions as Implicatures 103
  5.6 Presuppositions, Conventional Implicatures and Common Ground 105
  5.7 The Projection Issue 107
  5.8 Summary 109

6 Generalized Conversational Implicatures: Gricean, Neo-Gricean and Post-Gricean Pragmatics 111
  6.1 Introduction 111
  6.2 Gazdar’s Interpretation of Generalized Quantitative Implicatures 112
  6.3 Horn’s Scales and the Logical Properties of Scalar Implicatures 118
Contents

6.4 I-Implicatures 124
6.5 The Gricean Circle 130
6.6 Implicatures or Explicatures? 133
6.7 Return to Grice 135
6.8 Summary 138

Part III Empirical Evidence 141

7 Implicatures and Language Processing 143
  7.1 Introduction 143
  7.2 Pragmatic Theories and the Processing of Implicatures 144
  7.3 Are Implicatures Costly to Process? 148
    7.3.1 Results from Off-Line Measures of Sentence Processing 148
    7.3.2 Results from On-Line Measures of Sentence Processing 152
  7.4 Processing Generalized Versus Particularized Implicatures 157
  7.5 The Role of Speaker Knowledge and Conversational Relevance for the Derivation of Implicatures 159
  7.6 Politeness Factors Influencing the Derivation of Scalar Implicatures 163
  7.7 Summary 164

8 The Acquisition of Implicatures in the Course of First Language Development 167
  8.1 Introduction 167
  8.2 Children’s Developing Sensitivity to the Maxims of Conversation 168
  8.3 The Acquisition of Relevance Implicatures 171
  8.4 The Acquisition of Scalar Implicatures 175
    8.4.1 The Influence of Experimental Design on Children’s Ability to Derive Scalar Implicatures 176
    8.4.2 Do Children Derive Generalized Implicatures Earlier Than Particularized Implicatures? 179
    8.4.3 Why Are Scalar Implicatures Difficult for Children? 181
  8.5 The Acquisition of Implicatures in Atypical Development 185
  8.6 Summary 188
CONTENTS

viii

9  Implicatures and Second Language Acquisition  191
  9.1 Introduction  191
  9.2 Implicatures across Languages and Cultures  192
  9.3 Do Learners Derive Implicatures in L2?  195
  9.4 Factors Influencing Learners’ Ability to Derive
      Implicatures  200
      9.4.1 What Makes Some Implicatures Harder Than Others for Learners?  200
      9.4.2 Why Do Some Learners Understand Implicatures Better Than Others?  203
  9.5 Similarities and Differences between L1 and L2
      Acquisition  206
  9.6 Summary  208
Conclusion  211

Glossary  221
References  225
Index  245
Figures

2.1 Meaning in standard theory page 26
2.2 Meaning in extended standard theory 26
2.3 The architecture of GB 27
2.4 Grammar and its interface 27
2.5 Abstract-command relations between A and B/E 29
2.6 Structural representation of (2) 29
2.7 Different meanings of open 36
2.8 The tripartite parallel architecture 39
2.9 The linear model 40
2.10 The integrated model 40
5.1 Types of meaning following Grice 94
6.1 Logical and pragmatic relations for some 115
6.2 Logical and pragmatic relations for or 115
6.3 The classical Gricean representation of meaning 117
6.4 The logical square 121
6.5 Neg-Raising as I-implicature 128
6.6 The logical square for antonyms 129
6.7 The Gricean circle 130
6.8 The club sandwich semantics-pragmatics interface 131
C.1 Family resemblance between types of meaning 215
C.2 Types of meaning (summary) 217
## Tables

2.1 Four types of theory  page 43

4.1 Pay-offs in the traffic-fine situation  (explicit communication)  80

4.2 Pay-offs in the traffic-fine situation (implicit/explicit communication)  81

5.1 Features of conventional vs. conversational implicatures  93

6.1 Scalar and clausal implicature for or  118

6.2 Lexical realizations for A, I, E  122
Preface

When Cambridge University Press asked Jacques Moeschler to write a research synthesis on the subject of implicature, his first thought was that the task went far beyond his competence and knowledge. He immediately thought of Sandrine Zufferey, with whom he had already published two textbooks in French (Zufferey & Moeschler 2010/2015, 2012), and, most importantly, who had already discussed the issue of developmental pragmatics, including the acquisition of implicatures, in her 2015 book. However, the first table of contents they agreed on together appeared to them to be rather incomplete, mainly because it lacked the philosophical context of a theory of meaning based on implicatures, that is, the Gricean theory of meaning, which was a necessary step for an introduction to the book. When Anne Reboul agreed to join the team, the three of them were confident that their complementary fields of expertise would enable them to present an up-to-date, but also original and comprehensive, synthesis of work developing and using the concept of implicature.

The challenge was twofold. First, to offer a clear and comprehensive presentation of the various research fields in which the concept of implicature is currently used and has been used in past decades. Second, to go beyond the pragmatic theories of implicature and include new domains developed in experimental pragmatics, such as the processing and the acquisition of implicatures. The addition of a last chapter on the acquisition of implicature in second language learning was a natural complement to show first the current extension of the domain of implicature, and second the possible impact of pragmatics, and mainly implicatures, on second language acquisition.

As the reader will discover while reading this book, the notion of implicature is now widespread in almost all the domains of linguistic theory, from formal approaches in syntax and semantics to more functional approaches to linguistic meaning. One of the main decisions before writing this book was to adopt an inclusive approach
to theories of meaning. We hope that one of the contributions of the book is to do justice to the complexity of theories of implicature. The theoretical and empirical frameworks are multiple, sometimes providing conflicting findings, and all of them leave many questions unanswered. As the conclusion of the book shows, we do not yet have a complete theory of meaning where the notion of implicature, including its different types, is fully integrated. This means that research on the notion of implicature, and more generally on theories of meaning, will continue to evolve in the next decades, to incorporate new ideas and data at the descriptive, explanatory and experimental levels. Facing complexity in language is a first but necessary step to developing a sound and comprehensive theory of meaning, and the notion of implicature provides an excellent place to start.